A SYSTEMATIC LITERATURE REVIEW OF HOW MENTORS CARE FOR BLACK ADOLESCENT MALES

by

Paul David Spradley

B.A., Robert Morris University, 2003
M.S., Robert Morris University, 2006

Submitted to the Graduate Faculty of the School of Education in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Education

University of Pittsburgh

2017
UNIVERSITY OF PITTSBURGH
SCHOOL OF EDUCATION

This dissertation in practice was presented

by

Paul David Spradley

May 11, 2017

and approved by

Anthony Mitchell, EdD, Assistant Teaching Professor, African and African American Studies, Penn State University

Lori Ann Delale O’Connor, PhD, Research Assistant Professor, School of Education

Dissertation Advisor: H. Richard Milner IV, PhD, Professor, School of Education
A SYSTEMATIC LITERATURE REVIEW OF HOW MENTORS CARE FOR BLACK ADOLESCENT MALES

Paul David Spradley, EdD
University of Pittsburgh, 2017

The purpose of this inductive systematic literature review was to explore mentoring programs serving Black adolescent males and search for practical ways mentors can better support their Black male mentees. Using Geneva Gay’s work on culturally responsive care as a conceptual framework, my review of the literature was guided by two questions: (1) What promising practices of mentoring emerge from a review of the literature over the last 20 years; and (2) What themes of caring mentors and mentoring of Black males emerge from the literature? Using the University of Pittsburgh's PittCat+ comprehensive online database, I began with the search term 'Mentoring AND Black Males', and included search parameters of peer reviewed/scholarly studies from the last 20 years. Additional included and excluded subject terms helped narrow the results. Of the 200 remaining studies, 16 specifically explored mentoring programs primarily serving Black adolescent males and included examples of mentors “caring for” mentees. Examples of “caring for” were color coded into a database, and the data was synthesized through thematic analysis to ascertain my findings. Six themes of care emerged as practices of mentors serving Black adolescent males. The six themes included: safety, emotional care, culture affirming care, social care, academic care and organizational care. Among the major findings was the indication that the themes were hierarchical with organizational care serving as a
foundation for which the other examples of care are predicated. Similarly, the theme of safety appeared to serve as a prerequisite in the mentor/mentee relationship for which the other themes could be practiced effectively. The findings are significant because they support a dearth of literature on the mentoring of Black adolescent males from a strength-based perspective, and positions mentoring as a tool to care and not as a tool to “fix.” The findings in this review may also serve as a means to address disparities between the negative educational experience of some Black boys and other adolescent students.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE ..................................................................................................................................... X

1.0 INTRODUCTION ........................................................................................................ 1

1.1 THE PROBLEM .................................................................................................. 3

1.2 PROBLEM OF PRACTICE ............................................................................... 5

1.3 GUIDING QUESTIONS ..................................................................................... 6

1.4 POSITIONALITY ............................................................................................... 6

2.0 METHODS ........................................................................................................... 9

3.0 CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK ............................................................................. 15

3.1 CULTURALLY RESPONSIVE THEORY .................................................... 16

3.2 CARING FOR VS. CARING ABOUT ............................................................ 17

3.3 CULTURALLY RESPONSIVE CARE .......................................................... 18

3.4 THE DISCREPANCY BETWEEN BELIEFS AND ACTIONS ................... 20

3.5 PROFILE OF A CARING MENTOR ............................................................. 21

4.0 FINDINGS ........................................................................................................... 24

4.1 LITERATURE REVIEW ................................................................................. 24

4.2 PRACTICES OF CARING MENTORING AGGREGATED INTO THEMES ............................................................................................................................. 39

4.2.1 Safety ............................................................................................................ 41
# LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Included Filtered Terms ........................................................................................................ 10  
Table 2: Working Definition of Emergent Themes .............................................................................. 41  
Table 3 Recommendations from the Literature .................................................................................. 69
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1: PRISMA Flow Diagram ........................................................................................................... 13
Figure 2 Framework of Emergent Themes .............................................................................................. 62
Figure 3 What themes were identified within the study ........................................................................ 65
Figure 4: Sample Database for Coding Information from Sample Studies ........................................ 75
I’m incredibly grateful to have an opportunity to thank all of those who have been so significant in the completion of my dissertation. First, and foremost, I want to thank God. When I look back over these last few years, I am amazing at how God sustained me, and gave me strength when I had nothing left in the tank to give. I’m so grateful to God for his grace, his mercy and his provision.

To my beautiful and incredibly intelligent wife, my main cheerleader and the one who, here on this earth, truly made it possible for me to write by providing me space, I say, thank you and I love you. Because of you, when I needed to miss family gatherings or cut family time short to write, you made sure the girls never missed a beat or felt abandoned by their dad. When I needed to run an idea past you or get your thoughts on what was going on in my head, you were never too busy. Through tears, through ups and downs, despite my many flaws…you were always by my side. This journey could have easily been derailed, but despite it all…you were always by my side, cheering me on, even if I had given you reason not to. I dedicate this dissertation to you, because without you I would not have started nor finished. I love you so much, and am so grateful you are in my life. You’re an amazing mother, wife, professor, and much much more.

While in this doctoral program, I lost my mentor, Dr. Rex Crawley, to cancer, and my older brother, Phil, to suicide. My brother Phil always believed I would continue with school
after my Master’s degree. He told his friends how proud he was of me, and he himself showed me what it looked like to be an educated, proud Black man. Dr. Crawley’s words of affirmation, his counsel, his drive, his professionalism and his legacy are all very active within me. The fact that I still ask myself, what would Rex do, reflects the importance he had and will forever have in my life. I was saddened on the evening of graduation when I realized that neither of these men whom I loved were at my graduation. But today, I find comfort in knowing that my work in this manuscript and my work to come will honor them and would have made them proud.

I’m grateful for my mother, Deborah Henry, who taught me the value of education. At each level of my schooling, my mom motivated me to do better work. Through her prayers and attention to education, all five of her kids are college graduates.

I am incredibly indebted to the Heinz Endowments for investing in me financially. Thank you to Stan Thompson for your vision and leadership of the Heinz Fellows program. Thank you to Melanie Brown and Dr. Anthony Mitchell for ensuring we were supported through the practice of serving as a mentor.

I am grateful to my two small groups which consisted of Pastor John Kent and Berquin Feese in one group and Dan Dupee, Michael Thornhill and George Barron in another. Your prayers, your hugs, your affirmations were so appreciated.

To my staff, Tracy Frazier, Lauren Speerhas, Armani Davis, Nicole Law, Grace Novacek, and Andrea Schultz at Robert Morris University, thank you for your support. My secretary, Micheline Cain, was always willing to assist in any way possible, including with pulling research and looking over the document for formatting issues. Thank you to my staff for being patient with me on the days I needed to be away writing. I’m grateful to John Locke and
Armand Buzzelli who regularly asked me for updates on my work to ensure that I was plowing forward. To the many well-wishers and supporters at RMU, I am grateful.

I’m grateful for the Jackson Scholars program through UCEA, and my mentor in that program, Dr. Wayne Lewis. I gained more support and greater feedback as a result of being a Jackson Scholar, than I did at any major conference I went to.

I’m grateful to my dad, Paul Spradley, and his wife Nadine for supporting my wife and I by watching the girls when both of us were pressed by deadlines.

Thank you to my editor Meg McKivigan.

I’d like to thank the mentors and peer mentors in my life, who have invested so much time and energy into my life. The list is long, but those men and women that I am grateful for include: Gregg Spencer, John Michalenko, Stan Thompson, Dr. Anthony Mitchell, Dr. Michael Quigley, Makenzie Kambizi, Malcom Thomas, Brett Marcoux, Alexis Howard, the late Mr. Earl Williams, Ricardo Charity, Clayton Alves, Nikki Smith, Jay Carson and many many more. To my ancestors who have gone before me, I honor you.

I would like to thank my Chair, Dr. Richard Milner. From his incredibly poignant recommendations to his wealth of knowledge to his broad network, Dr. Milner is a true gem. He’s an international academic juggernaut yet was able to care about the small details of my personal life. As his advisee, he took great care of me. He was never too busy to connect via text, phone, email or in person. I fully recognize this document would be much less significant without the guidance of Dr. Milner. Thank you, sir.

Finally, for the Black boys and girls in high school who have been given up on, keep fighting. Know that there are people fighting for you in spaces that you do not even know about. To all students who fall into the category of “the least of these,” you need to know that people
care for you. To the student attending a below average school, wondering what’s next for their life, I need you to be excellent and demand excellence from those around you. I know you can be excellent, I’ve seen it in you.
It has been well established that Black males have been failed by the American Education system (Milner, 2013a), specifically in areas such as standardized testing, high school completion rates, academic achievement, and college attendance and completion (Gándara & Contreras, 2009; O'Connor, Horvat, & Lewis, 2006; Thomas, Caldwell, Faison, and Jackson 2009; Valencia, 2000; Vega et al., 2012). Researchers have put considerable resources towards identifying solutions to closing these educational gaps even though the school environment itself is still much more hostile for Black students, often triggering defensive reactions and interfering with their intellectual performance (Steele, 1992). Some scholars have pointed to mentoring as an effective intervention to addressing social and academic needs of disenfranchised Black youth (DuBois, Portillo, Rhodes, Silverthorn, & Valentine, 2011 Silverthorn, & Valentine, 2011; MENTOR, 2006; Osborne, 1999; Stinson, 2006). Mentoring can be defined as a flexible one-to-one relationship between a pair of unrelated individuals, usually of different ages, interacting on a long-term basis. Within this relationship, the more experienced individual contributes to the younger person’s wellbeing by supporting, motivating and serving as a role model (DuBois & Silverthorn, 2005; Evans, 2000; Hamilton, 1990; Keller & Pryce, 2010; Rawlings, 2002) who can positively influence social and educational outcomes of the mentee (Struchen & Porta, 1997; Thomson & Zand, 2010). A mentoring relationship can create a special bond of mutual
commitment, allow for trust, respect and loyalty to be developed within the relationship and encourage a sense of identification within the mentee (DuBois & Karcher, 2005; Hamilton, 1990; Keller & Pryce, 2010; Rawlings, 2002). Mentoring can improve the interpersonal skills, relationships, self-confidence, and attitudes towards school and academic achievement (Dappen & Iserhagen, 2006). As a result of these rapidly actualized benefits and noticeable results on the social and academic needs of youth, school-based mentoring initiatives provide a desirable intervention for schools and community organizations to positively impact the trajectory of youth (Dappen & Iserhagen, 2006; DuBois & Neville, 1997).

School districts around the country, appear to be in agreement, as many are re-evaluating how they serve their most fragile population. In some cases they have even prioritized the academic, social and emotional well-being of their Black male students (Jackson, Sealey-Ruiz, & Watson, 2014). Though factors such as training for mentors (MENTOR, 2006), the length of the mentoring relationship (DuBois, Portillo, Rhodes, Silverthorn, & Valentine, 2011; Rhodes, 2005; Zellers, Howard, & Barcic, 2008), the content in the mentoring program (DuBois & Silverthorn, 2005) and other factors influence the overall effectiveness of the mentoring relationship. With more than 3 million youth in a mentoring relationship in the United States, the practice of mentoring does not appear to be slowing down anytime soon. In fact, some researchers have specifically suggested that Black males fall into the “under resourced” category and make particularly strong candidates for mentoring interventions (Dappen & Iserhagen, 2006).
Geneva Gay suggests that culturally responsive caring is an essential part of the educational process for ethnically diverse students given the challenges associated with educating and being educated in the current education system. Ethnically diverse students may constitute a variety of races and ethnicities, but I wish to apply this theory specifically for Black adolescent male students. Though African American and Black are terms often used interchangeably, the ethnicity, African American, has a seemingly more narrow scope than the racial descriptor “Black”. For example, a Haitian-born male raised in the United States may identify as Haitian American, but without speaking with a strong accent, still experiences the positive and negative consequences of being Black in America because of the color of his skin, the community in which he may live, the way he dresses, etc. To be clear, though I am using the term Black because of its ability capture a broader population, the term Black does not represent a single experience based on the color of one’s skin, nor presume that all Black people are mostly similar. Rather, I use the term to identify samples of patterns common to a group of people in relation to other races.

When youth constantly hear and experience the message that they are outcasts, different, unworthy, uneducable, and uncontrollable (Beachum & McCray, 2016) and when researchers argue that schools have failed Black students, specifically when considering areas such as standardized testing, high school completion rates, academic achievement, and college attendance and completion (Gándara & Contreras, 2009; O'Connor et al., 2006; Thomas et al., 2009; Jackson, 2009; Valencia, 2000; Vega et al., 2012), we must isolate race and unpack why. Milner (2015, p.10) suggests that race cannot be fully comprehended, unless racism,
discrimination and the impact of structural inequity on Black males as individuals, is also understood. Racism is still evident as a result of the repetitive, systematic and institutionalized practices which have resulted in the subordination and devaluing of underrepresented groups, specifically Black males (Jones, 1991). The culminating impact of racism puts Black males at extreme risk for unfavorable outcomes and behaviors (Spencer & Dornbusch, 1990). It's important to recognize the risks that many Black males face merely because of their skin color and racial attributes assigned to them. Black males are among the most stigmatized and stereotyped group in America (Cunningham, 2001). It’s no surprise then that Gay (2010) suggests care as an essential part of the educational process for Black males.

