

March of Militarism: Contemporary Nationalism through Military Spectacle

by

Andrea Gunoe

Bachelor of Arts, Brigham Young University, 2011

Master of Arts, Brigham Young University, 2013

Submitted to the Graduate Faculty of the
Dietrich School of Arts and Sciences in partial fulfillment
of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy

University of Pittsburgh

2023

UNIVERSITY OF PITTSBURGH
DIETRICH SCHOOL OF ARTS AND SCIENCES

This dissertation was presented

by

Andrea Gunoe

It was defended on

July 17, 2023

and approved by

Dr. Kathleen George, Professor, Department of Theatre Arts

Dr. Michelle Granshaw, Associate Professor, Department of Theatre Arts

Dr. Todd W. Reeser, Professor, Department of French and Italian; Gender, Sexuality, and
Women's Studies Program

Dissertation Director: Dr. Patrick McKelvey, Assistant Professor, Department of Theatre Arts

Copyright © by Andrea Gunoe

2023

March of Militarism: Contemporary Nationalism through Military Spectacle

Andrea Gunoe, PhD

University of Pittsburgh, 2023

Over the last decade, large military performances such as parades and exhibitions have increasingly become the sites of controversy, violent attacks, and military strategy. From Russia's Victory Day Parades in 2022 and 2023 to President Donald Trump's proposed but un-realized military parade in the United States in 2018, these presentations have demonstrated their capacity to perform power and influence national ideology. *March of Militarism* explores spectacular military performances to interrogate their meanings and purposes. Through a focus on the fundamental element of these performances, military foot drill, this dissertation reveals the role of the soldier's body in these spectacles. In an interrogation of the soldier body in performance for the nation, I historicize drill through affect and ideal masculinity in the body's sociohistorical context. In doing so, I find means of nation creation in which the nation, masculinity, and affect crucially intertwine.

This dissertation explores several case studies of drill and spectacular military performances incorporating drill in their national mise-en-scène. In a move away from linear narratives of progress and cause and effect in the history of military drill, I provide a rhizomatic historiography of the battle and performance practice through Imperial Greece, Early Modern England, and the contemporary United States of America to pinpoint masculinity's role in the affective experience of drill. I then move to two spectacular performances: the Royal Edinburgh Military Tattoo of 2017 and the Bastille Day Parade (La Fête Nationale or le 14 juillet) in Paris, France, in 2018. I account for historical, political, physical, and theatrical contributors to their

meanings to understand the consequences of these performances for Scotland, France, and their accompanying national identities. I apply theories from sociology, military history, military studies, dance studies, and performance studies to primary sources, including historical military drill manuals, government records, and my personal experience at the performances to study numerous meanings for the nation and performance.

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements	x
1.0 Introduction.....	1
1.1 Methodology.....	7
1.1.1 A Rhizomatic History	7
1.1.2 Epistemology of the Body	11
1.1.3 Masculinity	14
1.2 Literature Review.....	15
1.2.1 Military Performance	16
1.2.2 Nationalism	19
1.3 Chapter Summaries.....	25
2.0 Esprit de Corps: Affect and Masculinities in Histories of Western Military Drill.....	27
2.1 Introduction	27
2.1.1 About Face: The Emergence and Re-Emergence of Drill in Western Warfare	30
2.1.2 A Brief Traditional History.....	32
2.1.3 Fall In: Affect and the Soldier Body.....	34
2.2 Attention: <i>Tactics of Aelian</i> and Drill in the Army of Alexander the Great.....	41
2.2.1 Tactics of Aelian	43
2.3 Forward, March: Drill Reformation in Early Modern England	53
2.3.1 The Military Revolution	56
2.3.2 English Effeminacy	57

2.3.3 Drill Manuals.....	59
2.3.4 Affect	61
2.4 Change Step, March: Precision Drill and the Warrior Ethos.....	74
2.4.1 Precision/Exhibition Drill.....	80
2.4.2 Precision, Affect, and Masculinity	85
2.5 Conclusion	92
3.0 Myths of the Mist: History, Identity, and Internationalism in the Edinburgh	
Tattoo	94
3.1 Introduction	94
3.1.1 On Building a National Identity	96
3.2 Romancing the Tartan: Military Historiography in Scottish Identity	100
3.2.1 Creating the Nation in the Scottish Wars for Independence	102
3.2.2 Romantic Highland Soldier.....	106
3.2.3 A different national identity.....	117
3.3 Controlling Motion: Epistemology of Highland Dance and Continuity Drill.....	121
3.3.1 Highland Dancing	124
3.3.2 The Queen’s Color Squadron	134
3.4 Cultural Festivities: Internationalism and the Audience in Edinburgh International	
Festivals	143
3.4.1 The Edinburgh Festivals and Material/Intercultural Model.....	150
3.4.2 The Tattoo.....	156
3.5 Conclusion	164
4.0 Commemorative (re)enactment: French Memory, Military, and Resistance.....	166

4.1 Introduction	166
4.1.1 Commemoration and the shifting ideologies of French Memory	173
4.1.2 French Nationalism.....	187
4.2 The Soldier on Parade.....	189
4.2.1 The Modern March.....	196
4.3 A Revolution Without a Center.....	202
4.3.1 Masculinity	210
4.3.2 Colonial Memory.....	212
4.4 Conclusion	219
5.0 Conclusion	221
Bibliography	228

List of Figures

Figure 1 Fred Wright Cartoon. 1941. Pitt ULS Digital Collection	89
Figure 2 Bastille Day Parade 2018. Republican Guard.....	198
Figure 3 Bastille Day Parade 2018. 27th battalion de Chasseurs alpins.....	198
Figure 4 July 15, 2018. One million fans celebrate the World Cup on the Champs-Élysées	205
Figure 5 July 15, 2018. Fans celebrate the World Cup win on top of a news-stand.....	205

Acknowledgements

I would like to acknowledge the contributions of many to the research, funding, advising, and emotional support of this dissertation. I would first like to thank the organizations that provided me the opportunity to experience military performances internationally. Funding was provided by the University of Pittsburgh European Studies Center, the Dietrich School of Arts and Sciences Summer Fellowship program, and the Pitt Theatre Arts department. I want to give special thanks to John K. Marshall, “The DrillMaster,” for guiding me to valuable research sources and for being the only one who could match my intensity of interest in military drill. I thank Captain Samuel Gunoe of the U.S. Army for answering military questions at all hours throughout the years of my research. I recognize the National Library of Scotland (Leabharlann Nàiseanta na h-Alba) and The Imperial War Museum London for the great experiences they provided to me as a researcher in their archives.

I appreciate the patience and confidence of my committee including Dr. Todd Reeser, Dr. Michelle Granshaw, and Dr. Kathleen George. Thank you to my dissertation Chair, Dr. Patrick McKelvey, for his great empathy and support. I would also like to recognize the rest of the faculty of the Pitt theatre department that have helped me grow as an artist and teacher over my extended sojourn. I could not have maintained sanity without the commiseration and laughs of my fellow graduate students, who are too many to list but hold a place in my cranky, graduate heart. I have endless gratitude for my Ph.D. cohort Shelby Brewster and Nic Barilar for truly embodying “cohort support.”

The largest contributor to my success has been my family. To my grandparents, Dave and Bonnie Badger, who let me use their home as an office, my brothers, Alex and Sam, for admitting

that I'm smart, and my ever-sympathetic best friend Carter Thompson, I sincerely thank you. The largest credit goes to my mother, Jennifer Gunoe, to whom I dedicate this work, for her unwavering faith and love in the dark and difficult moments of this endeavor. This work is also dedicated to my late father, Sergeant First Class Allen Gunoe, for exposing me to the performative world of the military, its good and bad, so that I could think, "Hu, what's that all about?"

1.0 Introduction

The world watched Moscow's Red Square on May 9, 2022, and again on May 9, 2023, when President Vladimir Putin gathered his military to carry out Russia's annual, traditional military parade on Victory Day. Military analysts were shocked at the parade in 2022 as Russia had recently invaded the neighboring Ukraine and dedicated its resources to the conflict. Many assumed that a country in active war would conserve its military might, and money, for the battlefield. This would undoubtedly make tactical sense. However, Victory Day is an important national holiday in Russia and across the former Soviet Union. It commemorates their triumph over Nazi Germany on the Eastern Front in World War II.¹ By Victory Day in 2023, news of the lack of supplies and poor training among the Russian ranks had spread, confirming that Putin had prioritized the military spectacle of thousands of soldiers marching on the square in commemoration over wartime supplies.²

Members of the media worldwide were able to identify Putin's rhetorical propaganda leading up to the holiday in 2022.³ Just a few months before the Russian invasion of Ukraine, Putin

¹ Russia and other states in the former Soviet Union recognize the dates of the war as Soviet involvement and instead call it the Great Patriotic War.

² Brad Lendon, "Russia Having Difficulty Making New Weapons, but Might Have Enough Older Ones, Report Says," CNN, April 19, 2023, <https://www.cnn.com/2023/04/19/europe/russia-weapons-production-report-intl-hnk-ml/index.html>.

³ "Russia's Victory Day Takes on New Importance for the Kremlin This Year," episode, *Weekend Edition Sunday* (Washington, DC: NPR, May 8, 2022), <https://www.npr.org/2022/05/08/1097184192/russia-victory-day-2022>.

began to use the word Nazi to describe Ukraine and its practices.⁴ Victory Day was a perfect time for him to draw propaganda parallels between the Nazi traits recalled in the commemorative holiday and Ukraine's perceived evils. However, the global media stopped its analysis there, wondering why the military distraction of a parade had even taken place. At the end of their live procession coverage, Dominic Nicholls and Theo Merz of the *Telegraph* agreed, "It doesn't seem to me that what we have seen or heard today had any military significance."⁵ In so doing, the *Telegraph* and other media outlets failed to recognize that not only were the Victory Day Parades of Russia crucial to Putin's performative power, but the properties of this specific type of performance had real tactical significance in this ongoing conflict.

This dissertation offers a more rigorous analysis of these types of spectacles and recognizes their place in national and military politics. The Victory Day parades are among many military spectacles that have received global coverage during the last decade, signaling the spectacles' use as stages of protest, violence, and nationalism worldwide. In August 2018, an attacker attempted to assassinate Venezuelan President Nicolas Maduro during a military display.⁶ Just a month later, at the Army Day Parade in Iran, terrorists killed 29 people.⁷ In January 2019, Yemen's Aden

⁴ Anton Troianovski, "Why Vladimir Putin Invokes Nazis to Justify His Invasion of Ukraine," *The New York Times*, March 17, 2022, Why Vladimir Putin Invokes Nazis to Justify His Invasion of Ukraine.

⁵ *Russian Victory Day 2022 in Full: Military Parade in Moscow as Putin Delivers Speech*, *Youtube.com*, 2022, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=wSxdfu3WPSc>.

⁶ Marilia Brocchetto, "Venezuelan President Survives Apparent Drone Assassination Attempt," *CNN*, August 5, 2018, <https://www.cnn.com/2018/08/04/americas/venezuela-maduro/index.html>.

⁷ Hilary Clarke, "29 Killed in Attack on Iranian Military Parade," *CNN*, October 4, 2018, <https://www.cnn.com/2018/09/22/middleeast/iran-attack-parade-intl/index.html>.

military ceremony came under fire by Houthi rebel drones, killing six.⁸ During the 2020 Coronavirus pandemic, CNN and *The Washington Post* shared articles about the Philadelphia military parade held by the city during the 1918 flu pandemic and its consequences in spreading the virus. The 1918 Philadelphia parade hit the news just weeks before Belarus held its Victory Day Parade in defiance of international health organizations, prioritizing the nation's celebration over public health. The United States saw years of debate over a display that President Donald Trump sought to produce in the style of the Bastille Day Parade he had seen in Paris in 2017, a prospect deemed controversial in large part because of its \$80,000,000 price tag. The government downgraded these dreams of a parade to a Fourth of July spectacular with fireworks and an Air Force flyover.⁹ The recurrence of media-covered violence and controversy surrounding military parades demonstrates their important place in the countries that regularly produce them.

In this dissertation, I contribute a rare analysis of military spectacles as performance to provide new and profound perspectives on their purpose to the nation. I identify military foot drill as the common performance practice across these spectacles. I negotiate the place of the soldier, their body, and their identity in military performances that contribute to the nations in which they are situated. In addition to looking closely at the performance through the soldier's body, I expand my research outside of the events themselves. I argue for theoretical connections of myriad factors across time and history, such as politics and physical practice that build the *mise-en-scène* of drill performance. In turn, I demonstrate the numerous ways the performance enacts change through

⁸ Mohammed Ghobari and Aziz El Yaakoubi, "Houthi Drones Kill Several at Yemeni Military Parade," Reuters, January 10, 2019, <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-yemen-security/houthi-drones-kill-several-at-yemeni-military-parade-idUSKCN1P40N9>.

⁹ Macias, Amanda. "Trump's Military Parade Is Estimated to Cost \$92 Million – \$80 Million More than Earlier Estimate." CNBC. April 05, 2019.

those connections. By doing so, I contribute a history and analysis—beyond the few existing linear historiographies of drill—to the fields of performance and military studies.

I present several types of military spectacles with the same foundational movement: drill. Western military drill (or foot drill) was born in Ancient Greece and has influenced military practice ever since. The infantry used the regulated marching of soldiers as an active battle component until right before World War I.¹⁰ Even though it has been retired from action, militaries still use the traditional movement practice in training even without direct battle application. Militaries also use drill in performances for the public, including parades, military bands, ceremonies, and precision (or exhibition) drill shows. I explore the performative nature of this war-based movement in training, battle, and purposeful performance, like parades and precision drill. I examine this physicality for its purpose for a nation. By taking a deep look at the minutia of drill movement, I build histories that have not yet received significant attention. In addition to my analysis of sites in Western Europe, I offer the first academic history of precision (or exhibition) drill in the United States as a contribution to both the field of military history and to performance studies.

The soldier is a focal point throughout the case studies I present. The soldier-body becomes the essential tool in military drill as a performance practice. I discover possible affective experiences of the soldier during military drill and argue that the affective experience of the soldier and audience dramatically influence the possible meanings of the performances, thus influencing the nation. I follow an affective logic gleaned from primary sources such as drill manuals and historical political documents to identify consequences for gender, society, and national identity.

¹⁰ James Q. Whitman, *The Verdict of Battle the Law of Victory and the Making of Modern War* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2012), 12.

I do not limit this study strictly by geography. Instead, I draw my case studies from Western performances of drill that attract a large audience and are significantly grounded in the performance of national identity. My primary case studies come from Western Europe: Scotland's Royal Edinburgh Military Tattoo in 2017, and the 2018 French Bastille Day parade in Paris. Both countries' national identities connect with ideologies of independence, rebellion, and revolution. The surface of these performances is well-ordered and dictated by the government, but through careful analysis, I find that the themes and movements on display have deep ties to these ideals. However, they promote hegemonic ideals of rebellion as foundational to narratives of the nation-state and the military. My first body chapter is more historically and geographically expansive. It takes on three case studies that map key historical moments in Western drill. I look specifically at the descriptions and choreography of Imperial Greek drill,¹¹ the resurgence of Greek drill as a training and performance practice in Early Modern Europe,¹² and the adapted contemporary practice of precision drill by the US Army Drill Team. I contribute to the historiographies of Western military drill by military scholar Harald Kleinschmidt¹³ and historian William Hardy McNeill¹⁴ by considering how the specific forms of movement in drill intersect with the social and political contexts from which they were created.

¹¹ I focus on the military manuals written by Aelianus Tacticus in the second century AD, which highly influenced later Western drill formation and training.

¹² I primarily use English military guides written at the time as well as historical accounts of drill and drill performance. (ex. Davies, EDW. "Military Directions or the Art of Training: Plainly Demonstrating How Every Good Soldier Ought to Behave in Warfare." *Printed by Edward Griffin London*, 1618.)

¹³ Harald Kleinschmidt, "Using the Gun: Manual Drill and the Proliferation of Portable Firearms," *The Journal of Military History* 63, no. 3 (1999).

¹⁴ William Hardy McNeill, *Keeping Together in Time: Dance and Drill in Human History* (New York, USA: ACLS History E-Book, 2013).

My study of military performances builds upon dominant discourses of performance and nation-building that treat performances as either nation-creating events or reflections of preexisting national identities. I extend these approaches by situating spectacular military performances as nexuses of connection, revision, and eruption. Large military performances are especially poised to be intersections of national creation as they are state performances open to the public that are produced by a necessary aspect of any nation, its military.¹⁵ In these types of military performances, national entities practice or act out values and images they want for the nation. The public witnesses the performance and is folded into the nation's narrative. The performers and audience participate in the events as ritual performance. Then, the spectacular element ensures that symbols of the nation, enriched with history and cultural milieu, are presented to the audience and, for the most part, entertain them.

My project acknowledges that interpreting the impact of these performances (or narrations) on nation-building can lead to singular conclusions about what has been performed and exactly how the nation has grown from that performance. I intervene in existing theories of nation-building through cultural practice and performance to state that the narratives from and in each of these events are manifold. I expand on studies of military performances that assume a homogenous audience, singular or absolute meanings, and cause-and-effect nation-building, in order to instead discuss multiple possible meanings and interpretations. I view the event as having the possibility to create, represent, and receive complex national values that change depending on the viewer, participant, and the multitude of surrounding cultural factors in play. Studies of nationalism can

¹⁵ I do not argue that every community needs a military but that the nation, to be considered such, must have a military to ensure precious aspects of what makes up a nation, including its borders and the nationalist ideology of power and defense.

also fall into the trap of assuming a linear history of nation-building and a homogenous nation. I use the performance as a site of endless variation in nation-building by foregrounding a heterogeneous nation and an event with multiple contributing social and political factors as well as pointing out ways in which the events disrupt and bend history.

1.1 Methodology

1.1.1 A Rhizomatic History

I come to the case studies with three lenses through which I maintain respective assertions. The first subject lens is history through which I assert that historiography need not be linear, and that time and history are not fixed. It is possible to experience history and to theorize through it in performance. The second is masculinity and the assertion that the physical experience of masculinity has consequences on society while society structures the possibilities of what masculinity feels like in return. The third is affect and the accompanying conviction that pre-categorized or prelinguistic sensations carry and portray information. I explore specific military performances in Greece, England, The United States, Scotland and France as ever-expanding networks of influence on the nation and its history. I argue that the multi-dimensional nature of performance (incorporating visuals, audio, movement, script, improvisation, etc.) in combination with its complex physical and socio-political contexts, such as history, gender, and affect, requires a rhizomatic approach to highlight the many possible outcomes a performance can have on those who witness it, as well as the nation at large. This argument departs from nation-building theories

from scholars such as Benedict Anderson and even his responders, which assume one cause-and-effect.

Linear historiographies, in both chronology and cause-and-effect, create hierarchies of knowledge and prioritize overarching narratives that apply to the powerful, the majority, or the groups the history serves. A cause-and-effect account of a military performance's meaning and reception generally assumes a homogeneous audience, performer, and nation. Deleuze and Guattari offer an alternative to such linearity through their use of the term "rhizomatic," referencing a plant that grows continuously underground in many directions, without roots, trees, or the directional hierarchies and causality a vertical plant brings. A rhizome has no beginning or ending points, just connections. They describe it as "dimensions or rather directions in motion. It has neither beginning nor end, but always a middle (milieu) from which it grows and which it overflows."¹⁶ You can enter a rhizome at any point, or any piece of the *mise-en-scène*, make connections to past and present, and exit with meaning. Approaching my case studies as rhizomes allows me to use aspects of the performance itself, its physical and political contexts (both contemporary and historical), and events that occurred after the performance to make connections and draw meanings that do not limit, or exclude, the other possible implications of the event that can be drawn from interminable contributing historical, social, and political factors and the heterogeneous nation with which it engages. It also allows me to connect contemporary versions of my case study performances to previous iterations.

Two performance studies methodologies influence my non-linear historical approach. The first is Diana Taylor's use of the scenario as a tool for understanding historical patterns that reoccur

¹⁶ Gilles Deleuze, Félix Guattari, and Brian Massumi, *A Thousand Plateaus: Capitalism and Schizophrenia* (London: Bloomsbury Academic, 1980), 21.

continuously.¹⁷ A scenario goes beyond narrative, enacting a historical script that shifts and transfers to future generations and events. The script can change, and variation can exist, but the structure of the scenario remains the same. This grants a distinctive way to approach history by identifying significant patterns of action instead of cause-and-effect events. Taylor also provides this dissertation with the concept of the repertoire. Taylor defines repertoire relative to the idea of the archive. The archive consists of written and recorded history of artifacts such as letters, books, writing, photographs, video, and maps. In contrast, the repertoire is held in the body, and the body is considered a way of knowing and understanding the past. Movement, affect, patterns, tradition, and trauma resist archival capture and hold information.¹⁸ The practice of drill acts as a piece of the repertoire in the physicality learned and passed from generation to generation.

A second performance studies methodology that is key to my approach is Rebecca Schneider's conception of (re)enactment.¹⁹ Reenactment is a re-performance of history. In the performance art world, people use re-performance to think about restaged versions of previous pieces. No matter how exact the recreation, the new performance is a new event with new possibilities. It stands as its own event, temporally distant from the first performance. However, it is also a replaying of the previous piece, thus confusing the temporality of re-performance. This concept is applied to the analysis of reenactment to create (re)enactment. Through (re)enactment, Schneider identifies temporal connections between current enactments of the past and the actual past that it represents. The continued (re)performance of an event affects the view and the record

¹⁷ Diana Taylor, *The Archive and the Repertoire: Performing Cultural Memory in the Americas* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2007), 13.

¹⁸ Diana Taylor, *The Archive and the Repertoire: Performing Cultural Memory in the Americas* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2007), 20.

¹⁹ Rebecca Schneider, *Performing Remains: Art and War in Times of Theatrical Reenactment* (Abingdon, Oxon: Routledge, 2011), 9.

of the past. In that way, the past and present fold together in mutual influence. The act of (re)enactment steps out of Taylor's archive to become a living, changing performance that is something of consequence in its own right.

The Scottish and French case studies have been happening for at least fifty years. Both are informed by the drill practices of Ancient Greece and the transformations of Early Modern drill. Likewise, the American case study follows a practice that has existed in some form since before World War II. The Scottish, French, and American performances play out annually. Although, they change slightly every time. I look at the performances not as scripted works that remain mostly the same but as performances that happen from year to year following a very particular outline that may appear almost identical. However, the specific performance I look at, and each iteration, exists in a unique time and has its own *mise-en-scène*. Taylor's scenario allows me to look at the historical structure of these performances as influential upon but not prescriptive of the contemporary performance. Schneider's (re)enactment allows me to interpret iterations of the parade side-by-side as events that both influence the meaning of the contemporary performance. Scenario and (re)enactment assist my rhizomatic approach, representing how past performances play out in their singular iterations of the present. I use these theories but grant that the history or previous iterations are of no more hierarchal importance than other elements of the performances' contemporary setting.

I explore nationalism as an object of study and part of the rhizomatic contexts for my project's case studies. Nationalism is a deeply rooted aspect of military performance that I explore through my analysis. I put these performances into a discussion with theories of nationalism that argue the nation is a construct built on connected communities and cultural practices. In this way, theories of nationalism are also important methodologies for my project. I explore this further in

the literature review section. I look for multiple ways that community and nation are built and reflected through performance. Each chapter relies on different conceptions of the nation, thus granting new lenses to interpret nationality in each context.

1.1.2 Epistemology of the Body

As I cut into the rhizome of spectacular military performances, I use the body as a guiding entry-point toward the nexus of the spectacular event. Though surrounded by symbols, lights, and sounds, military drill performances rely on the soldier's body in motion. I use epistemologies of the body throughout the project to contextualize and analyze the soldier's body. I use theories of embodiment such as the repertoire from Diana Taylor's *The Archive and The Repertoire*, muscular bonding from military historian William McNeil's *Keeping Together in Time*, kinesthetic empathy from dance theorist Susan Foster's *Choreographing Empathy*, and Randy Martin's social kinesthetic from *Critical Moves*, to read the body in performance. Taylor, McNeil, and Foster's theories all ground how information passes from body to body. Taylor's focus is setting up the transfer of information as possible through the body in contrast to the data that one can glean from archival sources. She argues that bodies pass down knowledge through generations. The repertoire is a guidepost for thinking through how the body holds and portrays history.²⁰

I theorize affect under Brian Massumi's definition of that term in *Parables for the Virtual: Movement, Affect, Sensation* (2005). He separates affect from emotion and identifies it as what comes before emotion when the body has been stimulated but hasn't identified the sensation and

²⁰ Diana Taylor, *The Archive and the Repertoire: Performing Cultural Memory in the Americas* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2007), 9.

placed it into the linguistic world.²¹ I cannot find the exact affect that a soldier felt in historical events, nor did every soldier feel the same. Instead, I follow an affective logic in which I identify required physical movements and identify likely reactions in muscles, breathing, and kinesthetic awareness. I theorize out of those likely reactions to identify possibilities of historical and contemporary affective experience during military drill and find connections between that affect and ideologies of its era.

McNeil and Foster provide possible means of this feeling transference. I use affect theories to expand on their ideas of the body in performance. William McNeil proposes that transfer happens through muscular bonding and attaches that bonding directly to military drill exercises and the soldier's body moving together in unison. McNeil defines muscular bonding as the "euphoric fellow feeling that prolonged and rhythmic muscular movement arouses among nearly all participants in such exercises."²² The euphoric feeling provides a means of relation in which the soldier's movements are extended beyond their person and are joined with others, opening up means for non-linguistic communication. I consider McNeil's muscular bonding as a concept on its way to becoming affect. In that light, I expand McNeil's historiography and methodology by applying affective analysis to accounts of military drill. I develop McNeil's muscular-bonding theory into affect when examining how specific movements, when done in unison, influence the soldier's feelings as a performer and how bodies are so unified that they become a single unit while retaining individuality.

²¹ Brian Massumi, *Parables for the Virtual: Movement, Affect, Sensation* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2021).28.

²² William Hardy McNeill, *Keeping Together in Time: Dance and Drill in Human History*, 3.

I use Foster's explanation and use of kinesthetic empathy as another methodology for understanding the transference of information and feeling from the performer to the audience in order to establish the *mise-en-scène* of the performances of my case studies including the spectator. In *Choreographing Empathy*, Foster argues that mirror neurons fire in the audience's mind when they see someone else performing an action that would usually ignite those same neurons in themselves. The connection then allows physical feelings when they watch a body in motion as they identify with it.²³ Audiences can then understand information of the body as if they were performing the movements of the actor. This helps the audience member understand what the movement communicates and means, from performer to audience member. This interaction, embodied in the parts of the performers and the audience, unifies the two and implicates the audience in the performance. I analyze movements and formations in performance and understand how these movements might influence the possible meanings gleaned by the audience during national displays. Teresa Brennan approaches a similar idea in *The Transmission of Affect* (2004). She identifies several ways that affect can transfer from person to person or through the atmosphere. I use Brennan's approach to supplement the concept of mirror neurons from Foster with considerations of heartbeat, perspiration, and smell in transference from soldier to audience and soldier to soldier.²⁴

In his work on the social kinesthetic, Randy Martin provides a method of closely reading movement while accounting for social and political context. He models how connecting disparate

²³ Susan Leigh Foster, *Choreographing Empathy: Kinesthesia in Performance* (London: Routledge, 2011).

²⁴ Teresa Brennan, *The Transmission of Affect* (Cornell University Press, 2004).

pieces of information can create restrictions and potentialities of movement.²⁵ Martin uses the metaphor of a constellation as a gathering of “intentions and conventions underlying the corporeal dimensions of life.” He analyzes structures of power and conventional acts as manifested in dance and quotidian movement.²⁶ I follow Martin’s lead in my rhizomatic approach as I seek the limitations and possibilities of movement in historical and social contexts, what Martin calls “historically specific microphysics,”²⁷ to understand the performance in its physical element. Through these theories of embodied epistemology, I interrogate possible meanings that can only come from and through the body and how those meanings influence the national narrative and the historiography of military performance.

1.1.3 Masculinity

I argue that masculinity is an integral component of Western war and military structures. Masculinity is a mode for the individual or nation to establish and present success in the military. It is also a drive for the soldier to go to war. I claim that Western military groups must represent masculinity as a whole unit to function. However, the definitions and ideologies of masculinity are constantly shifting. I identify prominent characterizations and recommendations of the ideal masculine soldier from the archive in a specific historical moment. I seek to understand that masculine ideology in the context of military drill, and its affect, at that time. Masculinity is a

²⁵ Randy Martin, *Critical Moves: Dance Studies in Theory and Politics* (Durham, NC: Duke Univ. Press, 1998).

²⁶ Randy Martin, *The Oxford Handbook of Dance and Politics*, ed. Rebekah J. Kowal and Gerald Siegmund (New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2019), 9.

²⁷ Randy Martin, “A Precarious Dance, a Derivative Sociality,” *TDR/The Drama Review* 56, no. 4 (2012): 62–77, 68.

performance and a tool for creating organizations (militaries) and nations. I follow Todd Reeser's argument regarding masculinity and the nation to argue that national and military identities are deeply connected. In *Masculinities in Theory: An Introduction*, Reeser identifies a mutual causality between masculinity and the nation. He states, "It is often extremely difficult to know what the originary ideology is in this back-and-forth process of mutual construction. The process of engendering between the gendered subjects of the nation and the nation itself is dialogic, since each influences the other and since the nation creates masculinity at the same time as masculinity creates the nation."²⁸ I explore this dialogue by identifying the possible affects of masculinity in military performance as it is a nation-creating event. I also look at the other side of the cycle when nations influence masculinity and structure affective potentiality.

1.2 Literature Review

This project is interdisciplinary and draws from various fields of study. Few performance studies scholars have treated contemporary large-scale military performances in monographs. Additionally, The Edinburgh Military Tattoo organization has been the only entity to publish on the subject. Because of this, I combine materials from several fields to examine the history of Western drill-based military performance, the Edinburgh Tattoo, the Bastille Day Parade, as well as US precision drill and the history of their precursors from Imperial Greece and Early Modern Europe. I engage with sociology, political science, and performance studies texts on nationalism.

²⁸ Todd W. Reeser, *Masculinities in Theory: An Introduction* (Hoboken, NJ: John Wiley & Sons, 2010), 178.

I also utilize texts on military performance, including historical scholarship and traditional military history. Several texts from these categories ground my methodological approach to spectacular military performance. I use primary sources in my exploration of historic military drill practices and the organization of the Edinburgh Military Tattoo, including historic drill manuals, government records, and my personal experience at the events.

1.2.1 Military Performance

There has been little writing about military parades in performance studies and no theorization of military drill as a performative practice. Even though the performance studies field has very few works about military parades, there are several select works in and outside the field that address the subjects of parade and drill. Two historiographies of military drill inform my knowledge of the practice, in addition to primary sources. However, these historiographies paint a picture of a linear history with a progress narrative, the idea that the form gets better and better over time. I seek to find connections in the many accounts of military drill to find meanings beyond the alleged improvement of martial tactics. The first of these texts, *Keeping Together in Time: Dance and Drill in Human History*, comes from history scholar William McNeill. McNeill argues that there are particular military and social advantages of moving together to a beat that he calls “muscular bonding.” He does not delve theoretically into that idea via affect or neuroscience. He does, however, provide examples of the use of drill throughout Western society, from ancient Greek training practices, through religious ceremonies, to drill team performances today.²⁹ I add to McNeill’s historiography by expanding his idea of muscular bonding into the sphere of affect

²⁹ William Hardy McNeill, *Keeping Together in Time: Dance and Drill in Human History*.

and performance and asking how the feeling of the movement functioned in a socio-historical context beyond the notion of tactical success.

I also draw on the historiography of Western drill written by military studies scholar Harald Kleinschmidt, who theorizes the role of weaponry in military practices through ancient and medieval periods, as evidenced by Greek and Macedonian texts on military drill.³⁰ I take a different view of drill than Kleinschmidt by decentering weaponry as the driver of drill evolution to imagine the form in its historical situation as a more significant determiner than the progression of weapons. Kleinschmidt provides a useful history of drill with respect to its most evident purpose, war. I use similar primary sources to Kleinschmidt, including ancient Greek³¹ and seventeenth-century drill manuals, but I approach the texts with an eye toward very different kinds of evidence. I analyze Kleinschmidt's key transitional moments in drill history through their physical contexts to discuss the possibilities of movement in the periods' social kinesthetic, a term borrowed from dance scholar Randy Martin.

Two performance studies texts treat the topic of military parades in contemporary society: Nestor Bravo Goldsmith's "Heterotopias of Power: Miners, Mapuche, and Soldiers in the Production of Utopian Chile," (2017) and *Welcome Home, Boys!: Military Victory Parades in New York City 1899-1946* by Sebastian Jobs (2013). Nestor Bravo Goldsmith theorizes a Chilean military parade as a heterotopia, a term borrowed from Foucault, to talk about spaces or events set apart from everyday life that imagine and perform a constructed nationalist Chile. He also

³⁰ Harald Kleinschmidt, "Using the Gun: Manual Drill and the Proliferation of Portable Firearms," 601.

³¹ The military tactics manuals written by Aelianus Tacticus in the second century C.E. have influenced contemporary Western drill practices. They will provide a source for understanding the soldier's movement in drill.

describes the heterotopia of the military parade as cyclical. He attributes this cyclical dynamic to the fact that they repeat but shift slightly depending on the government in charge at the time and the corresponding national ideals that government wants to perform. Bravo Goldsmith claims that looking at the parade as a heterotopia brings together ideas of national and regional identity, specifically in Latin America. He approaches the performance of the parade almost as a theatrical production and closely reads the symbols in the parade and what meanings they provide.³² Goldsmith makes claims about what is being performed without acknowledging the multiplicity of meaning possible in one performance for so many people of various backgrounds. I appreciate his focus on symbolism but depart from his examination of military parades by placing national symbols as only one of many meaning-holders.

Focusing on the soldier rather than iconography allows for immense possibilities of interpretation. In *Welcome Home, Boys!*, Jobs depicts the actor-soldiers in a liminal moment of transition during homecoming victory parades.³³ Jobs' comments on the nationalism performed for spectators as the soldier becomes a civilian and blends in with the spectators themselves, instilling militarism in daily life. None of my case studies are examples of homecoming or the blending of the soldier with civilian, but Jobs provides a springboard for theorizing out of the soldier-performer. Like Jobs, I look at soldiers as holders of nationalism, but I also argue that they are a means of direct connection to the past. I additionally consider the performative gender of military spectacles by homing in on the affective experience of the soldier.

³² Bravo Goldsmith, Nestor. "Heterotopias of Power: Miners, Mapuche, and Soldiers in the Production of Utopian Chile." Essay. In *Performing Utopia*, edited by Rachel Bowdich and Pegge Vissicaro, 223–58. London: Seagull Books, 2017.

³³ Sebastian Jobs, *Welcome Home, Boys! Military Victory Parades in New York City 1899-1946* (Frankfurt: Campus Verlag GmbH, 2013).

History and military studies provide little theorization on military drill. The two historiographies from which I build provide some context but do not theorize the body in motion in its socio-political context. The performance studies texts that include military drill as performance, both in the context of parades, do not accentuate the action of the performance or drill itself. I contextualize the body and socio-political history of military performance through my analysis.

1.2.2 Nationalism

Nationalism is an important theme throughout the chapters of this dissertation. In this project, I study nationalism beyond political rhetoric to understand how it is created or reflected in society and performance. I engage with several approaches to the idea of nation creation including concepts on the nation's ability to reflexively create itself in collaboration with the state, the nation as an agreement of shared history, the attributes of ethnicity on the nation, and the building of a nation by setting itself against an Other to create an in-group and out-group. Through these theories, I maintain that the nation is created through social ideology and not that it is naturally inherent to a specific place or people. Because of this, I use Benedict Anderson and his critics for their foundational analyses that allege nationalism formed from imagined and agreed communal ideas of unity. I also identify scholars working in dialogue with Anderson and his critics who place the performance of nationalism in the lives and communications of people within the nation. I engage with scholars applying the creation or reflection of national identity through quotidian performance practices. I build on Anderson's foundational elements, largely looking outside of Anderson's national frameworks, by utilizing scholars who argue for nation creation

occurring before print culture through very different means and theorize completely independent of Anderson's claims.

Benedict Anderson and his theories of imagined communities provide a groundwork for the theorization of the nation. His concepts are thus influential on theories of national identity in this dissertation, even when I engage theorists who disagree with Anderson. In *Imagined Communities* (1983), Anderson argues that eighteenth-century Europe shifted through revolution and the dissolving of monarchies into nation-states through the "idea" of the nation-state as an imagined community. The heterogeneous group of people, living in different ways and speaking different languages, in a particular area were not formed together as a nation because of borders but because print culture spread ideas and language. This happened in such a way that any individual reading the wide-spread information could imagine someone else, far away, that they had never met, reading the same information, thus making them connected as a community. He explains imagined communities as "an imagined political community – and imagined as both inherently limited and sovereign."³⁴ Anderson claims the comradeship or communion of being an imagined community or nation does not rely on the common understanding of national values that seemed to previously exist amongst the people that are now a nation. Instead, the national identity was created along with the nation as an imagined community and projected onto the past.

The post-structural rhizomatic approach I take encourages looking beyond simplified meaning in the nation-building process, like Anderson's assertion that print was the leader in building imagined communities. I connect to other factors at play, like structures of power. In the *Persistence of Nationalism* (2014), Angharad Closs Stephens argues that even though he agrees

³⁴ Benedict Anderson, *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism* (London: Verso, 2006), 5.

that the nation is a political construct, Anderson's focus on imagined communities ignores how nation and nationalism are tools for the state to discriminate from those they want "in" and those they want "out."³⁵ He claims that using Anderson's work continues a single linear narrative of history that thwarts attempts at resisting it. In *Nations and Nationalism* (1983), Ernest Gellner argues similarly to Anderson but pushes that regional and national authorities are leading contributors to national identity because they dictate nationalism to the people.³⁶ He gives examples of mass education systems and cultural authorities such as museums. Like Anderson, Gellner sees the nation and nationalism as tied explicitly to modernity.³⁷ I apply Gellner's approach to claim that a primary contributor to Scottish national identity is a fictive figure from romanticism that was created by hegemonic and popular lore and pushed by the state. Neither Anderson nor Gellner accounts for many variations or rejections from the people to either the print culture or the authorities, respectively. I theorize beyond Gellner to consider that in the rhizome, the state is a contributor of meaning, but so are the people and the land. I theorize beyond Anderson to consider histories of the nation before print culture.

This dissertation historicizes military spectacles and determines that early iterations of the spectacles and pre-modern historical events and ideologies are crucial to the spectacles' meanings. As performances of national identity, the spectacles use and represent pre-modern histories in creating the nation. Several scholars operate outside of Anderson's ideas of the nation and argue that the nation has been created throughout history.

³⁵ Angharad Closs Stephens, *The Persistence of Nationalism: From Imagined Communities to Urban Encounters* (London: Routledge, 2014).

³⁶ Benedict Anderson, *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism* (London: Verso, 2006), 7

³⁷ Ernest Gellner, *Nations and Nationalism* (Oxford: Blackwell, 1983).

Anthony Smith emphasizes the crucial role that ethnic groups play in nationalist ideology in *Theories of Nationalism* (1983). He states that ethnic and linguistic factors determine the in-group and out-group necessary for national identity.³⁸ These ethnic divides began before independence movements and contemporary nationhood. Fiona Watson argues in *Image and Identity* (1998) that the nation only needs clearly defined borders and a sense of shared history and future to exist.³⁹ Watson specifically argues that Scottish national identity began far before the nation-state through its interdependent relationship of conflict and alignment with England. The Scottish-English relationship through history and into today creates a unique dynamic of Scottish national identity in both opposition to and through identification with the United Kingdom. I contend that key historical moments have been held as important by people within certain borders, establishing a shared history, before the time of Anderson's claims, especially in often referenced Scottish battles in Scottish popular culture such as The Battle of Bannockburn (1314).

In "The Nation Form: History and Ideology," (1990) Etienne Balibar theorizes the nation as not just an imagined community but a functioning system of social and political life that upholds the system of the state.⁴⁰ I argue that the creation of that social system began before modernity and print culture. Balibar's concerns go beyond the invention of the nation to the continual process of influence between the nation and the state to support one another. This, Balibar argues, is enacted through a fictive ethnicity presumed and maintained through the continual reproduction of the state. In the French case study, I demonstrate the crucial philosophies of the French national

³⁸ Anthony D. Smith, *Theories of Nationalism* (London: Duckworth, 1983).

³⁹ Fiona Watson, "Enigmatic Lion: Scotland, Kingship and National Identity in the Wars of Independence," in *Image and Identity: Making and Re-Making of Scotland through the Ages*, ed. Dauvit Brown, Richard J Finlay, and Michael Lynch (John Donald, 1998), 18.

⁴⁰ Etienne Balibar, "The Nation Form: History and Ideology," *Review (Fernand Braudel Center)* 13, no. 3 (1990): pp. 329-361, 330.

identity, such as liberty, and the ways in which these ideologies participate in the fictive ethnicity and uphold the state.⁴¹ I also detail counter-national identity that decenters the French ethnicity as it has been built and challenges the unique national ideology of French Universalism.

In addition to the state and hegemonic influence, military performance helps create a communal identity by using symbols of the community and referencing diverse historical sources. I make connections to these sources to outline possible meanings in the performances. Theorizations of national holidays, national symbols, and national events provide a guide to the many ways performance influences the nation. I move beyond these theorizations to prioritize the soldier's body as a national symbol. Gabriel Elgenius's *Symbols of Nations and Nationalism: Celebrating Nationhood* (2019) is a thorough accounting of symbols used in national settings and their importance. Elgenius compares national performances, providing crucial knowledge of national days. Her clear information, in union with theorizations of nation-building, exposes that small and deliberate changes in national performance from one country to the next give considerable indications of meaning. Jisha Menon discusses the national military performance at the India-Pakistan border in *Performance of Nationalism: India, Pakistan, and the Memory of Partition* (2018) and argues that performance is used as a "tactic of political power."⁴² As a tactic, it reifies and makes visible the power of the state and establishes a relationship between the government and public through patriotism and the symbols of nation-building addressed by Elgenius.⁴³

⁴¹ Etienne Balibar, "The Nation Form: History and Ideology," 346.

⁴² Jisha Menon, *Performance of Nationalism: India, Pakistan, and the Memory of Partition* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2018), 10.

⁴³ Jisha Menon, *Performance of Nationalism*, 19.

I follow the theoretical framing of Edensor's matrix to connect contemporary iterations of military performance to the many factors that surround it. Tim Edensor writes about popular culture and its influence on nationalism in *Nationalism and Popular Culture in Everyday Life* (2002). He does not discount the impact of cultural hegemony and the state on nationalism. Still, he argues that popular culture is not all top-down, and that the circulation of material in contemporary society can create a more rounded nationalism that he asserts is still influential today, including large-scale performances as well as sports, carnivals, and tourist practices. Edensor provides a theoretical way to think about what impacts nationalism that helpfully moves beyond cause-and-effect by identifying a matrix of meaning.⁴⁴ This matrix includes local, regional, national, and global cultural contributions to the overall national identity. Anthony Smith argues that Scottish nationalism is polycentric and relies on outside forces in its self-creation.⁴⁵ I consider the matrix of influence when examining the structure of Scottish nationalism and its relationship with other nations.

I expand on Tim Edensor's critical engagement with Phillip Schlesinger and Michael Skey's "top-down" approach to the building of national identity as primarily hegemonic, in which Edensor argues for a "bottom-up" focus on popular culture as an avenue for national identity to propose that foundational texts such as Anderson and Gellner exist in a linear space that renders any interpretation hierarchical and causal. For this reason, I follow Edensor's approach to look at the creation of "nations" and imagined communities in a way that favors winding horizontal connections, such as Deleuze and Guattari's rhizome.

⁴⁴ Tim Edensor, *National Identity, Popular Culture and Everyday Life* (Oxford: Berg, 2002), VII.

⁴⁵ Atsuko Ichijo and Anthony Smith, "Forward," foreword, in *Scottish Nationalism and the Idea of Europe: Concepts of Europe and the Nation* (Routledge, 2016), x.

1.3 Chapter Summaries

The investigation into case studies of military spectacle begins with a historiography of military drill in order to establish the components of the foundational element on which the later performances rely. In the first body chapter, I identify three eras and geographies of significance in military drill. Instead of tracking an entire history of Western drill, I approach the history rhizomatically by pulling out various case studies and connecting them to each other while also allowing each its own historical importance, not as a line of progression.

In Chapter Two, I place detailed military drill movements and social masculine ideals together to uncover potential affective experiences. The first era is Imperial Greece, in which I probe a drill pamphlet from Aelian Tacticus in 136 AD on the practices of the army of Alexander the Great. I theorize the Greek concept of *andreia*, masculinity specific to battle, and its application in drill movement. The second era is Early Modern England, in which I use early seventeenth-century drill manuals in concert with evidence of masculine ideology in writing at the time. The third era tracks the masculine ideology in the US Army's Warrior Ethos and its reflection in the US Army's precision drill team. I contribute to the first academic history of precision (exhibition) drill.

Chapter Three addresses the 2017 Royal Edinburgh Military Tattoo, an extravagant military show conducted on the Edinburgh Castle Esplanade. The production features soldiers as musicians, marchers, actors, and dancers in a demonstration of abundant Scottish nationalism and national identity. I identify 2017's political moment and examine the Tattoo's performance of a fabricated historical identity, contradicting performance of precision drill and highland dancing, and the Tattoo's context as part of an extensive series of international festivals held in Edinburgh. I claim that Scottish identity is bound to historical military identity, and that the Tattoo is essential

to keeping that identity relevant today. I use Taylor's scenario concept to identify English control scenarios in Scotland that disguised themselves as scenarios of Scottish independence. These scenarios play out in the 2017 Tattoo and its history.