Interestingly, Gay (2010) also found that though many adults who work with historically disenfranchised youth agree in theory that care is important in working effectively with students. They find it challenging to adequately define care or even characterize what it looks like in practice between themselves and the youth. It is unsettling to me that though mentoring is happening with more frequency and as a tool to address the academic and social challenges that face many Black adolescent’s males, care appears to be missing in the literature as well as in the practice of mentors. I believe the gap in research and in practice that exists between mentoring and intentional caring is problematic for the Black males being mentored and for the work of mentoring.
1.2 PROBLEM OF PRACTICE

School settings are places where Black male adolescents will develop emerging gender, racial, academic and social identities (Davis, 2006). The presence of nurturing, caring relationships during this time can encourage or hinder positive development for these young men (Ransom & Davis, 2016). I believe that mentors can serve as caring adults in the life of Black adolescent males, yet little attention has been given in the literature to what care practically looks like. Through a systematic literature review, my problem of practice will seek to explore and identify care-based practices in the mentoring of Black adolescent males. This problem of practice is important because:

- The dearth of literature focusing on the mentoring of Black adolescent males
- My findings may bring needed attention to addressing the gap between mentoring and care
- This work may serve as a framework on which mentors serving Black adolescent males can improve their practice
- Care may provide a fresh perspective on how to navigate broader conversations around the academic and social achievement gap between Black and White adolescents

Though the mentors themselves may identify with a variety of ethnicities, it is the race of the students in the mentoring program which serves as the most important variable, as evidenced by the systematic and demonstrated failure in educating Black youth.
1.3 GUIDING QUESTIONS

I will be reviewing literature that examines the practice of mentors serving Black adolescents, with a focus on Black males. To guide my review of the literature, I will ask the following questions:

1. What promising practices of mentoring emerge from a review of the literature over the last 20 years?
2. What themes of caring and effective mentors and mentoring of Black males emerge from the literature?

1.4 POSITIONALITY

For nearly 10 years, I have functioned as a mentor serving Black students in 6 different programs. I am myself a Black male in my mid 30’s, who, over the last 5 years has been made aware of my increasing desire and passion to invest into the lives of Black adolescents and young adults; even though that was not always the case. In one of my first formal mentoring assignments, I recall going in as young professional looking to change the world. In my mind, I was perfect for mentoring. I was a Black male who had graduated from college. Mentoring appeared to be the next logical step. In our first interaction, I asked my mentee to tell me about himself. After he did, I told him about myself. The conversation after that was awkward. Over the next few weeks, I could not understand why my mentee did not ask me more questions about how I was successful in the navigation of the public-school systems as a Black male. You see, in
my mind, I thought the fact that I was present and interested in mentoring should have been
even to build upon. I thought that because I shared a few similar traits of this skinny, caramel
complexed adolescent male with high, curly hair, that we would instantly connect and that he
would be impressed by what I had accomplished at this stage in my life. I did not connect with
him in a meaningful way, nor was he impressed with me. My next mentoring relationship was
better, but not because of anything I did differently. My second mentee, with dark skin, glasses
and short hair, was incredibly engaging and easy to communicate with. While I remember what
my mentees looked like, I do not recall either of their names. I cannot tell you about their
dreams and aspirations, and I have no idea where they are today. Yet, if you asked me while in
the process of mentoring if I cared for my mentees, I would have answered unquestionably in the
affirmative. My race, my gender, our shared public school experiences, or any of my
accomplishments at that point meant absolutely nothing to my mentees. I failed as a mentor,
because I entered their space believing that their mentoring experience was about me. I did not
care for them.

In, 2016, I worked with one of my mentees as he navigated marital challenges, family
challenges, and I even called in a favor to help him get a full-time job. Later, he asked me why I
was doing all of this for him, and I told him that I loved him and wanted him to be better than me
in every way; I wanted his marriage to thrive, his relationship with his mother to improve, his
career to take off and so much more. Today, I hold a very different position on mentoring than I
did when I first began mentoring. Through reading and listening to others wiser than myself, I
would acquire a greater understanding of social and academic obstacles that are systematically
stacked against Black youth inhibiting their life chances. As a professed Christian, I am morally
opposed to practice of oppression and yet, must navigate a culture where I, and people who look
like me, are oppressed regularly. Defining my position and keeping my perspectives front and center throughout my research is, as Milner (2007) suggests, critical for avoiding unseen dangers such as being culture blind which could lead to misrepresentation of communities of color. For example, as a researcher, I should be cautious not to assume that the relevance of care-based practices are unquestionably applicable in the life of all Black adolescent males. Instead, I must provide space for my findings to be questioned and accept that my findings may lack relevance or be ineffective with some groups of Black adolescent males. As Milner’s researcher positionality framework suggests, race and culture are important considerations to be mindful of not only for myself, but the Black adolescent males my research is designed to support and the communities of which they are a part of (Milner, 2007).
2.0 METHODS

My systematic review will be inductive in nature, building off the theory of culturally responsive care and identifying implicit or explicit care based practices discovered through the literature. The method I used to identify studies to be included in this literature review was a keyword search of electronic databases. The keyword search was orchestrated by using the University of Pittsburgh’s comprehensive online library system PittCat+, which automatically provided me access to education databases such as Sage Ereference, Proquest, JSTOR, and ERIC via EBSCO. PittCat+ includes everything the library subscribes to, which represents approximately 80,000-90,000 journals and approximately 400 databases. To be included, studies first needed to be peer reviewed and scholarly in nature and written between the years 1996-2016. I employ a parameter of 20 years, primarily to examine the most current research on this topic.

The subject term I used to begin my search was “Mentoring AND Black Males”. The initial result for all scholarly and peer reviewed articles from the last 20 years generated 8,678 total studies. Even at first glance, many of the studies were irrelevant due to the study having nothing to do with adolescent males, or mentoring programs serving this population; I was specifically looking for mentoring that took place with adolescent males in school based environments. Using a “subject term” function, I narrowed down the search by filtering to include the following additional subject terms: adolescents, Black students, African Americans,
Blacks, Case Studies, Children and Youth, Community, High School, Influence, Intervention, Learning, Males, Mentoring; Mentors, Minority Groups, Minority & Ethnic Groups, Schools, Students, Success, Teenagers, Training, United States, Youth, Risk.

Table 1: Included Filtered Terms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject Term</th>
<th># of references in term</th>
<th>Subject Term</th>
<th># of references in term</th>
<th>Subject Term</th>
<th># of references in term</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>adolescents</td>
<td>491</td>
<td>influence</td>
<td>224</td>
<td>Schools</td>
<td>288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black students</td>
<td>191</td>
<td>intervention</td>
<td>355</td>
<td>Students</td>
<td>657</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>African Americans</td>
<td>263</td>
<td>learning</td>
<td>403</td>
<td>success</td>
<td>214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>blacks</td>
<td>272</td>
<td>males</td>
<td>375</td>
<td>teenagers</td>
<td>330</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>case studies</td>
<td>212</td>
<td>mentoring</td>
<td>277</td>
<td>training</td>
<td>283</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>children and youth</td>
<td>268</td>
<td>mentors</td>
<td>548</td>
<td>united states</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>community</td>
<td>198</td>
<td>minority groups</td>
<td>265</td>
<td>youth</td>
<td>441</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High school students</td>
<td>192</td>
<td>Minority and ethnic groups</td>
<td>292</td>
<td>Risk</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1 shows how many articles were associated for each term. If, for instance, I only filtered to include adolescents, then only 491 studies would have populated. A few of the search components I will elaborate on to help explain why they were included. First, is the term adolescent. The word adolescent is intentionally used throughout my research because it has historically encompassed the lived experiences of middle to high school aged youth. Early
adolescent is defined as 10-14 years of age, and late adolescent is typically 14-17 years of age. I am interested in the full range of adolescence because of the transition and maturing period in the teens years (Dictionary, 2016). Adolescent aged males are important to this study because by this time in their academic career, it is possible the student has been conditioned to understand themselves as second class citizen and below average student (Holliday, 1981, 1985). Interestingly, more research exists supporting mentoring and Black male college aged students than does adolescent males or elementary school aged males.

A second search term to note was “United States”. Because my original search intentionally included the racial category of Black, studies of mentoring Black males included results of Black Caribbean, Black African and even Black European mentees. It was with great intention that I explore the experiences of Black adolescent males from within the United States, because my problem of practice focuses in part on addressing the achievement gap of Black males within the United States.

Finally, when using the racial descriptor Black, in the context of mentoring, it often includes males who identified as Black or Bi-racial, attended a public school, and resided in or near a metropolitan city. Many, but not all, of the Black males lived in communities with people who looked like them, where job and financial security where challenges, and resources were limited. Most of the Black adolescent males needed support navigating a combination of academic or social challenges.

Occupational Health. After setting new parameters, the second filter resulted in 1,975 relevant studies, organized numerically in order of the most relevant (according to the database) to the least relevant. One by one, I began skimming titles first, then abstracts of the studies. I rejected studies that were solely faith or community based mentoring programs as well as programs that lacked academic components to them.

Interestingly, though the database had been filtered to reflect 1,975 studies, as I began scrolling through my filtered list, the database stated that I had “reached the end of my results” after exploring through only 200. At this point, I identified 37 studies which had sufficient information in the title, abstract and first paragraph to be considered in this review. The studies then fell into two primary areas: 1) 16 studies were on mentoring programs serving Black Adolescent Males; and 2) 9 studies explored elements of mentoring relationships from full time school based professionals such as teachers and counselors. A primary reason 12 of the studies were excluded was because they did not provide sufficient evidence of care based practices, and thus unable to adequately support my guiding questions.
Records identified through database search of “Mentoring AND Black Males”. 
(n = 8,678)

Records Identified through initial screening
(n = 3,640)

Records screened
(n = 1,975)

Records excluded
(n = 1,775)

Articles assessed for eligibility
(n = 200)

Studies excluded after final screen (n = 174)

Studies included in coding rubric
(n = 26)

Studies included in analysis
(n = 16)

Figure 1: PRISMA Flow Diagram

Not knowing specifically how I would sort the information in the studies, I first created an Excel spreadsheet, and put the reference information of the 17 studies focusing on mentoring, in the first column of the document and then began putting general statements of data I may want to collect along the top row of the tab. Examples of column headings included: Middle/high school; gender of the author(s); race of the mentors; theoretical framework; and findings/recommendations. I created a second tab for the nine studies examining mentoring practices by non-mentors, and replicated what was included in the first tab. I created a third tab to sort articles that supported culturally responsive care, and a fourth tab was used to house all the references in alphabetical order. Keeping my guiding questions in mind, I began reading through the studies line by line for practical examples of action based care, or “caring for.” When practical examples of “caring for” were demonstrated, I highlighted the information in pink. My hope was that general themes would emerge. After reading through three studies, I noticed initial themes of academic care, emotional care, social and culture affirming care. Later, I identified safety and organizational care as practical themes which emerged.

Studies were reviewed repeatedly for accuracy. An inductive approach was employed to summarize acquired data, construct emerging themes into categories and establish links between my guiding questions and the summary of findings. Once everything was entered into the database, I used open-coding and thematic analysis to identify emerging themes and patterns.
3.0 CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK

I am framing my literature review through the lens of culturally responsive caring. Care ethicist have in the past discussed "care" as a verb (Gilligan, 1982; Mayeroff, 1971; Noddings, 1984, 2013). They describe caring as the act of feeling compassion about an issue to be moved to do something (Bass, 2016). A pioneer in the scholarly work of “care,” Nel Noddings defined (Noddings, 2005) caring as a set of relational practices between a career and a cared-for party, that foster “mutual recognition and realization, growth, development, protection, empowerment, human community, culture, and possibility.” It is up to the carer, according to Noddings, to initiate and build connections with his or her student and the cared for party accepts the care (Noddings, 2005). Though I use these definitions in the attempt to frame care, I acknowledge that the term care in and of itself, is fallible as a result of its arbitrary nature. However, I believe attempting to define care as relational practices that fosters a reaction is appropriate for me as a social scientist to systematically study the literature. For clarity, I will elaborate on passive versus active caring in subsequent sections.
3.1 CULTURALLY RESPONSIVE THEORY

Culturally Responsive theory is based on the assumption that when knowledge and skills are situated within the lived experiences and frames of reference of students, they are more personally meaningful, have higher interest appeal, and are learned more easily and thoroughly (Gay, 2000). The key is focusing on the students’ lived experiences and using the cultural characteristics, experiences, and perspectives of, in this case, Black adolescent males, as tools engage the student more deeply and effectively (Gay, 2002). Equally as important as using the students’ culture as source of information, is the work of being responsive. Responsive mentors are able to respond to the students’ culture because they understand the student, their cultural influences, and use this knowledge to guide their actions (Bowers & Flinders, 1990; Berman, 1994).

A culturally responsive mentor serving an ethnically diverse mentee will need to be a student of his or her mentee. That means finding out their likes and dislikes, determining what they know and what they can do, as well as what they are capable of knowing and doing (Gay, 2002). Being culturally responsive means learning about the culture the mentee identifies with, the neighborhood they live in, the language they use to communicate, values, tradition, learning styles, contributions, relational patterns, and an appreciation of the history (Gay, 2002; Hollins, King, & Hayman, 1994; King, Hollins, & Hayman, 1997; Pai, 1990; Smith, 1998). This knowledge allows the mentor to build a relationship with their mentee around elements of their life that are important to them. Some educators are hesitant about dealing with cultural descriptors for fear of stereotyping and overgeneralizing, and they compensate by ignoring them (Gay, 2002). Culturally responsive care provides mentors with the skills to gain greater self-
awareness, greater awareness of others, and better interpersonal skills; it also helps mentors to more effectively challenge stereotypes and prejudices (Banks, 2004).

3.2 CARING FOR VS. CARING ABOUT

Noddings (2002) acknowledged, “All people everywhere want to be cared for” but stated that “caring for” others is not an innate behavior. It must be learned through reflexive modeling. In her research, Gay makes a very clear distinction in caring “for” and caring “about”. Caring for” is a combination of concern, compassion, commitment, responsibility and action to positively affect their lived experience (Gay, 2010). An image that comes to mind when describing “caring for” is an adult caring for a child who is ill by bringing them necessary medicine, making sure the room temperature is sufficient and feeding the youth their favorite soup. “Caring about” might be demonstrated simply through the adult asking how the sick youth is doing but not doing much more than that to aid in their healing. Caring often means sacrificing one's personal comfort and preferences while pursuing the best interest of the person being cared for (Bass, 2016).

Educators, then, who strive to care for feel responsible for empowering their students; they believe that they are charged with both doing something and being personally responsible for them (Owens & Ennis, 2005). Nodding’s (1984) suggests that when people genuinely care about unjust situations, they will spring to corrective action. In this sense, action means investigating what the problem is, why it exists, and how one can act to remedy it, followed by
investing the necessary resources to discover an appropriate solution and then taking action (Bass, 2012).

It should be noted however, that earlier work on care, and in particular the work of Noddings, has been critiqued for not adequately addressing issues of social justice (Card, 1990), being colorblind and overloaded on the emotional component of care rather than the action (Antrop-González & De Jesús, 2006). More recently, scholars have applied the idea of care in the education of Black and Latino students (Garza, 2009; Gay, 2010; Howard, 2008), giving space for culturally responsive caring to evolve.

3.3 CULTURALLY RESPONSIVE CARE

Pulling all three words together, culturally responsive caring can be characterized as a holistic approach to understanding students personally and academically (Gay, 2010) while caring enough to pursue the best interest for the person being cared for. Mentors who practice culturally responsive caring foster relationships with students that encourage them to develop confidence, pride, a sense of responsibility, and critical consciousness (Jackson et al, 2014, p.400). Gay, (2002) states:

“Culturally responsive caring is action oriented in that it demonstrates high expectations and uses imaginative strategies to ensure academic success for ethnically diverse students. [Mentors] genuinely believe in the intellectual potential of these students and accept their responsibility to facilitate its realization without ignoring, demeaning or neglecting their ethnic and cultural identities. They build toward academic success from a
A goal of such caring is to help Black adolescent males in this case, not only excel academically but also contribute to a more caring society where the student develops a sense of moral, social, and personal responsibility because of this culturally responsive caring (Jackson et al, 2014). Culturally responsive caring mentors often wear many hats and may assume the role of counselor, advocate, encourager, and racial cheerleader to meet the comprehensive needs of the whole student in this social, emotional and academic partnership (Siddle Walker & Tompkins, 2004). It’s worth stating that this partnership is anchored in respect, honor, integrity, resource sharing, and a deep belief in the possibility of transcendence (Gay, 2010).

Gay’s (2010) emphatic suggestion that the very presence of care in the affirming relationship for Black youth is crucial in achieving favorable outcomes, is one that is supported by research. Wentzel (1997) found, in her longitudinal study that when adolescents believed their teachers and administrators truly cared for them, they would work harder to achieve goals. Consequently, when a mentor does not implicitly express care for Black adolescent male’s culture and emotions, they may share a sentiment of many teachers of Black males in that his behavior is impulsive, overemotional, and out of control. This example of non-care is demonstrated when much of an educator’s interaction with a Black male student is grounded in discipline and control, or “We see examples of this in the classroom where much of a teacher’s classroom interaction with Black male students is of a disciplinary and controlling manner, directed toward getting them to ‘settle down’ and "spend more time on task" (Gay, 2010). Problematically, the student finds himself engaged with the teacher more around being
reprimanded for poor behavior than for being instructed on academic learning, constraining true academic achievement (Gay, 2010, p.61).

I can recall one instance where my mentee asked me to come observe him in his class and look over his work before he turned it in. The teacher was so frustrated with the uncontrolled class, that she shouted, “Ok listen! If you all calm down and do your work, I won’t give you homework for the rest of this week!” The documented records of this school detailed the need for the students to be afforded every opportunity to build academic stamina and yet the primary educator in this space refused to take on this responsibility, thus demonstrating the antithesis of care. Gay (2010) suggests that speaking out or talking across the room is a management issue, while reading and writing is an academic opportunity.

3.4 THE DISCREPANCY BETWEEN BELIEFS AND ACTIONS

I imagine, if the teacher in my mentee’s class was asked if she cared about her students, she would vehemently support the notion that she does. Her actions, however, suggest a discrepancy in her beliefs and expectations. For example, while many educators may say they ascribe to the belief that all students can learn, Good and Brophy (2003) suggest that they may not necessarily expect the students to do so. An educator may express disdain about the lack of diversity in a textbook, but they continue to use those textbooks without providing any resources offering an alternative narrative (Gay, 2010). If educators expect students to be high or low achievers, they will act in ways that cause this to happen (Gay, 2010). When educators hold poor assumptions about student’s intellect and behavior, the “self-fulfilling prophecy effect” suggests they will
treat the student negatively (Good & Brophy, 2003). Over time, when educators do not care, embody negative attitudes, or have low expectations, it can produce "learned helplessness" among Black students (Holliday, 1981, 1985). If told too often for too long that their contributions and competences are not worthy, students will stop being intellectually engaged in classroom interactions (Gay, 2010). This was evident when the students in my mentee’s class all agreed to the negotiation terms of the teacher. They quieted down, began making attempts at completing their work, and celebrated in the idea of not having homework the remainder of the week.

3.5 PROFILE OF A CARING MENTOR

The kind of care that ethicists and scholars are eluding to may be more clearly defined by what it is rather than what it is not. This kind of care may be expressed in concern for their Black male student’s “psycho-emotional well-being and academic success, personal morality and social actions, obligations and celebrations, communality and individuality, and unique cultural connections and universal human bonds” (Gay, 2010). In other words, educators who truly care ‘for’ students will honor them as humans, continuously respect and esteem the student, hold high expectations of them, and use a full arsenal of tactics to guide the student in meeting those expectations (Gay, 2010).

Ayers’ (2004) profile of a caring educator suggest the carer views their role as opening doors, minds, and possibilities for students; constantly seeking ways to know their students; for themselves and their students to be in better personal and pedagogical relationship; and building
bridges between the known and the unknown. Furthermore, caring educators place students at the center of the learning and turn their personal interests and strengths into opportunities for academic success (Gay, 2010). Rather than simply ascribing to beliefs such as every student can learn, a caring educator demonstrates that caring for their students is a priority, and she/he will work diligently to stay involved with their students (Ransom & Davis, 2016). When an educator makes caring for the student a priority, it no longer is about the educator but the student; viewing the world through the eyes of a student’s unique perspective (Ransom & Davis, 2016). In short, a caring educator not only ascribes to the notion of care in relation to their students, but their care has moved them to action (Noddings, 1984).

In summary, the literature is clear that care is crucial for both the immediate and future aspirations and success of Black male adolescent students. In fact, available research has suggested that youth who maintain strong relationships with caring adults are more confident, achieve higher grades, and experience an increased sense of security (Bean, Bush, McKenry, & Wilson, 2003 & Wilson, 2003; Tran & Weinraub, 2006). Unfortunately, Black males are all too often emotionally and psychologically assaulted in the school context through negative student-teacher relationships, lack of care from teachers, and low teacher expectations (Kunjufu, 1995; Steele, 1997; Ransom & Davis, 2016). Caring is too important in shaping the educational experiences and outcomes of Black adolescent males to be left to chance or good intention. Instead, it must be deliberately cultivated. The mere notion of caring is insufficient given the academic, social and emotional challenges facing Black adolescent males. Within the mentoring relationship, the personal well-being and academic success of the adolescent Black male are interrelated, and the mentor must, through a sustained, trusting and respectful relationship understand this deep commitment to the student as the foundation for all learning (Gay, 2010).
Mentoring programs have an opportunity to provide safety, protecting young Black males from the stereotypical assaults on their identity and intellectual ability that occur during this vulnerable developmental period (Woodland, 2008). Culturally responsive caring is launched when educators acquire more knowledge about ethnic and cultural diversity, become more conscious of themselves as cultural beings and cultural actors in the process of teaching, and engage in courageous conversations about issues fundamental to social justice in society and educational equity for ethnically diverse students (Gay, 2010).

In this paper, I agree with ethicists who have suggested that educators who care for their students may be the missing piece in unsuccessful reform efforts to close achievement gaps between Black males and other students (Delpit, 2006; Noddings, 1984; Shade, 1997; Willis, 1995).
4.0 FINDINGS

Though it was disappointing to see just how few studies existed on mentoring programs serving Black adolescent males, the studies found were encouraging as they overwhelmingly touted positive consequences resulting from work of thoughtful mentoring programs. My findings are organized first in a summary of the 16 studies I examined for this review, followed by anecdotes and examples of the major emergent themes. These themes serve as the basis for my implications and recommendations.

4.1 LITERATURE REVIEW

Project: Gentlemen on the Move (PGOTM), was designed to develop and nurture academic and social excellence in adolescent African-American males (Bailey & Paisley, 2004). Bailey and Paisley (2004) examined PGOTM to support effective mentoring practices of a program serving Black males. PGOTM’s mission is to develop and nurture excellence in African-American males through an empowerment and transformation process. Over a five-year period, nearly 300 young men were on the roster of PGOTM at some point. On average the weekly meetings netted about 50 young men (Bailey & Paisley, 2004). Results from the study demonstrated that participants who attended more regularly had higher GPA’s than those who were sporadic attendees or
dropped out of the group (Bailey & Paisley, 2004). Additionally, both participants and parents of
the participants could verbalize the positive impact PGOTM had on the youths’ social and
academic development through interviews and focus groups (Bailey & Paisley, 2004). Bailey
and Paisley (2004) noted that program was successful because it provided young men
opportunities to experience academic and social success. PGOTM strived to create clear and
consistent boundaries, high expectations, and hold members accountable for their actions and
decisions, involve families, and create collaborative relationships between students, parents,
school personnel, and PGOTM staff.

Conducted in the 2012-13 academic school year Biggs, Musewe & Harvey (2014)
researched an urban faith-based mentoring program to determine the impact of adult mentoring
on Black, under-resourced, urban, middle school students earned grades and to explore the nature
of the engagement of the one-on-one mentoring sessions. The Comprehensive Mentoring (CM)
program was designed to promote spiritual values, academic excellence, self-esteem, health and
wellness, life skill development, and a willingness to serve others. To measure the impact of the
mentoring relationship and positive social behavior, both mentor and mentee data were collected
and analyzed. Mentees completed surveys about their experiences. Monthly mentor feedback
was collected from the mentor to compare information from mentees regarding the nature of
contacts, activities engaged in, and areas addressed that helped improve the mentee’s academic,
social, emotional, and spiritual development. The test group was made up of 50 Black students in
grades six through eight, living in lower income communities who took part in one-on-one
mentoring. The comparison group was a part of a more general mentoring program, and did not
have one-on-one mentoring time. What they found was CM mentees earned higher GPAs than
non-comprehensive mentees overall in mathematics, reading, and science. Further, their results
indicated that the students mentored in the CM program were positively affected by mentoring—especially as reflected in grades earned in the subject of reading (Biggs et al., 2014).

Currently, there are 100 chapters of the We Mentor to Achieve mentoring program located around the country, in major metropolitan cities. Its mission is to improve the quality of life within Black communities by enhancing and providing access to educational and economic opportunities through programming initiatives. The mentoring component of the program services Black males between grades 3-12 and typically occurs during the school day with the support of volunteer mentors. Dickerson & Agosto (2015) used a content analysis to explore the We Mentor to Achieve (WM2A) curriculum. The content analysis was focused on identifying which Black Curriculum orientations were prominent in the guide, and if the curriculum truly helped mentors and mentees understand the barriers facing Black males in school today (2015). Black curriculum orientation was theorized by William Watkins (1993) and suggested Functionalism, Accommodationism, Liberal education, Black Nationalist, Afrocentric, and Social Reconstructionism characterized the educational experience of Black people in the US. Using the Black Curriculum Orientation as a framework, Dickerson & Agosto (2015) realized that several aspects of the WM2A curriculum were deficit based. With that knowledge, Dickerson & Agosto (2015) recommended to align the program's aims with the curriculum by integrating Black curriculum orientations such as emphasizing culture, agency, and understanding the broader socio-political context. Moreover, Dickerson & Agosto suggested that while mentoring programs with defined curriculums may encourage a decrease in drug abuse and behavioral problems, they do not always produce a sense of agency or cultural pride that can be harnessed to challenge the structure affecting more than just the individual mentee (Dickerson & Agosto, 2015). To create a more congruent mentoring experience, the authors suggest incorporating cultural relevance plus
Black curriculum orientations of Afrocentrism, social reconstructionism, and liberalism (Dickerson & Agosto, 2015).