In the fourth chapter, I analyze the 2018 Bastille Day (le 14 Juillet or Le Fête Nationale) military parade as a container and creator of national memory. I use Pierre Nora's concept of sites of memory (*les lieux de mémoire*)⁴⁶ and those who have built upon it to investigate the changes that the 2018 iteration of the spectacle have made to France's memory of the parade and the French Revolution. These changes were instigated by the 2018 *mise-en-scène* in which surrounding events complicated the national identity performed in the parade. I identify the performance as a commemorative (re)enactment, a modification of Scheider's (re)enactment, to argue the place that the storming of the Bastille in 1789 has in French memory and enactment today.

I conclude by connecting the spectacular military performances covered by the media from this introduction to two quiet films covering masculinity, drill, and the body to discuss the many roles that drill takes, both grand and humble. I argue for the importance of understanding drill as a military and performance practice.

⁴⁶ Pierre Nora, "Between Memory and History: Les Lieux De Mémoire," *Representations* 26 (1989).

2.0 Esprit de Corps: Affect and Masculinities in Histories of Western Military Drill

"Affect is the meeting of mind, body, volition and cognition, expectation and suspense, body depth and epidermis, past and future, action and reaction, happiness and sadness."⁴⁷
Brian Massumi *Parables of the Virtual*

2.1 Introduction

Episode 1, "Curahee," of HBO's star-studded World War II miniseries *Band of Brothers*, introduces audiences to the "Easy" Company of the 101st Airborne Division of the U.S. Army as they prepare to go to battle for the first time. This mishmash crew of undisciplined young men seems out of their depth as an angry First Lieutenant Sobel (David Schwimmer) rains insults down on the young privates, all standing at attention in clean, ordered lines. At the end of the beratement, Lieutenant Winters (Damian Lewis) does a crisp *about-face* and orders the privates in the company to fall out of formation.⁴⁸ The film intersperses their training, inflicted by Sobel, with scenes demonstrating the soldiers' youth and rowdy personalities. The montage also tracks the soldiers becoming more mature and more soldierly.

This scene is familiar in war movies: the young cadets or privates are berated by a drill sergeant or a young officer as they march in step around a field in ordered lines, turning and stopping on command. This training was very unlike the conditions these characters, based on real soldiers, were to face in battle. Despite rehearsing ordered drill, they were preparing to drop into

⁴⁷ Brian Massumi, *Parables for the Virtual: Movement, Affect, Sensation* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2021).

⁴⁸ "Curahee," *Band of Brothers* (HBO, September 9, 2001).

battle by parachute onto a beach in Normandy, France and then proceed to think on their feet and move about individually.⁴⁹

This formal, geometric tradition of training is called drill. In its most simple definition, to drill means to practice or rehearse. Harald Kleinschmidt defines drill as the “trained, patterned behavior of soldiers.”⁵⁰ A performance studies analysis of Western drill reveals several necessary components to the definition of drill: tempo, close order formations, following of orders or commands, and marching. This definition of drill accords with the rehearsal or practice of battle maneuvers from antiquity through the early nineteenth century. These maneuvers have their origins in pitched battles, pre-arranged or pre-known battles in which the two opposing sides choose to engage. However, when militaries stopped meeting in pitched battle, they continued to use drill to train troops. This emphasis on drill as training or rehearsal implies that there is a final, real moment of action for which the drill itself is preparation.

During the age of pitched battle and today, the rehearsal that is drill has an affective end function. The surface emotional effect of rehearsing precise drill for hours is that of discipline. In war films, such as *Forrest Gump* and the Civil War film *Glory*, the young cadet goes into training as an out-of-shape, immature nobody and leaves a disciplined and hardened soldier, reflecting real military tradition that war theorist William McNeil describes as the “treasured army tradition [that] held that this sort of thing made raw recruits into soldiers.”⁵¹ This trope is not new to popular

⁴⁹ In contemporary war movies, the cadets go from ordered formational marches, runs, and drills in boot camp to improvised battle out of an HMMWV, helicopter drop, or on the street, without strict formation, once they deploy to the field of battle—for example, the 1981 comedy *Stripes*, 2005’s *Jarhead*, 2014’s *American Sniper*, etc.

⁵⁰ Harald Kleinschmidt, “Using the Gun: Manual Drill and the Proliferation of Portable Firearms,” 603.

⁵¹ William Hardy McNeill, *Keeping Together in Time: Dance and Drill in Human History*, 57.

culture or the attitudes of real basic training today. It is grounded in long-held Western military tradition. A seventeenth-century English drill manual claims to “Demonstrat[e] the pathway to the youths and the many unexpert trainment of this kingdom, to lead them to the mark, which is to become perfect and absolute soldiers. Who...are very raw and altogether ignorant in most points of military exercise.”⁵² The soldiers are learning maneuvers through drill but are also becoming disciplined and “perfect” soldiers.

This chapter investigates the affective experience of drill beyond a battle technique or a lesson in discipline, arguing that drill has functioned as a mode of affective training to bring unity, order, and devotion to the state in the form of ideal masculinity from rehearsal to battle and daily life. This function has been established, reinterpreted, and revised throughout Western warfare from antiquity to contemporary drill. I support my argument by conducting a historiography of affect in Western military drill (namely Imperial Greece, seventeenth-century England, and the contemporary United States) that theorizes how the affects and movements of military drill reflect the broader historical context and that moment’s ideas of masculinity. Even though the practice of drill is used today in training and not in battle, it is not contained in training alone. Governments use military drill throughout the world in state and national performances such as ceremonies, parades, tattoos, and competitions. In performance, an affective experience of drill expands to a viewing audience, military or civilian. I include a performance of drill at a tattoo as my contemporary example to bring drill from practice to battle to an audience.

⁵² E.D.W. Davies, "Military Directions or the Art of Training: Plainly Demonstrating Hoe Every Good Soldier Ought to Behave in Warfare," *Printed by Edward Griffin London*, 1618, A2.

2.1.1 About Face: The Emergence and Re-Emergence of Drill in Western Warfare

Scholars have written little on the history of Western military drill on its own. Only two have widely published contemporary historiographies in the English language. These two historiographies of military drill, *Keeping Together in Time* by William McNeil and “Using the Gun” by Harald Kleinschmidt, document the beginnings of tight ordered battle formation tactics and the presumed links of training for those tactics throughout Eurasia, including ancient Mesopotamian, Chinese, Greek/Roman, and middle ages European traditions. What is evident throughout both historiographies is the reliance on weaponry as the driving narrative of whether drill was used or not by military forces in a particular historical moment. McNeil’s monograph relies on a theory of “muscular bonding” between soldiers that occurs while “keeping together in time” during marching and maneuvering in close order drill. For McNeil, this is an emotional connection. He marks his own emotional connection to fellow soldiers through drill while serving in the military. He argues that muscular bonding exists through time and exists in ritual and cultural dance. Even though his argument of muscular bonding relies on emotion, his historiography of drill is bound not to the body, muscle, or tempo but the access each military had to material technology throughout time. He separates his arguments about muscular bonding from the historiography of drill’s development.⁵³

The title of Kleinschmidt’s historiography, “Using the Gun,” implies a complete focus on the firearm in military drill, though he only mentions guns at the end. He also gives room to the emotional as he notes ideological and social features that mirror drill practices at any given

⁵³ Here I do include horses as technology as armies used them as tools of war separate from the soldier’s body.

moment. His historiography's drive is the weaponry that shapes the required battle movements and training. The reliance on weaponry as an impetus for military change in historiographical narrative necessarily places that narrative in a linear social metanarrative of technological advancement. The soldier is present in the narrative in as much as he is the carrier of the tool as it marches forward through history, but he is not the focus of this physical practice.

I approach the history of Western military drill rhizomatically by decentering it from a narrative of weaponry to a central nexus of the soldier body and its affect. Affect is not far from McNeil and Kleinschmidt's traditional histories. Both of their arguments hover on the edge of affect theory. McNeil does so through his examination of muscular bonding. I build on muscular bonding but approach the concept as the spread of affect among a group, which scholar Teresa Brennan, borrowing neuroscientific terminology, calls "entrainment."⁵⁴ Kleinschmidt accepts military movement as a reflection of social ideology. I approach movement's tie to society and ideology by interpreting affect as a bodily episteme that has the ability to transmit knowledge or information from one to another through both affective entrainment and a passing down of information through the physical repertoire. I center the body's experience in drill movement by considering historical restrictions and potentialities of movement, what Randy Martin calls the "social kinesthetic."⁵⁵ Instead of building a cause and effect narrative of drill building through time, I enter the rhizome at three entry points, of which the first two are notable elements of these traditional historiographies: the writings of Greek tactician Aelian of second century C.E.,

⁵⁴ Teresa Brennan, *The Transmission of Affect* (Cornell University Press, 2014), 9.

⁵⁵ Randy Martin, *Critical Moves: Dance Studies in Theory and Politics* (Durham, NC: Duke Univ. Press, 1998), 24.

seventeenth-century English drill manuals, and a contemporary drill performance by the U.S. Army Drill Team at their Twilight Tattoo.

2.1.2 A Brief Traditional History

Both Kleinschmidt and McNeil historicize a linear rise, fall, and revival of military drill practices. These two historiographic examples focus on weaponry but inadvertently give an account of embodied practice through their varied foci. My three-point historiography disconnects each era from the cause and effect of Kleinschmidt and McNeil. However, the traditionalism of their historiographies can elucidate an embodied genealogy. McNeil tracks close order tactics in Mesopotamia to just a few hundred years after the epic of Gilgamesh in 2450 B.C.E. Little is known of these tactics except the surviving material evidence, a stele depicting soldiers in a tight formation with shields.⁵⁶ The tight formation involved soldiers gathered close enough that their shields allowed no space between them, creating a wall. Some organizational grouping and movement would have been necessary to move without breaking the surface of shields. This tactic and the accompanying, assumptive drill training needed to accomplish this tactic are quickly replaced in Mesopotamia with the introduction of the bow and arrow in 2350 B.C.E. Scholars have many theories about the inhospitable nature of close orders for both firing and receiving bow and arrow when it is the primary form of weaponry and why the bow erased drill.⁵⁷ McNeil tells a similar story for Chinese close order tactics. His brief, Chinese drill historiography is rooted in a

⁵⁶ Stone or wooden tablet with writing or art, McNeill, William Hardy. *Keeping Together in Time: Dance and Drill in Human History.*, Kindle Location 134.

⁵⁷ William Hardy McNeill, *Keeping Together in Time: Dance and Drill in Human History*, Kindle location 1216.

discussion of the halberd or ge (part ax part spear) and its use in the Warring States period of 402-221 B.C.E. The halberd would have required immense training and practice to handle the weapon while in close formation. Sun Tzu, the author of *Art of War* around 400 B.C.E., is fabled to have trained women with halberds. It is documented that he did so with close order drill.⁵⁸ However, easier access to horses throughout China increased cavalry tactics around 320 B.C.E. The advent of the crossbow in China, first recorded in 341 B.C.E., made close order battle formations illogical and irrelevant.⁵⁹ Each generational shift in weaponry accompanied a corresponding physical reaction to that weaponry.

Kleinschmidt's historiography is far more focused on Western drill progression out of Greek warfare through Europe into the middle ages and Early Modern periods. He also grounds his work in the evidence of drill manuals. He draws patterns of weaponry from these manuals, but his use of evidence also demonstrates the manual's importance in Western military practice from antiquity through the renaissance. His history originates in Greek and Byzantine drill manuals by Tacticus and Maurikios, respectively. Kleinschmidt argues that "within the Greek tradition, manual drill was directly connected with the handling of weapons."⁶⁰ McNeil marks that drill went out of favor with a "new style of armored heavy calvary, equipped with powerful compound bows" which saw the end of close order infantry tactics in the eastern Roman and Byzantine empires around (527-565 C.E.) and western Europe during the 9th century.⁶¹ Kleinschmidt states that some

⁵⁸ Sun Tzu, *The Art of War*, trans. Griffith, B Samuel (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1963), 59.

⁵⁹ William Hardy McNeill, *Keeping Together in Time: Dance and Drill in Human History* (New York, USA: ACLS History E-Book, 2013)., Kindle location 1250.

⁶⁰ Harald Kleinschmidt, "Using the Gun: Manual Drill and the Proliferation of Portable Firearms," 604.

⁶¹ William Hardy McNeill, *Keeping Together in Time: Dance and Drill in Human History*, Kindle location 1363.

drill with longbows was present throughout Europe in the Middle Ages but that the elaborate Greek tradition, consisting of fixed words of command in conjunction with rhythm and more complex geometric patterns, returned to Europe after the 1590s as military leaders returned to the Greek drill manuals. Shortly after, this was adopted by Maurice of Orange in the Netherlands and his German relatives, then put to use and spread through Europe in the Thirty and Eighty Years' Wars.⁶² Drill training was then somewhat standardized across Europe and pitched battle became a calculable war game of changing shapes in which soldiers moved, even in the slightest way, in accordance with command. Drill training was therefore required to be done even in peacetime, creating a rigid and obedient infantry. In the late 17th century, increased use of firearms made the unified movements that served pike and longbow-clad infantrymen dangerous. Soldiers needed to be able to move according to the moment to adjust to longer-range weapons.⁶³ Previous historical moments have shown an abandonment of drill as a training practice when it was no longer directly linked to battle movements. However, through the eighteenth century and continuing in military practice throughout the world today, militaries still use drill in training.

2.1.3 Fall In: Affect and the Soldier Body

In a move away from a historiography of deliberate cause and effect, I focus on several points in the rhizome, two textual sources and one video, that exist in the history of Western drill. I use these points to explore the soldier body as the center of their meanings. A historiography of the body, and the body's experience, is difficult to access. The extant texts that I use to access

⁶² Harald Kleinschmidt, "Using the Gun: Manual Drill and the Proliferation of Portable Firearms," 607.

⁶³ Harald Kleinschmidt, 623.

these histories don't recall how soldiers felt, how they experienced things, or what emotions their movement aroused. To definitively say what any of these soldiers, or the soldiers as a group, were experiencing, feeling, and emoting would pull the history into structural linearity in which meaning can be found only if one could access the author, or the soldier's, intent. Nor do I want to conjecture on the many thoughts and feelings that come with the long-dead soldier's subjectivity. Instead, I access the gesture and quality of movements prescribed to and described of the soldiers in drill (training and battle) as evidenced by the drill manuals that have been left behind. Some of these manuals describe practices already in use, and others dictate soldiers' future practice. However, all reflect influence by the previous movement and were likely to influence the movement of those who read them, even subtly. If followed, the manuals' prescribed movements reflect an affect that is culturally specific. By analyzing these manuals, I reveal potential affective states in these historical moments and their reflexive cultural gender constructions. The potential affects created by the movements in these manuals influenced and were influenced by their sociohistorical moments.

In analyzing the physical practices of these manuals, I catch the movement affectively, meaning that I address that which precedes feeling or emotion. In *Relationescapes: Movement, Art, Philosophy* (2009), Erin Manning beautifully describes feeling as a reaction to stimuli in the body (affect) that starts to be categorized by thought and cognition. She writes: "Feeling is affect bleeding into thought, activating complexities on the verge of expression."⁶⁴ I cannot read a soldier's thoughts, but I can access some of the qualities and potentialities of affect by understanding how he moved. Brian Massumi distinguished affect from emotion and feelings. For

⁶⁴ Erin Manning, *Relationescapes: Movement, Art, Philosophy*, ed. Brian Massumi (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 2012), 220.

Massumi, emotion is the sociolinguistic labeling of a physical and cognitive feeling.⁶⁵ Emotion is an “Expression of [the] capture” of sensation.⁶⁶ One captures the feeling and interprets it in their sociopolitical moment through their subjectivity. Emotion is an “intensity owned and recognized.”⁶⁷ The reaction in the body to any stimuli (emotional or physical) must exist before their interpretation into the language of emotion. Massumi sees this as intensity and affect. Affect is not “semantically or semiotically ordered.”⁶⁸ It exists in the body before the capture, always as an origin of emotion, but unperceived as it travels into the realm of semiotics through definition and rationalization into categorized emotion.

Affect theory opens a means by which I can connect drill manuals and their movements trans-historically. The subjectivity through which the affect (resulting from participating in drill) travels on its way to becoming feeling and emotion are variable for each soldier. However, if done in unison and with precision as drill is intended, the movement may produce similar affect and sensation to many in the group. Affect can also travel and spread within a group in ways personal subjectivity cannot. Rebecca Schneider writes about Stewart and Lingis’ theorization of affect that can “jump.” She writes, “This jump has also been shown to be cross-temporal as well as cross-spatial, cross-geographic, cross- and/or contra-national. Affect can circulate, bearing atmosphere-altering tendencies, in material remains or gestic/ritual remains, carried in a sentence or a song, shifting in and through bodies in encounter.”⁶⁹ Each manual’s intention for group application crafts

⁶⁵ Brian Massumi, *Parables for the Virtual: Movement, Affect, Sensation* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2021). 28.

⁶⁶ Brian Massumi, 35.

⁶⁷ Brian Massumi, 28.

⁶⁸ Brian Massumi, 24.

⁶⁹ Rebecca Schneider, *Performing Remains: Art and War in Times of Theatrical Reenactment* (Abingdon, Oxon: Routledge, 2011), 56.

the potential for the creation and distribution of affect that is shared and jumps. I identify the connections between each historical moment's drill practices based on their mutual affects, or affect that can jump cross-temporally and cross-nationally. (I will discuss the transmission of affect later in the chapter.) Identifying and exploring affect and movement in these historical moments of drill unlock aspects of those moments that have not yet been explored. These histories are immensely applicable today as drill based on these same historical movements is still used in training and performance and, I will argue in the third case study of this chapter, has the potential to influence those who perform it: the soldiers who make up the world's militaries. The affective historical experience, though varied immensely, can inform how training for battle in a distant time influences the affective performance in wildly different battles today.

Affect is not only something we can search for in history but also something that carries history itself. In *Choreographing Empathy*, Susan Foster talks about sensation not as affect but as kinesthesia. Like affect, she defines kinesthesia as “primarily deriving from muscle sensations but also involving vestibular information.”⁷⁰ She connects these physical sensations, born of movement, to history. “Choreography, kinesthesia, and empathy function together to construct corporeality in a given historical and cultural moment. By looking at them alongside one another over time, it is possible to argue for the existence of corporeal epistemes that participate in the production of knowledge and the structuring of power.”⁷¹ She argues that not only can we access the corporeal episteme through movement but that historical movements passed down serve as a way of knowing and connecting to that history. Thus, as a legacy alive today, drill carries

⁷⁰ Susan Leigh Foster, *Choreographing Empathy: Kinesthesia in Performance* (London: Routledge, 2011), 11.

⁷¹ Susan Leigh Foster, *Choreographing Empathy*, 13.

knowledge through its affect. In exploring the ties of the affect experience to the historical moment's masculinities, I expose structures of power through movement.

Affect and movement may carry historical knowledge, but the present time (or period of study) also influences them. Structures of power exist around and within movement and therefore also in the affect that is felt. Dance theorist Randy Martin considers outside historical factors in the potentialities and limitations of movement in any given historical setting. He uses Foucault's theories of power⁷² as dispersed in societal and governmental structures and Raymond Williams' structures of feeling⁷³ to argue that movement (he focuses on dance) is not only limited in convention of any given historical form but is a constellation of "intentions and conventions underlying the corporeal dimensions of life."⁷⁴ He works constellationally to map factors influencing and powering movement. This constellation of influence in the historical moment is the social kinesthetic. He defines it as "the orientation, sensibility, or predisposition that informs approaches to movement, the historically specific microphysics that generates and governs

⁷² Foucault writes that there are several modalities of power. He uses sovereign power to describe the power held by authorities. However, in true democracies, there is disciplinary power in which we control ourselves through societal constructions, rewards, ideals, etc. This kind of power comes from everywhere and is "dispersed" power. Much of this control happens when we think we are being watched. Power is also manifest through accepted forms of knowledge and ideology. Michel Foucault, *The History of Sexuality*, trans. R. Hurley, 1976 ed., vol. 1 *The Will to Knowledge* (Penguin, 1998), 93.

⁷³ Williams argues that each historical or social moment is a uniquely felt experience and that each period has its own "particular qualities" that make it what it is. This experience works with historical markers like institutions, beliefs, and events to create the period. For Williams, structures of feeling are not yet articulable. This aligns with theories of affect that I use in this chapter in which affect is pre-linguistic. Looking at history this way, affectively, is not "feeling against thought, but thought as felt and feeling as thought: practical consciousness of a present kind. In *Living and interrelating continuity*." Raymond Williams, *Marxism and Literature* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1977), 131-132.

⁷⁴ Randy Martin, *The Oxford Handbook of Dance and Politics*, ed. Rebekah J. Kowal and Gerald Siegmund (New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2019), 9.

motional force fields.”⁷⁵ Movement in the microphysical is unique to its time because of myriad constellational factors in the social kinesthetic.

Martin’s social kinesthetic applies to the three sites of Western drill explored in this dissertation. Not only are these practices informed by the drill gestures and movements invented and codified in historical periods before their own, but they each have a constellation of cultural, social, and material practices of their contemporary moment that also informs them. In military drill, this influence is ever apparent. Drill is not a fluid improvisation but a heavily scripted and dictated set of movements given by the top of the power structure down to the lowest rank that is performing them. As a constellation, in keeping with Martin’s metaphor, the movements of the soldiers would then affect the world around them as they contribute equally to the social kinesthetic. In the constellation, without linearity, the movements are informed by their predecessors but not dictated by them. Martin supports that, saying, “Social kinesthetics do not impose a genealogy of influence but a series of lateral connections in which disparate practices are joined through some (but not all) of what organizes them.”⁷⁶ In my discussion of Greek drill, Early Modern English drill, and precision drill in the United States, I draw connections from their prescriptive and descriptive affects to the ideologies of their periods, specifically the ideologies of masculine embodiment, to illuminate the constellational link between martial physicality and masculine societal norms.

The historical texts I use to access the movement and qualities of drill are manuals, not journals. They depict large movements of drill and battle, not the thoughts and feelings of the

⁷⁵ Randy Martin, *The Oxford Handbook of Dance and Politics*, 9.

⁷⁶ Randy Martin, “A Precarious Dance, a Derivative Sociality,” *TDR/The Drama Review* 56, no. 4 (2012): 68.

soldier. They capture formations and formational changes prescribed for success in battle. They address how to hold weapons, what spacing is needed, and exactly what commands should be called and in what order. Unlike contemporary drill manuals, these historical texts do not provide details on the soldier's individual bodies, for example, how one should place their weight on the ball of one foot when changing directions or if the eyes, head, or body move in sequence or all at once when turning. Instead, these texts are focused on the larger picture of tactical maneuvers. However, these macro-descriptions imply micro-movements. The Greek text's notes on the cubit spacing for an entire phalanx give insight into the proximity between soldiers and the potential space for movement. The English text notes the order in which soldiers start to move with a distance of steps. This gives insight in the affective anticipation of waiting for a turn and of the urge to move to escape the person in the back starting and hitting from behind. These qualities of the broader formations connect to unnoted affective reactions.

By establishing a picture of *a* masculine ideal in the historical moment and connecting it to the drill's potential affect, I demonstrate one of the many possible purposes of drill's use in training in history and today. I note that the movement of drill may instill that ideal in those who perform it and can therefore rehearse it and bring it out into the world, but the movement of drill also creates that ideal for soldiers and non-soldiers to live up to. I explore these connections in the *Tactics of Aelian* written in 136 C.E. and the Greek masculinity *Andreia*, seventeenth century English drill manuals and masculine virtue, and precision drill in the contemporary U.S. Army and the Army's "Warrior Ethos."

2.2 Attention: *Tactics of Aelian* and Drill in the Army of Alexander the Great

Scholars are quick to tie Greek political social life to military success or failure. There is an arguable cause and effect from historical military status to the culture that was able to grow from it. Joseph M. Bryant argues for a reflection or connection between military training and battle tactics to larger ancient Greek cultural practices and ideologies of the time. He connects the institution of close order drill in the Archaic period (from 776 B.C.E.) to the shift away from aristocratic honor toward devotion to the *polis* that was occurring in government simultaneously. Indeed, the large configuration of the hoplite⁷⁷ phalanx demonstrates a unified body working together instead of scattered individuals following a single head, mirroring this ideological shift away from small villages toward democracy and citizenship.⁷⁸ Beyond formations, the soldier bodies moving within the phalanx exist in a reciprocal state of influence, a social kinesthetic, with Greek civic and social culture. Bryant recognizes these macro features of military movement as corresponding to state ideology. The theory connecting Greek military practices to politics is not new. In his *Politics*, Aristotle said, “As the states grew and the wearers of heavy armor had become stronger, more persons came to have a part in the government.”⁷⁹ He describes that as city-states built their infantry, units saw success in territorial expansion and more citizens were able to participate in government.

⁷⁷ The hoplite is soldier-citizen. He is a foot soldier with a panoply of shield and spear who fights in the formation of the phalanx.

⁷⁸ Joseph M Bryant, “Military Technology and Socio-Cultural Change in the Ancient Greek City,” *The Sociological Review* 38, no. 3 (1990): pp.501.

⁷⁹ Aristotle and Richard Robinson, in *Aristotle’s Politics, Books III and IV* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1962), 1297b.

I build on this by examining the micro-movements of the phalanx. I look at individual body movements not to see the whole unit's appearance but to examine the affective implications of these movements. Using the evidence found in the drill and battle manual *The Tactics of Ailian*, I connect the affective experience of Greek drill at the time of Alexander the Great to an ideological feature of Greek life at the time, one of the sides of Greek masculinity: *Andreia*. Whereas for Bryant, the shifting roles and means of interaction that happened in the close order formation of the phalanx were incongruent with a pre-democratic Greek aristocratic mentality, I argue that the shift in ideologies cannot have happened solely intellectually in a moment of recognition of equality on the battlefield then trickled into politics. The institution of the phalanx not only put noble and commoner together, as Bryant states, but caused them to move together. They performed the same movements at the same time, in close proximity. They shared an affective experience that could have mobilized into democratic thought. Dance scholar Randy Martin notes that setting up politics and movement as separate, though connected, is limiting. He states, "When politics is treated merely as an idea or ideology, it occurs in stillness, awaiting something that will bring people to action or mobilize them. But this presumed gap between a thinking mind and an acting body makes it impossible to understand how people move from a passive to an active state. The presumption of bodies already in motion...could bridge the various splits between mind and body, subject and object."⁸⁰ By isolating affective experience in military drill, I seek to demonstrate the mobilization of ideology and the reciprocal influence of that ideology on future movements.

⁸⁰ Randy Martin, *Critical Moves: Dance Studies in Theory and Politics* (Durham, NC: Duke Univ. Press, 1998), 3.

2.2.1 Tactics of Aelian

Archeological evidence illuminates the emergence of the phalanx during the archaic period, primarily in the forms of images of the large formations and weaponry. Still, military manuals provide closer descriptions of micro or particular movements. Aelian Tacticus' *On the Military Arrangement of the Greeks* (ca. 136 C.E.) focuses on pitched battle and close order maneuvers, unlike the other extant manuals that focus on siege warfare (Aeneas Tacticus c. fourth-century B.C.E.), naval approaches, camp life, and transportation (Xenophon c. 430-350 B.C.E.).⁸¹ Aelian was a Greek military theorist and a historian who lived in Rome and studied the military tactics of Alexander the Great and his army. To ascertain this military history that occurred half of a millennium before him, Aelian studied volumes of military manuals that are no longer extant to produce his own analysis and manual. In his first chapter, Aelian gives an extensive list of his sources, including, "Cyneas the Thessalian...Pyrrhus the Epirote...Clearchus, Pausanias, Evangelus, and Polybus the Megalopolitan."⁸² Twentieth and twenty-first-century analyses of his *Tactics* indicate that he relied heavily on the work of the Stoic philosopher Posidonius (c.135-51 B.C.E.) and possibly the work of Asclepiodotus (first-century B.C.E.).⁸³ Aelian's work was well received. The Byzantine Emperor Leo IV (866-915 C.E.) relied on Aelian's text when he created his own manual. Military leaders also revived it later during the Military Revolution, which I will

⁸¹ Christopher Anthony Matthew, Aelianus, and Brian Bosworth, *The Tactics of Aelian: Or on the Military Arrangements of the Greeks: A New Translation of the Manual That Influenced Warfare for Fifteen Centuries* (Barnsley: Pen & Sword Military, 2012), forward.

⁸² Christopher Anthony Matthew and Aelianus, *The Tactics of Aelian*, Ch1.

⁸³ Alice König, "Tactical Interactions Dialogues between Greece and Rome in the Military Manuals of Aelian and Arrian," in *Literature and Culture in the Roman Empire, 96-235: Cross-Cultural Interactions*, ed. Rebecca Langlands and James Uden (Cambridge, United Kingdom: Cambridge University Press, 2020), pp. 134-156, 134.; and Christopher Anthony Matthew, Aelianus, and Brian Bosworth, *The Tactics of Aelian*, forward.

discuss later in the chapter. Though extensive in his research, Aelian was removed from his subject. I proceed with the evidence as described by Aelian as one part of a historiographical approach of constellational connection. The social kinesthetic that surrounds and mutually influences the drill practices of the army includes Aelian's historiography.

Aelian's manual is not emotive. Much of the manual is dense instruction on how soldiers should order themselves in the phalanx, how many soldiers should exist in each line, how much space each soldier should occupy, etc. Aelian gives little by way of ideological explanation or motivational rhetoric. What Aelian does supply in emotional or ideological language reflects the shift away from the democratic *polis* inscribed in Bryant's idealized phalanx toward the Alexandrian empire that he is documenting. He writes, "Each phalanx contains within itself distinct bodies...subordinate classes...It is the first duty of a commander to select the fittest men...and to appoint each of these men to their proper place...a mighty but disorderly army has been defeated by a handful of men who were well disciplined and trained."⁸⁴ In this section, the third of fifty-three, Aelian calls for discipline, order, and class distinction. He cements class distinction as contributing to functioning social order, as might have aligned with the earlier Greek ideology that Bryant argues, but then also assigns value to the men in an all hoplite phalanx, hoplites usually being of the same class. This is perhaps a reflection of the later post-democratic state when he writes, "A file is then, after him, a column of men, who are arranged according to their worth, after the file leader."⁸⁵ In that third section, Aelian provides that one of the purposes of drill in training, at least for Alexander's army, aligns with twenty-first-century notions of

⁸⁴ Christopher Anthony Matthew and Aelianus, *The Tactics of Aelian*, 17.

⁸⁵ Christopher Anthony Matthew and Aelianus, *The Tactics of Aelian*, 21.

creating a disciplined and fit soldier, replicated in the military film drill trope discussed at the beginning of the chapter.

Beyond this conscious ideological grounding, Aelian prescribes movements that, if performed, create an affective experience. The logic of these movements points to or suggests specific kinds of analyzable affect. Throughout this section, I will follow the logic of the language of Aelian to imagine an affective experience from his prescriptive and descriptive text. Of the many movements described by Aelian, two descriptors stand out as being particularly separate from daily movement, thus having the ability to create a unique affective experience to the close order training and battle of the Greek phalanx. The first was a unique approach to side-to-side movements that created a complete lack of movement that usually exists in quotidian life, lateral movement. There is no moment through Greek drill in this time in which a soldier will step to their side laterally. Every motion is a forward motion or a turn. There are also no steps backward. The body's momentum is always carried forward or in a centrifugal rotation. This is noted in the 32nd chapter on closing in files (files meaning columns of soldiers and ranks meaning rows) to make a tighter formation. He states, "If the phalanx is to adopt a closer order by moving to the right, the extreme file on the right wing is to stand fast. The other files will then turn to the pike [I.e. To their right]. They will then march to the right [to close the interval between the files], halt, and then turn to face the front."⁸⁶ This type of movement applies to backward marches. A soldier never moves backward; instead, he rotates in place, or the entire phalanx rotates as one. The "closing in the file" maneuver highlights the crisp and staccato movements of drill. A unified lateral slide or bunching together would be a much smoother flow of motion than the halts and turns required by Aelian.

⁸⁶ Christopher Anthony Matthew and Aelianus, *The Tactics of Aelian*, 89.

Affectively, the staccato starts and stops cause quick tensing and releasing of muscles with rapid jerks to change positions. The ever-forward motion keeps the head, shoulders, and hips always in alignment, never allowing sway. This builds a semi-mechanical affect of precision in which the body can and should move with exactness.

This unspoken rule, found only through the lacking movements, is evident in a maneuver called the Epistraphē. This occurs when the phalanx is in tight formation when, because of bulky panoply, the soldier is unable to about-face in the tight close ranks. “Under these circumstances, the entire formation wheels about, just as a ship is put about, with the individual soldiers preserving their relative position to each other without breaking. When it is necessary to wheel to the pike [i.e. to the right] the file leader on the right of the line stands fast, like the pivot of a gate, and the remainder of the entire formation wheels around him.”⁸⁷ In this example, the forward motion happens in a context of close proximity and a larger hinging motion for the phalanx as a whole. This affective experience was likely incredibly different than the closing file described above. In this maneuver, each soldier had to acutely tune into the soldier’s position on either side of him as his body remained forward-facing. Kinesthetic energy, warmth, sound, peripheral vision, and touch would have guided the giant “ship” around the hinge. The individual did his own small hinge allowing one side of his body to stride longer than the other.

The second description of affective import that departs from quotidian life emphasizes silence and hyper-awareness at all times. Aelian devotes a chapter to silence and states, “It is absolutely necessary to preserve silence so that the word of command be distinctly heard and promptly obeyed.” Here we learn that large units were at times commanded by voice or visual

⁸⁷ Christopher Anthony Matthew and Aelianus, *The Tactics of Aelian*, 67.

signal and it was expected that these signals would be adhered to exactly. This would require attunement and focus.⁸⁸ Aelian then quotes Homer to support his advocacy for silence, “The Achaeans came on in silence, breathing boldness, their minds set on supporting each other.” By incorporating Homer’s epic into his military manual in this section, Aelian further enlightens an intended or possible affective experience down to breath. Christopher Matthew, the translator and editor of the 2012 edition of *The Tactics of Aelian*, notes that silence is a particularly interesting distinction for Aelian (and by extension, possibly for the army of Alexander the Great, which he describes) because previous eras were known for marching with song and music.⁸⁹ Aelian describes commands sometimes being given by trumpet, but hoplites marched and maneuvered in silence to hear those brief commands. The previous forms of drill having music enhanced the affect that comes with silence in Alexander’s army.

The intellectual state, a fixation of supporting one another, is enhanced affectively by proximity and potential for entrainment. Teresa Brennan describes entrainment as, “a process whereby one person’s or one group’s nervous and hormonal systems are brought into alignment with another’s.”⁹⁰ She elaborates, “Entrainment is a name for the process whereby human affective responses are linked and repeated...by olfactory and other sensory means accounts for situations where people act as one mind.”⁹¹ In Homer’s example and the case of soldiers in a phalanx, breath and mutual support connect. In a state of silence and likely stillness before orders are called, bodily sounds are some of the most prominent stimuli. As the hoplite wait in anticipation for their commands, this breath could begin to entrain. Entrainment of breath can be heightened along with

⁸⁸ Christopher Anthony Matthew and Aelianus, *The Tactics of Aelian*, 131.

⁸⁹ Christopher Anthony Matthew and Aelianus, 185.

⁹⁰ Teresa Brennan, *The Transmission of Affect* (Cornell University Press, 2004), 9.

⁹¹ Christopher Anthony Matthew and Aelianus, *The Tactics of Aelian*, 52.

every sensation in a body in anticipation (tight muscles and increased heart rate). This is not an intellectual responsibility of brotherly support alone but a pre-linguistic bodily affect of mutual connection and anticipation.

These two affective descriptions found in the manual, the lack of horizontal movement and the dedication to silence, exist within the time of Aelian's writing (ca 136 C.E.) and the period that he describes (336 B.C.E-323 B.C.E). As Bryant demonstrates, broad Greek military tactics can be and have been connected to Greek ideologies. The nature of affect as physical and as the potential sensory information that develops into emotion and ideas once categorized by the brain leads me to explore the affect of the phalanx with an ideology based on the body itself. Writing on aesthetics in dance, which I apply to movement I read as performance broadly, Randy Martin argues, "While aesthetics and politics can be conceptualized apart from each other, any expression of one — whether in the concert happening or the statehouse— assumes an articulation of the other."⁹² The movement in the phalanx and the affect felt within it were not only correlated to the political and social sphere, but they were articulations of one another.

For the Greeks from the archaic period through the Imperial period described by Aelian, the physical (I would say affective) was also moral. The body's function carried virtue within it, for example, by one of the Greek ideas of masculinity, *andreia*. *Andreia* is simply defined as masculine courage. Its primary and ideal use is in battle. Its early Homeric use is of a physical nature as a quality assigned to heroes who stand their ground in battle and use their powerful strength to defeat their enemies. The word takes a sizeable shift in Classical Athens along with the invention of the phalanx and the hoplites of which it was composed. The hoplites were soldiers

⁹² Randy Martin, *Critical Moves: Dance Studies in Theory and Politics*, 24.

who abandoned Homeric heroes' individuality for the unity of a powerful attack unit, but they also represented a new class of citizens. *Andreia* then shifts from a sign of solely physical courage to courage in battle, coupled with a commitment to the *polis*.⁹³ The hoplite was the ideal form of *andreia*, and no other could fully measure up, including women, enslaved people, and teachers/intellectuals. This masculinity, equated with military courage and dedication to the *polis*, was implied as physical and intrinsic. In a funeral oration, the general Pericles compares *andreia* to Spartan masculinity. He notes that Spartan masculinity was motivated by an external discipline (*nomos*). By contrast, *andreia* is an innate disposition.⁹⁴

The weaving of virtue and physicality compacts even more in Imperial Greece. *Andreia*, being masculinity, was a trait only allotted to men in the culture. The courage displayed by women could not be categorized as *andreia*. To encourage adherence to this virtue, "Greek and Roman parents wishing to conceive a virtuous son could take an active role in guaranteeing prominent biological signs of maleness in their offspring" through various diets and behaviors of the mother. Once born, male infants were bound with gauze to enhance masculine features and then schooled through young adulthood in masculine virtues, contemporary ideology, and physical training.⁹⁵ Their physical state reflected their perceived innate virtue. Imperial Greek *andreia* also seemed to reflect endurance as a core aspect in addition to courage and devotion to the state.⁹⁶ In *The*

⁹³ Bassi, "Semantics of Manliness," essay, in *Andreia: Studies in Manliness and Courage in Classical Antiquity*, ed. Ralph M. Rosen and Ineke Sluiter (Leiden: Brill, 2003), 43.

⁹⁴ Bassi. "Semantics of Manliness." Essay. In *Andreia: Studies in Manliness and Courage in Classical Antiquity*, 47.

⁹⁵ Joy Connolly, "Like the Labor of Herades: *Andreia* and *Paideia* in Ancient Rome," essay, in *Andreia: Studies in Manliness and Courage in Classical Antiquity*, ed. Ralph M. Rosen and Ineke Sluiter (Leiden: Brill, 2003), 298.

⁹⁶ Joy Connolly, "Like the Labor of Herades: *Andreia* and *Paideia* in Ancient Rome," essay, in *Andreia: Studies in Manliness and Courage in Classical Antiquity*, 309.

Nicomachean Ethics, Aristotle accounted for endurance in *andreia* by writing that “men are sometimes called *anderioi* for enduring pain.”⁹⁷ This endurance element was applied to men outside of war only in Imperial Greece to those who had endured great hardship. In this latter definition, virtue is directly tied to physicality and affect as pain. Ideally, men would achieve *andreia* by standing firm in battle through great pain in service to their state. They could enhance their *andreia* by demonstrating physical strength, endurance, and civic responsibility, as all would aid their ability to be courageous in battle.

Even as democracy and civic duty shifted in Imperial Greece, hoplite soldiers demonstrated this courageous masculinity by virtue of their identity, embodying an ideal form of *andreia*. They formed it through their actions and could only strip it away through acts of cowardice. In following Martin’s approach to movement and politics, one as an articulation of the other, I seek the affective experience of the phalanx as an articulation of *andreia* and vice versa. In the first movement example, the lack of lateral and backward movement, I established the phalanx as characterized by a precise and staccato movement. In the context of *andreia*, one could read this as a lack of flexibility and steadfastness. To read movement through the eyes of normative twenty-first-century masculinity may imply stubbornness. Still, to appeal to the positive virtue of *andreia*, the courage and determination in battle can be brought forth through the hard and fast movements with no room for misalignment. The quick tightening and releasing of muscles promote encountering change not with elasticity but with adjustment then force. Courage in masculinity is not read in this context as cunning, a lateral movement that smooth affectation may allow, but as an eager and hard strength.

⁹⁷ Joy Connolly, “Like the Labor of Heracles: *Andreia* and *Paideia* in Ancient Rome,” essay, in *Andreia: Studies in Manliness and Courage in Classical Antiquity*, 310.

The Epistraphē hinge maneuver may bring out the communalizing aspect Bryant argues for in early Athens. His argument stems from the intellectual realization that the lack of separation of classes in the phalanx into one hoplite class was not conducive to aristocratic government. From a solely intellectual standpoint, the Imperial Greek phalanx still had its class system. However, the Epistraphē creates an affective state wherein the body is hyper-aware of the other bodies in relation to itself and to the other bodies' states of being (speed, angle, etc.). The individual body then moves not at a speed and distance set in practice but at one set by the kinesthetic response to other bodies as stimuli. The body regulates itself so finely tuned to the other bodies that one side of the body is attuned to the person to the right, and the other side of the body is attuned to the person on the left. This awareness of others with immediate reactivity in oneself, likely in an affective and not intellectually processing state, demonstrates a deep connection with others in the phalanx. In a state of intellectual processing, the phalanx is divided by class; in pre-processing or affective state, there is an innate oneness. If, as Pericles argued, *andreia* is innate or can become intrinsic, perhaps its qualities may also exist in that sphere. This reactivity reflects or creates an *andreia* not necessarily of equality, as Bryant might argue for the phalanx, but of consideration and awareness. In the process of ordering affect into emotion and feeling, one might recognize the bonding or awareness of soldiers around oneself and apply that to consideration for fellow citizens and devotion to the state.

In the affective example of silence and anticipation, the soldier's consideration shifts toward oneness. The previous maneuver took great skill to be aware of the fellow soldier, but when Aelian speaks of silence and invokes Homer, breath is centralized. As the phalanx stands in silence and begins to breathe together, their primary stimulus is the sound of the breath of their fellow soldiers and bonding could occur. This is not a principle outlined by Greek philosophers as a key

to *andreia*. One is not required to be one with their fellow soldiers to be considered masculine. However, the collective phalanx itself is masculine as it features all of the qualities of *andreia*: courage, endurance, and service to the state. Karen Bassi writes, “Being a man is the effect of a disciplinary regime in which the collective actions are modeled on the individual actions of the hero.”⁹⁸ Aelian names parts of the phalanx after different body parts (the mouth, the head, the navel, etc.), implying that the phalanx functions as one body. However, it is the micro affective experiences of each soldier that allow the phalanx to function as such and secure *andreia* for the unit. Each soldier must individually stand in silence to allow the breath of their fellow soldiers to be their primary soundscape to create entrainment.

The soldiers may have experienced the affect needed to promote steadfast courage and an awareness that brings devotion to the state, but as hoplites, the soldiers were also the ideal manifestation of *andreia* to all men. It is through the true affective experience of war that hoplites can obtain *andreia*, but the society, collectively, obtained *andreia* through its hoplites. This may have occurred through representation but also through the transmission of affect. In conducting drill (in training and in battle), hoplites were rehearsing an ideal masculinity, a masculine identity, and feeling its affects. When home, they became part of the social kinesthetic and influenced the masculinity of those around them. *Andreia*, then, becomes part of the knowledge held in the movements of close order formations for other generations.

⁹⁸ Bassi. “Semantics of Manliness.” Essay. In *Andreia: Studies in Manliness and Courage in Classical Antiquity*, 34.

2.3 Forward, March: Drill Reformation in Early Modern England

(Some spellings have been adjusted in quotes for ease of reading. Where possible, I have kept the original spelling.)

Sir Francis Bacon said,

No body can be healthful without exercise, neither natural body nor politic; and certainly to a kingdom or estate, a just and honorable war, is the true exercise. A civil war, indeed, is like the heat of a fever; but a foreign war is like the heat of exercise, and serveth to keep the body in health; for in a slothful peace, both courages will effeminate, and manners corrupt.⁹⁹

For this Early Modern philosopher-politician and his contemporaries, the body, the military, and masculinity were all bound together. Both the physical and political bodies needed the exercise that war provided to shake off any effeminizing sloth.

By the Early Modern period, England had developed numerous ideological contributors to the masculine model different from the time and place of Greek *andreia*. Catholicism, Protestantism, and Puritanism were all fighting for religious, ideological control during the early Stuart era, and they all had slightly varied recommendations for what creates the ideal man. At this time, educated boys also learned Aristotle's ethics and the Stoic tradition. These classical works instilled a dependence on virtues, but varying religious leanings could sway which of the classic virtues were taught or emphasized.¹⁰⁰ Scientifically, humoral medical doctrine created

⁹⁹ Francis Bacon, "Of the True Greatness of Kingdomes or Estates," essay, in *The Oxford Francis Bacon*, ed. M Kiernan (Oxford: Clarendon, 1985), 97.

¹⁰⁰ Raquel Serrano González, "The Double Marriage: A Gendered Approach to Politics and Power," in *(Re)Defining Gender in Early Modern English Drama Power, Sexualities and Ideologies in Text and Performance*, ed. Laura Martínez-García and María José Álvarez-Faedo (Bern: Peter Lang AG, Internationaler Verlag der Wissenschaften, 2021), 196.

explanations for normative gender roles and prescribed masculine emotions based on the balance of the humors, like masculine anger for which there was a counter feminine anger.¹⁰¹ This was also the era of the beginnings of English colonialism, with its gendered metaphors for land, wealth, and peoples.

To distill the masculine ideology of the era would be disingenuous, given the possible avenues one could take on the masculine journey of the age. What was evident in a post-Elizabeth England, after the long reign of a queen, and now with a male peace-centered monarch James I (James VI of Scotland), is that gender was not far from the public's mind.¹⁰² The monarchical gender change was accompanied by a change spreading on the continent, what scholars now call "the Military Revolution." Military practices started to shift dramatically, and James was slow to catch on with these advancements in England's peaceful state. James I's political naysayers publicly used derisive gendered language as a tool to convince the public that James' strategy was not the best and to advocate their cause to reform the English military. Sir John Oglander wrote, "King James was the most cowardly man that I ever knew."¹⁰³ The implication that declining a fight was not masculine and their other gendered language enhanced any connection that already

¹⁰¹ Raquel Serrano González, "The Double Marriage: A Gendered Approach to Politics and Power," 192.

¹⁰² James I was seen as relatively peaceful due to his dual rulership over England and Scotland, thus limiting potential Scottish conflict. James also declined to go to war with Spain in the 1620s after having signed a peace treaty in 1604. This received vitriol from much of the English Nobility.

Susan Doran, "Monarchy and Masculinity in Early Modern England," in *The Palgrave Handbook of Masculinity and Political Culture in Europe*, ed. Christopher Fletcher et al. (London: Macmillan Publishers Ltd., 2018), pp. 201-224, 215

¹⁰³ Susan Doran, "Monarchy and Masculinity in Early Modern England," 215.

existed between soldiering, violence and the male ideal.¹⁰⁴ War was a primary way to demonstrate masculinity for the individual and country.

In time, James became aware of these attacks against his masculinity and acquiesced to military change. The monarch, merchant, and aristocratic classes proved their individual and collective masculinity by embracing the practices from the continent, those of the Military Revolution.¹⁰⁵ Through military ability, men could exhibit and rehearse key masculine values affectively. The crown ensured that all soldiers adopted these practices by installing regular drill practices and by publishing military manuals. Through these manuals, I am able to investigate the movements and practices of soldiers in training as they rehearse the ideological and physical purposes of the crown, one of which is martial masculine pride. As the soldiers practiced these maneuvers, they gained skill, which was outwardly visible and reflected well on them and England. This skill and its image could project a masculine “martial prowess” as described by David R. Lawrence. Under the initial masculine projection, I argue that the affects produced by the movements prescribed in the manuals could serve the martial masculine ideal so desperately sought by the crown and country. Drill was fulfilling its masculine conceits affectively in addition to intellectual representation of skill. The movements, the manuals that advocate for them, and their popularity across Europe are accounted for in the theory of the early-modern “Military Revolution.”

¹⁰⁴ Raquel Serrano González, “The Double Marriage: A Gendered Approach to Politics and Power,” 189.

¹⁰⁵ David R. Lawrence, “Great Yarmouth’s Exercise: Honour, Masculinity, and Civic Military Performance in Early Stuart England,” in *Worth and Repute: Valuing Gender in Late Medieval and Early Modern Europe: Essays in Honour of Barbara Todd*, ed. Barbara J. Todd, Kim Kippen, and Lori Woods (Toronto: Centre for Reformation and Renaissance Studies, 2011), pp. 367-391, 376.

2.3.1 The Military Revolution

Scholar Michael Roberts first proposed the theory of the Military Revolution in the 1950s. Since then, scholars have argued for and against this idea, but it has largely become the standard in the discussion of Early Modern military practices and the birth of close order tactics as the west knows them today, including the use of drill. The revolution covers the time of 1560-1660 and focuses its beginnings on the Dutch Maurice of Orange and the Swiss Gustav Adolf. These and other reformers revitalized Greco-Roman military theories and practices. Maurice learned from a famed humanist and neo-stoicist, Justus Lipsius, who distilled in Maurice the necessity of order in life and battle.¹⁰⁶ Maurice curated these ideals and the vocabulary of the *Tactics of Aelian* into a system of not only training, which some in Europe had been doing at the time, but also of applied battle tactics.¹⁰⁷ Maurice used disciplined synchronized marching, formations, and commands to win in battle and to make civilians into soldiers.

Gustav Adolf made similar changes to the already prominent Swiss column or pike square. These practices spread across Europe due, in no small part, to the publication of Maurice's tactics in the pamphlet *Wapenhandelinge (The Exercise of Arms)*,¹⁰⁸ and the subsequent theorizations of the work. To some in Europe at the time, the order and discipline of drill fit into existing ideological frameworks. As Roberts describes, to many, the theories were "a strange and powerful fascination:

¹⁰⁶ David R. Lawrence, "The Complete Soldier: Military Books and Military Culture in Early Stuart England, 1603-1645" (dissertation, Brill, 2009), 139

¹⁰⁷ Michael Roberts, "Military Revolutions, 1560-1660," in *Military Revolution Debate: Readings on the Military Transformation of Early Modern Europe*, ed. Clifford J. Rogers (S.l.: ROUTLEDGE, 2019), 14-15

¹⁰⁸ David R. Lawrence, "The Complete Soldier," 144. Known in English as *The Exercise of Arms for Cavaliers, Muskets, and Pikes* with the authorship unknown.

it was an ‘invention, a science’ indeed.”¹⁰⁹ Soldiers and philosophers took an interest in these new tactics, and they spread along ideological lines. Robert notes that Louis XIII made swift use of the drill routines and loved the order they provided, not unlike the order he established with the Académie Française. The symmetry of drill matched his successor Louis XIV’s newly established parade grounds.¹¹⁰ Philosophical shifts in Europe might have also aligned with drill’s new exacting format. Theorists like Galileo Galilei, Descartes, and Spinoza were writing theories of geometry, mechanics and the body, and movement at the initiation of or during the Military Revolution. Descartes even served under Maurice of Orange in the Dutch Army and would have trained in these geometric maneuvers. For England in the reign of James I, hesitancy to adopt the principles and training methods of the Military Revolution affected perceptions of masculinity for the King and the country.

2.3.2 English Effeminacy

England was slower to adopt the new drill principles. Roberts argues that this was due to England’s licentiousness and the fact that the country at that time lacked the discipline or total government necessary to install such practices. This is certainly a possibility. Another possibility lies in James the I’s relative peace during this era. His ascension to the throne largely calmed tensions between Scotland and England as they now shared a monarch. He signed the Treaty of London of 1604 not long after Elizabeth’s death, putting an end to the war with Spain, and again

¹⁰⁹ Michael Roberts, “Military Revolutions, 1560-1660,” 25.

¹¹⁰ Michael Roberts, “Military Revolutions, 1560-1660,” 21.

refused to fight the Spanish in 1620. Many of Elizabeth's previous conflicts were under control, leaving little need for military focus.¹¹¹

Political writings from the time reflect dissatisfaction with James' peace mentality, especially after 1620. Criticisms of the King evoked a man having become effeminate. A significant way his critics did this was by positioning the emotion of fear as the opposite of honor, implying that honor is synonymous with courage of sorts. For example, an anti-Spanish pamphlet, *Vox Coeli* by John Reynolds, argues against James seeking an honorable, peaceful conclusion by negotiation by asking, "But is it possible King James feares Spaine...It seemes so, for else he would never love it so excessively... Agesilaus said, that words are feminine, and deeds masculine, and that it is a great point of honour, discretion, and happines for a Prince, to giue the first blowe to his Enimies."¹¹² Here, one cannot achieve honor through negotiation, nor can proper masculinity be demonstrated in negotiation. Therefore, the country needed to go to war for the King to achieve the honor and happiness of masculinity.

The presumption that a lack of military dedication constituted an emasculating trait was also applied to Englishman more generally. Writing about a tattoo and military maneuver performance in Yarmouth in 1638, David R. Lawrence (2011) notes that the occasion was so grand because Yarmouth's company was coming back from a reputation of a considerable time of laziness and disarray. Lawrence notes, "Social commentators, authors of conduct manuals, and a host of soldier-authors decried the poor state of the militia, troubled over what they saw as the growing effeminacy of Englishmen and the neglect of the military arts in favour of more leisured

¹¹¹ David R. Lawrence, "The Complete Soldier: Military Books and Military Culture in Early Stuart England, 1603-1645" (dissertation, Brill, 2009), 134.

¹¹² Susan Doran, "Monarchy and Masculinity in Early Modern England," 215.

pursuits.”¹¹³ Lawrence’s analysis of the perceived lazy and effeminate militia that has much to show by gaining skill aligns with the quote from Francis Bacon at the beginning of this section. Bacon claims that the opposite of laziness is the exercise which is rightly done through “just and honorable war” as he warns of sloth’s ability to effeminate. By rehearsing and gaining military skill and discipline, the militias of England could slough off their laziness and perform masculinity. England could accomplish this by circulating and practicing the words of drill manuals.

2.3.3 Drill Manuals

While James was battered by gender-coded political attacks via circulating pamphlets, thousands of English soldiers who had served in foreign wars on the continent brought back literature and tactics from their time abroad. Throughout the 1610s and 1620s, these soldiers used their training and manuals from the continent to help form independent clubs or military societies where veterans could train amateurs in drill. The veterans wrote new manuals modeled on tactics from the continent. Gentlemen segregated to train in two common locations, the Old Artillery Garden at Bishopsgate and the New Military Garden at St. Martin’s field. Centralizing a location allowed these clubs to grow considerably amongst the genteel officer class and allowed onlookers of all classes to watch the soldiers on parade as entertainment.¹¹⁴ The practice of allowing an onlooking audience spread throughout societies and militias outside of London. Out of the clubs

¹¹³ David R Lawrence, “Great Yarmouth’s Exercise: Honour, Masculinity, and Civic Military Performance in Early Stuart England,” in *Worth and Repute: Valuing Gender in Late Medieval and Early Modern Europe: Essays in Honour of Barbara Todd*, ed. Barbara J. Todd, Kim Kippen, and Lori Woods (Toronto: Centre for Reformation and Renaissance Studies, 2011), pp. 367-391, 377.

¹¹⁴ David R. Lawrence, "The Complete Soldier," 11.

came approximately ninety manuals, exercise guides, and treatises written independently of the crown or official military channels.¹¹⁵

Most manuals were derivative of Maurice's *Wapenhandelinge (The Exercise of Arms)*, and the publishers often directly copied the illustrations therein done by Jacques de Gheyn. John Bingham republished his own *Tacticks of Aelian* in 1616 after he learned that it was the inspiration for the new, spreading tactics abroad. Some English manuals outlined movements for pikes, muskets, and cavalry, while others provided a guide to military life. In 1623, James and his privy council¹¹⁶ centralized the training of the military by releasing a manual from the crown, *Instructions for the Musters and Armes, and use thereof*.¹¹⁷ The privy council distributed their manual throughout the country to trained captains. Military societies used this manual, but independent manuals were still published, distributed, and practiced.

To capture the movement of the drill practices, I focus on two drill manuals with seemingly varied perspectives but with similar written results. The first is James and the privy council's 1623 *Instructions*, which chiefly states postures and movements for musketeers and pikemen. The second is an independent manual representing how those outside official channels were training before the release of *Instructions*. *Military Directions or the art of training: plainly demonstrating how every good soldier ought to ballad himself in the wars* by Edward Davies was printed in 1618 and is dedicated to Lord Compton, Baron of Compton, which is far enough from London that, at

¹¹⁵ David R. Lawrence, "The Complete Soldier," 56.

¹¹⁶ Veterans who sat on the Privy Council at the time included William Lord Compton, Sir Edward Conway, Sir Horace Vere, and Sir Edward Cicil, and it is believed that they penned the manual.

¹¹⁷ Most Honourable Privy Counsaile, "Instructions for the Musters and Armes and Use Thereof," *Instructions for the Musters and Armes and Use Thereof* (London: Bonham Norton and John Bill Printers of the King, 1626).

the time, it provides a regional perspective. Davies was also known to frequent the school of war at Ludlow Castle in Shropshire, far from London and the privy council's view.¹¹⁸ I use the movement prescribed and described in both of these manuals and align their potential affect to Early Modern ideas of masculinity.

2.3.4 Affect

In the ruling ideology of the time, the early seventeenth-century body was given life by the soul, and the medical philosophy was a pre-Cartesian reliance on the humors. Bodily phenomena and physical sensations, including emotions, came from the humors.¹¹⁹ In addition to considerations for the soul and the humors, the head was also seen as a controller of the body. In a proclamation from King James in 1616, we see how much, at least royal, ideology relied on the head as the source of thought and control. He says:

The proper office of a King towards his Subjects, agrees very wel with the office of the head towards the body, and all members thereof: For from the head, being the seate of Iudgement, proceedeth the care and foresight of guiding, and preuenting all euill that may come to the body or any part thereof. The head cares for the body, so doeth the King for his people. As the discourse and direction flowes from the head, and the execution according thereunto belongs to the rest of the members, euery one according to their office: so it is betwixt a wise Prince, and his people... And as there is euer hope of curing any diseased member by the direction of the head, as long as it is whole; but by the contrary, if it be troubled, all the members are partakers of that paine, so is it betwixt the Prince and his people.¹²⁰

¹¹⁸ David R. Lawrence, "The Complete Soldier," 164.

¹¹⁹ Susan Doran, "Monarchy and Masculinity in Early Modern England," 196.

¹²⁰ The Political Works of James I: Reprinted from the Edition of 1616. James I. Charles Howard McIlwain. Cambridge. Harvard University Press. 1918. "THE TREW LAW OF FREE MONARCHIES: OR THE RECIPROCK AND MVTUALL DVETIE BETWIXT A FREE KING AND HIS NATURALL SUBJECTS"

James' bodily metaphor links politics to the body and demonstrates the perceived direction of power in both politics and the human as being from the top down. However, James freely admits that the head is powerless to act without the motility of the body and the people. He also notes connectivity in the body and the people when he states that any illness or unalignment could hurt the whole.

Through James' metaphor, we can understand an ideology of the mind-body relationship that would have been well served by drill if the goal was masculinizing the body. At the time, control over passions (putting the head before the body) was a true sign of masculinity and was a trait with which women could not be attributed.¹²¹ Memorizing and performing the tailored maneuvers of drill, especially in the heat of battle, shows such mastery and control, a masculine trait. We can also mark how an organized military system, perhaps popularized by the people but decreed and distributed from the crown, could do the same for the politics and identity of a country.

Contrary to the head over the body theory of King James, I point to the many hours of practice and rehearsal that help to define drill and argue that a significant element of drill, and its efficacy in battle, is that the body is so practiced that it can function exactly without overreliance on the mind. Putting the mind first, as James might, would certainly cause a momentary delay, for one must think before acting. When hundreds of soldiers move together as one, this is impractical and dangerous. I argue that while soldiers are thinking and transcribing many sensations into emotions and conscious thought, much of drill and drill-based battle is a matter of affect, or the moment before sensation is categorized into words. The masculinity that is performed in the larger

¹²¹ Susan Doran, "Monarchy and Masculinity in Early Modern England," 192.

picture of drill is dependent on the small affective moments of drill that make it function in ways that support and negate the Early Modern masculine ideal.

Davies' independent manual *Art of Training* offers a quality to drill movement that was not evidenced in Western warfare before the Military Revolution: that of synchronized marching.¹²² Aelian's *Tactics* prescribes exactness in movements and formation but never makes mention of a unity of timing. Davies writes, "There is another war-like rule to be observed (that the souldier being ready to march, and attending word of command) which may well bee compared to a dancer... by hearing the sound of the drumme is ready to march forward, the first ranke to beginne, the second to follow, the third...keeping even pace."¹²³ Pacing became an essential drill element, notable enough for Davies to evoke dance when writing on the topic. Soldiers used drums and horns in ancient Greek drill as signals, but there is no evidence that they kept time. Michael Roberts supports this claim, arguing that "the demand for unanimity and precision of movement led naturally to the innovation of *marching* in step, which appears at some date impossible to establish about the middle of the seventeenth century."¹²⁴ With Davies' mention of keeping even pace compared to dance as a rule in *Art of Training* in 1618, it seems likely that the march step emerged instead by the *early* seventeenth century.

The process of becoming unified or synchronized is affective. In addition to affective entrainment via sound and breath discussed earlier, entrainment can happen through rhythm and interaction, both of which happen constantly when marching in unison. In *Timing of Affect*, Bernd

¹²² Sun Tzu's *The Art of War* from 4th-century B.C.E China mentions large-scale soldier synchronization of marches and movements to a drum. Sun Tzu, *The Art of War*, trans. Griffith, B Samuel (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1963), 58.

¹²³ E.D.W. Davies, "Military Directions or the Art of Training: Plainly Demonstrating Hoe Every Good Soldier Ought to Behave in Warfare," *Printed by Edward Griffin London*, 1618, 22.

¹²⁴ Michael Roberts, "Military Revolutions, 1560-1660," 25.

Bösel discusses developmental psychology's idea of "affective attunement." The theory is based on the communication between mother and infant. When the mother does an action or vocalizes to the infant, and the infant responds, the mother will reflect and inhabit some forms of the infant's affective response. This continues on the infant's side and creates a form of matching between the two. Bösel applies interaction through attunement to other affective communication and interpretation between more than one person or in a group. He calls these moments affect attunement interactions.¹²⁵ The matching that occurs in attunement between mother and child is similar to the affective attunement interactions occurring constantly to create unified marching.

During synchronized marching steps, or what Davies describes in his manual as like a dancer "keeping even pace," the soldiers are not following one leader.¹²⁶ Instead, to achieve the objective laid out by Davies, they are likely making constant minor adjustments to place themselves in perfect unison with those around them, many of whom are in their periphery.¹²⁷ They are not alone in this action; the other soldiers are in constant interaction or response to them. All of these adjustments, pauses, and speeding up, are minuscule and constant to the point that they are often unnoticed by the soldier unless a significant change needs to be made. The small, unnoticed adjustments are affective attunement interaction. When a soldier is out of attunement to

¹²⁵ Bernd Bösel, "Affective Synchronization, Rhythmanalysis, and Polyphonic Qualities of the Present Moment," in *Timing of Affect Epistemologies of Affection*, ed. Marie-Luise Angerer (Zürich u.a: Diaphanes: Verlag nicht ermittelbar, 2014), 91.

¹²⁶ Each rank, or row, follows the next until they are all marching. This manual nor *Instructions* cite following a singular leader.

¹²⁷ I speak from experience to some of the movements described by Davies through my contemporary lens, having participated in dance and drill teams throughout my life. I cannot know the Early Modern soldier's subjectivity or affect, but I theorize based on only elements of the movements or parts of qualities that may continue through time.

a large degree, affect must move to awareness, and thought comes into play, often counterproductively as the mind attempts to control the body back into step.

Synchronization is also able to happen through timing and rhythm. Affect itself can be defined temporally: as a moment of time or an interval between sensation and thought or an “intermediate zone” where energy travels between sensation and consequence.¹²⁸ Rhythm and synchronized marching also both depend on a temporal space in-between. Affectively, the highest intensity of sensation in a synchronized march step potentially occurs on the beat or the step when the foot hits the ground and shock waves run through the body. However, the adjustment of elongating or shortening, the attunement, happens in the space between as a lifted, gliding non-space between here and there. The moments of affective attunement interaction are not the moments that are most visible or conscious. It is the beat of the step that marks precision or error. The soldier has to experience both the intensity of the step and the flow of the in-between.

The measure of a soldier’s precision reflects a focus on discipline applied to other masculine qualities and passions of the time. Anger was encouraged and seen as masculine in the martial or honorable context, though it was feminine in rage and revenge.¹²⁹ Reigning ideology considered masculine fortitude as a virtue only when courage combines with the discipline of prudence, not with courage alone.¹³⁰ Demonstrating the ability to keep emotions under control was the masculine ideal. Having tight control over when movements started and stopped or precision

¹²⁸ Marie-Louise Angerer, “Affective Knowledge: Movement, Interval, Plasticity ,” in *Timing of Affect Epistemologies of Affection*, ed. Marie-Luise Angerer (Zürich u.a: Diaphanes: Verlag nicht ermittelbar, 2014), 106.

¹²⁹ Susan Doran, “Monarchy and Masculinity in Early Modern England,” 199.

¹³⁰ Susan Doran, “Monarchy and Masculinity in Early Modern England,” 204

in keeping the beat, even on the chaotic battlefield, was an opportunity for soldiers to exercise the virtue of masculine control.

The moments in-between the steps created the opportunity to establish emotional entrainment and comradery. Bösel states that a partnership or group in unison can move beyond affective attunement into entrainment as they keep a beat together. When their “flow of interaction” and adjustments are practiced enough, they will move into anticipation instead of reaction.¹³¹ The units drilling together on the Old Artillery Garden or regularly in their home village may have been able to reach a point of combined anticipative and reactive adjustments to create unison. Bösen writes, “This corporeal process leads, if sufficiently intense, to emotional entrainment, as well.”¹³² The intensity of drilling or battle may have created physical and emotional bonds not just because of time spent together or the regular experience of war, but also because of deep anticipatory affective communication. However, the bulk of that type of communication would have happened not in the disciplined moments of the step or the beat but the in-between adjustment. By establishing comradery, these soldiers could build masculine reputations for themselves and the crown, especially when working in independent training clubs. They could also feel a sense of masculine accomplishment. Bösel contends that synchronization during ritual, especially, can create a bond of solidarity, “There are also indications about how long the feelings of solidarity and belonging created in interaction rituals remains – more or less a

¹³¹ Bernd Bösel, “Affective Synchronization, Rhythmanalysis, and Polyphonic Qualities of the Present Moment,” in *Timing of Affect Epistemologies of Affection*, ed. Marie-Luise Angerer (Zürich u.a: Diaphanes: Verlag nicht ermittelbar, 2014), 93.

¹³² Bernd Bösel, “Affective Synchronization, Rhythmanalysis, and Polyphonic Qualities of the Present Moment,” 93.

week.¹³³ The regularly practiced affects that were possible through the movement embedded in the drill of Early Modern military manuals could establish actual ritual and connection.

The potentiality of emotional entrainment encoded in the drill movements of these manuals may have brought soldiers close to the concepts of fraternity and civic belonging that existed in masculine duty. “In Manhood, Masculinity, and Early Modern England,” Tim Reinke-Williams argues that participation in civic militias allowed men access to public life. Being a public man was thought to display many virtues, including wisdom, justice, and temperance. In addition, being known publicly as part of the military and participating in military performances brought even more masculinity. Reinke-Williams states, “Through public performances such as training drills and the enactment of mock battles, company members were able to display their honour, military prowess, order and discipline, fraternity, self-sacrifice and commitment to the common good.”¹³⁴ The perceived masculine display of fraternity owed to public service also occurred through affective entrainment. In a chapter on rhythmic entrainment, affect researcher and neuroscientist Wiebke Trost points to behavioral experiments that showed that participants who synchronized movements with a partner increased cooperation and “reported to make the partner also appear more similar to oneself, and consequently increases the feeling of compassion, [and] social affiliation.”¹³⁵ Through marching in time, rhythmic entrainment may have allowed soldiers to feel committed to each other but also to civil identities locally and country-wide. Those involved in

¹³³ Bernd Bösel, “Affective Synchronization, Rhythmanalysis, and Polyphonic Qualities of the Present Moment,” 93.

¹³⁴ Tim Reinke-Williams, “Manhood and Masculinity in Early Modern England,” *History Compass* 12, no. 9 (2014): pp. 685-693, 689.

¹³⁵ Wiebke Trost, “Time Flow and Musical Emotions in the Role of Rhythmic Entrainment,” essay, in *Timing of Affect Epistemologies of Affection*, ed. Marie-Luise Angerer (Zürich u.a: Diaphanes: Verlag nicht ermittelbar, 2014).

these exercises were all men; thus, the entrainment, community, and social affiliation was occurring along gendered lines to devote the soldiers to a male body politic.

I have demonstrated that fraternity was a quality that had the potential to be felt through drill in Early Modern England. The other qualities listed above may have been reputation more than affect. However, soldiers could have felt the masculine quality of fortitude through drill and battle practices at the time. Fortitude is a “courage united with prudence [that] was ‘the meane betwixt the two vices, boldnes and timidity’ (the latter of course also associated with a womanish nature).¹³⁶ The manuals give several moments of such fortitude. The Crown’s *Instructions* provides examples of the stillness and courageous strength required in the face of receiving fire from the enemy. “We give fire by the flanke thus; the outermost file nest the enemy must be commanded to make ready, keeping still, along with the body, till such time as they be ready, and they turn to the right or left hand, according to the fight of the enemy...and give fire. And when they have discharged they stir not. But keep their ground, and charge their peeces again in the same place they stand.”¹³⁷ In this example, musketeers are conducting a traveling maneuver. In the name of unison, they wait until all in the flank are set in location before firing, thus open to receive enemy fire. Once they have discharged their weapons, “Instructions” commands them to “keep their ground” and reload where they stand, still receiving fire.

As a physicality in contrast to marching, keeping ground contains no millisecond moment in-between. Instead, it is an elongated moment of waiting. The soldier is either waiting, shooting,

¹³⁶ Valerius, *Casket of Jewels* as quoted by Susan Doran, “Monarchy and Masculinity in Early Modern England,” in *The Palgrave Handbook of Masculinity and Political Culture in Europe*, ed. Christopher Fletcher et al. (London: Macmillers Publishers Ltd., 2018), pp. 201-224, 204.

¹³⁷ Most Honourable Privy Counsaile, “Instructions for the Musters and Armes and Use Thereof,” *Instructions for the Musters and Armes and Use Thereof* (London: Bonham Norton and John Bill Printers of the King, 1626), 6.

or reloading. Only one of those moments is actively fighting or protecting himself. According to the definition of fortitude above, courage and prudence must coexist in those still or unguarded moments of fortitude. For courage to exist, there must be fear. Davies describes the battlefield in *Art of Training* as follows: “Tumult that will grow amongst them, and that they cannot hear one another, have trumpets to give the charge, which yeildeth great comfort and courage thereof so plain, that in all distress and repulses they do not onely hold and keepe together, but also know their charge.”¹³⁸ Here he counsels the soldier to hold and keep together, but he also describes tumult, distress, and repulses. An interrogation of the sensations of keeping ground includes but is not limited to sudden sounds of musket fire by the neighboring flanks at equal and orderly intervals, shouldering and unshouldering the musket, keeping the body at attention with the musket shouldered, and perhaps the terrible sensation of a musket ball whizzing past.

Unlike the moments of unison with fellow soldiers where constant outward checking and adjusting occurs, it seems the body would direct affective processing of stillness inward. The goal is to stand ground despite the outside world, not to be in compliance with it. Barring moments of shock, the sensations and affects of the moment may enlist a physical response contrary to the goals of stillness. I would argue that the soldier becomes hyper-aware of these sensations and works to fight physical urges to react or works to ignore them. This intellectual control over the body aligns perfectly with ideal masculinity. Susan Doran notes, “Of the four cardinal virtues, temperance and prudence were especially linked to reason, as they were thought to be located in the mind,” and that “reason was perceived as dominant in men.”¹³⁹ Prudence is what brings

¹³⁸ E.D.W. Davies, "Military Directions or the Art of Training: Plainly Demonstrating Hoe Every Good Soldier Ought to Behave in Warfare," *Printed by Edward Griffin London*, 1618, 23.

¹³⁹ Susan Doran, "Monarchy and Masculinity in Early Modern England," 203-204.

courage to masculine fortitude because it implies the use of control through the mind. So, likewise, in these moments of stillness, the mind and instinct are negotiating with the affects the body receives.

Another quality present in the Early Modern manuals and not the *Tactics of Aelian* is a kind of unity between stillness and synchronization, that of leading and following. File leaders were always at the forefront while the ranks behind trailed along. However, these manuals demonstrate a timed system of stillness, anticipation, and action. A section on charging with pikes in Davies' *Art of Training* notes, "The foremost ranke is to raise up before the second, the second before the third, the third.....Then they are to charge their pikes from hand in imitating the aforelaid directions, which is, that the foremost rank does fall and charge first, then the second, and so all the rest."¹⁴⁰ When pikemen were to start out in their marching or in their charge, they did it by rank (row) until all had joined. Synchronicity with those already on the march and those in your rank was still required. Here, if Davies' prescriptions were followed to the letter, the soldier would have to begin the entrainment of rhythm in a still position before affective attunement and emotional entrainment of motion.

Rhythmic entrainment occurs when the body's system aligns with external rhythm. Trost writes that strong external rhythms can interact with a listener's body to the point that the internal body rhythm alters, such as heart rate or breathing patterns.¹⁴¹ In Davies' description, there are easy transitions between movements from rank to rank by taking ordered and timed turns. In order to create a seamless flow of soldiers, the soldier might feel the marching rhythm, either from an

¹⁴⁰ E.D.W. Davies, "Military Directions or the Art of Training: Plainly Demonstrating Hoe Every Good Soldier Ought to Behave in Warfare," 21.

¹⁴¹ Wiebke Trost, "Time Flow and Musical Emotions in the Role of Rhythmic Entrainment," essay, in *Timing of Affect Epistemologies of Affection*, 215.

audible count or those already marching and allow their internal body rhythms to adjust. Conscious thought may certainly be involved, but the synchronization's exactness suggests that a somatic awareness of the rhythm would be needed to obtain Davies' standards. The rank by rank start also opens the door for small acts of agency in action among more individuals.

In most European warfare in the five hundred years preceding 1560, select soldiers were highly trained as individuals with their own horses. The untrained fighters were often relegated to a pike square, a semi-unorganized mass of pikemen advancing together. Any pikeman who wasn't at the front or back of the mass was essentially pushed along for the ride. Roberts explains the strategy of the medieval pikeman, "The mercenary in the middle of a pike-square needed little training and less skill: if he inclined his pike in correct alignment and leaned heavily on the man in front of him, he had done almost all that could be required of him."¹⁴² In contrast, the Early Modern pikeman had to be trained and skilled in marching. He also had to individually take the step from stillness to forward motion when it was his turn rather than be carried along like the center pikeman of the previous century.

The moment scripted by the manual in which the soldier takes the first step, coupled with the physicality of a shift from stillness to forward motion that that shift requires has the potential to create an affect of anticipation that rejects Early Modern masculine values. In *Expectancy and Emotion*, psychology researchers Maria Miceli and Cristiano Castelfranchi posit that anticipation is not an emotion on its own. Instead, it is a family of anticipatory emotions that include negative and positive emotions, including hope, fear, excitement, and anxiety. The family of emotions link through their qualities. For example, in anticipatory emotions of excitement and anxiety, that

¹⁴² Michael Roberts, "Military Revolutions, 1560-1660," 24.

quality is a state of automatic high arousal.¹⁴³ The anticipatory affect of high arousal, whether positive or negative, is one of extreme intensity. Both manuals script anticipatory moments not seen in the logic of pre-military reform pike-squares.

The Early Modern soldier encountered many moments of waiting and beginning in sync when his turn approached instead of a constant mass movement travel flow. *Instructions* again outlines the practice: “Two ranks must alwayes make ready together, and advance tenne paces forwards before the bodies... First, the first rank, and whilst the first gives fire, the second ranke keepe their muskets close to their refts, and their pannes guarded; and as soon as the first are fallen away, the second presently present and give fire, and fall after them.”¹⁴⁴ Each moment of waiting then acting in turn described in this passage allows affective high arousal that comes with anticipation. Suppose the state of the anticipatory affective quality of high arousal is over, often in a matter of seconds, and the soldier has made their choice to press on in accordance with the prescribed movements. In that case, the body theoretically lands in a new emotional state. Though the new state may still be one of high alert, as the soldier may still be in battle, some release of anticipation might occur in that transition. In a drill practice dictated by these manuals, that is full of these moments, a soldier might experience continual peaks and valleys of arousal and attention, moving from high mental alert to movements in which the unaware affective body takes control and regulates synchronicity evenly.

¹⁴³ Alison Wood Brooks, “Get Excited: Reappraising Pre-Performance Anxiety as Excitement,” *Journal of Experimental Psychology: General* 143, no. 3 (2014): pp. 1144-1158, <https://doi.org/10.1037/a0035325>, 1144.

¹⁴⁴ Most Honourable Privy Counsaile, “Instructions for the Musters and Armes and Use Thereof,” 4.

In an atmosphere where masculine temperance was one-half of the “golden mean”¹⁴⁵ that applies to all other qualities, control over all of one’s emotions was vital. A man achieved honor and masculinity through a tempered approach. Even martial anger was acceptable over a woman’s anger because it was perceived as regulated by temperance. The affective and emotional peaks and valleys of start and stop, follow the leader drill through anticipatory arousal is oppositional to regulated temperance and does not contribute to achieving the Early Modern English masculine ideal for the individual soldier. However, the precision that these actions supply to onlookers portrays an extreme amount of control if done well. In this way, the soldier enhances masculinity for England but moves individually further from an ideal affective masculine state.

In Davies’ introduction to *The Art of Training* he writes that his manual is for “demonstrating the path-way to the youths, & the many vnexpert traine-ment of this kingdome, to lead them to the marke, which is to become perfit and absolute souldiers. Who (having reaped a large haruest of peace vnder the most peacefull Monarch in Europe) are very raw & altogether ignorant in most points of Military exercise.”¹⁴⁶ In his recognition of the narrative of sloth and, therefore, effeminacy, Davies offers a solution: to become the perfect soldier. The new form of drill practices for that day could increase fraternity and devotion to the state. I could also increase public service through affective attunement and rhythmic entrainment, fortitude through stillness, and the perception of temperance in precision. However, its affective experience may have contradicted an ideal virtue of temperance for the individual. Through the practice and implementation of this drill, these soldiers were rehearsing aspects of the masculine ideal. In

¹⁴⁵ Prudence being the other. Susan Doran, “Monarchy and Masculinity in Early Modern England,” 204.

¹⁴⁶ E.D.W. Davies, "Military Directions or the Art of Training: Plainly Demonstrating Hoe Every Good Soldier Ought to Behave in Warfare," A3.

achieving martial skill, fraternity, fortitude, and temperance, even if only in perception, the installation of drill contributed to a vision of a more masculine England.

2.4 Change Step, March: Precision Drill and the Warrior Ethos

In the post-9/11 era, as women step into combat roles and soldiering increasingly includes diplomacy, stability operations, counterinsurgency, remote drone control, and other less combat-oriented actions, traditional military masculinity of the soldier is at stake.¹⁴⁷ If the soldier cannot prove honor, courage, and strength on the battlefield with (or in the threat of) violence, the dominating masculine ideal cannot come to fruition. In 2003, following a surge of women enlistments post 9/11, the U.S. Army adopted the new persona of “The Warrior” by introducing The Warrior Ethos, four lines of army values, into the existing Army Creed.¹⁴⁸ These new phrases in the creed are meant to build The Warrior out of the civilian that comes into training.

¹⁴⁷ Women’s roles in the US military have shifted consistently since 1994 when the “Risk Rule” of 1988 that barred women from serving in risk positions was repealed. Women could then serve all roles except those in direct ground combat. This meant women could serve in most Airforce and Navy positions and in many Army positions. In 2013, it was announced that the women-in-combat ban would be lifted. The ban was repealed in 2015 and integration occurred in 2016. Emma Moore, “Women in Combat: Five-Year Status Update,” Center for a New American Security (en-US), March 31, 2020, <https://www.cnas.org/publications/commentary/women-in-combat-five-year-status-update>.

¹⁴⁸ The percentage of “Female enlisted recruits” of all enlisted recruits peaked in 2000 at over 20%. Office of the Undersecretary of Defense, “Demographics of the U.S. Military,” Council on Foreign Relations (Council on Foreign Relations, July 13, 2020), <https://www.cfr.org/backgroundunder/demographics-us-military#chapter-title-0-8>.

I will always place the mission first.
I will never accept defeat.
I will never quit.
I will never leave a fallen comrade.¹⁴⁹

The persona built by these lines commits to focus on placing the mission and Army first, strong will in not accepting defeat, power and stamina to never quit, and sacrifice for fellow soldiers and the cause. The Warrior with these qualities is not gender-specific, nor is it occupation-specific. Indeed, The Warrior only needs to serve the Army and the country to live up to its honorable character. The Warrior, however, is not without *gendering*. Absorbing the previous traits of the masculine male soldier, The Warrior is just as strong and ready for war. The only element of military masculinity not required for “The Warrior” is cisgender maleness.

In *War and Gender*, Joshua Goldstein argues that constructed masculinity is always dependent and synonymous with the soldier and war. He postulates that societies needed people to go to war. As the physical attributes of maleness best fit the bill, the ideals of a man were attached to the qualities necessary for war, including courage, strength, and violence.¹⁵⁰ I question the certainty of this theory and believe it may not work in every culture. However, in the previous analysis of Greek *andreia*, it holds true. The masculinity that was *andreia* was courage in battle specifically and served as an ideal even for non-battling men.

If we accept that war may be an important contributing factor to the construction of masculinity, war and masculinity are tightly bound. The Warrior, though sexless, is still heavily gendered because The Warrior is the ideal participant in war. The Army’s purpose of introducing

¹⁴⁹ Gary Riccio et al., “Warrior Ethos: Analysis of the Concept and Initial Development of Application,” *Warrior Ethos: Analysis of the Concept and Initial Development of Application* § (n.d.),v.

¹⁵⁰ Joshua S. Goldstein, *War and Gender: How Gender Shapes the War System and Vice Versa*.

the Warrior Ethos and “inculcating”¹⁵¹ it into soldiers was to “ensure that all Soldiers, regardless of rank, branch or military occupational specialty, are prepared to engage the enemy in close combat, while serving as a part of a team of flexible, adaptable, well-trained and well-equipped Soldiers.”¹⁵² They needed all soldiers, even those in occupational roles far from battle, to embody the courage, honor, and skill of the ideal combat soldier which aligns with the qualities of an ideal man. Thus, The Warrior is highly masculine even without official gender.

I argue that The Warrior only maintains its masculinity through its place in the U.S. Army as a masculinized organization. Individual soldiers of all genders are initiated into that masculinity through basic or officer training, which includes drill.¹⁵³ Training is the rehearsal of the masculine male combat role, even if never realized, through which the civilian becomes “The Warrior.” In this way, The Warrior is a masculinity that is neither male nor female. The individual may see their masculine assurance fade once at their non-combat duties or as women, if not for their constant connection to The Army as a masculine umbrella. The Army sustains this masculinity, for itself and The Warrior, through regular drill, ceremonies, and stylized performance of the initiating masculine training. I analyze a recording of one of these performances, a precision drill performance from the US Army Drill Team, as a masculine performance of The Warrior Ethos.

The Warrior’s masculinity cannot be maintained through an individual performance of warrior values. Instead, it is maintained through institutional performance. Steven Gardiner

¹⁵¹ Gary Riccio et al., “Warrior Ethos: Analysis of the Concept and Initial Development of Application,” *Warrior Ethos: Analysis of the Concept and Initial Development of Application* § (n.d.),4.

¹⁵² Gary Riccio et al., “Warrior Ethos: Analysis of the Concept and Initial Development of Application,” 3.

¹⁵³ Soldiers often enter The Army through various training methods depending on their experience. For example, officers coming from ROTC programs will have already trained through their courses.

analyzes the linguistic ramifications of the new genderless Warrior. He argues that the increase of women in the ranks and the decrease in combat roles generally wasn't necessarily an "identity" crisis for the individual soldiers that were not on the front lines. Instead, for Gardiner, "The new military masculinity has 'led to an institutional identity crisis that has coalesced around a discourse of institutional gender, or put another way, around the very 'masculinity of the Army.'"¹⁵⁴ This institutional identity question cannot be solved by helping individual soldiers feel more masculine. Instead, the Warrior is a persona for every individual soldier and the entire Army that is maintained through public military performances.

After implementing The Warrior Ethos into the Army Creed, The Army sought ways to instill its values into the soldiers in a manner that would have direct results in operations and be part of the soldier's character. The Department of the Army knew that after initial training, actual battle was sporadic, and soldiers would not be able to embody The Warrior enough to sustain it. The Army Research Institute, under the Army administration's directive, conducted a study to identify ways that The Warrior values are instilled into the soldier. The returned report states, "[T]he average soldier is not continually exposed to conditions within which Warrior Ethos is clearly manifested and do not frequently experience the conditions that foster Warrior Ethos. This is the case whether they are in garrison or in a combat situation." The study then suggests possible solutions. They state: "There is a need and an opportunity to develop training curricula which foster the development and sustainment of Warrior Ethos."¹⁵⁵ They sought psychological and

¹⁵⁴ Steven L. Gardiner, "The Warrior Ethos: Discourse and Gender in the United States Army since 9/11," *Journal of War & Culture Studies* 5, no. 3 (2012): pp. 371.

¹⁵⁵ Gary Riccio et al., "Warrior Ethos: Analysis of the Concept and Initial Development of Application," 3.

sociological ways to instill The Warrior values that were needed to be ready for combat into each soldier.

The Army instills The Warrior values institutionally through public-facing performers of a masculine Army persona. This is especially effective by applying The Warrior Ethos onto preexisting, seemingly timeless, masculine performance. As the traditional performances adapt, such as increasing the number of women soldier performers, they hold to masculine performance practices and structures to carry the essence of the Warrior Ethos. Exemplifying this is The Old Guard or The 3rd Infantry Regiment, the oldest active-duty regiment of the U.S. Army. The regiment requires rigorous additional training and pristine appearance. It almost exclusively serves in a position of performance. The official description of its duties states: “The Old Guard is the Army’s official ceremonial unit and escort to the president, and it also provides security for Washington, D.C., in time of national emergency or civil disturbance.”¹⁵⁶ As the official Army Honor Guard, the regiment conducts ceremonies at the White House, national memorials, and other government locations in Washington D.C. They have a special platoon dedicated to guarding the Tomb of the Unknown Soldier, which includes a ceremonial exchange of guards. The regiment carries out funerals and marches in parades. All of these ceremonies contain careful and symbolic performance elements and are seen by government officials and civilians.

The Old Guard’s other specialty platoon requires additional training. The U.S. Army Drill Team is a unit that performs precision drill, called exhibition drill in the civilian arena, at military and public functions. Their website states that their purpose is to be “goodwill ambassadors” for the Army to assist the Army in community relations and recruitment. The drill team also holds its

¹⁵⁶ “About the 3rd U.S. Infantry Regiment,” Old Guard, accessed June 10, 2022, <https://www.oldguard.mdw.army.mil/regiment>.

own performances, The Twilight Tattoo, regularly throughout the summer. The Army states that the soldiers for the unit are chosen for their dexterity, strength, and military bearing.¹⁵⁷

Through the U.S. Army Drill team performances, the Army performs The Warrior values that are necessary to uphold institutional masculinity. The team stylistically represents the standard drill training that initiated any viewing soldier into the masculine umbrella of the Army. Additionally, the emergence of The Warrior Ethos in 2003 solidified the team's precision drill performances as partially tactical endeavors to achieve the Army's goal in the Ethos to "ensure that all Soldiers...are prepared to engage the enemy."¹⁵⁸

The affective experience of The Army Drill Team must break from my previous analysis in several marked ways. First, precision drill, or any drill done in modern times, is learned and performed with no intent to be used in battle. Second, women can participate, and therefore, their subjectivity must be considered. Third, precision drill movements may not have been developed in a military setting at all, creating an epistemology of civilian-to-military physical repertoire. Finally, a difference of great importance as a scholar is that there are many hours of footage of the Drill Team performances for this type of drill, and it is a visible and publicly available form by its very nature, something that came only as a byproduct of Early Modern drill.

Precision drill (or exhibition drill) consists of marching in changing intricate formations for aesthetic, not tactical, purposes. In armed exhibition drill and the precision drill of the Army Drill Team, the performers spin bayonet-tipped rifles and use the rifles to form pleasing lines. Sometimes there will be a solo performance, which is a practice that defies some of the tenets of

¹⁵⁷ "U.S. Army Drill Team," US Army Drill Team, accessed June 16, 2022, <https://www.oldguard.mdw.army.mil/specialty-platoons/us-drill-team>.

¹⁵⁸ Gary Riccio et al., "Warrior Ethos: Analysis of the Concept and Initial Development of Application," 4.

drill including formations and unity with a group. However, solo performance draws from the same collection of movements as the rest of precision drill. The performance is akin to dance, as the soldiers run through careful choreography, maneuvering to play with shape and form. It is also part circus act, as the soldier-performers often toss bladed rifles in the air one to another in moments of suspense and awe.

2.4.1 Precision/Exhibition Drill

A thorough history of precision drill has not been compiled. Little is known of its origins because scholars, if interested in drill at all, have tended to focus on drill as a battle or training tactic and its efficacy in martial goals. I attempt to fill in some of the historical gaps to demonstrate that in the Army, the practice is performed as if built on a deep-rooted history with consequences for the ideal soldier but that it was constructed as such when the practice was adopted from elsewhere. In popular lore, many drill organizations cite a film of acrobat Hadji Cheriff rifle twirling in 1899 as the beginning of exhibition drill, but they do not provide hypotheses for the connections or bridges between Cheriff's highly acrobatic solo practice at the Midway Plaisance and the popular drill form that gained prominence post-WWII.¹⁵⁹

Militias and clubs performed military drill demonstrations in the U.S. since the re-institution of drill tactics to the by Baron Friedrich von Steuben under the direction of George Washington in the Revolutionary War. However, these standard drill maneuvers were sometimes altered for visual excitement. Just before the American Civil War, the French and North African

¹⁵⁹ Arabian Gun Twirler (Edison Manufacturing Co. , 1899), <https://www.loc.gov/item/96515758/>.