In Fashola’s 2003 study, the author sought to explore the disparity in academic achievement between Black males and other ethnic groups and how after-school programs could provide services that would address and decrease some of these disparities. Fashola (2003) identified four existing, effective models that have been successful in improving the academic achievement of Black male students were explored. The four models presented in this study were: *The Howard Street Tutoring Program, Help One Student To Succeed, Extended-School Day* tutoring program in the Memphis City Schools, and the *Exemplary Center for Reading Instruction*. Fashola (2003) found that among programs intended to increase academic achievement those that provide greater structure, a stronger link to the school day curriculum, well qualified and well trained staff, and opportunities for one to one tutoring were beneficial to the students. Additionally, Fashola (2003) presented programs that demonstrate success at developing the talents of Black students through mentoring programs. The programs examined included Big Brothers/Big Sisters, The Boys and Girls Clubs of America, and the Coca-Cola Valued Youth Program. What Fashola found through reviewing each of these programs, was that students involved in the mentoring programs performed better academically at the end of the year in mathematics, reading, and other subjects. Additionally, students involved in these programs demonstrated better work habits, better emotional adjustment, and better peer relations than that experienced by students in the other settings. Comprehensively, the results showed that students in the treatment group were significantly less likely to start using drugs and alcohol or to engage in aggressive activities and more likely to improve their peer relationships (Fashola, 2003). Socially, students actively involved in the programs demonstrated outcomes such as
reduced aggressive behavior, improved peer relationships, increased school attendance rates, and improved school performance (Fashola, 2003).

To explore mentoring as a tool to counter the effects of academic underachieving among adolescent Black males, Gordon, Iwamoto, Ward, Potts and Boyd (2009) examined the Benjamin E. Mays Institute (BEMI) mentoring program. BEMI builds on the ideals of mentoring to counter the effects of academic underachievement among adolescent Black males by building a model that is Afrocentric; uses prosocial modeling; and emphasizes cultural strengths and pride, and single-sex instruction in a dual-sex educational environment (Gordon et al., 2009). BEMI was based on the Afrocentric paradigm of Sankofa (go back and fetch), spirituality, Kujicahgulia (self-determination), Ujamaa (cooperative economics), Uhuru (freedom and social justice) and Maat (truth) (Akbar, 1991; Asante, 1998; Nobles, 1991). Mentors met weekly with their mentee for planned activities, which included structured mentoring time and events for the mentee’s circle of influence to attend in school program for middle school boys. The authors sampled 61 middle school Black males (29 in BEMI and 32 in comparison group) and found that the students in the BEMI program had significantly greater academic attachment scores and academic success than their non-mentored peers. Among the results was the notion that fostering a positive racial identity may begin to dismantle the social barriers to academic success often experienced by Black young men (Gordon et al., 2009). The programs’ focus on and use of culturally centered modes of instruction and experiences impact the development of the students’ racial identity and reinforces their community’s commitment to them. This commitment appears to extend beyond them, as students, into their community. This validates the reason for intentional community engagement. (Gordon et al., 2009). Ultimately, this study contributes to the literature by
providing support for the effectiveness of an Afrocentric mentoring program in fostering academic success and achievement of middle school Black boys.

Grant and Dieker (2011) sought to determine the implications of web-based mentoring for Black male students on factors that affected their behaviors and academic achievement. Using a case study approach, two Black males in high school participated in 2-3 web-based mentoring sessions a week for 13 weeks. Grant & Dieker (2011) documented observations of attendance, achievement, and classroom behavior. They analyzed responses to blogs by mentees, researcher journal logs, a parent survey and a student participants survey. Results of the study revealed that the participants’ behaviors and achievement were affected by negative school and home environments, but that web-based mentoring was a positive venue to support their needs. Four major themes emerged from the web-based mentoring: (a) Listen to me, (b) what I need, (c) what I prefer, and (d) what I need to succeed. After just the first 2 days of the study, the students expressed more of their emotional needs than those related to academic or behavior suggested in the literature. With each mentoring session, student voices increased. Their need to be heard influenced the researcher to lessen his voice about academic and behavioral issues and listen to the students’ voices. Consequently, the video chat aspect of the mentoring model became a platform for the students to articulate their social and emotional needs (Grant & Dieker, 2011).

Exploring the Young Men for Change (YMC) mentoring program, Hall (Horace R. Hall) offered insights to support mentors in identifying theories and practices that are beneficial and ineffective when designing a program intended to address issues facing Black males while also supporting them to be the change in their lives and communities. Young Men for Change aims to empower high school age Black males through a curriculum that reinforces their awareness of social issues. Situated within Paulo Freire’s critical pedagogy framework, the 31-week
ethnographic study included onsite observations, semi structured interviews with the 11-high school male students, inductive data analysis, and subjective meaning interpretation (Hall, 2015). The goals of Hall’s 2015 study were twofold: (1) to qualitatively evaluate the conceptual and practical basis of a school based mentoring curriculum, using anecdotal evidence from seven mentees who participated for one academic year; and (2) to broaden the natural history of youth mentoring by examining how this program adapts and extends fundamentals of critical pedagogy to heighten the personal agency of its student members. This study offered an anti-deficit mentoring model influenced by elements of critical pedagogy and guided by a specific cultural context. Fundamental to this study is the use of student voice as authentic sources of knowledge that provide a lens through which to plan and improve interventions like mentoring (Hall, 2015). The young men in this study provided very astute commentary on the need and importance of having a physical space to release repressed emotions, reflect on larger societal dynamics that touch their lives, and the importance of taking on alternative, active roles in transforming institutions and themselves (Hall, 2015).

Using Bandura’s (1986) Social Cognitive Theory as a frame, Holt, Bry & Johnson (2008) explored whether a 5-month adult mentoring intervention, Achievement Mentoring Program (AMP), delivered by school personnel could enhance the school engagement of 9th grade urban minority adolescents. AMP ran separate from a larger study being conducted with the 9th grade students, and was made up of twenty 9th grade students (58% were male and 47% were Black students) who exhibited at least two of the following risk factors: low grades and/or academic motivation, discipline problems, and frequent tardiness or absence from school (Bry & George, 1980). A test group of twenty students did not receive the mentoring intervention, however, all 40 students participated the pre/posttest administered to all 9th grade students to help
determine if urban minority students school connected thoughts and behaviors. Additionally, attendance, academic achievement and discipline records were collected to create a more compressive profile of the students. The twenty students in AMP logged up to four hours per week of interaction with their adult mentor (Holt, Bry, & Johnson, 2008). By the post-test, the students had exhibited significantly less decline during the first year of high school in perceived teacher support and decision making, and were less likely to enter the discipline system (Holt et al., 2008). The impact of the intervention included a sense of school belonging for the participants who were mentored as intended. Significant positive effects of mentoring were observed in the areas of perceived teacher support, school belonging, decision making, and whether a student entered the discipline system (Holt et al, 2008). According to Holt, Bry and Johnson (2008), when students at risk for academic failure spend sufficient time with a mentor, they feel more connected to several aspects of the school environment, most notably teachers. Because all mentored participants as a group showed fewer declines in decision making, this suggests that the Achievement Mentoring Program may serve to halt developmental declines typically observed in adolescents’ school-related cognitions (Holt et al., 2008). Finally, Holt, Bry and Johnson (2008) believe it is likely that the mentors’ monitoring of mentees’ behavior and encouragement around using prosocial skills with teachers and peers accounted for the fact that no mentee entered the discipline system during the intervention period (Holt et al., 2008).

The integrative model of minority child development (Garcia Coll, Crnic, Lamberty, Wasik & Jenkins, 1996) suggests that there are various aspects of minority children’s contexts that contribute to developmental competencies such as academic achievement and socio-emotional well-being. Specifically, experiences such as racism, discrimination, and other forms of oppression due to their social location and the historical context of the United States. The
model also identifies factors that contribute positively to developmental competencies (Garcia Coll et al., 1996). Hurd, Varner & Rowley (2013) used the integrative model of minority development theory as the framework to examine associations between natural mentoring relationships, involved-vigilant parenting and the psychological well-being and social skills of Black early adolescents (n = 259; 42% male; mean age = 13.56, SD = .96). The authors conducted 45-minute, online surveys in three middle schools with 259 total students. 220/259 Identified as Black/Black while 39 self-identified as biracial or multiracial with at least 1 Black parent (Hurd, Varner, & Rowley, 2013). Findings of research on formal mentoring relationships and natural mentoring relationships with diverse groups of youths suggest that relationship duration, frequency of contact, and relational closeness may influence the effectiveness of mentoring relationships in promoting more positive youth outcomes (DuBois et al. 2002; DuBois and Silverthorn 2005; Grossman and Rhodes 2002; Klaw et al., 2003; Hurd et al., 2013). Hurd et al. (2013) identified two types of mentoring relationships (less connected and more connected) based on relationship length, involvement, closeness, and frequency of contact. Structural equation modeling was conducted to determine if associations between involved-vigilant parenting and youths’ psychological well-being and social skills varied among youth with a more connected mentoring relationship in comparison to youth without a mentor or with a less connected mentor, controlling for participants’ gender, age, school, and parental education. Youth with more connected mentoring relationships (n = 123) had higher psychological well-being and social skills than youth with no mentor (n = 64) or less connected mentors (n = 72). Youth with less connected mentoring relationships did not differ from youth without natural mentors in average social skills or psychological well-being.
Jackson, Sealey-Ruiz & Watson (2014.) posit that an ethos of care which centers on interconnected relationships as well as students’ personal cultures, interests, and capabilities can restore a sense of humanity among Black and Latino male students who have been emotionally, spiritually, and intellectually broken by the lack of care for them in schools. This phenomenological study, framed through a care based lens, highlights the voices of a mentor along with 7 Black and 7 Latino males from New York who are part of the Umoja Network for Young Men (UMOJA). The UMOJA all-male, in-school mentoring program, had mentees meet twice a week over a 4-year period with a Black mentor. The authors extend the concept of culturally responsive caring by examining notions of reciprocal love and an ethos of care that characterize the mentor’s and mentees’ discussions of their experiences. (Jackson et al., 2014). Data collected for the study included observational field notes of UMOJA family group sessions, participant observations from the second author’s class at the school, and focus group interviews (Jackson et al., 2014). The results of the study demonstrate the ways in which a mentoring program, through an ethos of care, has the potential to reproduce itself, leading mentees to become mentors and role models in other settings. The mentoring that took place created an alternate space and educational experience that was so powerful it counteracted the negative experiences that happen in their regular school experiences. The ethos of care experienced in UMOJA helped the young men shape a positive disposition toward life that was already present within them but went uncultivated in other classroom spaces (Jackson et al., 2014). Ultimately, UMOJA created an environment for Black males where a sense of unity, trust, and open dialog was evident, while also upholding a belief in their capacities. The participants in this study demonstrated reciprocal love; that is, they openly expressed love and care for their mentor and each other, and in turn, were being loved and cared for (Jackson et al., 2014).
According to Sealey-Ruiz & Green (2011) few voices are more marginalized or muted in our society and our classrooms than that of urban Black males. They often are not given the outlets to discuss the effect of racism and discrimination on their daily lives. Drawing on the voices of Black urban youth in an all-male high school mentoring program, this study offered an affirming view of just how significance urban youth culture (UYC) is to a group of young men at an East Coast high school (Sealey-Ruiz & Greene, 2011). A sub-investigation of a study of the school’s achievement gap emerged as a qualitative study, as the lead author noticed a pattern in responses of the Black males who participated in the focus groups. At least 12 of the 20 Black males interviewed in the larger study mentioned the student club, Project Avalanche, about its positive impact on their experience at Riverview High School. The young men claimed that Project Avalanche provided peer support, encouraged academic excellence, and served as a social networking system that connected them to other young men of similar interests. For these young men, how the media portrays them and their culture is not how they view themselves. Through three focus groups with the 12, the authors deduced three primary findings: (1) the youth in the mentoring program viewed their UYC as a strength and source of empowerment within their school environment, (2) there was a notable downside to actively participating in urban youth culture in school, and (3) despite some negative treatment and perceptions, the participants used their connection with UYC to help them negotiate school, and create positive social and academic identities for themselves (Sealey-Ruiz & Greene, 2011). The findings from this study with 12 Black males offer educators concrete reasons why educators’ acceptance of UYC can yield positive social and academic outcomes for academically and socially marginalized students.
Spencer (2006) conducted in-depth semi structured interviews with 24 pairs of adolescent and adult (12 female and 12 male) who had been in a continuous mentoring relationship in a Big Brothers Big Sisters program for a minimum of 1 year, to examine four relational processes. The four processes included: authenticity, empathy, collaboration, and companionship. Cohen and Steele (Cohen & Steele, 2002) assert that for non-White youth to build productive relationships with teachers who belong to different ethnic groups, they must be able to trust the teacher. For such trust to develop, students must “feel assured that they will not be viewed through the lens of a negative stereotype” and will be viewed as an individual (Spencer, 2006). Providing wise feedback, which involves accompanying criticism of a student’s work with the setting of high standards and assurance that the student can meet those standards, is one way these researchers have found that teachers can communicate their intentions toward students, build trust, and increase student motivation. In this study, pairs described their relationships in ways that indicated they had become significant people in one another’s lives. (Spencer, 2006). In some cases, the adult had to carry the load of the relationship during the early months as the adolescent cautiously waited to get to know the new mentor and determine how trustworthy this adult might prove to be. However, at some point, the adolescent in the relationships that deepened over time, began to reveal more of himself or herself and to engage more fully in shaping the developing relationship (Spencer, 2006). The mentors recognized and focused on their protégés’ strengths and actively sought out opportunities to encourage and nurture their potential (Spencer, 2006).