Zouave regiments and their drill manual served as inspiration to Union Officer Elmer E. Ellsworth to create his own drill company, the “Zouave Cadets.” Ellsworth likely departed greatly from the practice of the true Zouave regiments, but after a national tour of Ellsworth’s Zouave Cadets, soldiers formed themselves into Zouave units on both sides of the Civil War. Zouave drill included significantly faster-rhythmed footwork than traditional drill and in smaller steps. It also involved the manipulation of rifles and sabers to a greater degree, including passing them from one soldier to another.¹⁶⁰ Traditional regulation drill competitions, including marching and shooting, began again after the war and continued throughout the turn of the century. While less involved in competition, Zouave groups would sometimes perform at these competitions.¹⁶¹

Throughout the early twentieth century, the military became uninvolved with drill performance. Military schools and ROTCs were the only official military organizations that participated in the performance practice that grew more and more civilian. While always depicting a martial aesthetic, drill and drill innovation belonged to high schools and universities. For some time, schools had used marching as a form of orderly physical fitness.¹⁶² In “A Manual for the Teaching of Exhibition Marching,” (1948) Ruth Bebbler marks the shift in high school drill, “It is realized that the days of calisthenics and marching drills in the physical education program have passed, but a different approach to the use of figuration and formation marching in the guise of an

¹⁶⁰ Elmer E. Ellsworth, *The Zouave Drill: Being a Complete Manual of Arms for the Use of the Rifled Musket, with Either the Percussion Cap or Maynard Primer: Containing Also the Complete Manual of the Sword and Sabre* (Philadelphia: T.B. Peterson and Brothers, 1861).

¹⁶¹ Eleanor Hannah, *Manhood, Citizenship, and the National Guard: Illinois, 1870-1917* (S.l.: Ohio State University, 2007), 131.

¹⁶² Evan J. Habkirk tells of drill and calisthenics being used as assimilation devices in indigenous residential schools throughout Canada starting in 1870. It is unclear if exhibition drill was involved but regulation drill was certainly used. Evan J. Habkirk, “From Indian Boys to Canadian Men? the Use of Cadet Drill in the Canadian Indian Residential School System,” *British Journal of Canadian Studies* 30, no. 2 (2017): pp. 227-248.

exhibition drill team which performs with the band at football games is being stressed... [an]activity with a capable physical education teacher as its sponsor and drill instructor.”¹⁶³ In *Marching Tactics*, a 1938 book by S.C. Staley published only a decade previous to Bebber, drill is directly placed into the hands of high school physical education to teach “order” or “morale.” Staley focuses on regulation drill and doesn’t yet seem to have a word for precision drill. Instead, he called his last chapter “Fancy Marching.”¹⁶⁴ Most manuals or books on drill pre-WWII are for use in the context of a marching band, in which creative formational marching precludes drill alone.¹⁶⁵ There is evidence of rifle spinning competitions by ROTCs as early as 1936.¹⁶⁶ It is unclear when exhibition marching and rifle spinning were joined into the armed exhibition drill we see today.

The official military stayed away from exhibition drill through the early twentieth century. Sentiments of the top brass were that military performance was not beneficial for the military. In her work on the National Guard, Eleanor Hannah states, “As late as 1906, President Theodore Roosevelt scolded National Guard Officers for continuing to waste time on traditional drilling and parades at summer camp.”¹⁶⁷ Through both world wars, no pageantry was needed to remind soldiers of their proximity to combat. Soldiers needed to be ready to fight and for President

¹⁶³ Bebber, Ruth Elizabeth. “A Manual for the Teaching of Exhibition Marching.” Thesis, Proquest LLC, 2014, 178.

¹⁶⁴ Seward Charles Staley, *Marching Tactics, for Use in Physical Education* (New York: A.S. Barnes, 1938), 2.

¹⁶⁵ It is said that the first marching band letter formation on a football field occurred in 1907 at Purdue University. The marching band was the innovator, but it is important to note that the Purdue Marching Band, like many others, grew out of a drum corps for the ROTC several years before this event. “About,” Purdue Bands Orchestras About Comments, accessed June 13, 2022, <https://www.purdue.edu/bands/ensembles/aamb/about/>.

¹⁶⁶ “Harry R. Gillet Will Go to Washington Today,” *St. Joseph News-Press*, February 12, 1939, p. 6A.

¹⁶⁷ Eleanor Hannah, *Manhood, Citizenship, and the National Guard: Illinois, 1870-1917*, 130.

Roosevelt, the country needed men trained on the tactics used in battle. Victory parades provided opportunities to demonstrate some marching ability with the air of dignity that the uniforms and other accouterments allowed.

In 1948, the military changed tact when the Marines formed a precision drill unit for a one-time performance at the Sunset Parade in Washington D.C..¹⁶⁸ When it was well-received, the official Marine drill team, The Silent Platoon, was formed. Shortly after, The 3rd Regiment of the Old Guard established a specialty platoon as the Army Drill Team. The other branches also followed suit. These official military units took on the exhibition/precision drill practice that had become popular in the civilian world and adopted it as if it were always officially military. As the soldiers marched sternly in their intricate positions with the appearance of ease, sometimes handling their rifles in stunning tosses and synchronized spins, it appears as if U.S. soldiers have been marching in such a way since the founding of the nation. The precision drill performance is then tethered to the historic regulation drill in the minds of the audience and public.

A classic drill text that details a methodology of teaching and performing regulation drill wherein soldiers spoke their own counts and commands is *The Cadence System of Teaching Close Order Drill* by U.S. Army Colonel Bernard Lentz. Though not an official government publication, the book was so popular that it released eight editions between its first 1919 and its last 1957 releases. After the mid-1940s, all editions quietly included sections on exhibition-style rifle movement. This institutional text for instruction adopted precision drill into its teaching of standard regulation drill without announcement, again contributing to an assumed narrative that it had always been part of the system.

¹⁶⁸ “Unit Home,” Silent Drill Platoon, accessed June 13, 2022, <https://www.barracks.marines.mil/Units/Company-A/Silent-Drill-Platoon/>.

The national military shifted in another notable way in 1948. In 1946, after being honorably discharged from the U.S. Army and while still in uniform, Sgt. Isaac Woodard, a young black man, was brutally beaten by a police chief in South Carolina. As a result, Woodard lost the use of his eyes. The police chief was acquitted of criminal actions toward Woodward nine months later.¹⁶⁹ After two years of committees and contemplation on this event, the civil rights movement, and the staffing inconveniences in WWII, President Truman issued Order 9981, desegregating the military. It was created to grant “equality of treatment for all who serve in our country’s defense.”¹⁷⁰

Akin to the challenges to the Army’s masculinity in 2003, when *The Warrior Ethos* was introduced, the integration of the military challenged the picture of the soldier in the cultural imagination. During this tumult of identity, the coinciding creation of military branch drill teams meant ongoing performances of embodied military perfection that suggested historic tradition and innovative future all at once. The tricks could always evolve but they were presented with a calm and classic aesthetic that could defy shifting ideas of the soldier. Today, the soldiers in the platoon may be of any race or gender but clothed in the same uniform with a hat low on the eyes, the platoon presents The Army identity first and as firmly and ideally masculine.

The post-9/11 shifts in Army practice for gender and tactics opened space for similar change in performance. Instead of adding a group of performers as in 1948, the Army added a persona to embody. This persona directly reflected the Army’s masculinity onto the Drill Team’s public and institutionally representative performances. As the Drill Team performed *The Warrior*,

¹⁶⁹ James I Deutsch, “The Blinding of Isaac Woodard,” *Journal of American History* 108, no. 3 (January 2021): pp. 671.

¹⁷⁰ (1948), p. 1.

it also performed tactical work toward the battle preparation goals that the army had for the Warrior Ethos.

2.4.2 Precision, Affect, and Masculinity

In the drill team's Twilight Tattoo performance of 2019, an all-male presenting platoon marched neatly onto the floor.¹⁷¹ Their pristine uniforms, the Army Dress Blues, consisted of blue pants with a yellow stripe (perfectly highlighting leg movements), a dark blue jacket, and a neat blue hat with a bill hanging low just over the eyes. The hat perfectly eliminates individuality and even gender and pushes the perception of the platoon to a line of identical toy soldiers. They also carried their standard 1903 Springfield Rifles with silver-shined bayonet tips. In near silence, they started their routine. Starting with rifle work, the soldiers faced the file next to them and swung their tipped rifles close to their comrade's bodies. Then, in a ripple down the line, the soldiers swung their rifles up in the air, creating a bridge with the opposing soldier as the drill commander walked through, his face only inches from the quick-moving bayonets. Slow building music picked up volume, and the routine moved forward with marching in various formations as well as rifle spins and tosses that made the audience gasp.

The visual interest came primarily from using line and angles as the soldiers held rifles in creative ways. The soldiers remained standing tall. Other than arm positions, their body lines were fixed, and the rifles seemed to move around them. The other oft-used aesthetic device was the

¹⁷¹ *United States Army Drill Team at Twilight Tattoo, YouTube* (YouTube, 2019), https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=_UY7xmB7jho.

ripple mentioned before. At various moments, the soldiers turned their bodies, spun rifles, tossed rifles, and changed rifle position in sequence down the line akin to dominos. The entertainment distracts from the intentioned goals.

As a task, representing The Army as an institution and projecting its Warrior masculinity seems a conscious and cognitive experience. There are many layers of symbolism in a performance-based semiotic discourse in which the skills of a drill team could signify and sustain a specific institutional masculinity. The soldiers in the drill platoon participate in the discourse by embodying The Warrior values including focus, stamina, strength, will, and brotherhood, with gestures and carriage. As discussed in previous sections, affect occurs pre-categorization, thus pre-semiotics. Is it possible then for the soldier-performers to experience not only their performance but also what their performance is *doing* affectively?

The performance contributes to an affective atmosphere. The soldier performers exist with the audience in that atmosphere and can experience a similar aspect of its affective feeling. Raymond Williams theorizes the concept of “structures of feeling.” He argues that each historical moment has unique “particular qualities” that encompass the feelings of that moment. Even though the experience of institutions, ideologies, etc., contribute to the structure, the feeling is social and lived. The structures influence the affective experiences of the soldier-performers, but the soldiers also contribute to the structure of feeling of the moment with meticulous movement and rifle-throwing suspense. These feelings are very quickly attached to the institution through cognition for both audience and soldier. William writes, “The idea of a structure of feeling can be specifically related to the evidence of forms and conventions – semantic figures – which, in art and literature,

are often the very first indications that such a new structure is forming.”¹⁷² Williams notes that not all art relates to structures of feeling in that they can relate to existing structures. However, art relating to existing structures can be a contemporary structure of feeling if they happen through modification or disturbance. The Army Drill Team performs regularly and repeats routines. The Twilight Tattoo occurs several times a summer and may even contain some of the same audience members. However, I argue that, according to The Army’s fear that Warrior masculinity can easily slip if not exposed consistently, each performance is a renewal of former institutional structures of feeling that may have shifted between performances, so they are coming from a place of newness every time.

The structure of feeling may exist in the space, but the feeling is shared or transmitted through affective transmission. Teresa Brennan approaches atmospheric feelings not as a structure of feeling but as shared affect transmitted from one individual to another. Brennan stresses that “All affects are material, physiological things.”¹⁷³ and as such, this material can be shared. She argues that this can happen in many ways including through smell, vibration, and sound. The soldier-performers and the audience can feel and transmit affect. It is possible that they might share in an atmosphere of performative masculinity through smell, vibration, and sound. However, the potential affect is limited by other material and aspects of the feeling structures in the space.

Politics and power influence the atmosphere and potential affective experience for both audience and performer. In the *Cinematic Body*, Steven Shaviro explains that one never experiences affect as a blank slate that happens, through the chain of classification and semiotics, to reach a political conclusion of thought. He writes, “Power works in the depths and on the

¹⁷² Raymond Williams, *Marxism and Literature* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1977), 133.

¹⁷³ Teresa Brennan, *The Transmission of Affect* (Cornell University Press, 2014), 6.

surfaces of the body, and not just in the disembodied realm of ‘representation’ or of ‘discourse.’ It is in the flesh first of all, far more than on some level of supposed ideological reflection, that the political is personal, and the personal political.”¹⁷⁴ In this manner, when The Army Drill team performs in identical structured unisex uniforms through carefully crafted choreography of precision and awe, the affect of performance that is experienced is already political, gendered, and associated with violence for audience and soldier-performer.

Unlike previous drill forms, precision drill and current regulation drill have no combat end point. Instead, one of the stated purposes of regulation drill in training today is “To aid in disciplinary training by instilling habits of precision and response to the leader’s orders.”¹⁷⁵ Precision drill serves no obvious direct to combat goal, not even disciplinary training. Instead, it is used to entertain and demonstrate skill with a “primary mission of showcasing the U.S. Army both nationally and internationally.”¹⁷⁶ The declared purpose of the drill team is political in its cultural diplomacy. To assume that the team is performing for entertainment only and is sponsored by an institution tasked with defense, creates a fissure of thought that contributes to the atmosphere of the performance that then shapes the potential affects. However, if one recognizes the performance’s move toward the objective of instilling The Warrior Ethos and institutional masculinity, that knowledge could also color potential affective response.

Some of the gestures and related affects I addressed previously in this chapter could be applied to this routine. The soldiers certainly have to be highly aware of their periphery, make

¹⁷⁴ Steven Shaviro, *The Cinematic Body* (Minneapolis, Minn: Univ. of Minnesota Press, 2011), viii.

¹⁷⁵ “TC 3-21.5,” TC 3-21.5 § (2021).

¹⁷⁶ “U.S. Army Drill Team,” U.S. Army Drill Team, accessed June 16, 2022, <https://www.oldguard.mdw.army.mil/specialty-platoons/us-drill-team>.

minute adjustments in the “between” moments of movements, and follow and wait in anticipation. However, carrying the weight of audience visibility and the politics of representation brings a new affect of showmanship.



Figure 1 Fred Wright Cartoon. 1941. Pitt ULS Digital Collection

In Fred Wright’s depiction of rifle spinning in the early days of exhibition drill, before the military had an official drill team, a Sergeant performs with an audience of Privates. He shows off his rifle then spins the rifle above his head with pride. Next, he spins it to the front. He even balances the bayonet tip on the end of his finger until the rifle slips, and the bayonet goes right into his toes. The Sergeant yelps, and the Privates smile. Then the Privates are punished for the Sergeant’s shame. Wright, a private at the time of his illustration, demonstrates the ire of a power dynamic he was likely experiencing. He depicted it using embarrassment, pride, and physical punishment to regain power.

The cartoon links performative riflery to pride and masculinity. Its broad-chested male sergeant is brought to shame by a simple mistake to the degree that he must punish others. That speaks to the masculinity of power, perception, and control used to keep the military running. In this moment, our goofy Sergeant was using skill in the form of entertainment instead of shooting accuracy or boxing prowess to build masculine confidence and prestige. Our small thin Privates have no power or skill; they exist only to be wowed and then to be punished for seeing too much. They have not yet received their masculine physical frame to match their power and rank.

Like the cartoon, the Army uses entertainment and skill to build a masculine persona with confidence or pride. In The Army's study on The Warrior Ethos and how to instill it, sociologists suggested a list of several stories of war heroes to which soldiers could be frequently read or exposed. The stories all include actions "that resulted in the award of the Congressional Medal of Honor."¹⁷⁷ The instillment of the feelings of pride and honor, especially in the face of danger, is key to the Warrior Ethos and can be achieved through demonstrating skill to an audience. There is value in being known and being rewarded as long as it is for being courageous. As individuals, the drill soldier-performers may possibly experience affective qualities of exhilaration or nerves from the showmanship aspect of performance and tossing with bayonet tips. However, as a unit guaranteed by identity-obscuring uniforms to be perceived as a unit, the honor and pride of the performance goes to the U.S. Army.

The soundscape of the performance is highly impactful to affect. During *this* performance, a slow electric guitar version of "The Army Theme" played in the background. It featured a riff akin to Guns N' Roses. In *every* performance, the team uses metal side-heel taps on their inner

¹⁷⁷ Gary Riccio et al., "Warrior Ethos: Analysis of the Concept and Initial Development of Application," 2.

heels so that when their feet come together, it is very audible. The routines also feature the rifle butts hitting the ground regularly as they move from one gesture to another. The butt of the rifles are also metal plated and make a distinct noise as they purposefully hit the ground in choreography. Varying timed march steps create a rhythm, as does every noisy hand movement on the rifle. All share the sound in the space. Unlike visuals which are drastically different depending on points of view (audience or performer), sound in this performance varies primarily only by volume. The soldier-performers can even use sound to perform ripple effects that they may not be able to see, therefore experiencing an aspect of the ripple that the audience does. The soundscape is hard and harsh. Sounds come from quickly banging a rifle butt on the ground or kicking the feet together with exactness. The other sounds of the rifle sound mechanical, like metal and wood working together. The sound is ideally masculine: direct and unemotional. There is a lack of elongated tones. There are no subtleties in volume variation or softness. Even in the specific performance described above which did feature the rare elongated tone, the music that was added called to a genre (hard rock) that is used as a tough-guy masculine identifier today.

The soundscape continues to masculinize the performance and the performers. Hard and fast bangs of metal and wood create a staccato affective tone and a pounding mood. Brennan notes that sound and visual elements contribute to the transmission of affect in the atmosphere. “Visual images, like auditory traces, also have a direct physical impact; their reception involves the activation of neurological networks, stimulated by spectrum vibrations at various frequencies.”¹⁷⁸ The sound continues to homogenize the soldiers as they hear and create the sound together as a unit, thus pushing the drill team to be symbolic and representative of The Army. The audience

¹⁷⁸ Teresa Brennan, *The Transmission of Affect* (Cornell University Press, 2014), 10.

participates in the atmosphere and the sound of the space and, through rhythmic entrainment, can feel attached to or in awe of The Army.

In multiple moments of changing masculinity in the military, the U.S. Army has used symbolic representations to ensure a sustained ideal masculine combat soldier. The U.S Army Drill Team and The Warrior Ethos function as reflections of each other solidifying The Army as a courageous, honorable, and masculine institution. The individual may be any occupation or gender, and still be a Warrior by association to the institution. The Twilight Tattoo and other Drill Team and Old Guard performances can create affective experience for audience and soldiers that reflects onto the unit then onto The Army.

2.5 Conclusion

Either as training or battle maneuver, linear drill tactics create a repertoire of gesture and movement. In its military setting, these movements can assist in great violence but also have the potential to create affective experiences of courage, fraternity, and anticipation. The affective qualities of these gestures have the potential to move with them out of battle into performative settings.

Drill and marching are foundational movements for many military performances of ceremony and entertainment. Parades, tattoos, and even funeral services involve the practiced precision of soldiers marching in formation. The following chapters address two of these performances that contain their own complex historiographies and performance practices. However, much of their physical library is derived from the movements described in the manuals and videos of this chapter.

The drill archive that provides prescription and description of action serves as transitional to the physical world and somatic experience. In doing so, it opens the door to connections with embodied experiences of corresponding historical moments and their ideologies. Masculinity serves as a crucial ideological embodiment in the rhizome of movement and war. In the following chapters, I move away from masculinity, as much as one can, and connect the physicality and performances of war to ideas and ideals both national and political.

3.0 Myths of the Mist: History, Identity, and Internationalism in the Edinburgh Tattoo

3.1 Introduction

The Royal Edinburgh Military Tattoo is a spectacular performance of national and martial exuberance. It is an hour-and-a-half display of patriotism, military marching bands, drill, bagpipes, drums, fiddlers, and dancers, all with a touch of projections and pyrotechnics. The Tattoo occurs every August on the esplanade (the former parade ground) of Edinburgh Castle, which perches high above Edinburgh and looks down from Castle Rock. Most military units performing at the Tattoo are Scottish, but the Tattoo invites international groups to perform yearly. In 2017 the Indian Naval Band, the Japan Ground Self-Defense Force Band, and the United States Naval Forces Europe Band all performed. Scottish Civilians also performed, including the Shetland Fiddlers and Viking Jarl Squad from Shetland and all of Scotland, as well as the Tattoo Dance Company, a company of highland dancers from several English-speaking countries, who performs its own numbers but also augments the size and shape of the visiting military performers' numbers.

The complete Tattoo exists in a setting with diverse historical and contemporary political influences. It includes intentional and incidental visual, audio, and affective performance practices. Through the Tattoo, the state displays well-known national symbols and iconography for audience members from around the world who are witnesses of various nationalities. It sometimes unfolds, as it did in 2017, in the middle of political upheaval. If one centers on the Tattoo as a spectacular nexus of national identity, its diverse components provide many possible interpretations. The scenarios of independence forged through the dialogue among the Tattoo, its influences, and its constituent parts are perhaps the most prominent.

In *The Archive and The Repertoire*, Diana Taylor discusses how meaning can transfer inside and outside the archive. One way this happens is through the scenario, a method for analyzing the structure of events that repeat continuously. Taylor uses the concept of the scenario to talk about macro-cultural happenings such as colonialism and relates their process of enactment to specific occurrences, such as scenarios of colonial encounters.¹⁷⁹ She demonstrates how the scenario of the colonization process repeats throughout history with great stability (for example, Cortés's entrance into Tenochtitlán and Oñate's claiming possession of New Mexico).¹⁸⁰ In the scenario, the basic structure of the performance functions stably but allows for revision. For Taylor, the scenario is "a paradigmatic setup that relies on supposedly live participants, structures around a schematic plot, with an intended (though adaptable) end."¹⁸¹ It does not rigidly script how each version of the scenario will play out but provides a structure for occurrences that resist, manipulate, or improvise. As Taylor uses the scenario as a tool through which to view historical and contemporary events, previously unseen patterns and variations begin to appear. She also emphasizes the embodied practices that create these patterns.

This chapter draws on Taylor's theorization of the scenario to understand performance practices and the *mise-en-scène* of the 2017 Edinburgh Tattoo. By identifying repetition and variation in the Tattoo identified through the scenario, this chapter argues that scenarios of Scottish independence are present and repeated, which contribute to a Scottish national identity grounded in independence. However, the scenarios of independence present in The Tattoo are problematic. These scenarios tend to act out a faux or pacifying front of independence that rather further cements

¹⁷⁹ Diana Taylor, *The Archive and the Repertoire: Performing Cultural Memory in the Americas* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2007), 13.

¹⁸⁰ Diana Taylor, *The Archive and the Repertoire*, 31.

¹⁸¹ Diana Taylor, *The Archive and the Repertoire*, 13.

Scotland's dependence on the British imperial project. The performers and audience embody these scenarios of independence in the Tattoo yearly with some revision. But the political context of Brexit and threats of a Scottish referendum in which the 2017 Tattoo occurred specifically enhanced questions of independence. In this chapter, I look to the ways in which these scenarios of independence are embodied throughout history and how they are specifically embodied and performed in the 2017 Tattoo.

Independence is certainly not the only meaning that the performance inscribes on the audience and performers in the Tattoo. In the following sections, I focus on performance practices and contexts that contain the scenario of pacifying independence when traced through to the 2017 Tattoo. These entry points are identity through military history and uniforms, the legacy of the Tattoo through movement practices and their 2017 manifestations, and the Tattoo's place in the international festivals of Edinburgh.

3.1.1 On Building a National Identity

In this section, I argue that independence was a collective identifier for the Scottish kingdom long before the enlightened nation and print culture, an argument that challenges foundational theories of the nation, national identity, and nationalism, such as those proffered by Benedict Anderson. In *Imagined Communities* (1983), Benedict Anderson argues that the print culture of the eighteenth century created community by sharing ideas across larger distances and people. He defines imagined communities as “an imagined political community – and imagined as

both inherently limited and sovereign.”¹⁸² He argues that print culture was crucial to the conception of the nation and national identity, and that once these nations were established, their heritage of identity was projected onto the past of their land as if it had always been a nation.

I join a cohort of scholars who have challenged the premises of Anderson’s thinking. For example, in *Beyond Imagined Communities: Reading and Writing the Nation in 19th century Latin America* (2003),¹⁸³ multiple authors claim that Anderson’s history is incorrect, that print culture was relevant before independence, and that it was separate from the nation’s creation in many countries. They also argue that he does not contextualize the texts he points to as influences on Latin American nationhood. Likewise, I challenge Anderson’s theories on the conception of identity principles at the time of print culture.

Contemporary Scotland’s nationhood and national identity are imagined; however, the imaginary is built and reinforced by symbols of history and tradition before the advent of print. In *Theories of Nationalism* (2006), Anthony Smith reminds readers that a large part of national identity and nationalist ideology are ethnic groups and communities, an idea that predates modernity. He argues that ethnicity and ethnic symbols establish the “us” vs. “them” idea that is crucial to nationalism. Here, authorities can manipulate how the nation sees itself, but it does so by using pre-established symbols and ideas of belonging, such as religion, traditions, festivals, and language.¹⁸⁴ In Scotland, military performance helps create a communal identity, using symbols

¹⁸² Benedict Anderson, *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism* (London: Verso, 2006), 5.

¹⁸³ John Charles Chasteen, Francois-Xavier Guerra, Tulio Halperin Donghi, Sarah C. Chambers, Andrea J. Kirkendall, Fernando Unzueta, Sara Castro-Klaren, Gustavo Verdesio, Beatriz Gonaes-Stephan

¹⁸⁴ Anthony D. Smith, *Theories of Nationalism* (London: Duckworth, 1983).

and references derived from diverse historical sources. As a state-run performance, the influence of national identity is somewhat formalized pomp. Still, the Tattoo uses symbols of quotidian Scotland to build a communal national identity that goes beyond its military trappings and that influences identity in everyday life. The Tattoo creates a Scottish nation and identity that relies on historical military iconography.

The Tattoo performs several layers of communal belonging, and through identifying the performances practices of the Tattoo, I demonstrate a strong tendency for Scottish national identity to establish itself through the oppositional identification of “not” England. Smith’s argument supposes that the people establish a nation by identifying with an us versus them binary. There must be an outside of the community for there to be an inside of the community. This chapter explores the many layers of Scottish nationhood when its identity-establishing binaries are nuanced by a Scottish imaginary that incorporates both ‘Scotland because it is not England’ and ‘Scotland is part of Britain, of which England is the head.’ The ethnic nationalist rhetoric of the Brexit campaign and Scotland’s separatist reaction to the Brexit result codify the perceived inherency of the “in” group in the establishment of Scottish national identity historically and Scottish national identity today.

The Tattoo, as a performance of Scottish cultural identity, is particularly apt to create the nation because of the strength of Scottish citizens’ conviction in that identity. It is possible to approach the Tattoo and any performance in the United Kingdom as performing a primarily British identity for a largely homogeneous audience. All nations in the United Kingdom fall under a unifying umbrella. However, Michael Skey compares and highlights the differences between English, Scottish, Welsh, and Irish newspapers to argue against any consideration of “British

nationalism” for all, as conceived by those imagining a homogenous audience.¹⁸⁵ A 2018 BBC survey conveyed the complicated nature of national identification across Britain and identified “Scottish” identity as one of the strongest identifiers of those on the British Isles. Four out of five people living in Scotland say they feel strongly Scottish, and 61% say they feel very strongly Scottish compared to only 54% of people in England who feel very strongly English, and only 41% of people in Wales claim to be very strongly Welsh. Conversely, 82% of people in England see themselves as strongly British, 79% of those in Wales see themselves as British, and only 59% of people in Scotland say that they feel strongly British. When asking Scottish voters only, 79% feel very strongly Scottish, and only 9% say they feel very strongly British. There is also great hope for the future in Scotland, with 64% of Scottish Nationalist Party voters feeling that the country’s best years are yet to come as they push for an independence referendum, as opposed to English nationalists, with only 13% stating that its best years are ahead of it.¹⁸⁶ If it is true that this poll demonstrates that Scottish is a solid national identification, and that its nationalist party is driven positively by its rhetoric, while the English nationalists are not, then the poll demonstrates Scotland as an imagined community that separates itself from Britain, at least through its identity. This strong Scottish identity is performed in the Tattoo by vignettes of independence.¹⁸⁷

The complexity of Scottish nationhood continues its negotiation while the scenario of independence continues to play out from The Battle of Bannockburn¹⁸⁸ to today. In the scope of this 2018 survey, a large proportion of Scottish citizens and voters embody hope for independence

¹⁸⁵ Michael Skey, “The National in Everyday Life: A Critical Engagement with Michael Billig’s Thesis of Banal Nationalism,” *The Sociological Review* 57, no. 2 (2009): 335.

¹⁸⁶ “Nationalism means something different in Scotland” by Sir John Curtice for BBC June 2018

¹⁸⁷ “Nationalism means something different in Scotland” by Sir John Curtice for BBC June 2018

¹⁸⁸ This will be discussed in the upcoming section.

to enact their feelings of strong Scottishness fully. As Homi Bhabha argues, the nation is constantly in flux. It does not exist to be stagnant. On the contrary, Bhabha claims, “the cultural temporality of nation transcribes a much more transitional social reality.”¹⁸⁹ In the scenario of Scottish independence and its creation of a national identity, the plot continues to play out in many ways to drive the nation’s narrative forward. The Scottish Independence Referendum proposed after Brexit has yet to occur. However, the embodied hope of independence creates a Scottish identity that may open the doors to continued, easy control from England through British power.

3.2 Romancing the Tartan: Military Historiography in Scottish Identity

When dusk falls into darkness, the lights turn down on the crowd. A low-rumbling sound emerges from the Edinburgh Castle Gatehouse. Fog rolls out onto the esplanade as the sound of bagpipes starts to brighten. Then, from the seventeenth-century stone entrance, as the lights begin to rise, what appears to be two hundred pipe and drum players stream over the drawbridge, marching themselves into rank and file, led by drum majors holding their maces firm.

Musicians wear ornate military dress uniforms that evoke the style of the Victorian era; a smart, tailored coat fits over the top of a knee-length tartan kilt. As the group Pipes and Drums contains many regiments and organizations, the group features several variations of uniforms, tartans, and bonnets, each representing a different regimental history. Each regiment represents itself and its

¹⁸⁹ Homi K. Bhabha, *Nation and Narration* (London: Routledge, 1991), 1.

history with its own tartan, which is shown on its kilts and fly plaids.¹⁹⁰ Their uniforms are the most traditional of any unit or position in the British military. For example, some musicians wear a tall feather bonnet that soldiers used in highland dress uniforms until 1914, but the military restricts these historic styles to only pipers and drummers in some regiments. Many others wear a plain glengarry, which the military issued during regular service between 1850 and 1914.

As the pipers and drummers march through the archway, they perform *When the Pipers Play* until almost all of them have passed through the gate. Then, when only a few drummers have yet to exit, they enter a simple formation and play *Scots Wha Hae*, a song with a tune rumored to have been played by Robert Bruce's army at the Battle of Bannockburn in 1314. Famed romantic poet Robert Burns wrote its lyrics in 1793 to evoke Bruce giving a speech to his army, including "Welcome to your gory bed or to victory... see approach proud Edward's Power, Chains and Slavery...Freeman stand or freeman fall, let him follow me....liberty is in every blow."¹⁹¹ Flanked by the statues of William Wallace and Robert Bruce, which seem to stand guard at the castle walls, the last musicians file out of the castle, playing this anthem of Scottish independence.

As this opening routine suggests, the Tattoo presents a mimetic militarized historiography of Scottish identity that has the ability to play out a scenario of independence using the performer and the audience. This opening routine alone is a feast of Scottish nationhood's semiotics. Every

¹⁹⁰ Kilts originated from the traditional Féliadh Mòr, or Great Plaid, a large piece of fabric worn by Scottish highlanders that would wrap around the waist and shoulders. Fashions changed to cut the fabric to just fit around the waist, creating the kilt. Though less practical than the shoulder wrap of the Great Plaid, the fly plaid remained in fashion for dress occasions as a small piece of tartan fabric draped over the shoulder.

¹⁹¹ Translated from an original Scotticized English to a more accessible English. Robert Burns, "Scots Wha Hae, or, Robert Bruce's Address to His Troops at Bannockburn by Robert Burns," Scottish Poetry Library, July 10, 2018, <https://www.scottishpoetrylibrary.org.uk/poem/scots-wha-hae-or-robert-bruces-address-his-troops-bannockburn/>.

part of the uniform, every wall of the castle, every note, and even the march reference a well-constructed piece of the Scottish national identity, but they also connect to Scotland's military history, making dominant military history central to hegemonic Scottish identity. By speaking in generalizations and offering no performances of alternative identities, the Tattoo presents a single national heritage and a singular Scottish identity, embodying "Scotland's National Fabric." The Tattoo presents itself as if it *is* Scotland or speaks for all of Scotland when it says: "Scotland, Great Britain, and the world are here."¹⁹² By separating Scotland from Great Britain and other international performers, this quote implies that Scotland itself was represented in the Tattoo in singular unity. It achieves this by performing selective aspects of Scotland's military past, building independence into the Scottish fabric of identity through the presence of the mythologized Robert Bruce, William Wallace, the Scottish Wars of Independence, and through the presentation of the romanticized highland warrior.

3.2.1 Creating the Nation in the Scottish Wars for Independence

The building of Scotland's national identity did not start, as *Imagined Communities* would invite us to believe, with the nation-state of early-modern print culture. Scottish nationalism can be traced instead to the thirteenth century when it first performed a scenario of the struggle for independence from England. During this period, a monarchy united the highlands composed of various clans with their own chieftains and the feudal system of the lowlands. Fiona Watson argues that Scotland constitutes a nation in this context, even without the requisite emphasis on

¹⁹² "The Royal Edinburgh Military Tattoo 2017: Splash of Tartan," *The Royal Edinburgh Military Tattoo 2017: Splash of Tartan* (Musselburgh, Scotland: Ivanhoe Printing Co. Ltd. , 2017), 7.

enlightenment ideas or modern political systems that are common to dominant histories of nationhood. Central to Watson's conception of the nation are the ideas of "the sense of a common past and future pertaining to a nation, despite the diverse inherited experiences of the individuals within it" and "clearly defined borders," both of which, she argues, developed "in Scotland only in the 13th century."¹⁹³

Establishing this Scottish identity required creating an "other" against which Scotland defined itself through scenarios of independence. For Scotland, this oppositional identity was particularly grounded not only in a distinction between 'us and them' but in constructing an 'us independent from them.' The separate cultures of highlanders and lowlanders came together to form a communal identity as Scots to become not English. They finalized their not-English identity partly through the Battle of Bannockburn and subsequent legends surrounding it, which are foundational to Scotland's independence scenario. Bannockburn achieved successful independence for Scotland from England as the foundational scenario. This accomplishment sets it apart from the adapted scenarios of independence played out in the Tattoo which demonstrate a spirit of, and that show an attempt for, independence only to result in continued or even enhanced attachment to the English or British government. However, Bannockburn provides a surface template for the scenarios of Scottish independence, which revise the original and do not achieve successful independence. Instead, the scenarios are of faux independence that sustains Scottish military identity based on the identity created in Bannockburn, but to the end goal of pacification to dependence on English power structures.

¹⁹³ Fiona Watson, "Enigmatic Lion: Scotland, Kingship and National Identity in the Wars of Independence," in *Image and Identity: Making and Re-Making of Scotland through the Ages*, ed. Dauvit Brown, Richard J Finlay, and Michael Lynch (John Donald, 1998), 18.

The first Scottish War of Independence (1296-1314), which culminated in the success of the Scots at the Battle of Bannockburn, developed in response to English intervention in succession to the Scottish throne. King Edward II gathered two contenders for the throne—John Balliol and Robert the Bruce—to swear Edward’s suzerainty over Scotland. Edward II crowned John Balliol as the King of Scotland, who subsequently began the war for Scottish independence. After a series of losses, the Scottish elite placed Robert Bruce in power. Under Bruce’s leadership, Scotland achieved independence from Edward and England through the famous battle of Bannockburn.

The Battle of Bannockburn and its legend are spectacles of Scottish independence that continue to inflect Scottish identity today. A win through the violence of war communicated that the Scots were both independent *and* victorious. In hailing the memory of this battle, contemporary Scottish militarism and nationalism fuse past and present. Jisha Menon theorizes contemporary performances of India and Pakistan that mimetically reference The Partition, the dividing of one nation into two. She states, “Contemporary retellings of the partition do not simply reflect the past but inscribe within their very narration the stories one wants to tell of the present,”¹⁹⁴ even arguing that “the diachronic doubleness of these memories that shuttle between 1974 and 1984 reveal that the partition as an event had not ended.”¹⁹⁵ While Partition and Scottish wars of independence are distinct in a number of ways, the Tattoo’s representations of Bruce and Scottish military history inscribe the independence narrative onto the lives of contemporary Scots in a manner consistent with Menon’s analysis, and the framework of the scenario of independence helps us see how the Tattoo accomplishes this. In the initial scenario, Scotland establishes itself in its fight for

¹⁹⁴ Jisha Menon, *Performance of Nationalism: India, Pakistan, and the Memory of Partition* (CAMBRIDGE UNIV Press, 2018), 19.

¹⁹⁵ Jisha Menon, *Performance of Nationalism: India, Pakistan, and the Memory of Partition*, 4.

independence from England. Through the war, Scotland made heroes and solidified its identity. Then the battle is won. The repetition of the Scottish fight for independence as it appears in following Scottish conflicts, Scottish daily life, literature, or the performances like the Tattoo has allowed the initial event of independence to continue without end from the thirteenth century onward.

The First Scottish War of Independence was a bold flash that created Scottish identity anew through its status as a spectacular event. Taylor argues that spectacle (and the scripts or political scenarios that house it) “both builds and dismantles a sense of community and nation-ness...it both forges and erases images of national and gender identity...it stirs and manipulates desire, allowing a population insight into events and blinding it to the meaning of its situation, how it presents both an invitation to cross the line between actor and spectator.”¹⁹⁶ This spectacle erases history before the establishment of a cohesive Scotland. It also erases an image of a possible future under British suzerainty. Instead, the event and the imagination of the event awakened an imaginative nation-ness, as Fiona Watson discusses in her account of the emergence of Scottish nationhood. If, as Watson argues, the throne of Robert Bruce and its struggle against the English brought about Scotland’s political coherence by its mere existence and opened Scotland up to many other notions of Scottishness that had not previously been imaginable, scenarios of independence were the impetus and the means of sustaining that coherence.

Bruce's participation in an early moment of Scottish nationhood that invented its Scottish national values, combined with his looming presence in contemporary performances like the Tattoo, keep Bruce’s legacy central to Scottish national identity today. When employed in

¹⁹⁶ Diana Taylor, *Disappearing Acts: Spectacles of Gender and Nationalism in Argentina's "Dirty War"* (Durham, NC: Duke Univ. Pr., 2005), i.

scenarios of independence, Bruce's legacy helps produce the hope that independence could always be only one step away. These performances seek not only to revive Bruce's role in an early moment of Scottish nationhood that invented its Scottish national values but also his record as a military figure with military accomplishments. Performing Bruce as a public hero helps make it apparent that the First War of Scottish Independence, and therefore the Scottish identity that is bound to it, was not peaceful but a practice of physical domination. While scholar Michael Penman has hypothesized that Bruce lacks some of the radicalism that draws many contemporary Scots to the legacies of the revolutionary William Wallace and the radical poet Robert Burns, Bruce enjoys a prominent role in Scottish popular culture. Geoffrey Barrow explains that Bruce "shines in popular mythology"¹⁹⁷ even if English-authored Scottish education curriculums obscure his significance. His image exists throughout the public visual sphere, not least of which is his presence in stone that watches over the martial pursuits of the Edinburgh Tattoo. The use of Bruce in performances of Scottish identity purposefully draws cultural ideas of independence and martial success to the present Scottish moment and roots contemporary Scottish identity in military history.

3.2.2 Romantic Highland Soldier

Through their collective evocation of the figure of the romantic highland soldier, the mass of anonymous soldiers and performers that blend together in the sea of spectacle is as crucial to the performance of the Tattoo as the named heroes are. The constructed highland soldier figure is important to the composition of hegemonic Scottish national identity and plays a key role in

¹⁹⁷ Geoffery W. S. Barrow, *Robert the Bruce and the Scottish Identity* (Edinburgh: Saltire Society, 1984).

fantasies of historical scenarios of independence. Foundational scholar of nationalism Ernst Gellner writes that “Nationalism is not the awakening of nations to self-consciousness: it invents nations where they do not exist.”¹⁹⁸ This section highlights the invention of the highland figure through romanticism and the systemic exploitation of Scottish men by the British military through the performance of this figure. Likewise, the Tattoo relies on this figure as its primary character to further imbue it into Scottish national identity in order to continue the aims of the British military from the nineteenth century to today.

I have argued with Watson that the national imaginary, and therefore the nation, began at Bannockburn. Here, I apply Gellner’s words to the hegemonic Scottish national identity and show how romanticism and the British Empire are some of the identity’s primary inventors, exemplified by the Tattoo. At the opening of the Tattoo, the number of marchers and musicians build an overwhelming sound as the bagpipes echo off the castle walls. Their uniforms present a sea of true Scottish heritage. However, that heritage is performative and not a historical fact. The wild and mysterious figure of the highland soldier, who dons a kilt and plays the bagpipe, comes from the imagination of romanticism. As a place seen as primitive and wild, the Scottish highlands were perfect fodder for the romantic movement that sought to go against progress and industrialism. Through literature, legend, and art, the land and its people could be inscribed with invented mystical and mythical pasts on an unrulable terrain. Literature scholar Matthew Wickman describes literary depictions of Scotland as shifting from “gloomy” to “sublime” in this period (the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries). Through the early part of the eighteenth century,

¹⁹⁸ Ernest Gellner, *Nations and Nationalism* (Oxford: Blackwell, 1983), 7.

the Scottish highlands' reputation among England and the lowlands was barbaric.¹⁹⁹ The romantic mysticism of the Scottish highlands and Scotland as a whole is a pervasive image today in tourism and portrayals of Scotland. The Tattoos' use of fog machines and moody strategic lighting continues that image.

The literary and embodied mythologies of the romantic highland warrior cemented the perceived mysteriousness of the land. Many scholars have theorized the romantic invention of the highland figure and its connection to Scottish nationalism and identity, such as Vivian Williams in her consideration of the bagpipe's perception (2016) and Leith Davis in a comparative analysis of Scottish and English romantic literature and national identity (1999). Scholars draw connections between the highland invention and Britain's imperial project by citing Macpherson's *Ossian*, the work of poet Robert Burns, and the depictions laid out by Walter Scott. In the late eighteenth to early nineteenth centuries, while the literature's shadow cast the highland character across Scotland, the British military was inventing an embodied version of the character. The military inscribed the same highland figure onto Scottish recruits to use them as a martial economic export and as a means of control. The embodied highland figure, the Scottish soldier under British direction, established a real being that could be placed on the mythical land, bringing the myth into reality.

The realized romantic highlander, the Scottish soldier, fulfilled this role by performing mythical historical narratives in clothing and image. The unique, romantic Scottish panoply and the highland aesthetic were crucial for the British military to distinguish the Scottish soldier from other British soldiers, thus ensuring the Scottish soldier's mythical character value. Their means

¹⁹⁹ Matthew Wickman, *The Ruins of Experience: Scotland's "Romantick" Highlands and the Birth of the Modern Witness* (Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2011), 9-10.

of differentiation and othering invented a contemporary national identity. This is reflected in the Tattoo and includes the lowlands in their purview of representation by providing only one historical narrative with no separated highland or lowland designation. The Pipes and Drums of the Tattoo depict the mythical highland figure to a tee with all the accouterments of the noble highland warrior, including bagpipes. The Scottish uniform that the performers wear derives from a “plaid,” or Félieadh Mòr, a large piece of cloth draped around the body and over the shoulder. This uniform belongs to romantic mythology as the modern kilt or plaid, and its predecessors were not the clothing of historical heritage until romantic artists and the British military popularized them. Even the plaid that was worn by rough highlanders and servants, never gentry, was not recorded before the sixteenth century. A reliable account of the creation of the *felie beg* or small kilt places its invention in 1727. It was not the ancient uniform of the highland soldier but an alteration made by an English furnace owner for his highland employees to have ease of movement.²⁰⁰ The history of each highland clan owning a unique family tartan for their kilts was also false and was a product of the British use of the highland figure in its military endeavors. This is one of the many bits of invented national identity that has been projected onto the past, as far back as identity-creating moments like the battle of Bannockburn, where no kilts were worn.

The British military was able to use and exaggerate the reputational barbarism that romantic literature made enchanting because the barbarian character was deeply established and politicized hegemonic tellings of Scotland’s military history. This pre-romantic aspect of the highland reputation was developed and performed in Scotland’s independence scenario, wherein the Scots are bold, brave, and violent in their quest. To demonstrate the interconnections between

²⁰⁰ H. R. Trevor-Roper, *The Invention of Scotland: Myth and History* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2014), 199.

Scottish identity as performed in the Tattoo, military history, and systemic English advantage that structure Scottish independence scenarios, I outline several historical factors, including the growth of the highlander-as-warrior image, the Jacobite rebellions and their connected legalities, and the British military's exploitation of the Scottish.

The military strategies of the highland fighters throughout the seventeenth century established a trait of brutal violence that is presented through veiled performance in the soldier character of the Tattoo. During the Early Modern "Military Revolution," theorized by Michael Roberts and discussed in Chapter Two, the highlands did not adopt the practices of drill and discipline coming over from the continent. Scottish highlanders, at this time under British rule, rejected this military structure. Instead, they stuck to traditional guerrilla-like tactics. They were good on the rough terrain of the highlands and aggressive in their strikes. From 1639-1689, the highland clans saw several victories in what historians have called the "Highland Charge." The battles in the charge had various motives, but they were successful. However, the charge perpetuated a reputation of the highland people as a somewhat primitive and warrior people. This observation continued into the following century. A French fellow soldier to a group of Scottish highland mercenaries in the eighteenth century said of them later that they did not use skillful tactics. Instead, they fought like they were out for revenge, "with a ferocity natural to savages, they made no prisoners, and spared neither man, woman, nor child."²⁰¹

Scotland's resistance to English power politicized the martial and civilian Scottish identity of the eighteenth century. In 1715, lowlanders demonized the performance of highland culture, which became more clearly political for the English after highland clans backed the Stuart claim

²⁰¹ Hew Strachan, "Scotland's Military Identity," *Scottish Historical Review* 85, no. 2 (2006): 322.

to the English and Scottish thrones in the Jacobite rebellion. In the rebellion, the English quashed the Jacobites resulting in parliament putting forward an act to outlaw highland dress and culture. It did not pass. Thirty years later, Charles Edward Stuart, known as Bonnie Prince Charlie, revived the Jacobite cause, which became a key moment of identity performance in the Tattoo. The highlanders saw more success this time, but the British defeated them at the now-iconic Battle of Culloden in 1746. Culloden was the last pitched battle to occur on British soil, with the British using the techniques of the Military Revolution. Shortly after the Jacobite rebellion of 1745, parliament passed legislation banning the teaching of Gaelic, wearing tartan, kilt, or plaid, holding ceremonial highland gatherings, and playing bagpipes. They also incorporated the highland into the land shares of lowland aristocrats, essentially killing the clan system. In *The Invention of Scotland* (2014), Trevor-Roper argues that much of the public then forgot about the history and the ban until parliament repealed the law in 1782. By then, the lower classes were not interested in returning to clothing that they barely remembered. However, the English and Scottish gentry began to wear it as a way into the heroic Scottish heritage and identity that emerged from romantics.²⁰² Political shifts in the performance of Scottish identity throughout military conflict accentuate the importance of depictions of identity in the Tattoo.