The purpose of Watson & Washington’s (2015) study is to document, describe, and explain the structure, implementation, and usefulness of the Umoja (Unity) Mentoring Project and the Spir-rhythms African drumming circle as a component and element of a community-based violence and juvenile delinquency intervention and prevention initiative. The initiative
provides culturally appropriate mentoring services to Middle and High school Black males ages 11-19 years old to prevent violence and juvenile delinquency (Watson & Washington, 2015). This article describes the community and school-based intervention and prevention program utilizing Washington’s et al. (Washington, Johnson, Jones, & Lang, 2007) pyramid mentoring model designed to foster the positive development, prevent violence, and to reduce contacts with the juvenile and criminal justice system. The Washington et al. (2007) pyramid mentoring model “promoting wellness” as defined by activities that positively impacted self-esteem, clarified values, improved positive behavior in educational settings, increased cultural knowledge of African cultural arts, traditions, history and geography, decreased contacts with the criminal justice system, and reduced violence. In the study, African drumming, was presented as an Afrocentric cultural arts tool to engage, establish rapport, and provide pyramid group mentoring experiences for 34 total (15 Middle/ 19 High school) Black male youth. The authors found that program participants indicated that the mentor relationships were helpful and instrumental in teaching them how to get along with other people and how to communicate their thoughts, feelings, and plans with others (Watson & Washington, 2015). All nineteen of the program participants agreed that they felt better equipped to make good decisions and stay out of trouble. All nineteen of the participants also agreed that they felt better prepared to make improvements in their lives (Watson & Washington, 2015). Interestingly, this study was one of only two studies explicitly acknowledging Black females and the critical and significant support roles they played in male mentoring programs. Though behind the scenes, the involved women supported with logistics, forming relationships with participants’ parents and families, procurement of resources, organizing activities, scheduling rooms and space, and administrative assistance.
To demonstrate an effectiveness of the Strong Teens Curriculum (STC) as a tool to create an outlet for Black adolescent males to reflect on and learn about their social and emotional skills and psychological wellness in a culturally responsive environment, White & Rayle (2007), through an ethnographic study, explored 12 weekly, hour-long small group sessions based on the STC. The STC (Merrell, Carrizales, and Feuerborn, 2004) is a competence-based, social-emotional classroom learning curriculum designed to promote the personal/social and emotional resilience, psychological wellness, and coping skills of all high school adolescents. The STC specifically targets “internalizing behaviors and emotional problems” such as depression, anxiety, social withdrawal, and somatic problems (Merrell et al., 2004). Within the small group sessions, attention was given to the unique Black male experience in adolescence and in schools. Based on several Black cultural values, historical figures were used as role models in helping to illustrate session concepts, and activities were modified to better connect group members with one another for social support in and outside of the school environment. A theme which emerged from White & Rayle’s (2007) study was the value of providing an outlet for Black adolescent males to reflect on and learn about their social and emotional skills and psychological wellness in a culturally responsive environment. In considering this, the STC-based, school-specific small group offered high school counselors an innovative and exciting group experience that supported, guided, and taught young Black male adolescents in a safe, racially/ethnically/culturally rich environment; a group through which members became strong teens.

After-school programs can play a pivotal role in reshaping the social and academic outcomes of young Black males. For after-school programs to occupy this critical position, meaningful research that engages these young men’s experience in the after-school context is
imperative (Woodland, 2008). In this review of the literature, Woodland (2008) highlights the importance of after-school programs for Black males and suggests that mentors who cultivate both consistent and trusting adult–child relationships and who can assist Black males in creating identities that highlight the relationship between urban Black male culture and academic achievement will have the greatest impact on the lives of young Black males (Woodland, 2008). Likewise, resources must be allotted to the after-school period to develop programs that meet the needs of young Black males and other vulnerable urban youth. Woodland also examined effective types of after-school programs and the core elements that drive the effectiveness of these programs are delineated (Woodland, 2008). First, Woodland suggests that many of the extracurricular activities model programs, such as the Boys and Girls Club, are effective because the programs use sports, arts, homework assistance, tutoring, and other broad-ranging activities to supplement the lives of participating youth (Woodland, 2008). Second, the mentoring model, which is most notably utilized by the Big Brothers/Big Sisters programs, has also proven effective because the model connects youth with adults or older mentors who provide the children with additional support and attention (Woodland, 2008). Finally, cultural rites of passage (Roper, 2011) programs have also led to successful social and academic outcomes for young Black males. These programs use culture-based interventions to supplement and support the transition of Black youth to adulthood (Woodland, 2008).

In the final study reviewed, Wyatt (2009) reported on the effectiveness of a 30-week, school based, Afrocentric male mentoring program called the Brotherhood, established by a professional school counselor in an urban high school. The Brotherhood meets weekly and promotes the goal of improving graduation rate of Black males within Chicago Public schools. At the time of this study, data from 307 total students, split into cohorts over a 4-year period was
collected. Through the use of a survey, the collection of GPA’s and state assessments, Wyatt examined the effectiveness of the Brotherhood program (Wyatt, 2009). GPA's of Brotherhood males were higher than comparison groups by as much as 60%, but on average, members of the group had a 16% better GPA than non-brotherhood males. Members and alumni reported an understanding and appreciation of the connection between themselves, their academics and the real world, the significance of interpersonal skills to respect self and others, and their need for help with decision making (Wyatt, 2009). Though the students involved in the mentoring program improved their academics, Wyatt (2009) also found that there is a need to provide continuous academic, personal/ social, and career development support to males through mentoring groups.

4.2 PRACTICES OF CARING MENTORING AGGREGATED INTO THEMES

Initially, the aim of my guiding questions was to understand what patterns emerge from the literature showcasing what caring mentors do for Black males. Specifically, I wanted to know what does care look like in practice? Earlier, I established the difference between caring “about” versus caring “for”, with the latter conveying the movement from belief to action (Gay, 2010). Initially, only the themes of emotional care and academic care emerged. However, as I continued to ask the question of what does the practice of care look like, other themes emerged from the literature. The six themes that emerged were: safety, emotional care, culture affirming care, social care, academic care and organizational care (see table 2). A seventh theme, anti-care,
emerged, however I used examples of this from the literature to build the argument in favor of care-based practices.
Table 2: Working Definition of Emergent Themes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Emotional Care</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caring for the overall emotional and psychological well-being, and teaching the Black male how to</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>understand and manage their own emotions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Academic Care</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caring for the overall academic well-being of the Black male, and serving as an active participant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in the academic advancement of the student</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Social Care</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Helping the Black male understand and navigate their immediate and broader societal contexts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Culture Affirming Care</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uplifting the Black male by encouraging an appreciation of manifested expressive behaviors, past</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and present of members of African and African-American ethnicities/culture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Safety</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creating an environment for the Black male student that allows him to feel safe to be his authentic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>self, and to explore new ways of living and thinking.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Organizational Care</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intentional forethought by the mentoring programs leadership to intentionally include care based</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>practices.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.2.1 Safety

A good mentoring relationship is only beneficial to the youth when a strong connection, founded in   |
mutuality, trust and empathy is developed, where ideas, beliefs and actions can be challenged;   |
comprehensive support is provided; and the mentee is being guided towards their dreams (Cohen &   |
Galbraith, 1995; DuBois & Rhodes, 2006). Jackson et al. (2014) utilized the metaphor “seed people”   |
in suggesting the most effective mentors to gardeners, arguing that their purpose is to cultivate   |
the academic, social and emotional success of the young men. Just as a seed cannot be properly   |
cultivated without good dirt, sun light, and protection from harm, so the young men cannot be truly   |
cultivated in poor conditions. Black adolescent males need an environment that allows them to trust   |
the mentor, grants them permission to be their authentic selves as well as the ability to explore   |
ew realities for the mentee. The intentional creation of a safe space must be a core element when   |
believe this space should represent the Kiswahili word *tumbo*, which is defined as a sacred catalytic space consisting of three essential qualities: safety, energy/power, and potential. The word *tumbo* literally translates into a mother’s womb (Washington, Caldwell, Watson, & Lindsey, 2017). In this study, setting the chairs up in a circle, with the mentors sitting in between the mentees, created an environment that fostered, supported, and promoted intimate group interaction on the visual, verbal, and emotional levels (Watson & Washington, 2015). It was in this safe space that the mentors helped mentees overcome their anxiety of drumming for the first time by sharing stories of the mentors’ first experience drumming, and connecting the importance of trying new and positive behaviors that may not be popular at school or in the community (Watson & Washington, 2015).

Throughout the literature, what I noticed was that great mentors deepened and reinforced the belief of a safe place by establishing the individual and collective mentoring relationships as familial. Whereas Biggs et al. (2014) suggest the relationship can evolve to resemble the relationship between an uncle and nephew, other researchers understand this familial relationship as a “significant other” who has the capacity to love, protect, guide and support youth (DuBois et al., 2011; Durlak, Weissberg, Dymnicki, Taylor, & Shellinger, 2011; Lauer et al., 2006).

Jackson et al. (2014) provide an excellent account of a mentor building safety by creating a familial relationship with and amongst the young men. Craig, the founder of UMOJA and mentor, was explicit in addressing the young men as his “little brothers” during family group sessions and conversation with his colleagues at both school sites (Jackson et al., 2014). Craig explicitly stated how much he loved the young men and saw them as little brothers whom he should protect. In the context of UMOJA, traditional classroom power dynamics of adult/carer/authority and student/cared for/subordinate were minimized, which in turn
empowered the mentees. The young men viewed their UMOJA family group sessions as a time to talk and write about how they were feeling, and what they were struggling with at school and home. The sessions became a safe space to seek advice about how to deal with a teacher they perceived to be racist or sexist, a problem at home or in their relationships with a female (Jackson et al., 2014). These conversations provided an opportunity for the participants to build and nurture friendships while gaining self-knowledge, a deeper sense of personal identity and increased self-esteem—all features of culturally responsive caring (Gay, 2010). The ability to feel safe in the mentoring space worked hand in hand with the mentees ability to express genuine emotion, free from the pressure to confirm to peer or social emotional standards.

4.2.2 Emotional care

A second theme that emerged was the concept of emotional care, or the ability of the mentor to care for the overall psychological well-being of the mentee. This practice of care includes the way you feel about yourself, and your ability to manage your feelings and deal with difficulties. In one example, Black mentees described situations in which they experienced varying emotions, how they processed those emotions and how they had learned and grown from both the comfortable and uncomfortable emotion. Through the caring conversation, the mentees realized these emotions had influenced their development as Black men in terms of identity, confidence, and their current and future goals (White & Rayle, 2007). Mentors in the White & Rayle study (2007) encouraged the Black male mentees to discuss what emotional situations they believed were specific to Black male adolescents in today’s schools and society and appropriate ways of handling such emotions. Furthermore, the mentors asked the students to identify Black male
figures in history (e.g., Martin Luther King, Jr., James Meredith) who had legitimate reasons to feel angry but expressed their emotions in positive ways and were successful in their lives (White & Rayle, 2007). The process of reflecting on personal emotions allowed the mentees to understand how their emotions had influenced their development as Black men in terms of identity, confidence, and their current and future goals (White & Rayle, 2007). This serves as one example of emotional care and the personal and communal benefits of such care. As made clear in the literature, the capacity to have these authentic conversations were built on safety and the mentee’s ability to trust that the mentor was authentic.

Miller, Jordan, Stiver, Walker, Surrey and Eldridge (1999) positioned authenticity as a quality of presence characterized by interpersonal responsiveness, which allows a relational partner to have access to one’s thoughts, feelings, and intentions. This involves offering engaging responses to the thoughts, feelings, and intentions of the other person (Miller et al., 1999). In Spencer’s (2006) study, authenticity, or engaging with a relational partner in a genuine way, was emphasized as important to the building of the relationship and considered by several of the youth to be critical to developing trust in their mentors. Demetrious, a 16-year-old Black male in Spencer’s study, noted the link he saw between his mentor’s authenticity and his own ability to develop trust and closeness in the relationship, “He had to be real with me, you know. I can’t get close to nobody without them being real with me, you know… And without you being real with me, you can’t be close with me …He brought it to me real, so I was like, okay” (Spencer, 2006).

What the mentee was speaking to was the concerted effort on the part of the mentors to show more of themselves and to be more open and genuine with their mentee (Spencer, 2006).
Bridging the concepts of family and authenticity, one mentor in Spencer’s study said, “I think of her [the mentee] as my little sister you know...I guess cause I let myself be vulnerable and you know, be emotional” (Spencer, 2006). The authenticity and realness of the mentor allowed the mentee to trust and build a stronger relationship with their mentor. When the Black male mentee sees themselves as family, they described feeling like they mattered to their mentor in a way that they experienced as psychologically nurturing and sustaining (Spencer, 2006). When the mentee feels safe and cared for as a family member, and recognizes the authenticity of the mentor, the adolescent Black male begins to reciprocate the relationship in a deep manner by expressing, their often-silenced emotions.