The 2017 Tattoo depicted the Jacobite Uprising of '75 in its own vignette or scene that established value judgments in favor of Scottish rebellion, thus reinforcing the historic Scottish independence scenarios in Scottish identity. The Band of the Royal Regiment of Scotland marches into place to play music as a group of men dressed as eighteenth-century redcoats assemble with muskets in hand. From the far end of the esplanade, another group emerged: rowdy rebels in brown

²⁰² H. R. Trevor-Roper, *The Invention of Scotland: Myth and History*, 204.

tartan kilts to challenge the Redcoats. A skirmish ensues, primarily of faux musket shots with bursts of smoke and choreographed advances and retreats until the Redcoats were defeated and driven into the castle. The Jacobites cheered and raised their arms to the crowd. This instigated spectator cheers as the audience cooperated with the narrative that rebels against the British are the heroes in the context of this vignette, and that the audience members are meant to participate in that narrative through applause.

Although the Jacobites lost to the British, and this vignette reenacted no specific battle, the romanticization of Culloden and the highland Soldier was fully displayed to the point that the performers encouraged the international audience to empathize. The revolution was not one of traditional independence, featuring one country escaping from another. Still, the story of this revolution was one in which the narrative counters the progressive and orderly world of the English in favor of the wild, independent, and war-like nature of the highland Scots. In rehashing the narrative of Culloden, Scots are performing a heritage of an independent spirit that thrives even when used in support of a British contender for the crown or when in defeat to the British. The British use the fortification of these identity markers and independence narratives to uphold the Scottish scenario of independence that, instead of ending in achieved independence or success like Bannockburn, serves to create a profitable Scottish identity for the British to use and compare against themselves.

The British military systematically used the invented highland warrior for its own purposes. Before and after Culloden, the British government conscripted highland soldiers to serve in the British Army. The army then put performance practices into motion that displayed the power and reputation of the fierce highland warrior identity to sell Scottish soldiers into foreign conflicts such as the Seven Years' War and the American War for Independence. Historians Stuart Allan and

Allan Carswell support the theory that the British Army exploited highland identity to profit militarily and financially. They state: “Essentially, the reputation of the Scottish regiments fitted perfectly with, and indeed was adapted to suit.”²⁰³ By serving, highlanders could regain the standing in government that they had lost in the failed rebellion. The British could focus Scottish martial energies for their gain and away from the thoughts of new rebellions while using these soldiers to police their own Scottish countrymen.²⁰⁴ This history of exploitation and its consequences are deeply engrained in contemporary Scotland. A foundational play of the National Theatre of Scotland explores the historical Scottish regiment, *The Black Watch*, and contemporary Scottish concerns in the British military. In *Black Watch*, a contemporary soldier character discusses the post-Culloden historical period for highland men and laments, “We were fucking mercenaries tay half ay fuckin Europe!”²⁰⁵ Here, the playwright, Gregory Burke, demonstrates that the highland recruitment and placement process is seen as expansive and connected to today’s Scotland.

Marketing Scottish soldiers to Britain and foreign militaries cemented Scottish identity as martial. While the romantics invented a literary figure of the highland warrior, the empire invented an embodied one. The government granted an exception to the highland dress ban for military personnel. Highland regiments were required to discard the ban and embrace tartanry for Britain to continue to build the warrior reputation to set them apart to boost their mercenary worth. The British found value in soldiers visually performing a perceived Scottishness, or embodying the

²⁰³ Stuart Allan and Allan Carswell, *The Thin Red Line: War, Empire and Visions of Scotland* (Edinburgh: National Museums of Scotland, 2004), 22.

²⁰⁴ Hew Strachan, “Scotland’s Military Identity,” *Scottish Historical Review* 85, no. 2 (2006): pp. 315-332, <https://doi.org/10.3366/shr.2007.0026>, 322.

²⁰⁵ Gregory Burke, *Black Watch* (London: Faber And Faber, 2010), 30.

highland character. The highland dress was now fully a martial uniform and, as such, held honor for officers and lords. Regimental uniforms traditionally vary by regiment across the entire military, so highland regiments were distinguished using different tartans. The British government relied on clan chieftains to gather young men for conscription, who would all serve in the same regiment.²⁰⁶ With time, the meaning behind the militaristic highland dress and the reason for the varied tartans blended into a rearward-projected history in which each regiment was representative of an ancient clan heritage containing a long line of warriors put onto the past along with their tartans. The collective memory then shifted to recall that the clans had historical ownership of tartans and those of the regiments they were associated with, even though it was a military organizational byproduct.²⁰⁷ These narratives are crucial for highland recruitment that continues, the Tattoo being one example.

By making Scottish soldiers performers of a perceived natural warrior identity that comes from the nature of their Scottishness, the Scottish body is in itself deemed violence-prone. If the warrior identity is true for any boy who might sign up for the military, the violent identity implicated any Scot. The martial aspect of hegemonic Scottish identity is not isolated to the look of the kilt or a distant idea. When the Indian Mutiny of 1857 occurred, the British government deemed that there were groups of people who were more disposed toward violence and better

²⁰⁶ The British military benefited from recruitment, but the historical structure of Scotland did not. Scottish historian Hew Strachan argues that these recruitment tactics destroyed the clan system by bringing the clan leadership into military service. He says, “The British state exploited clan loyalties to form regiments while simultaneously destroying the clans themselves. As Fraser’s career exemplified, military service enabled ambitious Scots to exploit the career opportunities opened up to them by the Union. Between 1714 and 1763 one in four officers in the British army were Scots.”

Hew Strachan, “Scotland’s Military Identity,” *Scottish Historical Review* 85, no. 2 (2006): pp. 315-332

²⁰⁷ H. R. Trevor-Roper, *The Invention of Scotland: Myth and History*, 205.

served in military capacities. Sikhs and Gurkhas were martial, but Tamils and Kashmiris were not. They began to use this classification across the empire. The characteristics that made an ethnic group or culture martial were that “they were northern, not southern; they came from mountains, not from the plains; they were rural peoples, not urban.”²⁰⁸ Not only did the highlanders show a dignified and romantic Scottish past, but the English also classified them as a military “caste” according to their discriminatory findings in India. Performers in the Tattoo embody the perceived intrinsic nature of violence and repeat it throughout the Tattoo, as real Scottish soldiers give life to historical occurrences of the scenario of Scottish independence, a scenario that began in violence.

The position of the Scottish military under the British military entangles identities for both. Even though the British military, and therefore the English, used Scottish soldiers and created a marketable Scottish warrior identity, the British military houses that identity as a subsection of itself. Scots’ identity is therefore inscribed into British identity and enmeshed with English identity. As a result, the British military embedded Scottish militarism in the empire's identity.

In the mid-nineteenth century, warrior imagery became synonymous with all of Scotland and was further commoditized. The “highland craze” of the Victorian era saw civilians taking up the emblems of the highland warrior as representations of their general Scottishness and the highland independence values as their national identity. As the British government used the highland warrior image heavily for recruitment, Queen Victoria increasingly began to visit Scotland.²⁰⁹ Through her example, she ushered in Scottish popularity. The highland image of being en vogue helped push the image to the entire Scottish military. By 1881, all Scottish regiments had

²⁰⁸ Hew Strachan, “Scotland’s Military Identity,” 316.

²⁰⁹ Hew Strachan, “Scotland’s Military Identity,” 316.

pipers and wore tartan. By then, people worldwide had seen their recruits as mighty soldiers. For Strachan, “They appropriated the paraphernalia of the Highland soldier as a universal symbol of Scotland. Kilts and broadswords, dirks and pipes... Like so many self-deceptions, they became self-perceptions, and ultimately self-fulfilling perceptions.”²¹⁰ The military wrote the past for the entire nation as a figure inseparably sewn to war and a fight for independence.

The 2017 Tattoo’s portrayal of the Jacobite rebellion through vignette carefully crafts a playful embodiment of the pacifying Scottish independence scenario. The Tattoo is able to control the historical scenario into a digestible narrative. It codes redcoats as uptight and formal. The band’s strategic cheers establish the rugged underdogs as those to root for. By World War I, when regiments ceased wearing kilts in battle, the kilt and tartan had existed for use in the Union for much longer than they had existed for the Scots alone. Still, through the performance of a non-historically specific Jacobite rebellion, the highland dress is consistently a symbol of independence. At that moment, the public applauds an independent spirit, even though the English won in the end. The remembrance calls to the moments after the rebellion when highland warriors who opposed the British were quickly enfolded and commodified by them. The Tattoo shows the Jacobites as clans in rebellion, but they also present the clans in their current state when the Tattoo introduces the real current chieftains at a different moment. With this introduction, the audience does not see an active exciting skirmish but the aftermath of the government folding their regiments into British military units and complicating the family history, heritage, and identity tied

²¹⁰ Hew Strachan, “Scotland’s Military Identity,” 327.

to military service.²¹¹ The careful identity that the military has crafted through conscription and mythology that the Tattoo upholds is not the only identity that is fighting for national visibility.

3.2.3 A different national identity

The Tattoo produces other narratives and identities, as do the stories of Bruce, Bannockburn, and Culloden. Tim Edensor reminds us of the myriad contributors to national identity at any moment.

I consider national identity to be constituted out of a huge cultural matrix which provides innumerable points of connection, nodal points where authorities try to fix meaning, and constellations around which cultural elements cohere. Culture, according to this conception, is constantly in a process of becoming, of emerging out of the dynamism of popular culture and everyday life whereby people make and remake connections between the local and the national, between the national and the global, between the everyday and the extraordinary.
212

For some, the hegemonic ideas of Scottish identity are steeped in violence, commodification, and kitsch. However, many aspects of Scottish politics, art, popular culture, and lived experiences outside the military contribute to national identities. Functioning as a nationally based performance group, The National Theatre of Scotland demonstrates varied potential Scottish identities that can be produced from the same cultural memory, cultural ritual, or mode of performance, which contrasts with the hegemonic Scottish national identity discussed in this chapter.

²¹¹ In the opening ceremonies of the Tattoo, the 2017 production brought out representatives from clans throughout Scotland. Fifty-seven clans appeared across the run of the Tattoo. The program's page on the clan feature states that it is part of Scotland's Year of History, Heritage, and Archeology, and that all people are encouraged to "explore their ancestral connections with the country." The theme of "Splash of Tartan" emphasizes the romanticized clans.

²¹² Tim Edensor, *National Identity, Popular Culture and Everyday Life* (Oxford: Berg, 2002), vii.

The National Theater of Scotland (NTS) uses the Tattoo to provide a counter-representation of the nation in direct opposition to the hegemonic narratives of tartanry contained in the Tattoo. In *Black Watch*, one of their most popular international productions, NTS presents the institution of the British-controlled Scottish military in a negative light. They highlight the experience of individual soldiers, who they depict more positively in representations of contemporary battle. The play directly references the Tattoo in the staging of a difficult and dramatic scene by partially representing it. The play is performed in traverse (or alleyway) staging, like the Tattoo. Playwright Gregory Burke spoke about the decision to represent the Tattoo in the production. “The Edinburgh Military Tattoo is also produced by the army. It is a very sanitised version of military life. Marching bands, displays of athletic ability, drill. It in no way reflects actual combat, because, obviously, the reality of military combat is not something the general public would find entertaining.... the main way we subverted it was through the idea that *Black Watch* was a ‘tattoo’ about actual warfare, whilst preserving the drill, the music, the athletic ability that the Tattoo also showcases”²¹³ His goal was to subvert the Tattoo’s meaning in the audience’s eyes. By doing so, he resists the romanticized martial history displayed therein.

The 2014 NTS play *Anything That Gives Off Light* uses the same iconic historical figures as the Tattoo to explore the national identity of contemporary Scotland and the history that made it so. It discusses and depicts icons such as William Wallace, Bonnie Prince Charlie, and Margaret Thatcher, in addition to Sir. Walter Scott, Scottish Enlightenment, and the Battle of Culloden. The play depicts a shift in the national identity away from the idealized rural Scots of romanticism and toward an urban and diverse citizenry dealing with housing crises and migration. The National

²¹³ Gregory Burke, *Re: Black Watch Thesis*, March 28, 2013.

Theatre of Scotland provides another narrative of shared national history but aligns that history not to a militarized contemporary Scottish identity but a community-minded identity.

The theatre space of the National Theatre of Scotland also challenges the visual image of Scottish identity. So grounded in military history and romanticized highland culture, the hegemonic Scottish image is a strong masculine figure in specific apparel. In recent years, the NTS has featured increasingly diverse performers regarding race, gender, and ability. They also eschew the cultural binding of Scotland to codified meaningful spaces, such as the Edinburgh Castle or the fields of Culloden, by initially having no permanent performing space. Instead, the company had a rehearsal space but performed traveling or in other appropriate venues. Today, they have the ability to perform in their rehearsal space but continue to seek out other venues for performance. The shifting bodies and space of the National Theatre of Scotland give national identity flexibility, unlike the Tattoo, which has been performed on the Castle Esplanade since it began, even under heavy debate about changing venues in 1955 and 1959.²¹⁴

However, even when acting in reaction to the Tattoo or as an alternative interpretation of historical heroes, the NTS does not escape the Scottish scenario of independence. They set themselves apart from the Scottish cultural establishment and the well-established National Theatre in England through their resistance. They seek a liberated, though nationally representative, theatre that thrives in environments like the Edinburgh Fringe Festival, in which they are prominently featured (I will address the Fringe later in the chapter). However, the Scottish government is a primary funder of the NTS, and the theatre provides cultural diplomacy globally

²¹⁴ W.V. Wastie (Edinburgh, n.d.).

in their tours of Scottish national themes, from which the government benefits.²¹⁵ Their work is not completely controlled, nor is it completely independent. Instead, it rests in a fight for independence that sits just enough off the edge to be deemed appropriate.

The Scottish public also resists the hegemonic identity. In *National Identity, Popular Culture, and Everyday life* (2002), Edensor looks at *Braveheart*'s effects on Scotland's national identity politics. For many, he argues, *Braveheart* was contested for its inaccuracies and persistence in portraying Scots in the tartan stereotype. He quotes T.C. Smout's lament on the Bruce and Wallace identity "in popular culture, Scottish history appears as the stuff of heritage industry, colorful and episodic, but basically not serious. It is a poor foundation on which to identify a Scottish nation."²¹⁶ While many dislike the romanticized highlander identity, they are nonetheless captured in its performance from the global gaze and internal capitalist and state goals. Rejection of the hegemonic narrative is not simple. Colin MacArthur argues that the hegemonic representation interpolates citizens by giving them a reflection of themselves, from which it is difficult to create an alternative identity.²¹⁷ Edensor continues to state that even the identities portrayed in films like *Braveheart*, and I would argue events like the Tattoo, perform values with which Scottish citizens still identify and seek to instill, a process described by Edensor as "transformative appropriation."²¹⁸ A value that is undoubtedly present in *Braveheart* and, I have proved the Tattoo,

²¹⁵ "Support the National Theatre of Scotland," National Theatre of Scotland, July 1, 2022, <https://www.nationaltheatrescotland.com/support-us>.

²¹⁶ T.C. Smout, "Perspectives on the Scottish Identity," *Scottish Affairs* 6 (First Series, no. 1 (1994): pp. 101-113, <https://doi.org/10.3366/scot.1994.0010>, 109.

²¹⁷ Colin McArthur, *Scotch Reels: Scotland in Cinema and Television* (London: British Film Institute, 1982), 40.

²¹⁸ Tim Edensor, *National Identity, Popular Culture and Everyday Life* (Oxford: Berg, 2002), 149.

is the spirit of a fight for independence. However, even if the kilt disappears, the attitudes of the highland hero are adopted and embodied.

3.3 Controlling Motion: Epistemology of Highland Dance and Continuity Drill

The 2017 Tattoo presented a purposeful and finely manicured Scottish heritage, as discussed in the previous section. However, the heritage of the Tattoo performance practice itself does not reflect such tight restrictions on its identity-enriching national performance. Several decades ago, the Tattoo included performances akin to military-associated carnival acts. The years 1989–1992 were some of the most spectacular. During those years, the Tattoo featured acts by the Royal Air Force Police Dogs, a display from the “strongest man in the world,” a physical fitness obstacle course, and a motorcycle show. In 1974 there was a firefighting demonstration, and in 1962, the audience joined the performers on the esplanade to dance the American-born twist to Chubby Checker’s “Let’s Twist Again.”²¹⁹ With a different theme every year and different producers over time, the Tattoo has shifted dramatically since its beginnings in 1949.

As an original performance designed for the year at hand, the 2017 Tattoo stood as a solitary performance. However, it also exists in a long line of Tattoos that each reflect their eras and create tradition and institutional memory over time. The setting on the esplanade against

²¹⁹ “Scottish Command Presents the Edinburgh Tattoo Programmes 1954-1985,” *Scottish Command Presents the Edinburgh Tattoo Programmes 1954-1985* (Edinburgh Tattoo, n.d.). and “The Royal Edinburgh Military Tattoo: History of the Tattoo,” Royal Edinburgh Military Tattoo, accessed July 12, 2022, <https://www.edintattoo.co.uk/history>.

Edinburgh Castle befits the Tattoo's amalgamated shifting history. First built in the Iron Age, builders added to the castle, demolished parts, and added again continually until 1927. Museum curators continue to alter the interior displays of the castle today. Like the castle manifesting an age older than its constituent parts, the 2017 Tattoo, a contemporary performance, appears to play out a long-held tradition.

The 2017 Tattoo mixed elements of the old and new to dictate a narrative of mythological Scotland together as linked but counter to progressive Britain, ultimately linking the Tattoo to the values of its post-Brexit UK identity more than the values of its Scottish independence. Like the castle, which the audience can see throughout the performance, the performers' bodies physicalize the Tattoo's blend of old and new through choreography. The scenario of independence wherein the Scottish people are defined by violent rebellion from the English only to be circumscribed back into the English fold of Great Britain, occurs through the dichotomy in the performer's body. I compare and contrast the performances of The Tattoo Dance Company and the Queen's Colour Squadron in the 2017 Tattoo to demonstrate how this iteration of the Tattoo attempted to unite Scotland and Britain in purpose and identity. By shifting and manipulating notions of Scottish tradition, the Tattoo unites Scotland with Britain covertly, perpetuating outward Scottish independence that Britain and England inwardly control. Through these two performances groups, I demonstrate how the Scottish Independence Scenario exists in the eruption *between* the two back-to-back performances, *at* a specific point in the timeline of complex performance practice development, and *in* the fixture of the performance in the 2017 political sphere. The movement and choreography of these performances do not dictate a personal journey through the independence scenario by every performer. Instead, these practices are some of the many pieces

of knowledge and tradition that are embodied by the performers with the potential for future transfer and repetition.

In *The Archive and the Repertoire*, Diana Taylor enriches her discussion on the scenario by identifying how information passes from one generation to another. In many contexts, Taylor argues, the archive is the privileged and traditional form of knowledge transfer. It includes written texts, photographs, videos, and objects that people can place into an archive for recollection. The repertoire, on the other hand, is an embodied practice. Taylor describes the repertoire as “performances, gestures, orality, movement, dance, singing—in short, all those acts usually thought of as ephemeral, nonreproducible knowledge.”²²⁰ The repertoire passes along many forms of knowledge, including cultural identity, values, and memory. However, just as historians and humans change the archive with each interpretation, the repertoire shifts and reforms as it travels through participants and history. Performances and practices in the repertoire exist with their own rules. Taylor notes, “The process of selection, memorization or internalization, and transmission takes place within (and in turn helps constitute) specific systems of re-presentation.”²²¹ The repertoire passes knowledge that is influenced and shaped by the structures of power and control that house it. For example, the Tattoo Dance Company performs Scottish folk dance, and the Queen’s Colour Squadron performs variations of traditional military drill. Both are embodied practices that have existed through the repertoire, have influenced and been influenced by the archive, and have been re-created by systems of power. These repertoire histories play out on the historic chain of bodies of the performers, demonstrating an element of an independence scenario

²²⁰ Diana Taylor, *The Archive and the Repertoire: Performing Cultural Memory in the Americas* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2007), 20.

²²¹ Diana Taylor, *The Archive and the Repertoire: Performing Cultural Memory in the Americas*, 20-21.

(more extensive than the one playing out on the body of the individual dancer) that plays out through the movement practice's history.

I draw on Edensor's connection of bodily epistemology, national identity, nation-building in my analysis of these two Tattoo performance scenes. Edensor claims that the state can organize national identity into performances, but the individual engages with national identity through personal feeling and affect. He states, "National identity is processed through the realms of affect and sensuality as much as through cognitive processes of meaning construction and transmission. Bodily dispositions, modes of inhabiting space and ways of using things infer a structure of feeling; they can transmit shared emotional and sensual experiences in intangible ways."²²² Highland Dancing and the drill of the Queen's Colour Squadron both have immense capacity to build and instill national identity through movement. They each contain very different physical scripts and affective potentialities. However, they exist within a highly choreographed national performance under the British military's direction and therefore contribute to the same overarching possibilities of the Tattoo's repertoire.

3.3.1 Highland Dancing

Highland dancing, a form of Scottish folk dance, has long been an important piece of the Edinburgh Tattoo. In the Tattoo's third year of existence (the second official year under the name Edinburgh Tattoo, 1951), the boys of Queen Victoria School in Dunblane, Scotland, entertained the audience with a "display of highland dancing." Soldiers from the highland regiments

²²² Tim Edensor, *National Identity, Popular Culture and Everyday Life* (Oxford: Berg, 2002), 140.

subsequently performed highland dancing in 1953 and 1954. Since then, highland dancing has been a staple at the Tattoo.²²³ Highland dancing is a form of Scottish step dancing developed from folk dances in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. Traveling dance masters taught choreographed steps and infused folk styles with aspects of ballet and formalized English dance styles.²²⁴ The dancers carry their weight on the balls of their feet and display hops, kicks, and quick footwork. Unlike Irish step dances, highland dance utilizes the upper body in choreography, often above the head. Dancers perform to bagpipes in addition to the fiddle music that is also traditional in Irish step dancing.

Cultural historiographic conjecture has long supposed highland dancing to be influenced by highland war dances, instilling an aggressive and martial aesthetic to the dance. Among highland dances are Sword Dances, the most popular of which is a solo dance in which one person dances over two crossed swords.²²⁵ There are several references in historical texts that state the dances, especially sword dances, were war dances that were used either before or after battle. However, the references are all from non-soldiers in non-war contexts who speak of second hand legends of the origins of the dance. Even if the warriors did not use Sword dance as a war dance to prepare for battle, the Sword dance aesthetic was aggressive. Carl Gustav Carus, a physician to the King of Saxony, recounts watching the Sword dance on the King's tour of Scotland in 1844. He notes the warrior quality of the dance.

The company moved into another room, and several men immediately entered, dressed in full highland costume. The piper commenced his enlivening strains, and a young

²²³ “The Royal Edinburgh Military Tattoo: History of the Tattoo,” Royal Edinburgh Military Tattoo, accessed May 17, 2023.

²²⁴ Mats Melin, “Step Dancing in Cape Breton: Contrasting Contexts and Creative Process,” *MUSICultures* 40, no. 1 (2013): 35–56, 39.

²²⁵ Michael Steven Newton, *Warriors of the Word: the World of the Scottish Highlanders* (Edinburgh: Origin, 2019), 274.

man in Scottish garb first appeared with two naked swords. He laid them crosswise on the floor and, with a particular jerking motion of his legs and arms, began to dance to the music of the bagpipes. With a certain rhythm, he stamped with both feet on the ground, quicker and quicker, trod now on this side and now on that, of the naked sword blades, without ever touching them—threw up his arms in the air, and one while assumed the attitude of an attacking, and at another of a defending warrior. At length, he seized the swords again—swung them over his head, and disappeared [...]

Next appeared two, and then four Highlanders, who performed a dance of similar character and significance as the former, but without weapons. At the moments of their liveliest movement, they continually uttered a sort of quick, lively, exclamatory song, which was succeeded by fresh vehemence in dancing, stamping of the feet, throwing about the arms, and advancing and retreating. I found it impossible to avoid recalling to my mind the drawings and dances among the New Zealanders and other savages, which I had often seen. One must be inspired with a complete interest in all the national peculiarities of Scotland, to be able to follow those movements and bursts of music and shouts with attention.²²⁶

Carus' 1844 account of a solo Sword dance and a group highland dance portrays a percussive form of Scottish dance that largely disappeared from Scotland but continued in the Scottish diaspora,²²⁷ returning to popularity in Scotland in the 1990s as Cape Breton Step Dance.²²⁸ The modern Sword dance retains much of the other features in this account, sans percussion. Carus highlights the aggression of the dance and advances his view of the dance, which is heavily influenced by European ballet, to the point of exoticism. In anti-romantic sentiment, he views the highlanders as savage, and by equating the sword dance to the Māori Haka, he names Scotland as

²²⁶ Mats Melin and Jennifer Shoonover, *Dance Legacies of Scotland: The True Glen Orchy Kick* (New York, NY: Routledge, 2021), 141.

²²⁷ "Scottish Diaspora" is used by scholars when discussing those who immigrated out of Scotland. This is primarily used to talk about the disruption of the highland populations when the British military and government destroyed the clan system, drawing highlanders to Scotland's cities and around the world. Here it refers to the large population of people of Scottish ancestry in Nova Scotia. This can be found in the work of Patricia Ballantyne, Mats Melin, and Jennifer Shoonover.

Patricia H. Ballantyne, *Scottish Dance Beyond 1805: Reaction and Regulation* (London: Routledge, 2020).

Mats Melin and Jennifer Shoonover, *Dance Legacies of Scotland* (2021).

²²⁸ Mats Melin, "Step Dancing in Cape Breton: Contrasting Contexts and Creative Process," *MUSICultures* 40, no. 1 (2013): pp. 35-56, 41.

one more of the British colonies. Accounts such as Carus' perpetuate the antiquated yet violent perception of the highland figure through the dance.

Through the nineteenth century, highland dancing was male-dominated and its stylistic ties to war and the highland warrior image made it the perfect dance for demonstrating masculinity and gaining masculine approval. Many years of the Tattoo reflect the nineteenth-century masculinized version of highland dancing. The highland dance was performed primarily by male soldiers until 1985, with a few years of exception.²²⁹ 1982 was an exemplary year for the highland warrior dance mythology when male junior pipers from four Scottish pipe bands performed "Argyle Broadswords," a dance in which four dancers (here soldiers) place their swords in front of them while facing inward with the swords touching at the tip. They then dance in unison as they move around outside the swords. With swords and highland military uniforms, one could easily imagine these soldiers as highland warriors dancing around a raging fire before battle in masculine glory.

Shifting standards also shift cultural memory in the twentieth century to strip highland dance of its masculine perception. Self-appointed organizations centralized and standardized the dances in the twentieth century, and the form became highly competitive, often competing at highland games. Outside the Tattoo, dancing associations had narrowed highland dancing and created standardized competition practices.²³⁰ Along with these changes, the practice shifted towards being dominated by women, not male soldiers. As a result, young girls were the primary

²²⁹ "Scottish Command Presents the Edinburgh Tattoo Programmes 1954-1985," *Scottish Command Presents the Edinburgh Tattoo Programmes 1954-1985* (Edinburgh Tattoo, n.d.).

²³⁰ Patricia H. Ballantyne, *Scottish Dance Beyond 1805: Reaction and Regulation* (London: Routledge, 2020), 106.

demographic in many competitions by the mid-twentieth century.²³¹ Instructors introduced new, more feminine dances with retroactively invented historical heritages. Fluid cultural memory interlaced these heritages with the romanticized highlander and the mystical Jacobite cause. For example, the dance “Flora MacDonald’s Fancy” was taught by Flora Cruickshank, who claimed to have learned it from her grandfather, a dancing master. She said it was danced to an old Scottish tune, but when she reintroduced it, organizations set it to tunes associated with Jacobites and Bonnie Prince Charlie and taught it as if it had originated from women in the time of Jacobean conflict.²³²

Dancers could perform and compete at standardized highland dances at Highland Games competitions held by official societies and the gentry, further complicating the epistemology of the dance as physical practice by power. Rather than demonstrate a pre-union Gaelic culture, the highland games presented the modernized and regulated post-union²³³ romanticized Scot. Scottish scholar Michael Newton states, “The Games allowed these British élite to enhance their own image as the natural leaders of Highland society, to project a romantic image of themselves and their estates, and to underscore their commitment to the British Empire by promoting a narrow role for Highlander as loyal soldiers of the Empire.”²³⁴ Through the highland games and limiting standardization, highland dance performed both Scottish heritage and British control. The repertoire built dances of Scottish folk tradition, European influence, romanticized highland choreography, and the impact of regulatory restriction.

²³¹ Michael Newton, “The Hidden History of Highland Dance,” Michael Newton © 2012 the hidden history of highland dance, 2012.

²³² Michael Newton, “The Hidden History of Highland Dance,” 8.

²³³ Here, the “union” refers to the creation of Great Britain when England and Scotland were united in 1707.

²³⁴ Michael Newton, “The Hidden History of Highland Dance,” 3.

The mid-twentieth century shifts in the perceptions and demographics of the dance were reflected in the Tattoo by 1992, finalizing the acceptance of the dance by Scottish hegemony as feminine and non-martial. It did so by introducing a women-majority dance group: the Tattoo Dance Company, who became the sole performers of highland dancing at the Tattoo for the years to come. In 1998, the Dance Company ceased performing what was then considered traditionally choreographed, regulated, and regularly competed highland dances and introduced Contemporary Highland Dancing – newly choreographed performance pieces for large groups in the highland dance style. This appealed to the contemporary, international audience of the Tattoo and the everchanging dance field.

The 2017 Tattoo Dance Company's performance gave the audience the antithesis of the masculinized war references of the previous eras of highland dance. The group, fifty dancers strong, took to the esplanade with giant smiles and pristine hair and makeup. The dancers no longer wore the military-style highland uniform. Instead, the 2017 team wore bright pink, yellow, green, and blue leotards with matching tartan skirts, socks, and miniature fly plaid on their shoulders. The large group followed the same movement style as the Tattoo highland dance performed in past years but performed it with more grace and agility because the performers were trained and practiced dancers instead of junior pipers from the regiments. The jumps are higher, and the leg extensions are more accentuated. The group weaves in and out of large formations, similar to a marching band. Throughout the routine, they hit several notable formations: the "white cockade," a Jacobite symbol of a white folded ribbon rosette, the Scottish flag, and the Union Jack. Notwithstanding the reference to the Jacobite rebellion, the violence and warrior affect described by Carus have been completely removed from the Tattoo's highland dance performance. The transition from masculine to feminine gender performance accounts for much of that change but

much also comes from the loss of swords, uniforms, and other martial accouterments. The most significant shift is the performative affect of the dancers. Rather than preparing for war, the Tattoo Dance Company seems to be dancing a happy highland jig at a romanticized community fête.

The multi-national demographic of the dance team brings further intricacy to the gestural history of the performance as each dancer of varied background carries and shares their own repertoire of movement and meaning to the national performance of highland dance at the Tattoo. Unlike many of the performers, who are soldiers from the British military, the civilian Tattoo Dance Company does not use a limited selection pool. With such freedom, the company contains dancers from Scotland, Ireland, Canada, the United States, and New Zealand. The company's dancer is mimetic of a true highland lassie dancing the traditional dances of highland women, only with a slightly updated highland dress. Behind the performance, the dancer may hail from any of Britain's colonial territories and may have gained her experience through training, not living in the highlands. However, the community-building identification that comes from highland dance as an iconic national dance mirrors the community created within the dance and competition community itself. Only some dancers fit inside the interlocking Venn diagram of the two communities: Scottish National and Highland Dancer. Dance theorist H el ene Kringelbach notes the doubled community created by competitive nationalized dances, "[B]allroom dancers are 'practically' – quite literally – a 'tribe' of dancers with a collective identity, the shared experience of a translocal ballroom culture of practice and competition which exists side-by-side with members' own national culture."²³⁵ The dancers exist as a team or a collective identity who, together, manifest Scottish cultural identity whether from Scotland or not.

²³⁵ H el ene Neveu Kringelbach, *Dancing Cultures: Globalization, Tourism and Identity in the Anthropology of Dance* (New York: Berghahn Books, 2012), 12.

The contemporary highland physical movement, as it is viewed and as it is learned, carries the knowledge of multiple community identities, one of which is a community dominated by structure and codification. Even through brightly colored leotards, the dancers evocate old Scottish mythology. The tartan in their costumes, the technique in their steps, and even the music to which they dance embody a practice associated with traditional Scottish life. No matter the country of origin, each dancer is enacting a Scottish physicality, whether it is an affective experience of twentieth-century Scottish interpretation of the past, the actual movement of pre-union highlanders, or the legacy of highland dance from Tattoos that have come before.

In a later scene in the Tattoo, a smaller group of the dancers perform as the Massed Pipes and Drums play “Skye Boat Song” and “Caledonia.” Both are love songs, but “Caledonia” is a modern song that speaks for exiled Scots. Instead of their brightly colored nod to the highland uniform, the dancers are wearing a white flowing skirt with a blue tartan vest. The dancers perform a slightly different style to these ballads. The step dance is more integrated with ballet to the point that ballet becomes the primary form for part of the number. There are turns, leg work, and leaps from ballet tradition. The dance’s uniform and choreography are reminiscent of the Scottish folk dance “Blue Bonnets,” a dance with a story of making oneself appealing to try to attract a suitor.

Attempting to parse apart which movements come from which era or geography in either of these routines is difficult to the point of impossibility and is resisted by the practical application of the repertoire on the dancer’s body. The dances have been developed throughout time, taught by traveling masters, written down, codified, then uncodified into the freedom of modern choreography again. The dances have been violent and peaceful, masculine and feminine.

However, the dancers enact and share the knowledge through the repertoire of these dances not as disjointed amalgamations but as a singular, fluid, and aesthetically pleasing style. Unlike a narrative dance like ballet, contemporary highland dance does not tell a specific story. Instead, it crafts affective states through its repertoire knowledge. Taylor states, “Instead of focusing on patterns of cultural expression in terms of texts and narratives, we might think about them as scenarios that do not reduce gestures and embodied practices to narrative description.”²³⁶ I argue that these dances pass and enact many pieces of knowledge through the repertoire, including the history of an independent Scotland and imperial control. The choreography does not place that knowledge in a linear narrative of wars and monarchies; instead, it molds the knowledge together in the dancer’s movements and gestures.

The Tattoo’s use of perceived Scottish folk dance grants the Tattoo observed heritage and nationalism. In his treatment of Nationalism, Edensor argues that spectacular national performances were “invented” between 1870 and 1914 in the establishment of national monuments, parades, and public holidays. He claims they were created to appear time-honored and contain a purposeful immemoriality. The state can accomplish these meaning making performances of nationalism by adhering to performance practices of collective ritual that endear the performer and audience to a sense of timelessness and history. He states, “By circumscribing the use of specific costumes, imposing a rigid order of events, including pseudo-antique carriages and artefacts to form a pageantry that is saturated with the gravitas commonly accorded to ancient rituals, such events perform timelessness, grounding nation in history, symbolising community

²³⁶ Diana Taylor, *The Archive and the Repertoire: Performing Cultural Memory in the Americas*, 16.

and legitimising authority.”²³⁷ From 1951, the Tattoo embodied a Scottish physicality by incorporating Highland Dance, making both the Tattoo and Highland Dance invented national performances under Edensor’s description. In 2017, the dancers embodied the national timelessness Edensor describes with their performance and connected to national pride by wearing uniforms that overtly referenced highland dress, performing to bagpipes – Scottish iconography – , and dancing steps that matched public perception of highland tradition. In doing so, the 2017 dancers have the potential to mask the male soldier highland dancers of the past Tattoos, instilling new memory into the Tattoo in which a feminized and contemporary/classic-hybrid highland dance is the style that was always performed.

The Tattoo ignores the complexities and nuance of highland dance to present it as only inherently and traditionally Scottish for the audience. In *The Archive and the Repertoire*, Taylor analyzes the narrative of conquest in Latin America. The complexities of conquest and occupation are very different in the Latin American context and many places in the world than in white and unenslaved Scotland/Britain, which must be acknowledged. Nor are the bodies of Scots used or coded like the people of color worldwide. However, Taylor does make a statement that applies to the production of the Tattoo and Scottish dance. She says, “The drama of discovery and display of native bodies- then and now- serves various functions. The indigenous bodies perform a “truth” factor they “prove” the material facticity of an Other and authenticate the discoverer perspective.”²³⁸ Through the Tattoo, the British military can present Scots in a narrow perspective that suits a hegemonic agenda that depends on the existence of a Scottish “other.” Highland dance

²³⁷ Tim Edensor, *National Identity, Popular Culture and Everyday Life* (Oxford: Berg, 2002), 73.

²³⁸ Diana Taylor, *The Archive and the Repertoire: Performing Cultural Memory in the Americas*, 63.

presented in this way keeps Scottish folk dance and practice in a narrow and stable form. In truth, the dances are not entirely traditionally Scottish but carry a repertoire of intercultural and intergenerational knowledge. Their evolutionary and derivative complexity reflects the Scottish identity. Essentially, the highland dance, as presented in the 2017 Tattoo, is a mix of old, new, and eclectic, presented as old and national.

3.3.2 The Queen's Color Squadron

The bagpipes accompanying the Tattoo Dance Company are an embedded national symbol delivered both aurally and visually. Bagpipes did not originate in Scotland. Scholars have dated them earlier in England in the thirteenth century. However, evidence exists that there were bagpipes in Scotland in the fifteenth century, and by the sixteenth century, the bagpipes were encoded with Scottish identity in England and the continent. The bagpipe rose in positive reputation as the highlander did throughout romanticism. Still, before the romantics got ahold of it, the Hanoverian English branded the instrumental icon negatively in its association with Scotland and the Jacobites. Music theorist Vivian Estelle Williams argues, “symptomatically the bagpipe was employed by Hanoverian and English Establishment propaganda as a synecdochical icon for Scotland throughout much of the eighteenth century, and it was used to stress the differences between the two nations.”²³⁹ Today, bagpipes are used commercially as a symbol of Scottish national identity in the tourist industry and as a national symbol of pride. Scottish regiments kept pipers with their bands as a visual and audible way to set them apart as fierce warriors to aid

²³⁹ Vivian Estelle Williams, “The Bagpipe and Romanticism: Perceptions of Ossianic ‘Northernness,’” *European Romantic Review* 27, no. 4 (2016): pp. 459-473, <https://doi.org/10.1080/10509585.2016.1190088>, 461.

recruitment of young men into Scottish regiments. Alternatively, the non-Scottish military bands that evolved out of the late eighteenth century and were standardized in the late nineteenth century used brass and wind instruments to play marches that were very different from the long nasal tones of the bagpipe.²⁴⁰

The 2017 Tattoo accentuated the difference between Scottish and other British military bands by placing a Pipe and Drum number directly before a number from a regimental band of brass and wind instruments. Following the rustic love songs that were danced by the Tattoo Dance Company and played by the Massed Pipes and Drums, The Band of the Royal Airforce Regiment played what felt like an exciting cinematic score accompanied by The Queen's Colour Squadron performing a drill routine. The two performances presented a dichotomy of Scottish and English nationhood in visual, audible, and embodied aesthetics. However, the performances worked together to play out the scenario of independence embodied by the performers.

The transition between performances appeared purposefully arresting which signified difference. The Tattoo Dance Company and the Pipes and Drums all wore tartan. The mood of Scottish heritage was intense as the folk song concluded on the bagpipes as they exited. Edensor notes that notions of "us" vs. "them" are heightened during national performances "when stereotypes are more likely to be bandied about, and this is also the case when 'exotic' otherness is being sold via commodities."²⁴¹ The key elements of Scottish national commodification and stereotype were present during the highland dance. What came next was the stark opposite. Quickly, a real helicopter appeared on the esplanade as the lights changed from a warm purple to

²⁴⁰ Paul Mazey, "The March: Military and Ceremonial Music," in *British Film Music: Musical Traditions in British Cinema, 1930s-1950s* (S.l.: Palgrave Macmillan, 2020), 150.

²⁴¹ Tim Edensor, *National Identity, Popular Culture and Everyday Life* (Oxford: Berg, 2002), 140.

a cool blue. Inside and around the helicopter were soldiers in modern combat uniforms: camouflage, helmets, and guns. Smoke billowed around the helicopter and the performance floor. Soon, the camouflage and helicopters were gone, giving way to the squad of precision drillers setting the bayonets on their rifles in their opening formation with the regimental band at the rear. The band and drill team uniforms were navy blue and contemporary. The layers of fabric for kilts, jackets, and accessories gave a stern contrast to the sleek and crisp look of the performers in the new routine.

The performances' non-musician physicality drew the most opposition in style to the Queen's Colour Squadron, which presents a contrasting affect to the affect I describe in the first section from the highland dancers. The movement of the Pipes and Drums and the Air Force Band did stay similar to each other. Both marched in formations. Their upper bodies and breath changed based on their instruments. However, the producers contrasted the dancers' physicality to the drill of the Colour Squadron. Like the United States Army Old Guard of Chapter Two, The Queen's Colour Squadron marched with precision. The marching varied in speed but was always firm and staccato.²⁴² Turns or directional changes were fast and without flare. The handling of the rifle was

²⁴² The amount of tempo variation sets this drill apart from the old guard's precision drill, which keeps a more consistent tempo, only occasionally changing to double time. The drill also differed from the American drill with a more varied style of march steps, including high knees, regular, and a scuffing action. The American counterpart has one regular marching technique. The Tattoo referred to this form of drill as "continuity drill," referring to the drill being a planned routine performed from start to finish without commands. The BBC broadcast refers to the act as a Silent Drill team. When this phrasing is used in the USA, it means the routine is done in silence. Here it means without command and is the same sentiment as continuity drill. The Tattoo program describes the Queen's Squadron of working with "precision drill" "The Royal Edinburgh Military Tattoo 2017: Splash of Tartan," *The Royal Edinburgh Military Tattoo 2017: Splash of Tartan* (Musselburgh, Scotland: Ivanhoe Printing Co. Ltd., 2017).

not dangerous or suspenseful. Instead, it matched the marching in its crisp energy and provided visual interest as the rifle moved positions.

The setting represented the image of an aircraft carrier and the UK's technical power. The announcer stated that its setting represented the UK's newest aircraft carrier, the HMS Queen Elizabeth. Zooming sound effects and matching strip lights that moved down the "runway" set the space. The most representative aspect, and perhaps most narrative, was when the band and Colour Squadron marched together into the formation of a fighter jet as the sound effects played in the background represented a take-off. The performance continued to exhibit modern touches. As aircraft sound effects played in the background, an electric guitar accompanied the band from the castle. The electric guitar played while the lights turned out entirely, and the Colour Squadron created images with lit props of changing colors. Through the modern presentation of the United Kingdom's latest instrument of war, power is performed with delightful technical advancement, especially when contrasted with the historical and bucolic Scottish traditions.

The performance by the Colour Squadron and the Regiment Band was coded English, despite being British, because of its contrast to the heavily emphasized Scottish national identity of the Tattoo that was featured in the performance of the Highland Dance Company and the Pipes and Drums. Like the Tattoo Dance Company's performance, the Queen's Colour Squadron and RAF Regiment Band contained old and new elements, bridging contemporary national identity to tradition and historical heritage. The Queen's Colour Squadron was formed in 1943 as the Royal Air Force Drill Unit, changing to its current name in 1960. Officers and gunners from the RAF regiment make up this squadron that performs many ceremonial and performance tasks. Other than movement, the most glaring difference between the two performances, highland and modern, is the Queen's Colour Squadron and Regiment Band's station and origination in England. Neither

element of the second performance has Scottish ties other than being under the umbrella of Great Britain. The drill stood in opposition to the style of movement and sound but also to national identity. The producers emphasized this opposition with which English style they selected to be seen. Instead of contrasting highland dancing with a routine of English folk dancing, the Tattoo contrasted the quaint Scottish movement with a powerful martial aesthetic, which performed specific English and British values and repeat them in the repertoire.

The brass and woodwind bands that had become standardized in the British military in the late nineteenth century matched the evolution of national patriotism and performance argued by Edensor. Having originated in England, many thought of the military band style as a British form. The bands played popular music for the community, but state performances that included newly crafted marches and military music were affectively effective in endearing national connection to the military. Musicologist Paul Mazey notes the military band's historical use by the British government. "The establishment recognised the power of military music in state ceremonials, as a means of bolstering the 'imperial image of the British monarchy,'" he argues, "at a time when its real political power was in decline". Thus, military music engendered patriotism and loyalty on a wide scale."²⁴³ The performance highlighted mechanical power and weaponry, continuing the tradition of demonstrating military power. In addition, it manifested the extreme order of the British military through drill and military bands.