4.2.2.1 Giving Voice

Noddings (2005) suggest that dialog is the means through which we learn what the other wants and need. The most basic strategy of incorporating dialog and attention is informal conversation to share personal anecdotes, interests, and events (Bondy, Ross, Gallingane, & Hambacher, 2007; Dunn, 2010). During these conversations, mentors strive to learn students’ backgrounds and interests (Garrison-Wade & Lewis, 2006) by encouraging them to talk about their hobbies; favorite websites, music, or movies; community events; and local restaurants and businesses their family frequents (Gay, 2002). When dialoging with students in an urban context, a strategy to consider is to learn students’ cultural behaviors, jargons, and conversational styles and interweave them into discussions and instruction (Bondy et al., 2007; Bonner, 2009; Sharan, 2010). As I discussed earlier, genuine dialog may be less likely to happen if a relationship is not first established. Engaging in small talk without making conscious efforts to learn anything about the mentee’s interests, life, or culture may prevent building a meaningful relationship (Gay,
2010). Truly, these gathered bits of information are little more than “token acknowledgement that one ‘cares about’ the other” (Shevalier & McKenzie, 2012). Once a relationship has been built however, the mentees are free to experience the power of their own voice.

When mentors as significant others can assist an adolescent’s social-emotional development by closely listening and observing, researchers suggest this process allows the mentor to simultaneously respect their mentee and while also learning about them (Biggs et al., 2014). Often, mentees who feel listened to are more likely share their feelings with each other without feeling emasculated (Biggs et al, 2014). One mentee stated, “I feel like when I talk these people listen and they give me good advice . . . I just feel like we trust each other, you know" (Jackson et al, 2014). The vulnerability that participants displayed fostered a deep level of intra- and interpersonal respect. Although the process of sharing personal information and feelings with others was initially uncomfortable, after a few weeks together, the young men recognized that they could create a space for genuine mutual caring and trusting relationships (Jackson et al., 2014).

Another example of effective listening as a tool to foster voice in the mentee was found in Grant and Dieker’s (2011) study. By the mentor listening to his mentee’s voice from the mentoring sessions, the mentee revealed his frustration with his school environment with particular regard to his peers (Grant & Dieker, 2011). Again, the illuminating of the mentee’s frustrations was not by mere chance, but rather because of very intentional caring on the part of the mentor. In this situation, the mentee, Zobee, demonstrated that when his need for a safe school environment is satisfied, he is not only capable, but has a desire to perform better academically (Grant & Dieker, 2011). For Zobee, the mentoring process appeared to give him a voice to appropriately share and vent, thus decreasing the build-up of pressure that can further
impair his ability to connect with thoughts, feelings, and needs, and subsequently lead to an explosive outburst (Grant & Dieker, 2011). I think about the students who do not have a caring adult in their lives who can decipher the meaning hidden between the words of their Black male student. More broadly, because of Zobee’s voice being heard by the mentor, and the pair being able to process through Zobee’s emotions, the mentee also recognized how his inability to manage his emotions interfered with his ability to succeed in school and life in general (Grant & Dieker, 2011). What can be assumed from this example is that often, adolescent Black males may have a desire to be academically successful but have never been given the mental space or necessary tools to comprehend using their own voice to break through emotional barriers potentially clouding their mind.

It must then become a responsibility of the mentor to identify creative ways for the mentee to vent, including externally voicing their problems and ideas. As was made evident in Hall’s (2015) study, that expression of voice does not only have to be verbal, but can be through creative means such as writing poetry, spoken word pieces, sketching, painting or photography. Hall found that providing space for the mentee to express their emotions also supported them in becoming more intimately connected to their own values, beliefs, and needs as well as to the mentor (Hall, 2015). The process of venting allows for repressed thoughts or sensitive emotions to come to the light. As one mentee in Hall’s (2015) study shared:

It was hard for me to open up at first ‘cause, you know, it’s kind of risky for brothers to be doing that. We just can’t. I mean, you know, I’ll talk to my girlfriend about stuff, but that’s about it ... That day we all talked about how to get through school and teachers, at first I just felt like I was the only one thinking, “I hate that teacher! Why she trying to fail
me?” But, you know, after hearing what everybody in the group was saying, I like realized I wasn’t alone.

When the mentee voices their emotion, a reciprocal space of authenticity is created where caring peers and adults accepts each other for who they are; no one is ridiculed, and everyone’s genuine thoughts and emotions are welcome (Hall, 2015). It is in this safe, authentic space that the student’s voice is not only an act of emotional care, but also a tool to help adolescent Black males build better lives for themselves in a culture that has institutionally silenced them (Hall, 2015). As one mentee profoundly suggested, “When you use your voice, you’re able to speak, you’re giving knowledge and letting people know everything and anything that’s on your mind. You have the power to inform people of what you want, of what you think they should know” (Hall, 2015). As was demonstrated in several examples, caring for the Black adolescent’s emotional well-being created space to address behavioral patterns among Black males that interfere with their learning and the pursuit of their academic, personal/social, and professional goals, because emotional and psychological needs were met (White & Rayle, 2007). However, what is truly beautiful is when the mentee is cared for by an adult to the point where they feel deeply known and seen (Spencer, 2006). Creating a safe space, treating the young men as a member of the immediate family, being authentic and providing the agency for the young men to give voice to emotions resting below the surface appeared to be foundational for building an effective relationship. These very intentional practices also give space for other forms of care to be present.
4.2.3 Culture affirming care

Black adolescent males have been oppressed and silenced in educational settings for a long time (Fashola, 2003). In several studies in this review, once the mentor created an environment where the mentee felt safe and could give voice to their emotions, the mentor would begin building up the mentee in multiple areas including culturally affirming, socially and academically.

Culture has been defined as “the integrated pattern of human behaviors that includes thoughts, communication, action, customs, beliefs, values and instructions of a racial, ethnic, religious, or social group” (Leighton, 1982). Gay (2010) suggest that culture is multidimensional, always changing, and is influenced by a wide variety of factors including time, setting, age, economics and social circumstances. Whether conscious or not, members of ethnic groups share cultural characteristics (Shade, Kelly, & Oberg, 1997) most likely found in a sample of an ethnic population. According to Gay (2010, p.11) these core characteristics of ethnic group cultures are manifested in expressive behaviors (e.g., thinking, talking, writing, performing, etc) and are influenced by different variables such as gender, education and social class.

At times, cultural differences contribute to cultural conflict, particularly when the dominant cultural group imposes a universal rule that postulates its way of thinking, behaving, and responding to the world as the superior or better way (Patton & Day-Vines, 2004). A few examples of this included the endorsement of competition, a focus on individualism, immediate family being a primary system of support, and religion as separate from other aspects of life. A Black American cultural orientation promotes collectivism, extended family network, and religion as integral to other aspects of life (Day-Vines & Day-Hairston, 2005). To offset the impact of these cultural conflicts to Black students several researchers believe it is imperative
that mentoring programs geared towards Black males be Afrocentric or at minimum, rooted in fostering understanding of culture and historical roots to encourage pro social behavior and nurture a sense of connectedness with others (Gordon et al., 2009; Kafele, 2009; Mitchell & Stewart, 2012). This intentionality around investing in the expressive behaviors of the mentees ethnic group culture serves as the premise for theme culture affirming care. Afrocentric based mentoring has a focus on collectivism and incorporating the community. As such, intentionally interacting with the community nurtures a sense of care evident in feelings of connectedness (Gordon et al., 2009).

To build a sense of connectedness, several researchers pointed to specific ways in which the mentors united with the community of their mentees. In Bailey’s (2003) study, connecting with the young men’s community ranged from providing breakfast for members before Saturday morning tutoring, to hosting the Mothers Night Out dinner event, to honor the "mothers or mother figures" of PGOTM participants. Other non-social engagements included monthly parent meetings to review topics chosen by the parents such as “Understanding and Using the School's Counseling Program,” “Forms and Scores: Understanding PSAT, SAT, Financial Aid, and College Applications,” and "Recognizing Developmental Assets in your Community" (Bailey & Paisley, 2004). Other mentoring programs strongly encouraged the mentors to contact the mentee’s parents verbally or in writing once a month to communicate one positive behavior demonstrated by the mentee (Holt et al., 2008).

The literature suggests that the more parents and primary caretakers were involved, the more likely the students were to believe that involvement in the program was important and relevant (Fashola, 2003). Additionally, meaningfully and creatively involving parents and neighborhood adults strengthened community investment in the program (Ladson-Billings &
Tate, 1995; Woodland, 2008). In short, when parents and community members feel more involved in the program, they are more supportive, more likely to encourage their children to attend, and more likely to maintain better relationships with program staff (Gonzalez-DeHass, Willems, & Holbein, 2005; Woodland, 2008). Consequently, the mentee is more likely to see the assets of their own culture and are given a framework on which to understand the need for collective responsibility.

4.2.3.1 Collective responsibility

Using culturally responsive caring as a lens, another fundamental aspect of culture affirming care can be characterized as a collective responsibility for all individuals involved (Jackson et al., 2014) with an emphasis on a sense of togetherness and connectedness. The literature suggested caring mentors helped the mentee understand that they are responsible for looking out for each other because we are all a part of the same village. Craig, UMOJA’s founder stated, “One thing I realized about having little brothers, you don’t let people abuse them. You don’t let people do anything to them that’s going to cause them all harm” (Jackson et al., 2014). Craig not only practiced this with the young men, but expected it to be practiced by the young men. Another example mentees were expected to care for the collective was through the responsibility of more senior mentees serving as tutors for new mentees (Bailey & Paisley, 2004). In the group UMOJA, Craig repeatedly reminded the group, “there are no excuses for any of you failing. Geno, if you and Johnny are in the same class and you’re passing, then he shouldn’t be failing. Remember fellas, you are your brother’s keeper” (Jackson et al., 2014). This type of repetitive conversation strengthened their communal bond and supports the development of agency to identify means in which to care and then express care for their brothers in the program. In
another study, mentors initiated an activity in which members thanked another member for something that was learned or something that they found valuable in their interactions together as a tool to foster care (White & Rayle, 2007).

As an added benefit, the sense of connectedness that was formed in UMOJA helped the participants increase their feeling of inclusion in the school site, because the young men strengthened and encouraged each other in classes (Jackson et al., 2014). Craig emphasized their duty to “look out for one another in school and on the streets” as a way to show love for their brothers (Jackson et al., 2014). One UMOJA mentee vocalized how learning how to connect equates to social and cultural capital, “I am realizing that it’s not just about me anymore, and even about us. It’s bigger—it’s my family, my ‘hood, my connection to others in this world. I wanna be that one who makes a positive difference” (Jackson et al., 2014).

Finally, the inclusion of Black History both in America and abroad is crucial when caring for Black adolescent males culturally. White and Rayle (2007) posited that knowledge of Black history remains important to understand these young men’s particular cultural experiences and how those experiences have changed over the years due to sociopolitical movements such as the American Civil Rights Movement. In this study, White and Rayle (2007) found that insight into the current school experiences of Black adolescents was helpful in recognizing how discrimination, prejudice, and social injustice continue to persist despite some progress. In one assignment, students brought in songs they identified as representative of their culture, that also represented some examples of both comfortable and uncomfortable emotions (White & Rayle, 2007). White and Rayle (2007) suggest that group interactions like this foster identity and cultural development.
When mentors are able to foster care for their mentees culturally, the students feel a sense of connection to their peers, their community and understand a rich history of great thinkers and doers that the student themselves are connected to. When the students are cared for in this way, the literature suggests young Black men are then able to move into the space of social consciousness. An example of this was found when the issue of Black male stereotyping kept coming up in the group mentoring sessions. As a result, the mentors empowered the mentees to take the initiative to prepare and execute a community forum. This process allowed the young men to move into the space of change agent and activist, and is a true example of the kind of socio-cultural engagement (Hall, 2015) that may help mentors practically understand the next emergent theme.

4.2.4 Social care

Because culturally responsive theory is centered in students’ cultures, it provides an active process for students to seek out information about what is happening in the communities around them. This guides the students to better understandings of and better solutions for the inequities encountered in their communities (Irvine, 2002). Caring mentors may help their mentees understand the plurality of navigating the world around them including their schools and communities, as well as the broader systems they must learn to navigate as Black males. As adolescent males become empathetic to structural inequalities, including disparities in political and economic power, they realize that these challenges inhibit diverse students from succeeding (Ladson-Billings, 2009). With the acquisition of cultural and social knowledge by the mentee, Gay (2002) suggests that “knowledge has moral and political elements and consequences, which
obligate them to take social action to promote freedom, equality and justice for everyone”. This becomes a new opportunity to care for the mentee in what I define as social care. By helping the mentee think about the social and political challenges that societies, communities, and they as individuals face and proactively act upon these challenges (Cochran-Smith, 2004), mentors can help create opportunities for students to critique, challenge, and transform examples of injustice or inequity in their daily lives and communities (Ladson-Billings, 2001). Caring for the mentee’s social well-being nurtures a sense of agency and action in the students. Minimally, this may provide the student with tools to navigate their society, but, according to Gay (2002) could very well translate into the will and drive to desire to foster social change.