The mystical 2017 Scottish performance of wild and independent highlander iconography allowed that identity to play out through music and movement. The contrasting performance was also a tool of identity. Even with a complex evolution, a perception of traditional folk dance creates

²⁴³ Paul Mazey, "The March: Military and Ceremonial Music," in *British Film Music: Musical Traditions in British Cinema, 1930s-1950s* (S.l.: Palgrave Macmillan, 2020), 150.

a moment of affective embodiment in Scottishness and romantic Scottish values, including independence. Argentine dancer and scholar Marta Savigliano explains this connection to national movement when she writes about the Tango and its place in Argentine stereotypes. She also draws to it as a decolonial practice. It is a “locus of my identification... ever since I moved outside my culture...It is a stereotype of the culture to which I belong... by assuming the tango attitude and taking it seriously, I can work at expanding its meaning and power.”²⁴⁴ However, a quick following performance by British units from English ground demonstrates that independence was and is always permitted and under control. The contrast in styles reinforces the scenario. When the romantic highlander was born in literature, art, and military practice, the figure stood as an anchoring Other to the Englishman of the enlightenment. Through the wild Scot, England could hold to its progressive science and philosophy by contrast and use the wild Scot for military protection. In one literary analysis, Mathew Wickam marks this purposeful dichotomy. “Primitive Highland society serves in *Waverley* as a relic against which British progress measures itself; but this progressive attitude must therefore preserve Highland Scotland as a site of irreducible alterity.”²⁴⁵ The Tattoo demonstrates the same Othering. The elongated tones of the bagpipe played by musicians in kilts layered with accouterments produce richness and texture. The highland dancers bridge Tattoo memory with contemporary practices, ensuring a new memory of femininity projected on the past. England is sleek and fresh with modern uniforms and cleanly forceful with the sound of the brass instruments. The drill team connects to a military past, but in front of Iron

²⁴⁴ Marta Savigliano, *Tango and the Political Economy of Passion* (New York, NY: Routledge, 1995), 12.

²⁴⁵ Matthew Wickman, *The Ruins of Experience: Scotland's "Romantick" Highlands and the Birth of the Modern Witness* (Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2011), 13.

to Middle Age perception of the Edinburgh Castle, the drill movements look new, ordered, and masculine.²⁴⁶

The Tattoo Dance Company and the Massed Pipes and Drums call to a different era and a mythical past in opposition to the order of a drill team and military band, but both the drill and the dance perform movement that is equally choreographed and trained. The choreographer set the dancers in precise positions and formations. Their movements weren't as level as drill (they jumped and hopped), but the dancers had great control over their leg movement with consistent muscle engagement. The 2017 Tattoo highland dance was not a loose style. The standardization of highland dances required specific and identifiable steps. The junior pipers from the regiment who danced at previous Tattoos showed less precision and tightness while still staying "in step." The Massed Pipes and Drums also maintained a tight standard drill march in their performance. While not a precision march, the soldiers of the Pipes and Drums would be trained in basic drill upon conscription and marching in formations once in a pipes band. Additionally, the routines do not stay the same every year for any of these performers, but they draw from the same library of gestures to create movement.

Highland dance's profound influences from ballet and English folk dance theoretically place its foundational movements in a similar historical physical epistemology as military drill, potentially joining the two performances in meaning beyond their proximity. Harald Kleinschmidt analyzed the movements of the military and movements in dance in Europe and compared their changes in history. He noticed that in the eighteenth century, the predominant theory in both dance

²⁴⁶ The regiment band played the cinematic new work, "F35-Lightning," instead of a patriotic march. The squadron also hit modern formations. However, the means of playing the instruments and the movements done by the soldiers aligned with traditional precision drill (explored in Chapter 2) and military band practices.

and military drill was stillness and control over the body, in which only the individual part of the body that needed to move did so. There was an “equilibrium” that the individual was meant to maintain with a stable core in both military drill and dance. Dance teachers mixed the ballet from this time with Highland Dance. The stillness reflects in the tight movements of drill.²⁴⁷ Just as the romantic highland figure was reflected in art and practical military execution, the sphere of physicality of the eighteenth century may have contributed to foundational technique in both ballet and drill.

The use of these gestures yearly in a performance of the British military, by both styles of performance, also creates a knowledge base that continues and shifts with the Tattoo. Edensor writes, “By demanding stylised and repetitive performances from the participants, memory and identity become inscribed into the body... This mnemonic effect, embodied within the (national) subject, bestows an affective yet disciplined sense of belonging, a sense that one can successfully perform, that one possesses a competence to enact the ritual and may be called upon to ensure its continued specificity in the future... Such rituals thus constitute powerful programmes for the enaction of collective remembering (and systematic forgetting).”²⁴⁸ These movements, while shifting, are key to Scottish national remembering as well as the British relationship in that memory. The transformation of Highland Dance to a primarily female youth style and from a previous training and battle tactic to current entertainment demonstrates how the movement evolves but continues to represent national values. As put by Kringelbach, “When adults spend hours trying to force specific movement styles into the bodies of children, it is about more than

²⁴⁷ Harald Kleinschmidt, “The Military and Dancing Changing Norms and Behaviour, 15th to 18th Century,” *1995* 25, no. 2 (January 1995), <https://doi.org/10.16995/ee.843>, 169.

²⁴⁸ Tim Edensor, *National Identity, Popular Culture and Everyday Life* (Oxford: Berg, 2002), 74.

creating perfection for a single show.”²⁴⁹ The scenario of independence plays year after year at the Tattoo and, as such, endows the movements of the contemporary highland dance and drill with the values of the performance. The ordering of the performance and selection of the Royal Air Force Regiment Band and Queen’s Colour Squadron to perform at this Scottish national spectacle continues an embodied scenario in which values of independence are performed through the repertoire only to be immediately negated and controlled by the British military.

The Tattoo Dance Company and The Queen’s Color Squadron embody the values of the United Kingdom. The dance choreography uses a complex mixture of styles to call to the mythical highland while grounding the dance in the modern and progressive present-day. The modern alignments of the dance company sync with the Queen’s Squadron, even though they appear quite different, to enact an affect of structure and obedience. However, the gestures embedded in these physicalities transfer ways of knowing from an array of historical sources through the repertoire. The evolution of highland dance has embedded tradition and signification from these various sources into the gestures. When coupled with the drill of the Colour Squadron, the Tattoo enacts the complex scenario of independence and control through the repertoire.

²⁴⁹ Kringelbach writes about teaching culture through dance and how it applies to instilling values through dance and movement. H  l  ne Neveu Kringelbach, *Dancing Cultures: Globalization, Tourism and Identity in the Anthropology of Dance* (New York: Berghahn Books, 2012), 10.

3.4 Cultural Festivities: Internationalism and the Audience in Edinburgh International Festivals

One of the Tattoo's most unique features is outside of the official boundaries of the Tattoo itself. The event is one of six surrounding festivals Edinburgh holds each August when people from all over the world come to see art, theatre, music, and military displays. Edinburgh is the self-declared "City of Festivals" as it hosts twelve annual international festivals.²⁵⁰ However, August contains the most populated festivals and, Edinburgh becomes a lively city teeming with patrons searching for culture. Together, the Edinburgh International Festival (EIF), Edinburgh Festival Fringe (The Fringe), The Edinburgh International Film Festival, Edinburgh International Book Festival, Edinburgh Art Festival, and The Royal Edinburgh Military Tattoo draw more than 2.5 million attendances each August.²⁵¹ Across all of the festivals in 2015, Edinburgh brought in 279.65 million pounds and supported 5,660 new full-time equivalent jobs.²⁵²

The three popular August festivals (EIF, Fringe, and Tattoo) annually perform cultural internationalism that projects a political bond between Scotland and Europe that signifies goals of Scottish Independence. However, the function of the festivals in Scottish capitalism creates an unseen binding to the UK. Further, the Tattoo performs a cultural exchange that leans far from the interculturalism²⁵³ for which the other festivals strive and instead limits exploration of culture by

²⁵⁰ The twelve festivals are Edinburgh International Science Festival, Imagine Festival, Edinburgh International Film Festival, Edinburgh Jazz and Blues Festival, Edinburgh Art Festival, Royal Edinburgh Military Tattoo, Edinburgh Festival Fringe, Edinburgh International Festival, Edinburgh International Book Festival, Edinburgh Mela, Scottish International Storytelling Festival, and Edinburgh's Hogmanay.

²⁵¹ BOP Consulting. *Edinburgh Festivals Impact Study Technical Report May 2011*. Report. 2011, 19.

²⁵² BOP Consulting. *Edinburgh Festivals 2015 Impact Study: Final Report*. Report. 2016, 20.

²⁵³ Definitions of internationalism and interculturalism will be addressed later in the section.

focusing on nations over localities, heralding the merits of internationalism over interculturalism. Through consideration of intercultural, international, and capital festival histories, this chapter clarifies the nationalist meanings present in the 2017 Tattoo in its festival and political context.

The festivals beyond the Tattoo celebrate art, music, dance, theatre, and literature but still have roots in war. The Edinburgh Festival is a performing arts festival created in 1947, just two years after the end of World War II. The war had injured many of the significant cultural meccas of Europe. It halted culture and art festivals that had been active before the war due to arts buildings being a low priority for repairs. Europe did not regain many of these festivals until the 1950s. London's West End had received damage as well. Jen Harvie explains, "While Edinburgh certainly suffered many of the negative effects of war, it had come through with relatively little bomb damage. It retained, intact, the material infrastructure – theatres, halls, equipment, hotels and restaurants – necessary to host a major arts festival."²⁵⁴ Planners in the UK and Scotland saw an opportunity for a festival that might help Europe's peace and unification, or put another way, a "post-war rallying point."²⁵⁵

Edinburghers discussed nationalism and internationalism from the beginning of the Edinburgh festivals. Many in Edinburgh saw the EIF as elitist and criticized it for drawing talent and work from England. English theatre standards, critics, and art organizations like the Arts Council of Great Britain influenced the EIF's selection in its earliest years. 1947's line up included highbrow pieces like Shakespearean productions from The Young Vic including *Taming of the*

²⁵⁴ Jen Harvie, "Cultural Effects of the Edinburgh International Festival: Elitism, Identities, Industries," *Contemporary Theatre Review* 13, no. 4 (2003): pp. 12-26, <https://doi.org/10.1080/1048680032000118378>, 14.

²⁵⁵ Jen Harvie, "Cultural Effects of the Edinburgh International Festival: Elitism, Identities, Industries," 14.

Shrew and *Merchant of Venice* alongside Compagnie Jovet de théâtre de l'Athénée's productions of Molière's *L'Ecole des femmes* and Giraudoux's *Ondine*. The 1947 lineup did not include a single Scottish work. In the most prominent scholarly history of the festival, *The Edinburgh International Festival 1947-1996*, Eileen Miller states that one of the most blatant criticisms of the festival from its inception has been "The official Festival represented a largely foreign import grafted onto an Edinburgh setting," and that "there should have been far greater emphasis on Scottish music and drama."²⁵⁶ Miller argues that even though the festival is international, the festival should consider national priorities.

Opposition to the elitist and imperial nature of the EIF formed counter festivals: The Edinburgh Festival Fringe (the name coined in its second year) and the short-lived Edinburgh People's Festival. The opposing festival creators were aware of the EIF from the beginning and founded The Fringe the very same year. Because of this, the EIF and Fringe have always co-existed. Today they even exist under the same "Festival City" organizing umbrella. The founders of The Fringe formed it as an inclusive festival programmed by a council with minimal vetting of the participating productions as directly opposed to the EIF's single producer model. Policies began to shift when the EIF recognized the many criticisms in its direction and started producing some Scottish work by its second year, and The Fringe quickly became international. Both festivals have continued to grow. The Fringe now far out-sizes the EIF and they both continue to show work from many other countries.

The festivals pride themselves on their internationalism. In the early years of the EIF, German and French companies performed at EIF in their native languages. This suggested, to

²⁵⁶ Eileen Miller, *The Edinburgh International Festival 1947-1996* (Aldershot, Hants: Scholar Press, 1996), 13.

some, that Scotland was friendly to Europe in ways the English were not.²⁵⁷ This multilingualism reflected the multinational approach of the festival. The multilingualism was short-lived, but the festival's branding as an "international festival" has always been its grounding. The Fringe also continues to highlight its internationalism as part of its brand, declaring on its main website that in 2019, "63 Countries represented onstage at this year's Fringe, performing in 753 shows."²⁵⁸ The EIF enacts a model that includes granting commissions and development funding for certain styles, companies, and specific works. The Fringe, on the other hand, puts out calls for productions and accepts plays and performances of varying levels that are entirely funded by the performing companies, down to housing, transportation, and venue rental.²⁵⁹ Both demonstrate differing international and intercultural projects.²⁶⁰ The performance festivals differ in national and international approaches from their co-existing "festival:" the Royal Edinburgh Military Tattoo.

The terms used in the chapter vary slightly by scholar and I focus them through Rustom Bharucha's interpretation of Schechner's definition. Richard Schechner describes interculturalism in opposition to internationalism. He posits that for internationalism, nations conduct the cultural exchange. Even if individual officials do the exchange, they are acting as representatives of the nation. Interculturalism is the exchange of culture regardless of boundaries and as individuals representing culture, not the state. Rustom Bharucha clarifies Schechner's definition by stating that there is "no such illusion that intercultural interactions can be entirely free from the mediations

²⁵⁷ Jen Harvie, "Cultural Effects of the Edinburgh International Festival: Elitism, Identities, Industries," 20.

²⁵⁸ "The Fringe in Numbers," Edinburgh Festival Fringe, August 26, 2019, <https://www.edfringe.com/learn/news-and-events/the-fringe-in-numbers>.

²⁵⁹ Rachael Healy, "Someone's Making Money but Its Not Us'- the Comics Spurning the Edinburgh Fringe," *The Guardian*, July 11, 2022, sec. Comedy.

²⁶⁰ Rustom Bharucha, *The Politics of Cultural Practice: Thinking through Theatre in an Age of Globalization* (New Delhi: Oxford University Press, 2003), 4.

of the nation-state.” Bharucha defines interculturalism as “the phenomenon by which diverse cultures are exchanged, transported and appropriated across nations.”²⁶¹ I use interculturalism through this section to address a more individualized or localized sharing of culture, and I use cultural internationalism to imply exchanges of cultures that are being used as representative of the nation.

Intercultural theatre, studied from a Western perspective, is fraught with colonial histories. The history of the binarized east and west, in which the west pulled culture from the east in intercultural pursuits for Western audiences, marks the term with a process in which two cultures are in exchange, and that one culture is privileged over the other. Daphne P. Lei describes this as “Hegemonic Intercultural Theatre,”²⁶² and Ric Knowles illuminates that white Western charismatic men dominated the style that “participated in the commodification of the ‘other’ and thereby the perpetuation of the colonial project, in which the raw materials of the world (including its cultures and peoples) were and are grist for the colonial mill of Western industry and capitalist production.”²⁶³ The promise of equal cultural exchange becomes uneven when the west controls the performance.

The festivals can be approached not only from the means of producing but also from marginalized perspectives of interculturalism. Recent intercultural theorists have explored a post-structural approach to intercultural examination that accounts for the multiplicities of interaction and exchange that occur in one encounter and likewise focuses on interculturalism “from the

²⁶¹ Rustom Bharucha, as quoted in Charlotte McIvor's "Introduction," in *Interculturalism and Performance: New Directions?*, 6.

²⁶² Daphne P. Lei, “Interruption, Intervention, Interculturalism: Robert Wilson's HIT Productions in Taiwan,” *Theatre Journal* 63, no. 4 (2011): pp. 571-586, <https://doi.org/10.1353/tj.2011.0118>, 571.

²⁶³ Richard Paul Knowles, *Theatre & Interculturalism* (London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010), 22.

bottom,” or performance controlled by subaltern and marginalized cultures. Jacqueline Lo and Helen Gilbert approach interculturalism rhizomatically to observe the many possible points of contact in culture, power, and performance.²⁶⁴ I look at the festivals at specific points in their intercultural rhizome that demonstrate both fluid and hegemonic cultural exchange, primarily through materialist structures. However, I acknowledge the many ways intercultural moments may occur at the festivals on the streets, at hotels, and elsewhere.

Akira Iriye defines cultural internationalism as “the idea that internationalism may best be fostered through cross-national cultural communication, under-standing, and cooperation.”²⁶⁵ The festival city plans and carries out twelve major international festivals a year. These festivals establish a city that performs the value of dedication to internationality and the arts. This dedication is part of the city’s fabric, along with its historic architecture, heritage mythology, and industry. I argue that these central values of the city toward internationality are driven partly by the start of the EIF/Fringe and its snowball effect but primarily by Scottish nationalism.

Scottish nationalism is unique and functions very differently from most countries in the European Union. The uniqueness of Scottish nationalism derives from its connections to other nations and governmental structures. The Scottish position as British creates a duality of state belonging. Additionally, the rhetoric of Scotland’s nationalism does not stand in opposition to international and global projects, as the nationalisms of many other countries do. The opposite is the case. Scottish nationalism as a political idea heavily connects to a pro-Europe stance. Nationalist priority slogans that cut ties to internationalist efforts like “America First!” or “Keep

²⁶⁴ Helen Gilbert and Jacqueline Lo, *Performance and Cosmopolitics: Cross-Cultural Transactions in Australasia* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009), 45.

²⁶⁵ Akira Iriye, *Cultural Internationalism and World Order* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins Univ. Press, 2010), 27.

Britain British” run counter to the nationalism of Scotland because Scotland’s attachment to internationalism occurs as a means of distinguishing itself from England and as a path toward national independence. In this manner, creating deep bonds in the international community treaties and coalitions, leads the nation away from a sovereign connection with the United Kingdom to one that is solely political and economical in instances such as the EU.²⁶⁶ A respondent to a study on Scottish identity and political alignments stated, “Hostility toward Europe is an English experience. It is really hardly found here. We want to be European.”²⁶⁷ In this response, the individual suggests that Scottishness is essentially not English as they assume that Scots would never do something the English would do. They also declare the loyalty of Scotland to Europe. This study is more than a decade old but demonstrates the persistent thoughts that connect Scottish Nationalism to Internationalist practices, whereas other nationalisms would be more introspective. This is reflected in the current activism by the Scottish National Party.

Scotland’s polycentric nationalism creates an optimal stage for Edinburgh’s outward reaching international festivals. However, the festivals’ capitalist contexts keep Scotland introspective with Britain. Anthony D. Smith describes Scotland’s kind of nationalism as polycentric, “A nationalism that is open to outside influences, which feed the sense of national identity.”²⁶⁸ Edinburgh, and Scotland more broadly, use internationalism like the festivals to dig their own national identity deeper. As the city leads the nation in drawing values, art, and political ideas from outside the United Kingdom, it is distancing itself more and more from the English. But, of course, this is not true for all who live in Edinburgh. Some, like the Fringe’s original

²⁶⁶ Atsuko Ichijo, *Scottish Nationalism and the Idea of Europe: Concepts of Europe and the Nation* (Routledge, 2016), 85-108.

²⁶⁷ Atsuko Ichijo, 86.

²⁶⁸ Atsuko Ichijo, 87.

creators, see the festivals and their internationalism negatively as catering to the outside world when many Scottish issues need to be addressed.²⁶⁹ However, the Fringe is the most attended and profitable of all the festivals. Proving its national prominence, The Fringe has one of the largest percentages of local attendees, with 50%, according to early impact studies.²⁷⁰ Many of these local attendees are experiencing international and intercultural performances.

The Edinburgh Festivals, including the Tattoo, are heavily branded as Scottish while most equally advertise a kind of internationalism that reflects positively on Scotland. Through this branding, the collective group of the Edinburgh festivals perform an idealized independent Scotland through art and culture that is free to connect with international collaborators over its southern neighbors. Further inquiry into the Tattoo and the material models of the Edinburgh International Festival and The Festival Fringe, demonstrate a non-escapable commitment to British exclusivity.

3.4.1 The Edinburgh Festivals and Material/Intercultural Model

The Fringe promotes interculturalism through its open-access model, encouraging polycentric Scottish nationalism. The Fringe allows any performers to participate and gain visibility at the festival. Troupes from anywhere need only register, and they can perform for thousands of August festival goers. Scottish venues and audiences are participating with fluid international and intercultural exchange and performance practices because they function without

²⁶⁹ Michael Billington, "Edinburgh: A Fringe Affair with Scotland," *The Guardian*, August 2, 1996, sec. The Guardian Features Page.

²⁷⁰ John R. Gold and Margaret M. Gold, *Festival Cities: Culture, Planning and Urban Life* (London; New York: Routledge, Taylor et Francis Group, 2020), 195.

the selection and censorship of screening that may filter performances through a British ideology. For the Edinburgh International Festival, the art must be ‘the best’ by the standards of the current director.²⁷¹ For The Fringe, culturally based standards of the audience or a selecting director are less pervasive and constraining. Without the interaction of Fringe collaborators, artists from outside the UK present cultural performances to Scottish audiences unaltered. For the most part, the performers are not representing their nations as a delegation and are, therefore, more able to engage in interculturalism over internationalism, as described by Schechner.

However, economics stealthily control the freedom of cultural exchange which negates the values inherent in Scottish independence including freedom from the controlling institution. As Bharucha noted, interculturalism is never free of structures of power.²⁷² Visibility of each performance once at the festival is touched by cultural bias in audience choice, venue location, and time slot. A primary constraint to cultural exchange is accessibility to the festival itself. While it is open access, there is a registration fee, and participants pay for and arrange their own travel, housing, and performance venue. Rustom Bharucha argues against blanket suggestions of globalism and interculturalism by pointing to the marginalized groups that cannot participate in the “global” or intercultural information exchange, thus nullifying the concept. He states, “There should be no false euphoria about the celebration of autonomy in interculturalism.”²⁷³ A 2022 article in the Guardian launched criticism that the Fringe ran a “pay-to-play” model, and that the performers are “the festival’s main customers.” Researcher Donagh Horgan said, “They are paying

²⁷¹ Jen Harvie, “Cultural Effects of the Edinburgh International Festival: Elitism, Identities, Industries,” 15.

²⁷² Rustom Bharucha, as quoted in Charlotte McIvor's "Introduction," in *Interculturalism and Performance: New Directions?*, 6.

²⁷³ Rustom Bharucha, *The Politics of Cultural Practice: Thinking through Theatre in an Age of Globalization* (New Delhi: Oxford University Press, 2003), 4

for themselves – and putting themselves in unsafe positions. The landlordism has got worse” with little landlord regulation from the festival organizers.²⁷⁴

These financial limitations ensure that the festival shares privileged international culture to the benefit of the festival, Edinburgh, the Scottish government, and the United Kingdom. A 2010 study showed that The Fringe brought in 141.56 million pounds of economic impact for Edinburgh, which is 60.1% of all the festivals combined. Audience, artist, and volunteer spending substantially bolsters Edinburgh’s economy. The neoliberal culture market that benefits the nation-state governs perceptions of theatrical freedom and border-free cultural exchange, erasing the possible distance between interculturalism and internationalism at The Fringe. All intercultural stage performances benefit the nation and are therefore national. It also ensures the performers and their cultures become unpaid commodities to the high portions of local Scottish audiences that attend The Fringe. A change to the financial model of The Fringe would significantly shift its monetary contribution to the city and its current ability to pull and manage the immense amount of talent that it does. A differing financial model might also have to place the Fringe in a model of selection.

The Fringe’s reputation plays into the independence scenario, but it does not function with liberated practice. In 2015, the ten-year plan for the Festival City organizing umbrella was released with an outline of the objectives of the combined festivals in a preview section titled “National and Global Positioning.” They set to demonstrate:

How forging strong international partnerships gives the nation a voice on the world stage, and how branding and marketing of the Festival City are integral to relationship-building and central to a new understanding of leadership for the city and the nation. The report recommends further developing international partnerships, continuing the joined-up

²⁷⁴ Rachael Healy, “Someone’s Making Money but Its Not Us!- the Comics Spurning the Edinburgh Fringe,” *The Guardian*, July 11, 2022, sec. Comedy.

approach to marketing Edinburgh Festival City, and for the festivals, their stakeholders, and partners to work collaboratively on seventieth-anniversary programmes in 2017.

The festivals are critical features of Edinburgh for economic gain and national politics. Later in the document, the writer solidifies that these objectives are for the United Kingdom in addition to Scotland, “Edinburgh’s festivals are a truly international cultural brand for Scotland and the UK.”²⁷⁵ The Fringe brings in large groups and maintains Scottish nationalism through the lore of its creation as a feisty, independent Scottish project. It also maintains nationalism through the continued favoring of Scottish work. There is The Made in Scotland Showcase that grants Scottish work additional publicity during the Fringe, which holds the Fringe to its original purpose of Scottish inclusion. However, it limits an egalitarian intercultural exchange.

The Edinburgh International Festival differs from The Fringe as it promotes controlled interculturalism, which appeals to measured intercultural and international relationship. For example, the 2017 festival program states, “Edinburgh’s invitation to the world....people from across our city and across the world gather together to share their stories and cultures.”²⁷⁶ EIF must carefully select productions from varied countries and cultures to maintain the international and intercultural brand. Through selection, they can ensure diverse voices proactively. The festival also funds the run of the productions it brings to the festival, including pay for performers and technicians. This provides an opportunity for cultural travel that The Fringe does not allow. The impact study directly antecedent to the 2017 festival reported that 91% of visitors agreed that the festivals allowed them to see high-quality work from around the world. This increased from the

²⁷⁵ BOP Consulting and Festivals and Events International, “Edinburgh Festivals: Thundering Hooves 2.0: A Ten Year Strategy to Sustain the Success of Edinburgh's Festivals ,” 2015, 4-9.

²⁷⁶ “2017 Edinburgh International Festival Brochure,” *2017 Edinburgh International Festival Brochure* (City of Edinburgh Council, 2017), 1.

same question in 2010, which was at 87%.²⁷⁷ It is possible that in the atmosphere of national and international strife of Brexit, Scots were more inclined to appreciate the international perspective in order to draw closer to European culture. Regardless, The Edinburgh International Festival provides international performances to Edinburgh locals. The percentage of local audience members is relatively high at most EIFs, at about 36%.²⁷⁸ The EIF promotes its productions more than the Fringe with a higher advertising budget. With fewer performance offerings, the shows are also likely to attract more audience members and avoid being hidden in poor venues and time slots, which leads to a greater chance of cultural exchange. This ultimately reinforces Scotland's polycentric nationalism. A 2018 report on the national effects of the festivals argues that the "global" nature of the festivals promotes "confidence, ambition, status, and recognition" in Scotland's individuals, organizations, and policymakers.²⁷⁹ The goals for the internationalism and interculturalism are for the state, which is the United Kingdom.

The Edinburgh International Festival is profoundly involved in its intercultural season, limiting some fluidity of cultural exchange which shifts the internationalism toward independence standard, controlled internationalism, and further British commitment. EIF produced or partially funded development of seven of its nine theatrical performances for 2017.²⁸⁰ Other contributors to the theatrical performances were The National Theatre of Scotland, The Old Vic, The Royal Lyceum Theatre Edinburgh, The Traverse Theatre (a contemporary Scottish-based Company), and The British Council. All of these sources are in culturally and financially privileged positions in

²⁷⁷ BOP Consulting. *Edinburgh Festivals 2015 Impact Study: Final Report*. Report. 2016, 9.

²⁷⁸ John R. Gold and Margaret M. Gold, *Festival Cities: Culture, Planning and Urban Life*, 195.

²⁷⁹ BOP Consulting, "Edinburgh Festivals The Network Effect: the Role of the Edinburgh Festivals in the National Culture and Events Sector," 2018, 9.

²⁸⁰ BOP Consulting, "Edinburgh Festivals The Network Effect: the Role of the Edinburgh Festivals in the National Culture and Events Sector," 2018.

the British theatre, and many receive government funding. The festival, the collaborating theatres, and festival director's hand so bound with artistic decisions creates questions of cultural influence. Before 2022, the festival hadn't seen a Scottish or female festival director since its creation.

The financial limitations of The Fringe, that seem to be eased in comparison to EIF's ability to pay artists' way, confronts issues of artist's accessibility to positions and the right exposure to be asked to participate. The invited culture will match with the festival director's imaginative projection of that culture and further blend with British tastes in the festival's coproduction that is attached to funding. For example, in EIF's first year, the festival attempted to put on a Scottish play and commissioned a piece. This would have alleviated much of the criticism that surrounded the festival that year. However, the festival did not trust a Scottish company to act the play and put it in the hands of the English company, The Old Vic. Differences arose between the theatre company and the playwright, and the festival canceled the production.²⁸¹ This international distrust is evident in 2017's program, which is heavy with British influence and interpretation. This practice encapsulates the concept of Lei's Hegemonic Cultural Theatre. Initially, Lei was speaking of the intercultural approaches of artists like Peter Brook and Richard Schechner, I believe the EIF fits the term today. She states it is a "specific artistic genre and state of mind that combines First World capital and brainpower with Third World raw material and labor, and Western classical texts with Eastern performance."²⁸² Of course, EIF does not only invite "eastern" performers to participate in its international practice. Other European countries are represented throughout their

²⁸¹ Eileen Miller, *The Edinburgh International Festival 1947-1996* (Aldershot, Hants: Scholar Press, 1996), 7.

²⁸² Daphne P. Lei, "Interruption, Intervention, Interculturalism: Robert Wilson's HIT Productions in Taiwan," *Theatre Journal* 63, no. 4 (2011): pp. 571-586, <https://doi.org/10.1353/tj.2011.0118>, 571.

program. Through its approach to internationality, the EIF binds itself further with British partners and British theatrical influence.

Both The Festival Fringe and the Edinburgh International Festival serve in Scotland's trajectory and performance of the Scenario of Independence. The festivals stabilize the Scottish national values established in the fight for freedom at Bannockburn beyond violence; those of eager tenacity, comradeship, and hope for an ideal independence (in this case through intercultural art exchange). The Tattoo works with the other Festivals but holds to the performance of independence through violence. It also discounts intercultural exchange in favor of nationalized performance.

3.4.2 The Tattoo

The Edinburgh Tattoo purposefully performs many moments of internationalism and false interculturalism. Still, I argue that the internationalism of the Tattoo, unlike the Fringe and EIF, is primarily in the audience. The Tattoo draws the fewest locals of all the August festivals and attracts the most international visitors at 70%.²⁸³ In opposite form to the cultural performances of the other festivals, the primary performance is self-declared local culture, even if it is romanticized. The Tattoo is also unique from the other festivals because it is not performing interculturalism on the stage, though it seems so. One could view the individual acts in the Tattoo performance as intercultural in other contexts. However, through the Tattoo's strict adherence to national iconography and vocabulary, the homogenization of nationality within the international performances, and the embodiment of national identity the Tattoo ensures a performance of

²⁸³ John R. Gold and Margaret M. Gold, *Festival Cities: Culture, Planning and Urban Life*, 7.

nationalism at the erasure of interculturalism. The adherence to nationalism closed natural cultural connections with performers from other countries in opposition to polycentric national practice toward a post-Brexit independence.

Before the show began, the military-constructed stadium on the castle esplanade was full of audience members in tartan hats, scarves, and blankets. It was August, but many men wore wool flat caps. The temperature dropped fast and the wind picked up. The pre-show music was loud so individual surrounding voices weren't audible, but the stadium appeared to be populated by Scots. However, the stadium was actually full of international tourists who had been shopping in the tartan-heavy tourist shops before the chilly performance after a hot day. Moments before the show was set to begin, the announcer came on and asked, "is anyone here from England?" There were some rumblings and shouts. "Is anyone here from France?" The yells got louder. "What about Germany?" The reply was thunderous. "The United States?" Every group waited for their turn to yell with fellow nationals around the stadium as the announcer continued his list.

In his attempts to warm up the crowd, the announcer declared that this was a national affair to which he invited audience. Through the demonstrably loud vocal responses, the audience physically joined the nationalist performance and claimed sides. People twisted in their seats, looking around their sections for who they thought might have yelled with them because maybe they had some of their people there. So far from home, a stranger is an ally under national pride.

The audience's national identity declaration was soon confused as the highest-ranking official of the night received a toast from the lone piper in a ritual of authenticity. As an audience, people stood in national reverence for officials and traditions that were not their own. On the BBC broadcast of the Tattoo, that official was Prince Charles accompanied by Prince William. The audience had just physically manifested their non-Scottish national identities; then, the

performance immediately thrust them into participation in the national rituals of another. In *National Ceremonies: the pursuit of authenticity*, Gordana Uzelac states, “A ceremony’s authenticity is, at best, a quality of experience among its audience. Only when the audience is transformed into willing participants through a performance’s *mise-en-scène* can a national ceremony be seen as a ritual-like performance.”²⁸⁴ The romanticization of the upcoming performance and the tartan-clad tourists contrasted against a military and national custom that had an affectivity of authenticity wherein the performers demonstrated respect and reverence that read as genuine. Though this moment was also full of pomp and fanfare, the ritual nature and willing participation by the audience brought the audience into the Scottishness of the performance as a means to instill validity for the Scottish nation and its ritual in the audience’s eyes.

The Tattoo performs its Scottishness, not internationalist, sentiment most prominently; a practice that casts its internationalism as self-referencing and national. Evidence of this exists in statements from the Tattoo’s creators. Unlike the other festivals, the Tattoo doesn’t project internationalism and interculturalism as part of its brand. The founding of the Tattoo in 1949-1950 came after the founding of the other festivals and did not have the same objectives. Instead, it had objectives that directly favored the nation. Sir Andrew Murray, the Lord Provost of Edinburgh and one of the creators of The Tattoo, said in 1959 that the Tattoo was started not as a commercial endeavor but was instead to raise local spirits. He stated “At that time, the city was divided against itself to a certain degree. We started it at a time of great difficulties, such as rationing and a shortage of accommodation.”²⁸⁵ Murray loved military spectacle and enjoyed seeing its power, though he

²⁸⁴ Gordana Uzelac, “National Ceremonies: the Pursuit of Authenticity,” *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 33, no. 10 (2010): pp. 1718-1736.

²⁸⁵ “The Tattoo Should Be Free Says the Lord Provost: The Ideal Location - Holyrood.” *The Scotsman*, August 28, 1959.

objected to its site at the Castle. In 1960, an administrative document indicates that the Tattoo was intended, by some, as military PR, “The Tattoo can be an extremely useful vehicle for gaining favourable publicity for the services in general.”²⁸⁶ Contrary to Murray’s suggestion that the Tattoo wasn’t commercial, both a letter to the editor of *The Scotsman* in 1955 and correspondence between military organizers and Castle officials refer to the Tattoo as “a wonderful money spinner”²⁸⁷ and a “guaranteed money spinner,” respectively. The letter to the editor continues, “There is no doubt at all, if it were not for the proceeds of the Tattoo, the festival authorities would be in dire straits.”²⁸⁸ Whether for military publicity or for money to support the other festivals, the early Edinburgh Military Tattoo was an asset to the city and the government. Its continued focus on the performance of nationalism instead of its international performances, reflects a governmental purpose to the Tattoo, then and today.

The contemporary internationalism that the military performs on the Esplanade during the Tattoo uses a false interculturalism that supports its nationalist themes. The Tattoo began its international performance in 1952. In the case study year of 2017, it featured four international acts that all performed their unique cultural style. The United States Naval Forces Europe Band had a classic navy aesthetic and performed swinging jazz. The Tattoo Dance Company accompanied in matching theatrical “cracker jack” navy uniforms. The Ninth French Marine Infantry Band used patriotic images of flags and icons projected onto the Castle. That traditional

²⁸⁶ Collard, D.F. “Edinburgh Military Tattoo ‘Standing Administrative Instructions’ Amendment No. 1.” Edinburgh: Ministry of Works Tattoo Office, December 21, 1960.

²⁸⁷ Redcoat. “Site for Edinburgh Tattoo: Objections to the Castle Esplanade.” *The Scotsman*. June 21, 1955, sec. Points of View.

²⁸⁸ Wastie, W.V. Letter to Minister. Edinburgh: Headquarters, Scottish Command, September 10, 1959.

military band ended their set with a Daft Punk medley and adorned themselves with Daft Punk-esque helmets and dance moves. The American and French bands were relatively calm visually, besides a couple of gold helmets, with dark uniforms and dancing that moved only small distances. Similarly, the Japanese Ground Self-Defence Force Central Band presented a traditional military band. They played “Legend of Ashitaka” from the Japanese anime film *Princess Mononoke* for their second number. To the dramatic music, two samurai staged a mock battle with the Western-style band surrounding them. The ballad that followed featured a singer in a red kimono singing in Japanese.

The Indian Naval Band’s performance was the most spectacular. The band brought a team of New Delhi-based dancers from Teamwork Arts. Dancers wore colorful and glittering uniforms of pink, oranges, and blue. The dancers were energetic and eye-catching. The women had large arched fanlike structures on their backs that they could maneuver with handles on the edges. With them, they made shapes and gestures. Midway through the first song, the Tattoo Dance Company dancers joined the bands wearing red and blue lehengas and carrying faux torches. The Tattoo Dance Company differed from the Teamwork Art Dancers in the color and style of their uniforms and in dancing technique. The Indian Naval Band primarily played contemporary Indian music and the Indian national song “Vande Mataram” (a song that rose to popularity with political activists during the Indian Independence Movement).

Forms of varied hegemonic national identity are exchanged in these international performances. Each nation performs their own standard martial exhibition for the international Scottish audience. The Tattoo performs these intercultural acts as the cultural essences of each nation. However, as governmental delegates and, more pointedly, as martial delegates, all cultural performance is sieved through national and martial representation and aesthetic. By participating

with the Indian Naval Band, for example, the non-military Teamwork Arts dancers are perceived as military assets along with the soldier musicians carrying out naval duties by performing at The Tattoo. The dance style, no matter its origins or intentions, serves the militarized state.

The Tattoo guarantees the limitation of cultural exchange in its international performances by homogenizing its international performers. As an alternative to interculturalism, Bharucha offers intraculturalism, in which relationships are formed between different cultures at regional levels.²⁸⁹ This kind of cultural mingling and work leads to less homogenizing erasure as it focuses on interactivity and translation.²⁹⁰ As unified presentational delegations from each nation, the United States, French, Japanese, and Indian performances could only perform one idea of the national culture and did not account for the regional differences of the performers or the nation. With these military performances based on marching and drill, they create visual unity and oneness of the performers, enhancing their cultural homogenization. Bharucha laments the tendency for “festival” culture to perform this regional erasure in India, “in which performers from different parts of India were transported arbitrarily by government agencies to Delhi, where their histrionic skills were decontextualized, reassembled, and synthesized to form packages, which were then exported to foreign capitals where ‘India’ was displayed and consumed with very little thought given to what would happen to the performers on their return home.”²⁹¹ Western militaries enact this process broadly with the talents and physical sacrifice of soldiers from around a nation for the standardized military work, especially in cultural performance. For example, musicians from NATO allies partially staff the US Naval Forces Europe Band. In the 2017 Tattoo, which included

²⁸⁹ Rustom Bharucha, *The Politics of Cultural Practice*, 8.

²⁹⁰ Rustom Bharucha, 9.

²⁹¹ Rustom Bharucha, 48.

Italian military musicians, the US band performed American culture through sea shanties with a small interlude of American Jazz.²⁹² The song selection represented a time when none of the performing US American or Italian performers were alive. Colonial practices and the proliferation of British and European military traditions, including the military band style, also marked the international performances.

As with the intercultural work that occurs in the streets and hostels of the Edinburgh performing arts festivals, there is potential for intercultural and intracultural exchange through gathering humans in spaces. Rehearsals, backstage, and housing spaces can see moments of resistance to the militarization of individual cultural talent. These moments also happen in the audience, as internationalism and interculturalism occur in mingling one audience member with another. However, there are limitations to the diversity of cultural exchange if culture is silenced on stage or behind closed doors due to lack of access and privilege to performance or travel. The Tattoo can pay its performers. However, financial barriers highly constrict audiences. Additionally, for many, qualification for military bands worldwide is determined by access to instruments and lessons before joining the service. Those without this access become soldiers like any other, not soldiers with a double-performing life. Through audience and off-stage interculturalism, the Tattoo can facilitate the meeting of heterogenous cultures.

²⁹² The US performance was a demonstration of americana. The navy band wore the Enlisted Dress Blue Uniform, which is the look that is often referred to as Cracker Jack because of its representation on the box of the American snack Cracker Jacks. Cracker Jacks embody americana because of their association with Baseball. The classic baseball song includes a reference to the snack. This uniform and its white version are used extensively in popular culture for sailors. The Tattoo Dancers also wore a version of the crackerjack uniform that was tighter and exaggerated. The use of Jazz highlighted a care-free America. The Jazz also brought association of the proliferation of the Black American created art form into white popular culture through now-nostalgic Jazz Orchestras or “big bands” in the interwar period.

In its perceived performance of internationalism, the Tattoo does not contribute to a Scottish struggle for independence. The Tattoo does not imply strong bonds with the international community like the performing arts festivals. As stated above, international performances are a feature, but they are not the main feature or branding of The Tattoo. For this reason, The Tattoo does not work to bind Scotland to Europe and the global project in a way that may separate it from English influence. Instead, the Tattoo is confidently nationalist under the direction and protection of the United Kingdom. The international relationships on display in the Tattoo are of use to the Scots by way of the British Military. The cultural internationalism instead performs military alliances and state diplomacy.

The Edinburgh Tattoo invites the audience to become a Scottish “clansman for the evening.”²⁹³ but does not succeed. Princess Anne lets the audience know that “The Tattoo is all about bringing people together and celebrating our glorious differences, revealing in the diversity of our global communities and cultures, Military and civil societies. Scotland, Great Britain, and the world are here with current and future friends.”²⁹⁴ The invitation to abandon individual cultural and national heritage and join into Scottish heritage inspires utopian hope in which nations could fall away in favor of the romantic and wild Scottish highland. Anne is similarly utopian. For her, the Tattoo cultivates people, communities, and cultures in a global capacity that maintains cultural diversity, with Scotland and Great Britain at the head. An aporia exists in Anne’s wishes for the Tattoo as an international festival. The global bonds as “friends” that intercultural performances can create are null in the presence of militaries, whose only function is protecting and enforcing

²⁹³ “Scottish Command Presents the Edinburgh Tattoo Programmes 1954-1985,” *Scottish Command Presents the Edinburgh Tattoo Programmes 1954-1985* (Edinburgh Tattoo, n.d.), 11.

²⁹⁴ “Scottish Command Presents the Edinburgh Tattoo Programmes 1954-1985,” 7.

separation and boundaries. International audience members cannot truly become clansmen for the evening in the face of militarization created to violently stop them if they wanted to take any Scottish bounty as their own. The Tattoo's military performance, representational of culture as it may be, performs nationalism over culture because of its military presence.

The Edinburgh International Festival and the Edinburgh Festival Fringe also invite. They invite audiences and performers to attend and to create. They invite participants to perform cultural internationalism that is self-limiting of its capacity for intercultural exchange by the material constraints of the Scotland/UK benefit model. The work that may be done to bond Scotland to Europe through the festivals' internationalism also bonds Scotland to the United Kingdom because of that model. Perhaps all three festivals could evaluate the top-down interculturalism, of which Bharucha warns, to shift the architecture of exchange.

The international festivals do represent an attempt at a Scottish poly-centric nationalism in which Scotland pushes away from the UK toward the influence of other nations. Mirroring the alliances that formed the Jacobite cause, all three festivals have an active attempt to create international alliances that could lead to independence. This continues the independence scenario wherein all attempts lead back to English influence.

3.5 Conclusion

The word tattoo comes from the Dutch phrase *doe den tap toe*, meaning turn off the tap. It dates to the seventeenth century when English soldiers served in the low country (Belgium and the Netherlands). It refers to the garrison's nightly drumming to signal the innkeepers to turn off the taps so that soldiers would begin to head back for their nightly curfew. Eventually, *tap toe*

transitioned into taptoo and then tattoo. The beat of the drum is built into the etymology of the performance practice. English military tradition is also embedded in the performance's beginning.

Since its beginning in 1949, the Tattoo has steadily followed the drumbeat of Scottish nationalism and British loyalty. The Military history performed by the Tattoo stands in for all Scottish history and permeates into Scotland's heritage narrative. This history is a repetitive fight for independence. The physicality of the highland dance performed in the Tattoo also projects that neat romantic heritage even when its repertoire of information is eclectic. The pairing of highland dance with drill demonstrates the reining in of romantic independence of Scottish history by perceived British contemporary rationality. Edinburgh's international festivals, including the Tattoo, seek to create moments of intercultural and international exchange but are constrained by the materiality of capitalism and the need to benefit the Scottish and British governments and the British military. The 2017 Royal Edinburgh Military Tattoo performs and embodies these scenarios. Still, it is also a nexus of all these performance practices and the political landscape immediately post-Brexit, in which Scottish nationalism and British loyalty are ever-important. The yet-to-be-seen Scottish independence referendum will carry out the independence scenario. If never completed, the campaign for independence manifests the value of independence in the public identity while staying comfortably under British control. If completed, the result will tell the next plot for the scenario of independence for the Scots.

4.0 Commemorative (re)enactment: French Memory, Military, and Resistance

“Commemoration is an argument about the past presented as if there is no argument.”
Bruggeman, “The Commemorative Conundrum”²⁹⁵

4.1 Introduction

On the afternoon of July 15th, 2018, the French Football team conquered Croatia 4-2 in Moscow at the FIFA World Cup finals. The international tournament occurs every four years and exhibits top athletic delegations from around the world. Back in France’s capital, Paris, football fans watching from home and in crowds spilling out of cafes jubilantly celebrated their national achievement by filling the streets and walking, as a city, toward the Champs-Élysée. Journalists estimate that more than one million people ended up on the famous street that night to cheer, light fireworks and smoke bombs, and wave the French tricolor flag. But, as the sun fell, the energy of the crowd shifted. The fans’ slight disregard for city property in order to climb to higher heights to cheer (see Figures 4-5) started morphing to intentional vandalism. Many in the crowd found their way out of the Champs-Élysées to the relative safety of side streets as the scene grew more

²⁹⁵ Seth C. Bruggeman, “The Commemorative Conundrum,” in *Commemoration the American Association for State and Local History Guide* (Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield Publishing Group, 2017), pp. 1-39, 3.

violent.²⁹⁶ In the end, revelers broke storefront windows on luxury businesses, flipped a car, and threw objects at the police and others. Police officers, who had been waiting on side streets in vans, responded in riot gear with tear gas, water cannons, and a physical push from a line of shielded officers marching down the avenue.²⁹⁷

This scene of national pride, celebration, and violence, that I witnessed first-hand, starkly contrasted with the national celebrations the morning before. The July 14th French national day celebrations, known as La Fête Nationale or le 14 juillet in France and Bastille Day for English speakers, began with an orderly military procession down that same Champs-Élysées which displayed the precision and synchronicity of march steps. The onlookers likewise stood in an organized system. They were divided into sections and corralled by metal barriers in organized festivity. The only moments of disorder occurred during the jet flyover meant to cast ribbons of blue, white, and red smoke in the sky. One jet was obviously out of place, ruining the effect of the French flag in the sky and bringing snickers from the audience. There was also a small motorcycle mishap during the presentation to the President of the Republic. However, the French military executed the rest of the parade without apparent disarray.

As peaceful as the parade transpired, the violence that was so apparent the following day also served as the foundational undercurrent of the state-sponsored spectacle of national identification. The parade of le 14 juillet is traditionally a military parade. The French soldier is

²⁹⁶ This story comes from personal experience and observation in the crowd that day. I left the scene as the energy started to shift before heavy vandalism and police response. However, I then observed the crowd from a high window a block into a side street, where I observed and smelled the use of teargas and other SWAT tactics.

²⁹⁷ Bate Felix, “French Police Clash with Unruly Fans, Clear Champs Elysees,” *Reuters*, July 18th, 2018, <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-soccer-worldcup-final-paris-trouble/french-police-clash-with-unruly-fans-clear-champs-elysees-idUSKBN1K514D>.

the primary performer, therefore, the representative character of the national celebration. Though the soldiers are marching in a ritual manner no longer used in battle, as discussed in Chapter Two, they move through the streets in a physicality with its own long, violent tradition. The majority of the soldiers wear formal dress uniforms, not battle uniforms, referencing battle attire of the nineteenth century, similarly distancing the soldiers' performance from the realities of contemporary battle while broadcasting traditions of violence.²⁹⁸

The 2018 parade event occurred two years after a July 14th terrorist attack in Nice, France, that killed eighty-four people.²⁹⁹ The threat of terror attacks on the crowd during the holiday brought out immense security throughout the parade in a counter-terror performance of strength. While 4,290 soldiers participated in the parade, 110,000 soldiers and gendarmes (armed police) worked as security throughout the weekend. The street security paced in their own repetitive movement behind the spectators while the onlooker's eyes were on the spectacle in the other direction. The security soldiers and gendarmes wore contemporary camouflage battle dress, bulletproof vests, and large firearms across their chests. The sight of security invokes ideas of both fear and safety. Their presence served as a reminder of past terror events that could happen again at any moment. The weaponized security also stood as a looming threat with their visibly violent potential. It was a possible source of significant unease for those uncomfortable around firearms, no matter the situation. Simultaneously, they served as protective comfort that the government has acknowledged the danger and has taken all safety measures to fight off any attack.

²⁹⁸ *New York Public Library Digital Collections*. (The Miriam and Ira D. Wallach Division of Art, Prints and Photographs: Picture Collection, The New York Public Library, 1871), <https://digitalcollections.nypl.org/items/510d47e1-0b54-a3d9-e040-e00a18064a99>.

²⁹⁹ Peter Wilkinson, Jason Hanna, and Euan McKirdy, "Attacker in Nice 'Radicalized Very Quickly,' French Interior Minister Says," CNN (Cable News Network, July 17th, 2016), <https://www.cnn.com/2016/07/16/europe/france-attack-on-nice-isis/index.html>.

The two events of the weekend are symbiotic. The events of the parade and the world cup celebratory riot perform French national pride and national identity. The police reaction to the riot and the security at the parade both purposefully perform the power of state control through military might over the possibilities of identity creation. The occurrence of these spectacular national performances, along with the police and security presence at each, highlights the variety, but ultimately similarity, of the means of two performances of public national pride. The entire weekend as a historical moment becomes a nexus of French identification that performs militarism and violence as crucial aspects of that identity. This occurs through militarized embodiment and national memory.

Le 14 juillet serves as a national day connected heavily to the commemoration of the storming of the Bastille, which is itself a symbol of the greater French Revolution.³⁰⁰ In so doing, it continues the cultural memory of the revolution. French governments throughout the existence of le 14 juillet celebrations have placed varied focus and importance on revolutionary commemoration or the Bastille in the celebration as a national day. However, the date of the national day permanently ties it to the Bastille storming, which occurred on July 14th, 1789. The anniversary alignment of the national day to a revolutionary attack brings forth the values of the

³⁰⁰ The day commemorates the storming of the Bastille, which occurred on July 14th, 1789. On this day, a small uprising approached a Paris prison, the Bastille, that they believed held a large stash of weaponry. The prison was severely understaffed and held few prisoners at the time. After speaking with a leader from the stormers, the guards surrendered, and the crowd executed them. This is considered the symbolic beginning of the French Revolution and, for some, France's founding myth.³⁰⁰

As stated in a poll from the magazine L'Express circa 1992, 70% of the French public stated that "the revolution is seen as the founding myth of the national conscious." Christian Amalvi, "Bastille Day: From Dies Irae to Holiday," in *Realms of Memory: The Construction of the French Past. Vol. III Symbols*, ed. Pierre Nora and Lawrence D. Krutzman, English Language Ed., vol. 3 (New York: Columbia University Press, 1996), pp. 117-162, 118.

Republic, as well as its violence, to the contemporary French national milieu. At the Fête de la Fédération, an early precursor to le fête national, on July 14th, 1791, the National Guard and government officials held a parade that began at the ruins of the Place de la Bastille and ended at the Champ de Mars in order to link their public perception to the storming in 1789. Militants attempted to march the same path several days later to align their cause with the idealized beginning of the revolution, but National Guard soldiers were able to stop them.³⁰¹ Opposing factions both sought to claim the ideological reputation of a just revolution, thus instilling cultural memory their group as attached to the heroic story by performing a parade. The beginnings of the national holiday and its military parade were militant and commemorative.³⁰²

This chapter explores the celebration of le 14 juillet, specifically in 2018, as an embodied, performed commemorative practice. It argues that the commemorative nature of the military parade and its connected World Cup reactions the following day connect these present physical performances to historical and national memory. By doing so, the contemporary and historical bodies in performance are perceptively and affectively bridged to assure the survival of a militarized national identity in both periods.

The events of the weekend of La Fête Nationale 2018 existed in a mise-en-scène of national identity and conflict. Surrounding events, history, and culture bolster the militaristic memory of that nexus moment. The nationalism and capitalism of sport and the complex history of protest in

³⁰¹ Joanna Hope Toohey, “‘CE JOUR IMMORTEL’: THE STORMING OF THE BASTILLE AND THE FORMATION OF CULTURAL MEMORY, 1789–1794” (dissertation, University of Colorado Boulder, 2017), 62.

³⁰² Gabriella Elgenius, *Symbols of Nations and Nationalism: Celebrating Nationhood* (Basingstoke, Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan, 2019), 111.

France establish the environment for the embodiment of militarized memory yearly in the military parade, specifically in the nexus of performance in July 2018.

Using France's thorny relationship with communal memory, realized through its concept and legislation of the *devoir de mémoire* (Duty of Memory), this chapter applies the commemoration of French historical memory to Rebecca Schneider's theories on (re)performance and (re)enactment (2011). Through Schneider's theories, I consider how Pierre Nora's *les lieux de mémoire* (or sites of memory) can be realized as human bodies and how that embodiment influences the most significant commemorative events in France's calendar.

In *Performing Remains*, Rebecca Schneider explores the temporality of performance and the reenactment of history. Using civil war reenactments, reperformed performance art, reproduced photographs, and other performative connections to the past, she argues that the embodiments of history through performance are the "remains" from the past. She states, "If the past is never over, or never completed, 'remains' might be understood not solely as object or documental material, but also as the immaterial labor of bodies engaged in and with that incomplete past: bodies striking poses, making gestures, voicing calls, reading words, singing songs, or standing witness."³⁰³ Because of these connections with the past, she promotes skepticism of linearity to see time as more of a "zigzag" in which "the past can disrupt the present but so too can the present disrupt the past."³⁰⁴ Considering an embodied and non-linear past, Schneider borrows theories from Brennan's *The Transmission of Affect* (2004) that discuss

³⁰³ Rebecca Schneider, *Performing Remains: Art and War in Times of Theatrical Reenactment* (Abingdon, Oxon: Routledge, 2011), 33.

³⁰⁴ Rebecca Schneider, *Performing Remains: Art and War in Times of Theatrical Reenactment*, 15, 31.

communal cross-spatial affect transfer and argues for the capacity of communal cross-temporal transfer.³⁰⁵

The military parade held on July 14th in Paris is not a reenactment. However, I argue that commemoration's direct reference to the past connects the parade performance to the past in applicable ways to Schneider's theories on reenactment. Unlike Schneider's subjects, the parade does not act out a historical action or strive for mimetic exactness. Still, the parade stands as a unique commemoration, apart from wreath laying or moments of silence, as it is an embodied act by soldiers that seeks to commemorate battle specifically. Soldiers, or revolutionaries, of the past are implicated by the narrative of those battles that the parade and holiday commemorate. The soldiers of the 2018 parade do not stand in for specific characters of history. This is evident because they far outnumbered the rebels at the Bastille in 1789. Instead, the militarized commemoration causes these soldiers to stand as embodied representations of France's rebellious and militarized past. It reinforces communal memory that strongly connects formal soldiers to historic revolutionary fighters. This places the parade and its soldiers into a grey area of representation and reenactment. In keeping with Schneider's principles but applied to a different set of parameters, I refer to this type of performance as a commemorative (re)enactment. In using Schneider's parenthetical spelling, I likewise take reenactment out of its casual meaning and emphasize the physical enactment of repetition and doubling. Simply put, commemorative (re)enactment is a commemorative performance in which a performer embodies the subject being commemorated (without acting out a narrative, and without requiring the specificity or the mimesis of reenactment), even if the subject is an abstract idea.

³⁰⁵ Teresa Brennan, *The Transmission of Affect* (Cornell University Press, 2004).

I explore the theory of commemorative (re)enactment in relation to France's unique historical ideology and national identity. This exploration occurs through the case study of the distinctive 2018 Bastille Day celebrations and the following World Cup celebrations. Bastille Day is steeped in ritual and tradition. The schedule for July 14th includes the military parade in the morning, fireworks at night, then a late-night dance at a fireman's ball (which also occurs on the 13th). The balls are community parties held by firefighters at the fire stations that include late-night dancing, alcohol, and revelry. July 14th, 2018, was a rare occasion that didn't include fireman's balls as the city prepared for the suspected commotion the following day. In this cancellation, one of the day's least militaristic events was gone, which kept focus on the commemorative performance of the day.

4.1.1 Commemoration and the shifting ideologies of French Memory

France's scholarly and public approach to historiography through commemoration is well debated and legislated. However, many marginalize the affective properties of commemoration and memory to the facts of history and propaganda. French theorists Halbwachs (1877-1945), Ricoeur (1913-2005), Nora (1931-), etc., have created a legacy of the study of French memory. To reflect Schneider's work on this foundation of memory analysis extends the analysis beyond concepts of how the present deals with the past to how the present influences the past.

Commemoration evokes historical reflection and provides representation that calls the audience and performers to remember. Participatory commemoration allows for affective and embodied memory. Renowned French memory scholar Pierre Nora considers the active call to

remember as a negative aspect of both commemoration and the Duty of Memory.³⁰⁶ Nora describes France's Duty of Memory as a command more than an invitation, arguing that it, therefore, cannot bring forth fruitful communal memory. Commemoration acts as a point, or site, of memory coercion in which the participants and audience are asked (or forced) to reach for memory or invent it to remember. However, under Schneider's consideration of (re)enactment, as it applies to commemoration in this instance, that call to remember is not a chore but an active participation in memory creation that connects the past and the present. During a physicalized commemoration that uses representational performing bodies, the participants remember both mentally and physically, complicating what Nora sees as a strain to remember. The physicality of marching and drill has been instilled into the muscle memory of the soldiers before the parade even starts. This movement, aligning with militaristic movements of the past, means that the soldiers are not only cognitively remembering specific histories in commemoration but also carrying the memory itself. In the commemorative (re)performance of the parade, the audience also takes in the living commemorative representations affectively, which shifts commemoration from a mandate on the audience in the present to remember into the elicitation of the present audience body's participation in the past, and vice versa. Theorist Peter Carrier (1996) defines commemoration in a manner that always contains both past and present. He wrote of commemorations: "[T]heir meaning derives from elements of both the original event and the new context within which the commemorative 'event' takes place." By definition, a commemoration both calls an event of the past to memory and preserves this memory in a ceremony, monument,

³⁰⁶ The Duty of Memory is a French ideological and legal dedication to eradicate disinformation about the suffering of Jewish people during the holocaust and to honor victims through remembrance. More information is provided later in this section.

or cultural artifact.³⁰⁷ Schneider contributes the implications of the body as an enactor of that temporality.

Other French theorists uphold skepticism of the historical or temporal merit of commemoration. Peter Carrier echoes one of Nora's established fears that yearly commemoration dulls the feeling of the public to that which is being commemorated. He claims it creates a banal history and adds that as a representation of history, commemoration is a medium that separates spectators from what is being represented. He recommends a continually passed oral history in an oral society, where he claims "natural" remembrance occurs, leaving no gaps in the passage of cultural memory. This separation is necessary because he and Nora claim that commemoration is "participation without participation" or, I would paraphrase, a performance without an audience or performers.³⁰⁸ Missing from these arguments is a consideration of the somatic experience of participants and the immense capacity of performance to pass on memory.

Commemoration's repetition through tradition builds its own significant memory that carries forward the remembrance of the historical event. Though not continual like oral culture, annual commemoration represents history, at its simplest, by reperforming the turn toward history as of the previous or first years of the performance of the commemorative event. Yearly repetition creates mimetic performances of the first act of commemoration, which is bound to the historical event or idea. There is active consideration of the traditions, or histories, of the past and the meaning that the current performance will solidify for the future. The choice to include a march during 1790's La Fête de la Fédération, a commemorative (re)enactment of the path trod in 1789,

³⁰⁷ Peter Carrier, "Historical Traces of the Present: The Uses of Commemoration," *Historical Reflections / Réflexions Historiques* 22, no. 2 (1996): pp. 431-445, 435.

³⁰⁸ Peter Carrier, "Historical Traces of the Present: The Uses of Commemoration," *Historical Reflections / Réflexions Historiques* 22, no. 2 (1996): pp. 431-445, 439.

established commemoration through participation and tradition for future commemorations of the Bastille. Connecting the yearly events by folding or doubling time allows us to reflect on annual performances where linear considerations only show a twelve-month gap of change and a tendency to modify or “contrive” history.³⁰⁹ The slowly shifting demographic or practices of the event over time demonstrate that the history is still alive and still occurring. The performers of the 1790 Fête de la Fédération implicated the present performance when creating the commemorative event. Historian Gerard Namer wrote, “To commemorate, is to collectively practice *mémoire message* in a fictive time in which past, present, and future coexist.”³¹⁰ In this way, the 2018 performance is already a part of the commemorated (re) performance of the storming of the Bastille, even in 1790.

Schneider’s work demonstrates that it is not only the history of the Bastille that falls into a commemorative feedback loop. The active movement of history, time, and commemoration is not limited. Like a (re)performed performance art piece, the commemorative (re)enactment is as much a performance as the original. The repeat even influences the original. Schneider states,

For history, replayed, is not ‘merely’ citational (as if citation were ever mere) in that history replayed is neither entirely removed nor significantly distanced from that which is cited, in the way, perhaps, that a slap is not removed from the face slapped, even as the hand and face do not become one and the same. There is, here, a “refusal to refuse” affiliation, even if the affiliation, like a stereotype, causes the sting of discomfort.³¹¹

³⁰⁹ Peter Carrier, “Historical Traces of the Present: The Uses of Commemoration,” 439.

³¹⁰ Gérard Namer, *Mémoire Et Société* (Paris: Méridiens Klincksieck, 1987), page unknown. As quoted in Alain Corbin, “History and Memory,” in *The Columbia History of Twentieth-Century French Thought*, ed. Lawrence D. Kritzman (New York: Columbia University Press, 2007), pp. 255-260.

³¹¹ Rebecca Schneider, *Performing Remains: Art and War in Times of Theatrical Reenactment* (London: Routledge, 2011), 176.

Commemoration's closeness to history creates the same bonded affiliation. Even if the historical memory were to shift from accuracy, the body or the memorial still embodies a connection to that history. It still wears a string of directional affect that connects to history.

The storming of the Bastille as an event does create a unique commemoration (no matter how it is performed) because the historic event was celebratory by nature. French memory essayist Charles Péguy's theories align more with Schneider's to support my claim that the commemorative event can be a living acting event. In *Clio, Dialogue de l'Histoire et de l'âme Païenne* (posth. 1931), Péguy considers the storming of the Bastille and its memory. He extends beyond the thought that every commemoration commemorates its first iteration (or the first 1790 anniversary) to claim that for commemorations of The Bastille specifically, the historical event was born as a commemorative event in itself in 1789. He stated,

The capture of the Bastille, history tells us, was essentially a festival. It was the first celebration, the first commemoration, and in a sense the first anniversary of the capture of the Bastille. Or, rather, the *zeroth* anniversary. We were mistaken, history tells us. We saw things one way, they had to be seen another way. We saw. The Festival of the Fédération was not the first commemoration, the first anniversary, of the capture of the Bastille. The capture of the Bastille was the first festival of the Fédération, a Fédération before the fact.³¹²

Here Péguy notes that the historical event that the commemoration represents is bound to the creation of a Fédération as a group. The rebellion was, in fact, an act of celebration. Péguy's historiography of the event and its festival opens it up as a critical nexus of identity consecration and creation. The chicken or the egg of the French revolutionary spirit as an instigator for revolution or a product of revolution is expressed through the 14 julliet parade's commemorative

³¹² Charles Péguy, *Clio, Dialogue De L'histoire Et De L'âme Païenne* (Paris: Gallimard, 1932).

and performative properties. Participants act out a national identity while also simultaneously creating and remembering it.

Commemoration embodies an affective historiography. In Péguy's example of the history of the Bastille, the affective solemnity and celebration of commemoration were present before the hallmark "turn toward the past" was possible. This affect of commemoration can shift depending on the context, but it always retrieves the past through that affect. For example, in a moment of silence for someone who has passed, the affective solemnity, stillness, and reach for memory act as a special kind of historiography of that person's passing that is only felt. State and national ideology and identity influence commemorative affect. France's state involvement in memory and its commemoration establishes researchable ideological tracking of national memory. The memory's most prominent scholars also influence this memory.

Pierre Nora recognized a growing bifurcation of ideological universalism³¹³ in cultural memory and commemorative practices of the 1990s. He had already questioned commemoration's

³¹³ French Universalism is an extension of the definition of universalism as the opposite of particularism in ethnicity, religion, nationality, etc. In essence, it is an idea that values man first as a French citizen before all other characteristics. A more general idea of universalism is crucial to theories of the Enlightenment. From the French revolution in 1789 came the "Declaration of the Rights of Man" which granted universal rights to all men, unlike the US Declaration of Independence which guarantees the rights of Americans. "Universalism is inherent in revolutionary definitions of citizenship... a neutral subject who must be divested of all particularities to access their rights." As an idea connected to the French Revolution, the French considered it their concept and their duty to proselytize the idea of human rights across Europe and the colonies, as they once had proselytized for the Catholic Church. Universalism was also bound to the French language which Descartes and the French Republic saw as the language of reason. It was spread among the French colonies then commonwealth. French Universalism is deeply connected to the idea of French Exceptionalism wherein the French, with the language of reason, philosophies of the Enlightenment and the Revolution, and governmental success set France as superior in enlightenment. French Universalism and Exceptionalism have been critiqued as antisemitic, antiwoman, and colonialist throughout the years. The Rights of Man were promised to all men but did not include women or slaves.

capacity to hold history. He was scornful of the numbing influence of the repetitive commemoration on the memory of the historical event. His skepticism of historicity stems from the inability of commemoration to represent its subject with a complete and detailed history away from the hegemonic influence of the state on the narratives of national state-controlled commemoration. To embrace the shifting atomization³¹⁴ of commemorative moments or monuments, Nora attempted to use memory as a term that implies more relationality and influence from societal structure than his definition of history.³¹⁵ For Nora, “National continuity is no longer sustainable historically, but is founded instead on the ‘dynamic agent’ of memory, and on a socially motivated ‘national memory’ as opposed to a ‘national history.’”³¹⁶ The national memory was made of existing pieces of history with agreed-upon cultural narratives that first come from communal memories. One can liken Nora’s idea of memory to the Diana Taylor’s concept of the repertoire wherein a historical moment or idea is passed down through the act of living in cultural tradition, even while reinventing and adapting it.³¹⁷ To live in memory, for Nora, is ruined by the

Naomi Schor, “Universalism,” essay, in *The Columbia History of Twentieth-Century French Thought*, ed. Lawrence D. Kritzman (New York: Columbia University Press, 2007), 344–48.

³¹⁴ Atomization is a word Nora uses to describe France’s budding rejection of universalism,

³¹⁵ Seth C. Bruggeman supports an emotional shift away from history toward memory. He argues for that memory to occur in events and memorials, calling commemoration “the *lingua franca* of public memory” because it relies on feeling over historical circumstance. Several scholars support this use of the words. In one example, Corey Kai Schultz states, “Memory, ‘a word that has more emotional and narrative connotations, since ‘history’ is the ‘official’ record, while ‘memory’ is the vernacular.”

Seth C. Bruggeman, “The Commemorative Conundrum,” in *Commemoration the American Association for State and Local History Guide* (Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield Publishing Group, 2017), pp. 1-39, 1.

Corey Kai Schultz, “Memories in Performance: Commemoration and the Commemorative Experience in Jia Zhangke’s 24 City,” *Film-Philosophy* 20, no. 2-3 (2016): pp. 265-282, 268.

³¹⁶ Peter Carrier, “Historical Traces of the Present: The Uses of Commemoration,” 434. Quoting Nora

³¹⁷ Diana Taylor, *The Archive and the Repertoire: Performing Cultural Memory in the Americas* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2007).

force-feeding of history that negates that lived experience.³¹⁸ The change and evolutions of memory are unconscious, so praised by Nora, but history is a conscious reconstruction that is always incomplete, as is commemoration.³¹⁹

French historian Annette Wieviorka examines the ideological control surrounding commemoration. She veers from Nora in acknowledging that memory and commemoration are studyable. She likewise views commemoration as a historical challenge. She argues that the individual or group producing the commemoration significantly changes the meaning of the historical referent. The dilemma is that those who call history forward are those who preserve its memory. Because of this, Wieviorka argues that the historian must examine not only the history, or memory, being represented in commemoration but also the structure of the representation. She argues that France went through an “Age of Commemoration of the second world war” from 1989 to 1995 that significantly altered France’s memorial ideology.³²⁰ This epoch of commemoration shifted the commemoration and attitudes concerning Jewish loss during WWII from the republican³²¹ ideal: “They died for their homeland” toward anger at the Vichy³²² state and focus on the atrocities of the holocaust.³²³ It did this through shifting commemorative narrative structures.

³¹⁸ Pierre Nora, “Between Memory and History: Les Lieux De Mémoire,” *Representations* 26 (1989): pp. 7-24, 7.

³¹⁹ Pierre Nora, “Between Memory and History: Les Lieux De Mémoire,” 8.

³²⁰ Annette Wieviorka, “Reflections on Commemoration,” *Annales : Histoire, Sciences Sociales (French Ed.)* 48, no. 3 (1993): pp. 703-714.

³²¹ In this context and throughout the chapter, a Republican is a person or thing that supports the French republic in opposition to the monarchy.

³²² Vichy France refers to the French government from 1940-1944. The Vichy were compliant and collaborative with Nazi occupiers.

³²³ Peter Carrier, “Historical Traces of the Present: The Uses of Commemoration,” 1992.

Looking at commemoration as performance troubles Nora and Wieviorka's impressions of history and commemoration. Commemoration's ability to reference the past and to touch history through memory and commemorative (re)enactment is not reliant on an attempt to try and then fail at historical accuracy nor merely a study of the creators involved and their influence. Commemoration's inherent call to remember and its physicality of representation exist without claims to be a mimetic reenactment of history. A monument wall is a reference to the fallen soldiers whose names are on the wall, and it is a call to remember and affectively connect but is not attempting to depict a battle accurately. Beyond the monument, commemoration is not just a signal to the past; it is its own event drastically separated in physical context and aesthetic properties from its referent. I have argued for the closeness of commemoration to its historical event through repetition, but it is still its own kind of event. Schneider points out performance art's different mindset than theatre. Both are art, yet theatre never purports authenticity or reality, while performance art exists in what Richard Schechner calls "actuals."³²⁴ Schneider troubles the rawness of performance art by analyzing its subsequent repetition and relates war reenactment to art reperformance more than she does theatre. However, unlike war reenactments, I contend that commemorations touch history and bring it along because they are not attempting to *be* history, only to provoke audiences to affectively turn themselves toward that history, folding the memory of the historical moments (past and present) together.³²⁵ Even without an attempt at being history, the soldier bodies in the parade implicate themselves as representations of memory.

³²⁴ Rebecca Schneider, *Performing Remains: Art and War in Times of Theatrical Reenactment* (Abingdon, Oxon: Routledge, 2011), 16.

³²⁵ Rebecca Schneider, *Performing Remains: Art and War in Times of Theatrical Reenactment*, 6.

France's attitudes toward history and memory provide a uniquely nuanced case study because of its Duty of Memory. Memory can be tracked, to a degree, in the development of many national myths, but political reactions to historiography at very specific moments in the nation's history point to France's unique approach to memory. Nora argued that the universalism and positivity of France's national history and identity displayed at French commemorations before the 1990s took a dramatic ideological shift toward "particularisms" of identity and historical memory.³²⁶ This is demonstrated by the French idea of the Duty of Memory. *Le devoir de mémoire*, the Duty of Memory, is a name given to an ideological imperative that shifted into place in the late 1980s and 1990s. It influenced public memory, historical motivations, and legislation. Post-World War II President Charles de Gaulle perpetuated a historical myth of the war that supported idealized French universalism. In the myth, French people all fought together as one against fascism, and the deaths of French rebels and French Jewish victims were both perceived primarily patriotically as sacrifices for the country. After the end of de Gaulle's presidency in 1969, myriad factors led to an increased consciousness of what the Jewish community had experienced and the realities of the holocaust, referred to as Shoah. Throughout the 1970s and 80s, histories and public trials began to identify the Vichy French government's participation in the Nazi occupation and its remaining support that trickled through the de Gaulle administration. During this time, some historians began to deny aspects of Shoah. In response, in 1990, the government enacted the Gayssot Act, which criminalized some racist acts and, importantly for this study, the denial of crimes against humanity. The act was the first of several memory laws for France and an example

³²⁶ Pierre Nora, "The Era of Commemoration," in *Realms of Memory: The Construction of the French Past*, ed. Lawrence D. Kritzman, vol. 3 (New York: Columbia University Press, 1997), 1009.

of many memory laws that governments passed throughout Western and Eastern Europe. Historians now focused the legal and appropriate histories on the plight of Jews during Shoah, the evils of the Vichy government, and the goal never to forget. This was a turn away from the previous heroic narratives toward the memory of victimization and cruelty. This was a duty of memory or a duty to think about those who suffered. It primarily connects to World War II, but the Duty of Memory extends toward suffering in many conflicts, including wars that followed the Gayssot Act and that preceded colonialism.³²⁷ In 1986, The *Commission à l'Information Historique pour la Paix* of the Department of Veterans Affairs proclaimed a Duty of Remembrance for all conflicts.³²⁸ Political and social leaders continue to use the phrase “*le devoir de mémoire.*”

The Duty of Memory implicates multiple temporalities. Like Nora, theorist Paul Ricoeur argues against the Duty of Memory. In *Memory, History, Forgetting* (2004), Ricoeur builds off Nora’s arguments against commemoration and other state-led memory practices to say that the obligation to remember is onerous. Additionally, the work doubles because it is a command not to forget. To not forget, argues Ricoeur, is an impossible task assigned to an unknown moment in the future. He argues that the essence of the Duty of Memory is harmful as it seeks to remember the atrocities of the past. He writes, “The Duty of Memory consists essentially in a duty not to forget. In this way, a good share of the search for the past is placed under the sign of the task not to forget. More generally, the obsession of forgetting, past, present, and future accompanies the light of

³²⁷ Nikolay Kaposov, *Memory Laws, Memory Wars: The Politics of the Past in Europe and Russia*, Cambridge UK ; New York ; Port Melbourne ; Delhi ; Singapore: Cambridge University Press, 2018, 87-89.

³²⁸ Jean-Pierre Rioux, “About the Duty of Remembrance,” *Inflexions* N° 13, no. 1 (2010): p. 125, <https://doi.org/10.3917/infle.013.0125>, 132.

happy memory with the shadow cast by an unhappy memory.”³²⁹ To remember, he argues, is an arduous task of continual non-forgetting accompanied by the fear that one might forget in the future.³³⁰ However, Ricoeur’s argument of temporal complexity surrounding the duty not to forget can bring the commemoration and the event even closer in mutual influence. When both the past and future are thought of in one present moment and, according to Nora and Ricoeur, instill darkness or worry, the string of affect again connects through events. The historical affects of Shoa are carried through by the quality and category of contemporary affect, in as much as participants project it during solemn commemorations.

The acts of commemoration, or commemoration’s performance, are crucial for this connection. Commemoration demonstrates a pre-decision not to forget. However, meeting this duty of memory through commemoration cannot happen through hope alone. The commemorative practice, location, or symbolism must be a tool in memory recall and reinforcement. Nora’s seminal theory of *lieux de mémoire* explains the ability for memory to continue and thus demonstrates commemoration’s ability to fulfill the Duty of Memory. *Les lieux de mémoire* are sites or objects of memory that serve as receptacles of communal memory. They embody what remains as memory from all the history and events of the past.³³¹ Examples include museums, memorials, books, anniversaries, festivals, important documents, locations, artefacts, or anything endowed with the memory it now represents.³³² Memory is separated from history as history

³²⁹ Paul Ricoeur, *Memory, History, Forgetting*, trans. Kathleen Blamey and David Pellauer (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2004), 494. Kindle

³³⁰ Paul Ricoeur, *Memory, History, Forgetting*, 1352. Kindle

³³¹ Pierre Nora, “Between Memory and History: Les Lieux De Mémoire,” 12.

³³² Pierre Nora, “Between Memory and History: Les Lieux De Mémoire,” 12.

concerns itself with the events of the past, while memory is concerned with sites, or the ideological representations attached to the *lieux de mémoire* and not by the details of the referents.³³³ Nora claims the “most fundamental purpose of the *lieu de mémoire* is to stop time, to block the work of forgetting.”³³⁴ Antithetical to Nora’s claim of stopping time, *lieux de mémoire* are always performing or representing when viewed through performance. Labeling the object as a *lieu de mémoire* implies an endowment of meaning that the object then projects, or performs, outward as it scripts the perceiver to remember. Because they are performing their endowed meaning and memory, these *lieux* (even tangibly unchanging ones) constantly interact with their audience and, I argue, bring times together as time moves instead of stopping it. As active devices of temporal directional command, in that way acting much like the Duty to Remember, the sites reach toward the past and the future with their other purpose, “to block the work of forgetting.”

The soldiers in the parade function as, or perform as, a *lieu de mémoire* that the audience dutifully remembers. A *lieu de mémoire* can be treated similarly to (re)enactment in that both feature representation reaching toward the past. Like commemoration, a site of memory likely does not reenact a moment directly, but it represents and performs that history through the cultural memory that it carries. Schneider explains the temporal logic of (re)enactment as something in the present reenacting the past for those in the future. It is extended across time as she says, “to keep

Nora even claims there are People of Memory who function as a site of memory. He specifically states that Jewish people are People of Memory in the context of France and Europe for all around them because their bodies, willing or not, are symbolic containers of memory. This theory is interesting as it considers the political identity of the body. Still, it is problematic because it doesn’t consider consent in its analysis or mention the feelings of the “people of memory” themselves.

³³³ Pierre Nora, “Between Memory and History: Les Lieux De Mémoire,” 22.

³³⁴ Pierre Nora, “Between Memory and History: Les Lieux De Mémoire,” 19.

the past *alive*.”³³⁵ Commemoration seeks the same goal and contains corresponding trifold temporality. It is possible for commemoration to provoke thought about the past only for those in its own present moment, but, especially in the context of the Duty of Memory, commemorative practices point to the past for the memory of those in the present and the future. Those in the present are performing a relationship with the past so that those in the future “never forget.” Commemorations can be *lieux de mémoire*, according to Nora, but likewise can *lieux de mémoire* be small pieces in a larger commemoration. It is the *lieu* as a component of the whole that makes a commemoration representational in a manner comparable to historical reenactment. While the parade as a whole can be considered a site of memory, the soldiers in the 2018 parade served as *lieux de mémoire*, holding the memory of soldiers of the past and then serving that memory-meaning back to the audience in a feedback loop under the structures of commemoration (as parade).³³⁶ Through commemoration, or the call to remember, the soldiers become endowed with parts of the total memory. Then, simply by inhabiting the space on le 14 Juillet in uniform and gesture, they instill soldiers’ lives into the fabric of the memory by performing commemorative (re)enactment.

In further deviation, I expand the consideration of the body in Nora’s theory of *lieux de mémoire*. It may seem appropriate to use Nora’s theory of People of Duty to assign the soldiers the moniker instead of *lieux de mémoire*. However, the soldiers temporarily inhabit that position in their role in commemoration. While Nora argued that Jewish people at the time of Nora’s writing could hold memory as people, that would be a permanent holding of national memory.³³⁷ However,

³³⁵ Rebecca Schneider, *Performing Remains: Art and War in Times of Theatrical Reenactment*, 37.

³³⁷ Pierre Nora, “Between Memory and History: Les Lieux De Mémoire,” 22.

the soldiers can shake off their soldierhood and the memory inscribed to them after the parade. Even dressed as soldiers after the commemoration in a different context, those bodies would not serve as the same positional *lieux de mémoire*. It is their performance, along with their physical presence, that endows the meaning, not just their existence like Nora's People of Duty.

4.1.2 French Nationalism

The memories of *lieux de mémoire*, once experienced, create the nation. The memories create the public consciousness and its perception of itself, including a communal national identity. In a step away from Anderson's approach to nationalism from which my other chapters build or deviate, I will rely on the influential idea of the nation by Étienne Balibar. Balibar conceptualizes the nation in the context of its relationship to the state, wherein the state is the government, and the nation is the social gathering of people and ideology created alongside that government. The nation and the government are put into place to maintain and recreate the nation-state reflexively. A government cannot cover all the sociological aspects of the nation. He said, "States tend to become nations, but nations do not always form states."³³⁸ Like Anderson, Balibar considers the idea of imagination in the composition of the nation. Instead of focusing on the time of national creation, as Anderson does, Balibar focuses on the necessity of a "fictive ethnicity" created to comprise the nation's citizenry. The fictive ethnicity is full of contradictions, as Balibar points out, and is thus profoundly intertwined with racism. For example, for the fictive ethnicity to be intact, there must be an Other to which it must compare. However, once an Other is created, the national

³³⁸ Etienne Balibar, "The Nation Form: History and Ideology," *Review (Fernand Braudel Center)* 13, no. 3 (1990): pp. 329-361, 330.

citizenry is no longer made of this imaginary ethnicity alone but of itself and its other. Thus, the idea of the nation will always subjugate or marginalize by way of its existence. With the fictive ethnicity of a nation comes the assumption of the inevitability of the nation. Thus, the assumption is that all social and physical things are within their perfect boundaries. Balibar argues this is a false imaginary, and that the idea of the nation is upheld by the constant testing and reallocating of borders.³³⁹

Balibar argues that all communities are imaginary but that self-acknowledging communities of revolutions that have the awareness to see themselves as “the people” create a reality and political power with their imagination. However, to retain that political power, the unity of “the people” must be reproduced continually.³⁴⁰ This can be done through common symbols or “ideal signifiers” that replace what religion was to absorb affect and the sacred.³⁴¹ For the French after the revolution, a common French identity and ideology were vital to building the state. Balibar frames the resulting French universalism as a result of these signifiers, specifically in highly controlled language and repression of cultural “particularism.”³⁴²

The holiday of le 14 juillet can serve as an ideal signifier of the French nation, reinforcing French universalism as part of its national identity. It does so by stating that the citizens that celebrate are united in their celebration and their shared ability to identify with the holiday and its festivities. The shared moments across the day, including the parade, fireworks, and fireman’s balls, provide extended periods of synchronization and gathering, whether in person or digitally. The concept of a national signifier can align with *lieux de mémoire* in the case of the military

³³⁹ Etienne Balibar, “The Nation Form: History and Ideology,” 337.

³⁴⁰ Etienne Balibar, 346.

³⁴¹ Etienne Balibar, 349.

³⁴² Etienne Balibar, 358.

parade because the parade and its individual soldiers serve as *lieux de mémoire* that hold a revolutionary memory which is a key memory of France's national identity and commemorative affect. This identity and affect influence the state.

4.2 The Soldier on Parade

For the state to function after a civil war or revolution, the citizens must be willing to participate in cultural amnesia and curate its memories. In the “Commemorative Conundrum” (2017), Seth C. Bruggeman claims that instituting festivals creates new memory that can push out old, unwanted national memory.³⁴³ The aftermath of the revolution, starting during the long revolution itself, needed French unity. La fête nationale and its predecessor, the Fête de la Fédération engaged the public in commemoration through festival, thus asking them to look to the present to create new memories of the past. Because of this, the beginnings of Bastille Day following the storming of the Bastille in 1789 were well crafted and political. As Kimberly Jannarone argues in “Choreographing Freedom: Mass Performance in the Festivals of the French Revolution” (2017), after and through the revolution, revolutionary authorities sought ways to instill the values of the revolution, *Libertè, Egalité, Franternité* into the people through embodied action. Festivals provided opportunities for the people of the new nation to act together. Festivals also provided an opportunity for reimagining France and its people away from the religious

³⁴³ Seth C. Bruggeman, “The Commemorative Conundrum,” 5.

practices of the Christian festival calendar toward repurposed secular practices and imagery.³⁴⁴ Jannarone writes, “Crosses were turned upside down to become liberty trees; altars were re-engraved with images and slogans supporting the Republic.”³⁴⁵ The festival is united by shifting memory, even the memory of the city’s iconography. A procession of military men through famous geographic *lieux de mémoire* performed a secular militant national identity. Like its first performances, the (re)performance of the Bastille Day parade in 2018 commemorated the Bastille through the Arch de Triumph down the Champs-Élysées. Amid the slippery nature of the memory of the Bastille and its morals through time, the physicality of the performers continued to project “Liberté, Égalité, Fraternité” while at the same time embodying martial control. These meanings exist in the gestures of the parade and the structures of militarism that inhabit and encase it.

The La Fête de la Fédération or la Fête national was of great importance to national identity creation, even before the state established it officially or agreed upon its history. Careful planning occurred to encourage the “right” narrative of the French people and the national memory. When the day was declared the country’s official national day in 1880, a century after it began, opposing factions debated privately and publicly about the appropriateness of the day to represent the state as its one national day. There were also debates on the existing historiography of the storming and

³⁴⁴ Amalvi includes secular prayers in his history of Bastille Day that verbally recalled the three tenets of the revolution. For the first 1880 festival, one of them was *Ave Maria*: “Hail Liberty, beloved only deity of the French, true goodness is with thee. Blessed art thou by oppressed peoples everywhere, and unity is thy fruit. Holy Liberty, daughter of nature, look after thy children who once were slaves and we will ardently defend thee now and in the hour of our death. Amen.”

Christian Amalvi, “Bastille Day: From Dies Irae to Holiday,” 134.

³⁴⁵ Kimberly Jannarone, “Choreographing Freedom: Mass Performance in the Festivals of the French Revolution,” *TDR/The Drama Review* 61, no. 2 (2017): pp. 117-139, https://doi.org/10.1162/dram_a_00651, 121.

how the 14th would influence the memory of the Bastille and vice versa.³⁴⁶ In a pamphlet from Republicans heralding the celebration of July 14th as the national day, politicians described the Bastille to reinforce the morality of its overthrowing. A Republican wrote, “This Bastille, this dark and sinister fortress with its eight towers, loomed over Paris, which lay vulnerable to its artillery. It was tyranny’s foot on the belly of the people. There, in dank cells, victims of aristocratic whim lay rotting, wretches snatched from favor and stricken from the rolls of the living.”³⁴⁷ The opposition wrote a counter-history in another pamphlet describing the same location and casting a different historical pride or importance to the storming of the Bastille. It was “a poorly defended fortress that opened its own gates to a crowd of rioters, a bunch of criminals who seized on the surrender as an opportunity to massacre unarmed men: that is what happened, nothing more or less.”³⁴⁸ The national day’s position on the 14th would bind the national identity to the Bastille and whatever historiography of the event prevailed.

The heroic memory of the Bastille inscribed by celebrating the nation at the Bastille’s commemoration acts out several sub-memories throughout its celebration: the afternoon meals and fireworks endow the memory with equality and fraternity. The morning activities endow memories associated with the state. The first Fête in 1790 was a festival of the masses. Thousands of delegates from around France gathered in Paris to hear toasts and oaths but also to sing, dance, and revel. Soldiers, bourgeoisie, and proletariat danced together. They did not gather to watch a

³⁴⁶ Christian Amalvi, “Bastille Day: From Dies Irea to Holiday,” 119-121.

³⁴⁷ *Sainte Republique—Fête Nationale 14 Juillet 1881: Prime Offerte Par Le Genie Moderne*, Print (Bibliotheque nationale, n.d.).

³⁴⁸ Léon de Poncins, *Brochures Populaires Sur La Révolution Française* .. (Paris: Librairie de la société bibliographique, 1873). Found in and translated by Christian Amalvi, “Bastille Day: From Dies Irea to Holiday,” in *Realms of Memory: The Construction of the French Past. Vol. III Symbols*, ed. Pierre Nora and Lawrence D. Kritzman, English Language Ed., vol. 3 (New York: Columbia University Press, 1996), pp. 117-162, 124.

procession alone but to participate. Jannarone states of the early revolutionary festivals and the French people, “they themselves would comprise the event; they would be the reason for and the object of the mass celebration.”³⁴⁹ On the effects of the first commemoration, Jannarone writes, “The nation had been corporeally embodied and united — a nation of equals, of citizens working together, of bodies singing and moving and speaking in harmony.”³⁵⁰ The presence of these values on the national and commemorative day ensures that the associated memory of the Bastille would absorb these characteristics.

The 1880 version of the national day again featured citizens not as audience alone but also as performers. The active participation of the average citizen continued to secure the national identity and national memory as rooted in equality and fraternity. The afternoon festivities often comprised “amateur plays, municipal bands and choral societies, sports, and public school fairs.”³⁵¹ The evening also involved village dances. The citizens contributed to the holiday as they were observing it. Historian Christian Amalvi claims this was not the case in public commemorations and celebrations throughout the constitutional monarchy and the empire. Between the early revolution festivals and the creation of the national day in 1880, the national celebrations would relegate common citizens to audience-only.³⁵² Considering Balibar’s theory of the fictive ethnicity in the festival context, group performance crafts the national identity suggesting French universalism wherein the Othering component of nation-building was ignored.

³⁴⁹ Kimberly Jannarone, “Choreographing Freedom: Mass Performance in the Festivals of the French Revolution,” 118.

³⁵⁰ Kimberly Jannarone, “Choreographing Freedom: Mass Performance in the Festivals of the French Revolution,” 127.

³⁵¹ Christian Amalvi, “Bastille Day: From Dies Irea to Holiday,” 134.

³⁵² Christian Amalvi, “Bastille Day: From Dies Irea to Holiday,” 135.

Still, the universal ideology pushed existing class and racial distinctions under the rug in favor of the universal French celebrator. For the national day, there was unity in practice. Through these more casual afternoon entertainments, the French citizen participated in embodied practice as a group, recalling and inhabiting a memory of the French public who harnessed their power for liberation on July 14th, 1789. The joy of plays and school fairs then colored this memory.

The memory of the Bastille shifted along with ever-changing political ideas and received influence from the presence of the military on the national day. The group participation, or mass performance as Jannarone argues, during the afternoon activities of 1800s on were accompanied by the morning celebrational activity of a military parade, which had been a consistent fixture in commemorations of the storming of the Bastille before the declaration of the 14th as the official national day. Throughout the war, over the historiography of the storming of the Bastille and the battle for what memory would comprise the foundation for the national holiday, the military parade remained a necessary political event starting in the early 1870s.³⁵³ Its symbolism changed throughout the decades. Through the 1880s, Republicans regarded the parade as a celebration of the people and the revolutionary spirit. Many officers were Monarchists and thus had to be forced by the army to participate in leading their proletariat-born soldiers in the parade because of the social meanings interpreted from the parade. By the 1890s, leftists argued that the national day was a bourgeoisie day that affirmed the state and, through the parade, its state control. This was an

³⁵³ Gabriella Elgenius, *Symbols of Nations and Nationalism: Celebrating Nationhood* (Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan, 2011), 105.

idea to which the right did not object.³⁵⁴ During the 1899 Dreyfus Affair,³⁵⁵ government skeptics and opposers begged for a new trial by disrupting Bastille Day events across France, including the parade, illuminating the place of the Parade as a tool of the state. In 1911, these sentiments continued, but so did the far-right's conviction that the memory of the Bastille was a dangerous blood-thirsty tale that the nations should not celebrate. Consequently, they also protested during the parade. However, in response to fascist riots in 1934, the 1935 holiday passed with support from both the right and the left as it celebrated the democratic attitudes of the Bastille.