When combing through the literature, several studies spoke to the value of preparing Black adolescent males with tools to navigate some of the day to day social challenges they may be confronted with. In one study, the mentors were intentional on addressing issues such as: how to appropriately identify and respond to prejudice/racism from teachers, administrators, counselors, or community members; how to combat peer pressure; and how to adjust to being the only African-American male in upper level classes (Bailey, 2003). Dickerson and Agosto (2015) highlighted how role-play was used to address responses to social issues and practice new ways of addressing that issue. Doing this allowed the group to hold each other accountable for better behavior, but more importantly outline the practical benefits of effective expression, types of communication, and differences in the types of communication used with different types of people (Dickerson & Agosto, 2015). From a day to day perspective, it was also important for mentors’ social care to include interactions with individuals and experiences from other cultures as means to promote healthy identity development and successful social interactions (Bailey, 2003). In one example, the mentors devoted the first three activities (field trips, college
visitations, and special event opportunities) to broaden members’ world view by exposing them to places, people, and situations different from their normal experience (Bailey & Paisley, 2004). Mentors used group meetings and journaling to promote social development through diversity training, leadership development, resume writing and interviewing as well as the enhancement of self-efficacy through personal and business etiquette training, and opportunities to give back to the community (Bailey & Paisley, 2004; Wyatt, 2009). In both group and paired mentoring sessions, mentors practiced important and relevant behavior with the mentee, such as having the mentee rehearse speaking to a teacher or parent, organizing a notebook together, or doing homework together (Holt et al., 2008).

More specifically, caring mentors in the literature believed the mentees should be able to understand at a base level the role people, systems, and structures play in perpetuating the social injustices that they as Black men, encounter regularly because it better connects their lived experiences and society (Hall, 2015). So, for example, mentees constructed analogies between problems outside of school (poverty, joblessness and mass incarceration) to problems inside the schools (high suspensions, dropout rates, transfer into special education). The mentee’s were then able to better understand their relationship between the problems identified and how people, systems and structures perpetuated these constructs (Hall, 2015). Caring enough for the mentee to empower them through sharing of social capital reinforces that mentees should not passively accept social injustices, but rather, with confidence understand that they are active participants in scripting their lived social experience. Caring mentors reinforce the mentee’s voice as having value not just locally in their school and neighborhood, but more broadly. One Black male adolescent explained his experience being cared for socially, stating, “We sitting around, we sharing what we know or think we know about the world ... It was cool ‘cause everybody was on
like an equal plane, even the mentors. And, that’s different ‘cause my teachers always telling me what to do and what to think” (Hall, 2015).

In several cases, as the mentees grew in knowledge, and were taught how to use their voice, the young men began experimenting with ways to reintroduce themselves to their communities as men with a social agenda. In one instance, the culminating activity for a mentoring program allowed the mentors to display newly learned African drumming skills, receive awards and speak about how the program has inspired social activism in front of parents, city officials, program funders and members of the community (Watson & Washington, 2015). In another study, the mentees felt so inspired to act toward positive social action that they created a campaign against the use of the “N” word (a term often used in urban youth culture in music and conversation) in their school community (Sealey-Ruiz & Greene, 2011). Again, this truly significant act was made possible by the mentors first creating a safe, authentic space where they were given agency to use their own voice, understand the strengths of their own culture and provided tools to navigate the society in which they were apart. Because of the care of the mentors, having deliberate conversations with the group, the inspired young men invited other students across racial, ethnic and gender lines to have a social conversation in an academic environment. The young men, empowered to understand their academic environment and engage in discourse around it, I believe, may represent a hierarchy of culturally responsive care by the mentors that emerged from the literature which can be represented as follows:

Safety ➔ Emotional Care ➔ Culture Affirming Care ➔ Social Care ➔
4.2.5 Academic care

In many of the studies reviewed, the primary goals were social support and academic support, with hopes of improving the academic performance of arguably the country’s most vulnerable academic population in adolescent Black males. As such, the easiest theme to identify from the literature were examples of mentors caring for their mentee’s academic abilities, or academic care. It was clear, however, that without intentional efforts on the part of the mentor to care for the mentee academically, merely having concern for the mentee’s academic development (or caring about) was insufficient to move the needle. For Black adolescent males to feel better and subsequently, perform better academically, academic success needed to be a goal of the mentor (Hall, 2006; Jackson et al., 2014; Sealey-Ruiz & Greene, 2011; Wyatt, 2009).

First, mentors in the literature set the expectation of academic excellence, but then gave very specific tools on how to be excellent academically. For academic growth, mentors in several studies review a combination of "how to" and "need to know" areas of study with the young men. Examples of “how to” topics to enhance academic excellence include: (a) evaluating and understanding their learning styles as students, (b) evaluating and adapting to the teaching styles of different teachers, (c) methods to study and review different subjects like math, foreign language, science, and history, (d) writing tips, (e) vocabulary recommendations, (f) PSAT and SAT review, (g) critical questioning (h) communication skills inside and outside of the classroom and (i) promote reading curiosity (Bailey, 2003; Biggs et al., 2014; Wyatt, 2009). Examples of “Need to know” topics include: (a) who and what are other academic enrichment resources, (b) the study of African, African-American, and family histories, as discussed earlier in this review, (c) and health-related issues that could keep the mentee from performing at their
best (Bailey, 2003; Biggs et al., 2014). Additionally, mentors took mentees on trips to the libraries, bookstores, museums, college tours and other cultural venues broaden young adolescents’ view of the world and provide opportunities for cognitive growth and development (Bailey, 2003; Biggs et al., 2014).

Once tools were shared with the mentees to achieve academic success, mentors in the literature then provided opportunities for the young men to practice their skills in safety of the mentoring environment and then in the classroom. With the PGOTM program, a series of regular activities were held including regular homework assistance and tutoring, Saturday learning institutes where supplemental tutoring and intense exam preparation were the focus, and semester exam lock-ins where the mentees participated in 12-14 two-hour study sessions over the course of the weekend prior to the end of the semester (Bailey, 2003).

One difference between mentors who “care for” their mentees academically and mentors who merely “care about” is the mentors who care for, follow up to ensure the student is moving towards success. Through weekly check-ins with the mentees (Wyatt, 2009) and closely following the mentees attendance record, discipline referrals and report cards (Holt et al., 2008), mentors were able to keep the goal of academic success on the forefront as a goal, evaluate progress and identify strategies in real time to address challenges that arise such as peer tutoring (Wyatt, 2009). In one study, the mentors took their academic care to a higher level by calling and meeting with their mentees’ teachers about their in-class performance and identifying ways to strengthen their academic performance (Spencer, 2006). Repeatedly, the literature highlighted mentors who not only shared the students’ longing for greater academic proficiency, but were willing to put in long hours, standing alongside their mentee, to actualize academic growth. In
many the studies reviewed, the investment of the mentors and the reciprocated hard work of the mentee was rewarded with improved grades for members of the mentoring group.

4.2.6 Organizational care

After the first review of the literature the themes of safety, emotional care, culture affirming care, social care and academic care had emerged. As I began coding the information however, a final theme began to emerge. If the goal of the mentoring program is to truly address the personal, social, cultural, academic, and institutional factors that lead Black adolescent males into categories such as “troublemaker” or “academically under achieving,” the decision to care for the students must be thoughtful, deliberate and intimately connected to the core values of the mentoring programs (Bailey, 2003; Fashola, 2003; Hall, 2015). This intentionality should translate into specific actions for the organization and expectations of the mentors.

Organizationally, the mentoring program should define clear goals with the success and achievement of Black adolescent males in mind, as well as seek to understand why the challenges exist for Black males in the first place (Fashola, 2003; Woodland, 2008). For example, BEMI established a primary goal of impacting the intellectual, spiritual, physical, and social needs of the students served through role modeling and mentoring (Gordon et al., 2009). While many general mentoring best practices may be applicable to serving Black male students, to support a specific population, it’s important to understand the needs and wants of the population being served (Fashola, 2003). To gather information about the students being served and to provide accountability for meeting the desired goals of the mentoring organization,
Fashola (2003) suggests identifying an advisory committee with a goal to push the mentoring organization to better serve the students social and academic needs.

To be proactive in the consideration of how the mentoring program will serve the Black male students with optimal results, researchers in this review suggest staff training, structured programs, flexibility within the program, positive environments, continuous evaluation of the program toward program goals, and a clear understanding of program goals (Fashola, 2003; Woodland, 2008). In a broader review of the literature on mentoring, researchers found that programs that had ongoing training for mentors, established clear expectations regarding frequency of contact and relationship duration and systematically monitored mentor-mentee activities resulted higher quality relationships and demonstrated a greater impact than those who did not specify such requirements (Garvey & Alred, 2000; Herrera, Sipe, McClanahan, Arbreton, & Pepper, 2000). A similar theme was consistent in this review of the literature as it was understood that well-trained staff tend to be more flexible, show greater facility with the youth, and are able to be authoritative without being punitive or harsh (Woodland, 2008). Mentoring programs practicing organizational care were methodical with implementing a specific number of professional development hours at the beginning of the program, providing ongoing professional development for the duration of the mentor’s tenure and thorough evaluation of the all aspects of the program for evidence of effectiveness (Fashola, 2003; Gordon et al., 2009). Conversely, when mentors did not receive adequate support from their agency, the impact of their work appeared to be reduced (Spencer, 2007). In addition to training the mentors, programs committed to caring for their mentees organizationally suggested maintaining constant interaction between all stakeholders (participants, parents, school personnel, and program staff).
and being willing to offer training on how to support the young men in their growth (Bailey, 2003; Holt et al., 2008; Spencer, 2006).

Next, the program’s curriculum and daily structure should be well planned and consider the individual experiences and abilities of the youth in the program but not be so rigid as not to allow for participants to guide the lesson to meet their own unique needs (Woodland, 2008). When programs lack structure, Woodland (2008) suggests they may in turn, have poor curriculum content, and mentors on staff who are unprepared and may fail to meet the needs of young Black males. The curriculum, structure of the program and the practice of the mentors should be regularly evaluated for effectiveness (Fashola, 2003; Woodland, 2008). This process allows mentoring programs to understand their specific needs, identify which methods are most efficacious as well as pinpoint ineffective practices so that resources can be put towards improving the development of the students.

Finally, the organization must hold certain expectations of its mentors to achieve the desired result. Broadly, the mentor must be expected to believe wholeheartedly in their mentee, and become a “student of the student” (Bailey, 2003; Fashola, 2003; Gay, 2010; Hall, 2015). Belief in student means that the mentor believes that their mentees are capable of learning, and are worthy of love, nurturing, guidance, support and meaningful opportunities (Bailey, 2003). Acting as a student of the student means caring about the conditions that impact the students’ academic, social and emotional life, and seeking to understand the individual feelings of the Black adolescent male and factors that foster feelings of failure, isolation, and anxiety then seek to create situations that will change the dynamics for the student (Fashola, 2003).
The purpose of this systematic literature review was to identify themes that emerged through a review of studies on the mentoring of Black males and to categorize specific practices of the mentors within those themes. I structured this study on the framework of culturally responsive caring. What I found was the practices fell into four seemingly progressive themes (safety, emotional care, culture affirming care and social care) that worked harmoniously for mentors to effectively support a fifth theme (academic care). For maximum impact in the life of the Black male, these themes must be predicated in the sixth emergent theme of organizational care (see figure 2).

Figure 2 Framework of Emergent Themes
I’ve deduced several profound revelations because of this study. First, the notion of intentionally and authentically caring deeply for Black male mentees and not merely caring about them must be an organizational commitment. Caring for the mentees suggests an active process that does not stop at insisting that students achieve, but instead, being willing to work tirelessly to create the conditions necessary for student success, including showing them how to succeed (Bondy & Ross, 2005; Bondy et al., 2007; Howard, 2001; Ware, 2006). A mentor committed to caring for their mentee should listen and observe, challenge negative personal views, plan collaboratively, advise against risky behaviors, and model actions and attitudes that can potentially positively impact the youths’ lives, just as a family member would do (Biggs et al., 2014). In fact, it is suggested that a strong relationship with the student is vital to the success in and outside of the classroom (Milner, 2013b). A good mentor takes advantages of opportunity anchors to close distance between them and begin building and scaffolding a progressively strong relationship (Milner, 2013b). A strong relationship is built on persistence, learning from the student, understanding and acknowledging who the student is fully, authentically sharing who the mentor is and identifying points of convergence, and empowering the student to share their personal narratives (Milner, 2013b). When this happens, the literature suggests that the student is more willing to grant the mentor permission entry into their world, and thus be willing to learn and grow with the mentor (Milner, 2013b).

It is up to the supporting mentoring organization to provide the mentor with a rubric or list of practices for the mentor to follow on a regular basis that exemplify care. For example, when building rapport with the mentee, the mentoring organization may teach the mentor how to first create a safe/trusting environment for mentee by establishing confidentiality (apart from the mentee being in danger or a serious threat to harm others) as house rule. The mentoring
organization may teach the mentor how to drive initial conversations, but follow up by teaching the mentor to become strong listeners to allow for emotions to be processed. It is the mentoring program’s responsibility to have the expectation that the mentors will be students of their mentees and actively seek to learn about their interest, their culture, their community, their dreams and aspirations. If the mentor does not have these skills, the mentoring organization cannot passively hope the mentor will acquire the ability to care for their mentee on their own. As evident in Figure 3, the mentoring programs reviewed often provided examples of care from multiple themes, stressing the importance for mentoring programs to be intentional in this work.

Once care is established as a commitment by the mentoring program, next, it appeared the literature covertly suggested a hierarchal order in which the emergent themes must be practiced. The theme of safety appeared to serve as a prerequisite in the mentor/mentee relationship for which the other themes could be practiced effectively. In many cases, before the mentee would feel comfortable sharing their emotions or before they would embrace academic support, the student needed to feel safe and able to trust the authenticity of the mentor as they might a member of their own family. Because of the trust established, the mentor can empower the student to give voice to emotions which may have been buried by society. As the mentee begins to understand their areas of pain, the mentor builds up the student by helping the mentee connect with a vibrant history and culture and reinforces cultural value by engaging the community.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Afro Centric</th>
<th>Safety</th>
<th>Emotional Care</th>
<th>Cultural Care</th>
<th>Social Care</th>
<th>Academic Care</th>
<th>Org Care</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Biggs, Musewe &amp; Harvey (2014)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dickerson &amp; Agosto (2015)</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fashola (2003)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gordon, Iwamoto, Ward, Potts and Boyd (2009)</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grant and Dieker (2011)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hall (2015)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Holt, Bry and Johnson (2008)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hurd, Varner and Rowley (2013)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jackson, Sealey-Ruiz &amp; Watson (2014)</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sealey-Ruiz &amp; Greene (2011)</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spencer (2006)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White &amp; Rayle (2007)</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Woodland (2008)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wyatt (2009)</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 3 What themes were identified within the study
Feeling empowered by heritage, the Black adolescent male is encouraged to ask questions about how and why social injustices are replicated in the lives of the mentee and their friends. The mentors help the mentee navigate day to day issues while also teaching them how to confront social injustices using their own thoughts and voice. As the adolescent transitions through several stages of mental and emotional development, space is provided for the mentor to equip the mentee with tools to excel academically. By this point, the mentee trusts the mentor wholeheartedly believes in their ability, is secure in the reality that the mentor would not lead them astray and is open to more intensive academic support.

Finally, I believe the literature is suggesting that mentors and educators should not merely mentor to fix, but rather mentor to care. In doing the research, I found that in many instances mentoring programs are reactive interventions. Schools are often looking for a simple, almost cookie-cutter, solution to addressing behavioral and academic challenges they experience with their Black male students. They settle on mentoring because it is cost effective, gives the school a feel-good talking point, and may produce positive results. This line of thinking is problematic for two reasons. First, Black adolescent males are complex, so one could deduce there is not one simple solution for engaging and serving this population. Second, the focus on fixing creates a narrow lens through which to “know” the Black male. Milner (Milner, 2013b), suggests the use of grades and test scores as explanations for academic opportunities can force educator to focus on groups of students rather than “inequitable, racist, and sexist structures, systems, contexts, policies, and practices that lead to perceived achievement gaps”. By caring for the Black male and every aspect of his life, and not solely his academic or social performance, the literature suggests margin, or space, is created for the mentees potential in multiple areas to be recognized.
While the research clearly supports the use of school base mentoring programs for Black males, it is important to account for how each mentoring program will be affected by school culture, geographic region, funding and initiatives at the school, district or state level that exists to support students (Jackson et al., 2014). According to researchers, even willing and well-intentioned mentors can run the risk of having a negative impact on the mentee if they are not grounded in culturally responsive care and provided proper training (Garvey & Alred, 2000; Jackson et al., 2014; Lakind, Eddy, & Zell, 2014). In the next section, I discuss recommendations for mentoring programs serving Black adolescent males.

5.1 RECOMMENDATIONS

Because of the findings which emerged after a review of the literature, I am prepared to make several recommendations to mentors, mentoring organizations serving Black adolescent male development, and researchers interested in this topic. These recommendations are designed to support and improve the practice of mentors of Black adolescent males and to support the field by identifying tools to protect Black adolescents from the negative impact of school-based racial discrimination (Butler-Barnes, Chavous, Hurd, & Varner, 2013).

I do not believe care in and of itself is a silver bullet with the ability to magically transform the lives of Black adolescent males, or that these recommendations will be applicable to all mentoring relationship involving Black adolescent males. I do believe however, that incorporating culturally responsive care as a tool for developing mentors may have deep and life-influencing impact on the young men. As such, I am recommending care be used as a tool to
develop both the thinking and practice of adults who serve Black adolescent males. I believe teaching adults how to care for and not merely about creates margin to begin building a stronger relationship with the mentee and allow for tools to be shared with the mentee to assist their holistic development.

On more than one occasion, when speaking about my research interest, I have had non-Black adults express concern that most of the studies I looked reviewed chronicled Black mentors mentoring the Black males. In each of these conversations, my colleagues asked if they as a non-Black person could be effective as a mentor to a Black adolescent male, and my response was a resounding yes, if they are willing to put in the work to care for their mentee. While I did not review very many examples of this happening, I did review one study and have seen personally that it is possible for non-Black mentors to care for their mentee across the themes of safety, emotional care, culture affirming care, social care and academic care. This however, means learning about the student’s culture, norms, values and mores and not holding the Black adolescent male to the standard of another race. It means, being committed to care in the good times and when the student cusses you out. My primary recommendation is for mentors and mentoring organizations to support their practice by studying and applying the themes of culturally responsive care and committing to caring for their mentee.

Below is a list of recommendations that have been suggested by various researchers. Though many more recommendations have been made when considering the mentoring of Black males, these recommendations all support a care-based approach of engagement. Additionally, the recommendations have been paired with the themes that have emerged from this review.
### Table 3 Recommendations from the Literature

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Functional Profile of Culturally Responsive Caring in Action</th>
<th>Care based theme</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Providing spaces and relationships where ethnically diverse students feel recognized, respected, valued, seen, and heard</td>
<td>Safety; Emotional Care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fostering warmth, intimacy, unity, continuity, safety, and security</td>
<td>Safety; Emotional Care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowing culturally diverse students thoroughly personally and academically</td>
<td>Emotional, Cultural, Academic care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultivating a sense of kindredness and reciprocal responsibility among culturally diverse students</td>
<td>Safety, Culture affirming care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Being academic, social, and personal confidantes, and advocates, resources, and facilitators for culturally diverse students</td>
<td>Academic, Social, Emotional care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acquiring knowledge of and accepting responsibility for culturally diverse students that go beyond the school day and its</td>
<td>Safety; Emotional care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>organizational parameters</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Helping students of color develop a critical consciousness of who they are, their values and beliefs,</td>
<td>Culture affirming care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>as well as being receptive to new ideas and information</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enabling ethnically and culturally diverse students to be open and flexible in expressing their thoughts, feelings, and</td>
<td>Emotional care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>emotions, as well as being receptive to new ideas and information</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Being academically demanding but personally supportive and encouraging</td>
<td>Academic care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledging social, cultural, ethnic, racial, linguistic, and individual differences among students without pejorative</td>
<td>Safety</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>judgments</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dealing directly and bluntly with the vicissitudes of racism, and the unequal distribution of power and privilege among</td>
<td>Social care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>diverse groups; preparing students to understand and deal realistically with social realities (what is), along with</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>possibilities for transformation (what can be)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teaching ethnic, racial, and cultural knowledge, identity, and pride</td>
<td>Culture affirming care</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 3. Recommendations from the Literature continued

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Functional Profile of Culturally Responsive Caring in Action</th>
<th>Care based theme</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Building confidence, courage, courtesy, compassion and</td>
<td>Social care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>competence among students from different ethnicities and</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cultural communities</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communicate a culture of success by helping students</td>
<td>Academic care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>understand mistakes are a part of the process, but that you</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>expect the best from the student</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Though frustrated by student behavior, they accept problems</td>
<td>Safety</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>as normal, and they believe in students' ability to improve</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Although speaking firmly is sometimes necessary, the mentors</td>
<td>Safety</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tone should remain matter-of-fact; they should never threat</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>en, demean, or create power struggles</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Programs should be active in exploring with and understanding</td>
<td>Culture affirming care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>from the perspective of Black young men, how they view their</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ethnic/ cultural heritage impacting their developing academic</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>identity</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>From a cultural perspective, mentoring interventions need to</td>
<td>Culture affirming care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>consider and develop strategies that foster a sense of pride</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in Black young men, their culture and the collective unity they</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>experience</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Create school context that extends to the families of the young men</td>
<td>Culture affirming care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Allow all students to explore their interests in the context</td>
<td>Academic, Social care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>of a classroom setting</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Value the communities, cultures, and families of students in</td>
<td>Culture affirming care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>meaningful ways</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Listen to students and become conversant in what interests</td>
<td>Safety, Emotional care</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5.2 IMPLICATIONS

The implications of this systematic literature review may not only resonate with me personally but may also with a broader community of mentors, researchers and other adults with an interest in serving Black adolescent males. There is a dearth of systematic literature reviews that exist supporting mentoring of Black males and yet there is a clear need from the academy to critique the practice of mentors and provide tools to enhance the work of its practitioners. This review of the literature contributes to the field by using culturally responsive care as a frame to identifying themes which mentoring programs serving Black males may use as tools to improve the practice of its mentors, consequently supporting a comprehensive development of the mentee. If culturally responsive care is not present however, mentoring could be less effective, particularly when working with high-risk kids (Biggs et al., 2014; Jackson et al., 2014; Lakind et al., 2014). An area in which I am still struggling as a researcher is clearly defining culture affirming care and how to speak to the value of uplifting and investing in the heritage and cultural components of Black adolescent males, while not unintentionally claiming very narrow Black cultural experiences.

The most immediate implications impact my personal philosophies and practice. As I mentioned earlier in this document, my mentoring practices have improved over time as a direct result of knowledge acquired on Black adolescent males and a willingness to grow in my practice. My findings identified several themes of care, of which I was challenged most by safety, emotional and organizational care. I have unintentionally created safe spaces for my mentees, but I now am prompted to intentionally create that space when I meet young men who may become my mentees. I’m much more honest and authentic when I am building relationships
because of this review than ever before. Organizationally, I have not been in the position to make recommendations on how the mentors were trained. Additionally, it was only a moderate concern for me whether the other mentees in the program had a well-trained mentor or not. I was focused on being the best mentor for my mentee. While I may care for my mentee, this study has positioned my thoughts to care for the family of young men who are in the program. Finally, emotional care as a practice is a relatively new revelation because I did not have a defined skill set to allow me to meet emotional needs of my mentees. Never had a reason to be concerned with what the cared how we were being trained, because it was about me and my mentee.

As the director of a Student Success Center at a local University, professionally, the implications of this review will guide new ways of thinking about how we serve all our students. When students begin their collegiate career as freshmen, they transition from working with the admissions counselor and are partnered with a staff member from my office who is there until graduation supporting their academic needs. The findings in this review suggested creating a safe space should predicate academic care. In my office, we offer incredible services, yet have experienced poor attendance in some instances when reaching out to students who are performing poorly academically. Often conversations around ways to improve focus on marketing, making things mandatory or improving the service. However, more recently, I am using the findings of this review to guide conversations around building better individual relationships with our counseling load using safety as a tool.
5.3 LIMITATIONS

This research was limited by available time to dive deeper into various components of the literature. For example, my review focused on Black adolescent males, whom the mentoring program felt needed the support to improve social or academic performance. As a result, my review excluded mentoring programs serving high achieving Black males. My search terms were limited and despite the comprehensive database used to collect studies, system administrators were unable to explain why a search that initially suggested a total of 1,975 results only allowed me to view 200 studies.

5.4 FUTURE STUDIES

The review of these selected studies and themes which have emerged have positioned me to continue my work on the mentoring of Black males. Because of my access to mentoring programs serving Black males, one question I wish to research is how do Black adolescent males understand and respond to care from their mentor? I am curious if care looks different for Black female mentors serving Black females adolescents of if I would find similar results? Finally, there appears to be opportunities to further explore culturally responsive caring and mentoring, as well as “critical mentoring,” a term which presented itself within the literature.
This review contributes to the dearth of research examining care based mentoring practices supporting adolescent males. To date, I have had the opportunity to present my findings at the 2017 University Council for Educational Administration (UCEA) national conference; the University of Pittsburgh’s 2017 graduate student research symposium; and will present my research as a poster presentation at the 10th annual convening of the Carnegie Project on the Education Doctorate (CPED) to satisfy my Demonstration of Scholarly Practice requirements. Upon the completion of my dissertation, I will develop a professional development training to support the work of mentors serving Black adolescent males. Recently, I was invited to facilitate a professional development of the camp counselors for the Black Male Leadership Development Institute; a week long, residential summer camp for Black high school aged boys. Finally, I will be working with my staff at a local university’s Academic Success Center, to establish care based practices as a core value and the standard for our engagement with students.
APPENDIX A

Figure 4: Sample Database for Coding Information from Sample Studies


Milner, R. H. (2013b). *Start where you are, but don't stay there*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard Education Press.