Throughout the tumult of changing perceptions, the gestures and movements of the parade have remained close to the same. The events of the Fête de la Fédération and the following years describe “processions” with little detail about the style of the march.³⁵⁶ From the founding of the le 14 juillet as a national day in 1880, evidence suggests military parades much like the parade of 2018. For example, two known consistencies through the event since 1880 are the ritual of the presentation of colors and the marching pace of 115 marching steps per minute.³⁵⁷ The parade route has changed over the years from various routes incorporating the Place de le Bastille to its current route from the Arc de Triomphe, down the Champs-Élysées, to the Place de la Concorde for review in front of the President of the Republic.

³⁵⁴ Christian Amalvi, “Bastille Day: From Dies Irea to Holiday,” 135-136.

³⁵⁵ The Dreyfus Affair was a political turmoil that unsettled the Third Republic during the turn of the century. It centered on a case in which the French military had wrongfully accused and convicted a Jewish soldier of treason through espionage. However, the military knew he was not guilty, and the guilty party was a white man. When this news came to light, a political divide arose when people picked sides. Those who supported Dreyfus condemned the conviction as antisemitism. They performed protests to beg for Dreyfus to receive a new trial. The affair also led to antimilitarism in the country due to the military's actions.

³⁵⁶ Christian Amalvi, “Bastille Day: From Dies Irea to Holiday,” 132.

³⁵⁷ Gabriella Elgenius, *Symbols of Nations and Nationalism: Celebrating Nationhood*, 106.

The consistent physical location choices and date for the military parade created an ideological connection between the Bastille and the performing army. Journalistic evidence demonstrates that the public had seen the soldiers of the parade as representations of revolutionaries at crucial times in history. During the 1945 parade, the first post-World War II, De Gaulle sought to pepper the parade with nationalist memory by starting the infantry parade with a review by De Gaulle at Fort Vincennes. However, the official review occurred at the Place de Bastille, which was tradition. The location and the date played a significant role in the perception of the parade so that instead of only being perceived as nationalist, the parade projected revolutionary attitudes because the soldiers of 1945 stood as *lieux de mémoire* of the revolutionaries when in the parade context. The French paper *Le Monde* stated, “On this day Paris once again cheered the army. But it was not to the aristocratic avenues that the people flocked, it was to the Place de la Bastille, to the foot of the column commemorating the ‘Trois Glorieuses,’ wrapped in the colors of the Allies. The soldiers emerged from the faubourg where once citizens mounted the barricades to die for freedom.”³⁵⁸ The newspaper deliberately attaches the 1945 soldiers to the citizens of the revolution in a mythical memory of 1789 and the active commemorative memory of the present 1945.³⁵⁹

³⁵⁸ *Le Monde*, July 15th, 1945. As quoted in and translated by Christian Amalvi, “Bastille Day: From Dies Ira to Holiday,” 156.

³⁵⁹ An article from July 1908 demonstrated the audience's readiness to feel a temporal and physical blur with the memory of the Bastille. “This year, my fellow citizens, we have yet another reason to rejoice, for we, too, have overthrown our own little Bastille. Our reactionary old municipal government was, in fact, a lot like a fortress. Just as the collapse of the Bastille on July 14th, 1789, buried beneath its ruins.” In this quote, the writer equates the recent elections to the Bastille. The writer's wording makes a close comparison between the people's actions today and those of the people on that day by saying “we too” but qualifying it with “our own” when referencing the Bastille. The writer then takes it further— “Just as” captures a deeper connection. The people of now (1908) and the trials of now are just as or exactly like the people and the trials of July 1789.

4.2.1 The Modern March

The parade still has a deliberate frame of ideology that influences and is influenced by the practices of the audience and participants. The 2018 route through the Arc de Triomphe, which does not make contact with the Place de la Bastille, appeals to the militaristic memories of Napoleon more than the Bastille. However, the consistency of gestures in the march carries the memory of the Bastille. The group that stormed the Bastille would not have marched with uniformity. However, the consistent use of this physicality for commemorating the storming of the Bastille, in 1791 and post-1880 married those gestures to reoccurring commemorative (re)enactments back to 1790 and, therefore, that year's direct referent: the previous year's storming of the Bastille. The movement of marching becomes a holder of memory and has a similar affective potential to the standard drill discussed in previous chapters. The soldiers executed the 2018 march traditionally: many units varied their march slightly to account for rifles or sabers. Some kept the weapon stationary, while others let the arm with the saber move. The soldiers marched in step, at a cadence of 115 s.p.m.,³⁶⁰ in precise rank and file. They carried their heads fixed forward, as no turns were present in the march down the Champs-Élysées. However, the traditional linearity of drill was complicated by the final stop of the parade in front of the President at Place de la Concorde. The units approached the seated audience perpendicularly and must divide their files evenly to the left and right. They curved the line to turn, then marched away back to line parallel to the audience stands.

Le Phare De La Loire, July 16, 1908, p. 4. As quoted in Christian Amalvi, "Bastille Day: From Dies Ira to Holiday," 145.

³⁶⁰ The standard speed for the U.S. Army is 120spm. Pre-American Revolution, the cadence was 76spm. "TC 3-21.5," TC 3-21.5 § (2021), 1-2.

For the opening of the parade section structured as a presentation for the President and dignitaries, the French Republican Guard infantry,³⁶¹ cavalry, gendarme motorcycles, and the band performed an exhibition routine that, in 2018, consisted of many circular topographical company maneuvers. Marching in one circular formation, multiple small, circular formations, or a combined presentation, the performers (including horses) stepped far from historical and traditional linear marching styles. At one moment, during a pinwheel formation, infantry created the innermost part of the lines, cavalry in the middle, then motorcycles on the outside. With the length and speed that the performers on the perimeter of the formation had to travel the task as opposed to the inner performers, the hybrid wheel kept a clean appearance of 115 s.p.m. This type of formation was reminiscent of the Greek *Epistraphē* maneuver, wherein soldiers used kinesthetic awareness to turn as a hinge while maintaining linear rank. However, the synchronized march step was preserved in the contemporary maneuver where the Athenian Greeks would have adjusted without temporal restriction. In these tight formations, two gendarme motorcycles struck and toppled over but were quickly back on the intended trajectory. The drill team also performed simple precision drill.

³⁶¹ quadrille des baïonnettes; 1st regiment. Republican Guard Bayonet Drill Team



Figure 2 Bastille Day Parade 2018. Republican Guard



Figure 3 Bastille Day Parade 2018. 27th battalion de Chasseurs alpins

If considered as a living and adapting *lieu de mémoire*, the performance and its potential affect carry the physicality of traditionalism hidden in controlled progress. For the public, the majority of the parade is rank and file in standard march step down the Champs-Élysées. The exhibition, for dignitaries but televised to a broader public, performs gestures and formations created only for spectacles not seen in battle or even standard training. The kinesthetic awareness

and affective synchronization required to march the bulk of the parade are turned up to spectacular levels during the circular rotations of the exhibition to stay precisely aligned. The exhibition feels dangerous for the audience and performers that weave through formations with purposeful near-collisions. Indeed, the motorcycle accident demonstrated the tight gaps between performers and the real danger. The excitement of a near miss, for both performer and audience, and the wonder at the novel circular pattern of such a usually linear practice, grants the *lieu* a sense of freshness and a feeling that the military, therefore the nation, is willing to take chances and seek out the new. The joyfulness of spectacular performances distances the association between performers and producers from the militarism inherent in the scene's uniforms, dress, and movements. The spectacle was just different enough from everyday military life that the audience could overlook the militaristic presence to perceive the total nation performing excellence and capability. The memory of the storming of the Bastille as a joyous step toward independence can be experienced affectively through excitement and wonder.

Even through the spectacle, the objects that build the commemoration are actual tools of war recontextualized, even the soldier-body. Accordingly, while a present projection of joy is put onto the memory of the past, the horror of violence creeps forward from the past into the present. The procession leading to the Place de la Concorde meticulously enacts traditions of militarism accompanied by the potential affective reaction to militarism. Never more is this present than during the presentation of the French Foreign Legion. The Foreign Legion is an infantry corps created by Louis Phillip during the conquest of Algeria in 1831. Unlike other parts of the French military, the Foreign Legion allows recruits from outside the country that want to serve France.

The Legion also performs its duties outside of hexagonal France.³⁶² Several detachment groups in the Legion called Pioneers worked as the tradesmen of the corps in its nascency but are now ceremonial carriers of tradition. The Pioneers, or Sappers, have a unique appearance and stand out in the French military, including a large leather apron, a beard, and an axe. The Foreign Legion usually closes the parade's infantry march as they march at only 88 s.p.m. opposed to the standard 115 s.p.m. The Pioneers march even slower at 80 s.p.m.³⁶³ The Legion's contrasting pace slows the energy and momentum of movement in the parade. The audience has a possible moment to experience a slowing or calming affect that brings the solemnness of the day's commemoration. Because of their slow march, they appear longer before each audience section. The audience can dwell on the uniqueness of the uniform. After a consistent barrage of military units with large firearms, the audience sees the jarring image of an axe placed over the Pioneer's shoulders. While the firearm is much more dangerous, the possible visual numbness to rifles could have set in by the time the Legion marches through, and the presence of the axe forces the audience to consider weaponry at all.³⁶⁴ For a knowing audience, the colonial history of the Legion is also demonstrable in the Pioneer's traditional dress. The Legion's finale performance of dedication, precision, and pace exposes the parade's element of militarism that has always been among the spectacle. The state and military's tight control becomes exposed as a foundation for the spectacle's liberated French identity.

³⁶² Mainland European France is known as the hexagon. This excludes the French European Islands, which are considered Metropolitan France when included with mainland Europe. In addition, these delineations exclude overseas regions.

³⁶³ Gabriella Elgenius, *Symbols of Nations and Nationalism: Celebrating Nationhood*, 109.

³⁶⁴ The axe is not meant to be a weapon. Instead, it symbolizes early Foreign Legion tradesmen's work, like clearing obstacles. However, the contemporary presentation of axes in media allows the mind to think of weapons upon viewing them. The Pioneers are also carrying it in the position that other units carry a firearm.

During the 2018 performance, Singapore's Prime Minister Lee Hsien Loong watched with pleasant decorum among the rest of the audience. When the Foreign Legion Pioneers marched into view of the dignitary seating, he turned and looked at France's President Macron and, while seated, enacted the gesture of a slow, steady, commanding walk. The Pioneer march stood out from the other units because of its slow and somber affect to the point that it stimulated a physical reaction from the Prime Minister in which he mimicked the movement as a heavy trod. Macron then leaned over and whispered to Lee.³⁶⁵ I can only imagine he was recounting the history of the Legion and remarking why their movements are purposefully slow. This affective reaction represents many reactions to the movement of marching that either stand out by design or blend in to quietly carry the inherent presence of violence. Whatever the reaction, the memory of the Bastille is influenced by it.

The memory of the storming of the Bastille is constantly in flux. Politicians use historiographies of the event as tools to shape national thought. The parade as a reoccurring *lieu de mémoire* gives a steady repetition of movement. The context of the parade influences the meaning of that movement but, the movement itself also carries memory as the soldiers stand as *lieux de mémoire* themselves. The affective transfer from that movement to the audience creates a performance of nationalism that is built of revolution. It does this, as each iteration of the commemoration connects to the commemorations of the previous years, like an affective folding of time.

³⁶⁵ [Watch] *Bastille Day 2018 with PM Lee as Guest of Honour, RSAF Takes Part in Flypast, YouTube* (The Straits Times, 2018), <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=9eME1y6V-T4>.

4.3 A Revolution Without a Center

The military parade is essential for the meaning of the national holiday and French identity. Opening the national day by (re)enacting and resolidifying military control into the national fabric paints the rest of the holiday with a militaristic quality. The national day and the parade perform an ideological paradox. The soldiers march as the people once did toward the Bastille in the spirit of revolution. For this, commemoration performs values of the revolution. However, the rigidity of the parade and the state as its producer is inherently order-keeping or anti-revolutionary. The contemporary iteration occurs in front of the President and elite foreign dignitaries. In July 1892, a political group of syndicalists shamed the festivities of 14 juillet as the representative national day. One writes the reason they do not celebrate is because the “bourgeoise reaped all the benefits of the seizure of the Bastille. Since we consider ourselves as aggrieved today as in 1789.”³⁶⁶ However, French identity uniquely connects to the qualities and ideologies of the parade and memory performed by the holiday. Elgenius states, “The link between the military procession and war-ridden French history stand unambiguous...and is embedded in a nexus of national symbols and ceremonies within the overall ceremony.”³⁶⁷ It has been used throughout French history to portray national identity and ideology.

The nation that was built first on violent revolution, then held together with unique ideologies of Universalism and the Duty to Remember, becomes enriched by each performance of that meaning and particular French identity. Still, the revolutionary meaning is not always consciously absorbed. I have argued that even when not acknowledged, the storming of the Bastille

³⁶⁶ *Le Socialiste*, July 17, 1892, p. 95. as quoted in Maurice Dommanget, *Histoire Du Premier Mai*, trans. Christian Amalvi (Paris: Societe Universitaire d’Edition et de Librairie, 1953), 358.

³⁶⁷ Gabriella Elgenius, *Symbols of Nations and Nationalism: Celebrating Nationhood*, 111.

is present in the parade and holiday of 14 juillet because the memory of the Bastille and the contemporary affect influence each other. I have written mainly of a unified French identity or singular French affective experience of the parade. The memory and experience of individuals, separate groups, and component *lieux* that cannot be controlled will always complicate the intended memory of the state-sanctioned *lieux de mémoire*. Thus, individual citizens' or small communities' memories also complicate national identity, putting universalism into question. Regardless of its symbolism and physical manifestation, contemporary iterations of the holiday rarely reference the Bastille event. Such omissions can be very influential on holidays' memory and message. Based on a 2011 South African national survey, Sabine Marschall argues in "Public Holidays as Lieux De Mémoire" that half of South Africans do not know the meaning of many secular national holidays.³⁶⁸ The holidays of Marschall's study were, like 14 juillet, politically debated and purposely placed on specific dates with carefully planned activities to accomplish state ideological goals. Though this is a survey from a different country about different holidays, it highlights *lieux de mémoire* creators' assumptions of a national knowledge base for commemoration on national holidays. The transfer of memory's affect can occur during performance. Still, it is possible that intellectual meaning is lost or that meaning has changed so drastically over time that the commemoration's memory no longer connects to a historical event in the eyes of the public.

Each iteration and each individual participant, bring subjectivity heavily influenced by context. Through this, memory grows in many directions in relation to the historical event. I argue

³⁶⁸ Sabine Marschall, "Public Holidays as Lieux De Mémoire: Nation-Building and the Politics of Public Memory in South Africa," *Anthropology Southern Africa* 36, no. 1-2 (2013): pp. 11-21, <https://doi.org/10.1080/23323256.2013.11500039>, 17.

that the military Parade on Bastille Day in 2018 was influenced drastically by its surrounding events, but instead of the meaning drifting further from historical memory, the world cup events influenced it back toward its original intended social memory, not away from it. In *History as an Art of Memory* (1993), Patrick Hutton includes public memory as a critical element of French identity. However, he argues, “Two hundred years after the event, the revolution had ceded its role in national identity formation to a broader range of events.”³⁶⁹ Through a focus on the body’s place in memory and affect, as discussed in previous chapters, I argue that even if the people of France become intellectually distanced from the historical event, arguments that French identity has evolved to a state that doesn’t include the memory of the revolution neglect the very real contemporary French spirit of protest. From the Bastille to the Yellow Vest Riots to the protests for pension reforms of 2023, France’s chosen performance method of political disagreement between the people and the state has continually been active, destructive, and sometimes violent public protest. The integration of the revolutionary spirit into the political world provokes agitated activism. The World Cup riot solidified the revolutionary affect on the national identity that the national holiday performed. As a commemoration of the storming of the Bastille, the parade’s marching soldiers carry and experience affect as they reinform a French identity based on the revolution.

³⁶⁹ Patrick H. Hutton, *History as an Art of Memory* (Hanover: University of Vermont, 1993). As quoted by I. Stephen Legg, “Contesting and Surviving Memory: Space, Nation, and Nostalgia in Les Lieux de Mémoire,” *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 23, no. 4 (2005): 481–504, <https://doi.org/10.1068/d0504>, 490.



Figure 4 July 15, 2018. One million fans celebrate the World Cup on the Champs-Elysées



Figure 5 July 15, 2018. Fans celebrate the World Cup win on top of a news-stand

The affect performed by the combination of the parade and the riot is not the only cause of the increased revolutionary spirit. The collective conceptual shift toward the Duty of Memory in the 1990s bound commemorative practice to feelings of justice. Ricoeur argues that there is a

significant difference between everyday memory and mourning, and that the Duty of Memory is felt as a sense of justice for the memory of those who suffered.³⁷⁰ This justice-in-memory fits its intended purpose when fashioned toward the twentieth-century conflicts for which the Duty of Memory was created, like Shoah. However, the ideological shift in the methodology of memory and its commemoration in French culture towards the Duty of Memory cast a broad net binding justice to all national memory deemed worthy of remembering. The existence of a commemoration is a declaration of memorial exceptionality. To participate in commemoration is to actively or dutifully remember. If the participant's ideological approach to memory includes the well-taught Duty of Memory, justice will likely be a part of that memory and commemoration. The already existing narrative of justice in the memory of the storming of the Bastille links the memory to the post-1990 historical methodology. It is, therefore, potentially commemoratively performed in the parade and its context.

The French people's proclivity to protest as civil engagement, whether real or perceived, has been a memory of its own, passed through historical eras. In contemporary France, the widespread protests of 2023³⁷¹ and the Yellow Vest (*gilets jaunes*) Riots of 2018,³⁷² exemplify an

³⁷⁰ Paul Ricoeur, *Memory, History, Forgetting*, trans. Kathleen Blamey and David Pellauer (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2004), 1368. Kindle

³⁷¹ In 2023, French President Macron signed into law a raise in retirement age by bypassing a parliamentary vote. As a result, large protests broke out around France, which were extremely visible in Paris. There was heavy clashing between protestors and police. On May 1st, 2023, 112,000 people protested in Paris. The Place de la Nation suffered a small fire, and police and protestors were injured throughout the day.

Joseph Ataman, Saskya Vandoorne, and Oliver Briscoe, "May Day Protest Erupts in Paris as France Seethes about a Hike in the Retirement Age," CNN, May 1st, 2023, <https://www.cnn.com/2023/05/01/europe/france-pension-protests-explainer-intl/index.html>.

³⁷² In 2018, rising costs of fuel in France led to working-class hardship and placed a focus on economic disparity. Working-class people protested around France and, like in 2023, clashed with police. Macron vowed never to cave in to protest like French leaders of the past. The movement was known for the yellow reflective utility vests the protesters wore.

investment of protest in French identity and affective memory. Alexis Poyard, a French youth activist in the 2023 protests, tells the English magazine *Dazed*,

We can explain this ‘tradition’ by [looking at] the history of France: the French Revolution, the commune of Paris 1871. In France, we protest whenever we are sad or when we are angry. Conservatives believe social movements and protests divide us, but actually, it’s the opposite, at least for popular demonstrations. The gilets jaunes protests, for example, wanted to recreate that social link between people. French democracy was built on a model in which voting is not the only means of popular expression. A demonstration expresses dissatisfaction with government policy...And it works.³⁷³

In this quote, an activist on the ground references the revolution of 1789 and the overthrowing of the French government by the working-class national guard in 1871. Citations from the past, including violence and death, inspire the contemporary protest climate. He cites protest’s benefits: a unification between people and the communication of emotion to the government. In the context of the French revolutionary memory, the performance of protest is grounded in affect and connection.

The protests also bear consistency through the protestors’ physicality and the government’s reaction. In the Yellow Vest protests,³⁷⁴ the pension protests of 2023,³⁷⁵ and the revolt of 1968,³⁷⁶ the physicality of the protests is reflected by the police approach. All three saw water hoses, tear gas, and physical engagement with riot police. Hutton writes that the French nation throughout the nineteenth century also engaged in protest, and that the protesters modeled the protests after the storming of the Bastille. “The revolutions of 1830, 1848, and 1871, not only mention a number of

Adam Nossiter, “‘Yellow Vests’ Riot in Paris, but Their Anger Is Rooted Deep in France,” *New York Times (Online)*, December 2nd, 2018.

³⁷³ Serena Smith, “Why Are the French so Good at Protesting?,” *Dazed*, March 17th, 2023.

³⁷⁴ Adam Nossiter, “‘Yellow Vests’ Riot in Paris, but Their Anger Is Rooted Deep in France,” *New York Times (Online)*, December 2nd, 2018.

³⁷⁵ Joseph Ataman, Saskya Vandoorne, and Oliver Briscoe, “May Day Protest Erupts in Paris as France Seethes about a Hike in the Retirement Age,” *CNN*, May 1st, 2023.

³⁷⁶ “France Feared on Brink of Civil War,” *Eugene Register Guard*, May 25th, 1968, 214 edition.

abortive popular insurrections along the way, were perceived by many of their participants to be reenactments of the prototype of 1789.”³⁷⁷ Enactors performed the physical catalog of protest throughout the development of the nation. In Balibar’s definition of the nation, this physicality came to be integrated into the fictive ethnicity of the French identity.

Like memory, the legacy of protest in France is not only felt but also legislated. In August 1789, the National Assembly lawmakers set the first twelve articles of the Declaration of Rights, including the Right of Resistance (*Resistance à L’oppression*). However, by September, the National Assembly was already negating the Right of Resistance by assigning the National Guard to quash protests by people opposing the National Assembly. In October, legislators modified the right by passing a martial law against “seditious gatherings.” In 1792 it was clarified that the right to resistance only applied in defense of the citizens to a tyrannical and unconstitutional government.³⁷⁸ Under this application, the Right of Resistance became a tool of the government to claim validity over royalist traditions. In a complete reversal from a right of the people to a right of the government in 1793, the established military in Vendée used the right as a recruitment tool to join the official state-sanctioned military. “*Resistance à L’oppression*” was exhibited on the top of recruitment posters. One official government poster synonymized the official soldier with the revolutionary by calling for revolutionaries to “raise a combat to the death against all royalists, moderates, nobles and aristocrats of our anguished interior, and the *patrie* will be saved.”³⁷⁹ It

³⁷⁷ Patrick H. Hutton, *History as an Art of Memory* (Hanover: University of Vermont, 1993), 125.

³⁷⁸ Micah Alpaugh, “The Right of Resistance to Oppression,” *French Historical Studies* 39, no. 3 (2016): 567–98.

³⁷⁹ *Resistance à l’oppression*. 1793. Paris. As quoted in Micah Alpaugh, “The Right of Resistance to Oppression,” *French Historical Studies* 39, no. 3 (2016): 567–98, <https://doi.org/10.1215/00161071-3500321>, 589.

named any opposition to the government not as insurrectionists but as counterrevolutionaries. The right was removed from the Declaration of the Rights of Man in its 1795 iteration.

Coopting the purpose of the Right to Resistance from precautions that the government implemented to protect civil engagement through protest by the people for government use mirrors the assignment of revolutionary spirit to a hegemonic institution. The memory of revolution and justice that the parade holds as a *lieu de mémoire* uses refined geometric movement under strict governance to paradoxically carry the affect of resistance. The affect of resistance in the parade draws the parade, itself a symbol of government power, close to the French political riot.

French political historian Gerde-Rainer Horn qualifies the difference between American and French attitudes toward protest. He said, “When protests erupt in the U.S., the instinctive reaction of much of the population is kind of skepticism or even dislike. In France, there’s much less reticence about them, and you even have a contagion of the protest mood between different communities.”³⁸⁰ The contagion of protest traveled during the Yellow Vest Riots when anger over fuel prices spread unrest among farmers and university students. In the May 1968 revolt, a student protest against capitalism spread to factories and the working class. The action, or physicality, of these protests, demonstrates a pattern of civic engagement with an affect that spreads through time, but also through communities.

³⁸⁰ Ciara Nugent, “French Protesters Just Won Concessions From Macron. Here’s Why They’re More Successful Than American Demonstrators,” *TIME*, December 12th, 2018.

4.3.1 Masculinity

The riot after the world cup was not a protest. No activists brought political terms to the government in light of the riot. It was, instead, a celebration of nationhood and national identity that rose to the extreme gestures of the French protest tradition. It also refocused the national celebration from the day before while instilling an essential feature of the French ethnicity. The state masculinity of prudence and control of the parade shifted toward working-class civilian masculinity. The riot also centered people of color, the faces of the historically colonized, in the national demonstration. Even without the same goals, the affective expression held in the body for times of protest remains in the body in times of relative peace and can release under different circumstances.

Neither the parade nor the world cup celebration-turned-riot were exclusively male. Plenty of soldiers marching in the parade were women. However, as discussed in Chapter Three, the uniforms remained traditional, and the traditional uniforms, which usually utilized head covering that shaded the face and obscured the individual characteristics of the soldier, carry the masculine memory of historic military tradition. Likewise, in association with the masculinity of the military, the actions done by the soldiers on parade and the people in the riot, as actions of protest, perform a masculine affect. In *Masculinities in Theory* (2010), masculinities theorist Todd Reeser uses Anderson's Imagined Community to expose the masculinity of some national identifiers, even if women are included. "If an all-male military takes on that role, for instance, an all-female group is excluded from embodying the nation. If the actual military is mixed-sex, but an all-male group is imagined to embody the nation, then the actual presence of women in the military is de facto

rejected in the representational sphere.”³⁸¹ If the representation is masculine-coded, the transferred or communicated affect is influenced even though the affect is pre-linguistic and pre-masculine-coding and, in retrospect, is deemed masculine.

The French national pride of the weekend of July 14th, 2018, demonstrated a masculine conception of the nation. July 15th demonstrated a revolutionary concept of the French nation, which included a step away from state control to civilian. On July 15th, the national fervor from the day before was still alive as the anticipation for national glory rose through the afternoon. The climax, or perhaps the moment of catharsis, struck as the football game concluded, and France emerged as the world champions. Clad in symbols of nationhood (colors, flags, singing the national anthem, etc.), the people gathered. Faced with the affect that comes from an overwhelming national pride, or possibly a kind of substitution of oneself into the action, fans were without complete emotional explanation for the affect’s intensity. Consequently, they channeled their affect into physical application. The energy that started as singing, dancing, running, and smiling spiraled itself up in intensity until the fans were compelled to return to an inherited French physical application of masculine overwhelm: a riot.

The masculine culture of silence creates unqualifiable, or impossible, emotion from the affect experienced by fans that day. Reeser illustrates the possible incapacity of a man to find a socially accepted emotional definition of this affect. He writes, “A male subject may sense that he cannot use words to contain, control, and capture an affect which remains linguistically

³⁸¹ Todd W. Reeser, *Masculinities in Theory: An Introduction* (Hoboken, NJ: John Wiley & Sons, 2010), 175.

autonomous outside of discursive control.”³⁸² Without that linguistic, thus emotional, control, the fans express affective energy in masculinity-rich actions such as demonstrations of strength (breaking windows and throwing objects). Pride for the national team mirrored the national pride enacted in the previous day’s parade. However, the football fans were without the affective and physical control of the military. Instead, the themes of the revolution expressed in the parade through commemoration were now a physicality of the revolution being (re)enacted by civilians. The physicality and affect of the riot decentered the narrative of a controlled and prudent France to one of masculine revolutionary violence.

4.3.2 Colonial Memory

The masculine French affect brought the audience and participants of the events closer to a memory of the Bastille than the Parade alone, even in contemporary society. The physical appearance of the actors of the riot event also illuminated the increasing diversity of the soldier body in the commemorative event, even though uniforms mostly cover it. The effects of diversity in the French parade are not simply a reflection of a changing Europe; they physically highlight another piece of the foundation of the “fictive” French ethnicity and a contradiction to universalism: colonialism.

There is a stark contrast between historical parade performances and contemporary iterations, even as it carries (re)performed memory through time. Contemporary military parades

³⁸² Todd W Reeser, “Approaching Affective Masculinities,” in *Routledge International Handbook of Masculinity Studies*, ed. Lucas Gottzén, Ulf Mellström, and Tamara Shefer (London ; New York: Routledge, Taylor et Francis Group, 2021), pp. 103-111, 104.

feature a more extensive diversity of race and stand out because they contain any diversity of gender at all. Yet, this change in military demographics does not only represent progress. During World War I, colonialism played an essential role in the French fight. The French military conscripted more than 140,000 West Africans³⁸³ into the French army as infantry soldiers on the front lines.³⁸⁴ The majestic march of the Foreign Legion Pioneers is a glaring reminder of this colonial past. The appearance of diversity throughout the parade is not always a sign of integration, as it is consistent with the integration of foreign fighters by force. The contemporary parade performs a contradiction of colonial power and post-colonial universalism.

The 1790 Fête de la Fédération brought perceived equality to the streets of Paris and began the memory of *égalité* in the Bastille procession. Jannarone recounts a declaration that

People should not take horses or carriages, but instead walk on the streets of Paris, a command that mandated that all bodies be treated and perceived equally. According to a contemporary account: ‘It had been forbidden that opulence disturb this peaceful celebration with the traffic of its carriages. All were to join the people and be happy to count among them’ (Thiers 1864:134–35). This order intended to enforce corporeal togetherness worked... culminating in a dance at dusk at the Bastille.³⁸⁵

The universal ideal is enacted with the group commemorative performance. The people set class distinction aside when forming memory around the history of the Bastille. The Yellow Vest and pension riots demonstrate that class equality was certainly not maintained throughout the application of the French universal. The World Cup riot, with its affect-clad gestures of protest, indicates inequality as part of the revolutionary legacy. The revolution’s movement, which holds

³⁸³ Conscripted soldiers enlist on compulsory grounds.

³⁸⁴ Joe Lunn, “‘Les Races Guerrières’: Racial Preconceptions in the French Military about West African Soldiers during the First World War,” *Journal of Contemporary History* 34, no. 4 (1999): pp. 517-536.

³⁸⁵ Kimberly Jannarone, “Choreographing Freedom: Mass Performance in the Festivals of the French Revolution,” 127.

some memory of equality, is consistently (re)enacted even after the time that things were meant to be equal, as in the world cup riot.

Many scholars engaging with *lieux de mémoire* acknowledge its rich potential framework, but some (Achille et.al.) argue that Nora's theory on the heterogeneity of the national memory only accepts inter-European migration and various cultural differences, not the necessary consideration for the memory built from the exchange of empire and colonial migration. Additionally, his hexagonal approach to the geographical contributions to French memory neglects the many francophone locations of colonialism that do influence the memories in the hexagon. Indeed, highly manicured commemoration can shift memory away from the colonial past toward any direction it likes. However, French theorists argue that by retaining a hexagonal approach, Nora does not acknowledge the potential for colonial memory, whether removed from the potential memory or not.³⁸⁶ In *Postcolonial Realms of Memory: Sites and Symbols in Modern France* (2020), Achille, Forsdick, and Moudileno argue that the *lieux de mémoire* concept must be post-colonized.³⁸⁷ This is accomplished by expanding geographies, decentralizing the hexagon and the capital, and including the colonial implications of currently acknowledged traditional sites.³⁸⁸ They also reclaim the term *lieux de mémoire* as a term encompassing diverse forms of representation of that past.

³⁸⁶ Benoît Majerus et al., *Dépasser Le Cadre National Des "Lieux De Mémoire": Innovations Méthodologiques, Approches Comparatives, Lectures Transnationales* (Bruxelles: P.I.E. Peter Lang, 2009).

³⁸⁷ Étienne Achille, Charles Forsdick, and Lydie Moudileno, "Introduction: Post-Colonizing Lieux De Mémoire," in *Post-colonial Realms of Memory Sites and Symbols in Modern France* (Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 2020).

³⁸⁸ Étienne Achille, Charles Forsdick, and Lydie Moudileno, "Introduction: Post-Colonizing Lieux De Mémoire," 13.

The riot decenters the commemoration of the Bastille Day parade that would usually depend on top-down state-produced memory. By drawing the center of meaning between the traditional practices of the holiday, the focus on the sport of 2018, and the riot, the moment commemorates anti-authoritarian methods of French identity creation from the revolution and the diversity of post-colonial French identity. Enacting the riot on the parade path, a famed boulevard of luxury shops and restaurants transfers the space's potential memories to new ones, not only the social memory grounded in opulence and the state. The pairing of the two events draws both memories of the space together, forming one of French nationalism in a space between the elite and the marginalized.

Sport, even without a riot, can serve a decolonizing function in the concept of French ethnicity and French national pride. Achille, Forsdick, and Moudileno point to arguments around citizen and non-citizen French athletes refusing to sing the "Marseillaise" (the national anthem) at sporting events as post-colonial implications in identity-creating *lieux de mémoire* in as much as the anthem is a site of memory. They expand the claim to apply Nora's *lieux de mémoire* more broadly. Achille, Forsdick, and Moudileno claim that "[S]port can itself be considered a site of memory that encompasses the recent controversies connected to the idea of Frenchness while in the meantime opening up a wider array of possibilities going far beyond the current debates."³⁸⁹ Sport draws the center of French identity away from the hegemonically established parade-as-*lieu* to a less controlled environment for identity creation. The identity grounded on the hegemonic histories of primarily white actors builds the social memory that structures a fictive ethnicity and a fictive catalog of heroes. The images and heritages of the men leading the nation into great

³⁸⁹ Étienne Achille, Charles Forsdick, and Lydie Moudileno, "Introduction: Post-Colonizing Lieux De Mémoire," 14.

victory on the football pitch challenge those heroes. French defender Raphaël Varane was one of the stars of the World Cup team. He is visibly of Martiniquais³⁹⁰ decent and played for Real Madrid for most of his career. French center-back Samuel Umtiti and his family migrated to France from Cameroon³⁹¹ when he was a child. Midfielder Paul Pogba was born in France to Guinean parents.³⁹² Arguably the star of the 2018 team, Kylian Mbappé, of Cameroonian and Algerian descent, served as a carrier of identity for the whole French nation that looked to him as their representation on the global stage and felt his success as if it were their own.³⁹³ The French national heroes of the 2018 World Cup shifted French identity for today and influenced the French memory to illuminate diverse historical contributors and acknowledge French colonialism in the memory.³⁹⁴

The memory of France's colonial legacy that the Foreign Legion's march performed in the parade was also brought forth through the World Cup game. The players Mbappé, Pogba, Umtiti,

³⁹⁰ Martinique is a territory of France in the Caribbean, "French West Indies." It is a single territorial collectivity, meaning it functions as a department/region of France but sits outside what is known as hexagonal France. The French colonized it in 1635.

³⁹¹ Umtiti and his family are from Yaoundé, Cameroon, which was occupied by France after WWI (seizing it from the colonizing German empire) until 1960 when French Cameroon gained independence.

³⁹² The West African country of Guinea was under French control from 1898-1958.

³⁹³ "France 2018 World Cup Winners- Who Were the Players and Where Are They Now?," Goal.com, December 14th, 2022, <https://www.goal.com/en-us/lists/france-2018-fifa-world-cup-squad-winning-team-players/blt79ef3cc0962357e4#cs5a92da7e98221755>.

³⁹⁴ The heroes of the 2018 French world cup are not the first in this position. The revered French player Zinedine Zidane led the French to a World Cup victory in 1998. He is a non-practicing Muslim and his parents immigrated from Algeria to France right before the Algerian revolution. He has been so loved that he was voted the Nation's Favorite Figure in a poll done by the Institut français d'opinion publique and the *Journal du Dimanche*. He has been used by politicians and the public as both the ideal example of universalism and Algerian particular excellence. Philip Dine, "Football in 'French' Algeria and 'Algerian' France," essay, in *Football, Politics and Identity*, ed. James Carr et al. (London: Routledge, 2023), 87.

and Varane (with additional others not listed) did more than represent a diversity of appearance in the French national team. These players' heritages all connect to sites of the French colonial project (Martinique, Cameroon, Guinea, and Algeria). The nexus of West African heritage, national representation, and football brings forth the important role that football played in the colonization and independence of these francophone West Indian countries. For example, football was brought back to West Africa from soldiers who served with British and American allied forces in WWI. In Algeria, whose government functioned as a province of France, the sport quickly spread and segregated football clubs formed around the country. The initially acknowledged clubs were formed for European settlers with primarily European players. A few clubs were more integrated and allowed upper-class Algerians access.³⁹⁵ However, indigenous players began to form covert clubs and leagues. Clashes between settler and indigenous clubs, both from players and supporters, grew violent in nature. The French authorities attempted to impose a rule that all indigenous teams have at least three European players to curb some of the violence, but it was not followed. Instead, several indigenous clubs were also secretly nationalist groups. The Mouloudia Club Algérois wore the colors of the banned nationalist flag.³⁹⁶ Many young players were exposed to Algerian nationalist groups and independence ideology through the football scene. Philip Dine describes the colonial nature of football at the time. "Algerian stadiums became microcosms of the colonial encounter, encouraging the emergence of a revolutionary national consciousness through the

³⁹⁵ Albert Camus played on one of these teams in the junior division. He wrote of this time later in life.

³⁹⁶ Philip Dine, "Football in 'French' Algeria and 'Algerian' France," essay, in *Football, Politics and Identity*, ed. James Carr et al. (London: Routledge, 2023), 79.

playing out, both on and off the pitch, of the confrontation between coloniser and colonized”³⁹⁷

Football continued to be used for the Algerian nationalist cause through its revolution by its backing from the Algerian National Liberation Front while many regulations were imposed and attempted by the Fédération internationale de football association (FIFA).

Even though the entirety of France, including provinces outside of the hexagon, is theoretically engaged in creating the ideal and universal French identity, the nation’s history privileges the European identity as the standard. The image of the players as heroes and the acknowledgement of their heritages decenter the French identity to a wider francophone world. Making diversity and colonial memory visible through football reshapes the national memory. However, Balibar wrote of France’s relationship to race and colonialism as the foundation of the false universal. “Nativism’ has always been implicit in the history of French national ideology until, at the end of the nineteenth century, colonization on the one hand, and an intensification of the importation of labor and the segregation of manual workers by means of their ethnic origin on the other, led to the constitution of the phantasm of the ‘French race.’”³⁹⁸ While the identities of the new French heroes through sport stretch the image and implications of the fictive ethnicity, the hold of universalism tries to ignore particularisms to include rather than exclude the new developments. Integration through colonialism is the definition, not the exception, to the universal.

Because of universalist ideology, the representation on the football pitch is not enough to decolonize or decenter French memory or the French hegemonic identity. It does assist in the story

³⁹⁷ Youcef Fatès, *Sport et Tiers Monde* (Paris: Presses universitaires de France, 1994), 30-31. As paraphrased by Philip Dine, “Football in ‘French’ Algeria and ‘Algerian’ France,” essay, in *Football, Politics and Identity*, ed. James Carr et al. (London: Routledge, 2023), 80.

³⁹⁸ Etienne Balibar, “The Nation Form: History and Ideology,” *Review (Fernand Braudel Center)* 13, no. 3 (1990): 329–61, 359.

told on the Bastille Day and World Cup weekend. The physical actions of the fans and the rioters worked as a (re)performance of revolutionary memory, helping the visual and intellectual influence of the football game to decentralize the revolutionary spirit from the hegemony of the parade toward the nexus of the weekend's events. Through performance of the body, affective memory is passed on that may not exist in the intellectual narrative. In "Contesting and Surviving Memory" Stephen Legg writes of memory creation and the body's importance. "To recollect social memory is a genealogical task, rather than one of historical analysis. This genealogy must take in both counter memorial, commemorative acts, and the way that memory survives and evolves in the social, and anatomical body."³⁹⁹ Through the mixture of commemoration and revolt, the French body decentralizes either one's affective memory.

4.4 Conclusion

French memory and national ideologies are unique and entrenched in its history. However, it is the memory of that history that influences the actions and lives of its citizens today. Le 14 julliet is a day set apart to encourage the nation and instill a national identity. The political handling of the holiday from its origins to 2018 have created an ever-shifting story of what it is to be French. To remember the nation's history is of great importance. The commemoration of the storming of the Bastille on its national day establishes that event and its values (as far as it is remembered) as quintessential Frenchness. Key to the day's national success is the physicality of performer and

³⁹⁹ Stephen Legg, "Contesting and Surviving Memory: Space, Nation, and Nostalgia in Les Lieux de Mémoire," *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 23, no. 4 (2005): 481–504, <https://doi.org/10.1068/d0504>, 498.

audience in commemorative performance. The physicality of the military parade, as repeated gestures through time, takes on the meaning and memory of the Bastille, along with its own martial implications, to impart violence and revolution. This is accomplished as the soldiers stand as *lieux de mémoire* to create a commemorative (re)enactment of the Bastille storming.

France's World Cup win on July 15th, 2018 substantially changed the meaning, therefore the memory, performed in the identity-creating holiday. The diversity of the team and the inescapable colonial past of France in Western Africa challenge French hegemonic identity and it's the memory it creates as the team is gladly identified as a representation of France while receiving world-wide glory. This challenge highlights the revolutionary aspect of colonized francophone identity. Some French fans' reactions to the win was an escalation of uncategorized affect that was released through communally remembered gestures of revolution. It is these three events together that form a nexus of meaning-creation that draws violence and revolutionary commemoration out of the military parade and national memory out of the actions of the World Cup rioters. This interconnection brings the national events to a memory and physicality of revolution. The revolutionary spirit is remembered when the fans march with their fellow Parisians just as the 1798 revelers did, as the rioters agitate and destroy as the 1789 revolutionaries did, and as the soldiers carry the physical memory in commemorative (re)enaction.

5.0 Conclusion

“On being furnished with a suit of regimentals, the first ordeal that awaited me was a course of drill extending over six months, a sort of purgatorial process, through which all are doomed to pass, preparatory to their being admitted into the comparative paradise of the ranks.”
Memoires of Sergeant R. Reid 1st (The Royal) Regiments, 1846⁴⁰⁰

The French film *Beau Travail* (1999), written and directed by Claire Denis, follows a complex triangle of affection and masculinity in which a French Foreign Legion Sergeant explores feelings of admiration for his commanding officer and jealousy of a new recruit while they are stationed in Djibouti, formerly a French colony.⁴⁰¹ Loosely based on Melville’s *Billy Budd, Sailor*,⁴⁰² *Beau Travail* quietly exhibits masculine forms of comradery, violence, and desire. It questions the structure of military command. Through careful choreography and the camera’s focus on the male body in motion, Denis depicts military drill almost as a dance. She dedicates much of the film to the choreographic training sequences that depict the beauty of formations and social bonding through movement. With like topics, the American film *The Inspection* (2022) establishes a plot built on military structures, the masculine body, and male relationships.⁴⁰³

⁴⁰⁰ R. Reid, “National War Museum ” (Edinburgh : Edinburgh Castle, n.d.).

⁴⁰¹ Claire Denis, *Beau Travail* (France: Arte, Pyramid Distributions, 1999).

⁴⁰² Eve Sedgwick analyzes *Billy Budd, Sailor* in *Epistemology of the Closet* (1990). Sedgwick argues for an interpretation of desire and male desire in this story about men, passion, and legal obligation. She states that the story asks, “Is men’s desire for other men the great preservative of the masculinist hierarchies of Western culture, or is it among the most potent of the threats against them?” I note that *Beau Travail* similarly dances on homoerotic performances of military and masculine hierarchies.

Eve Kosofsky Sedgwick, *Epistemology of the Closet* (Berkeley and Los Angeles, CA: University of California Press, 2008), 93.

⁴⁰³ *The Inspection* (United States: A24, 2022).

Written and directed by Elegance Bratton, the film reflects Bratton's own experience as a young gay black man in Marine bootcamp post 9/11. In the film, cruelty and masculine dominance by his co-cadet "brothers" gives way to a few meaningful connections between soldiers also living on the margins of the masculine ideal. Like *Beau Travail* before it, the homosocial and homoerotic plot is woven through training sequences in which drill and many other physical tests break the boys to make them into soldiers. Bratton showcases the black queer body throughout struggle and power. Through movement focused sequences, he sets his body as not quite the soldier of the all-American, muscular, straight, white body. Both films demonstrate the ability of soldier's movement to tell a story, and their wide distribution attests to a public appetite for a view of those stories.

The spectacular military performances of politics and terror staged for the global media, that I addressed in the introduction, stand on a spectrum with these modest films. While marketed to reach a large audience, the films depict the soldier in drill with unobtrusive choreographic flow opposite the parades and performances that have been covered by media with regalia and pomp. Both films explore the body in military training and the consequences of masculinity on that body. The spectacle of the Russian Victory Parade, and attacks at military performances in Venezuela and Iran, demonstrate the aptitude of drill in performance to act as a platform for national politics and ideologies. Though lacking spectacle, the body in drill depicted in *Beau Travail*, *The Inspection*, and real-life soldiers doing training drill, play out the politics and ideologies presented in national performance. Through drill, the body becomes the inheritor and disseminator of masculine ideals and national fantasy.

This dissertation has established that the movements and traditions of military drill have consequences on the society that they inhabit. As a practice drawing from archival and repertoire

histories, political contexts, masculine ideology, and the soldier himself, military drill becomes more than a battle or training tactic. It becomes an echoing remix of those contributing factors as it is performed daily in boot camps, parades, mock battles, and drill performances.

When approaching a history of drill to ground the performances of the Parade and Tattoo, it was essential to detach the confines of a progress meta-narrative that scholars have placed on the few previous historiographies. After all, if the practice of drill continued to adapt and improve from the Greeks to today, wouldn't it still be used as a battle tactic? Rather than considering improvements in movement or weaponry, I approached the rhizome through a socio-ideological *mise-en-scène*. I chose moments in time that were significant for the physicalities of both drill and ideal masculinity, which I argue are bound together. By tracing those two physical states and movements, I was able to find an affective logic in which I touched the past by understanding its potential physical experience. The connection of affect, masculinity, and drill revealed a unique historiographical possibility of affective connection to the present. Though the military, its movement, and masculinity are drastically intertwined, I believe the historiographical approach may provide new meaning and insights into other subjects. By triangulating a movement practice and a connected social ideology with its potential for affect, the scholar both affectively responds in the present and comes closer to the historical moment, which Randy Martin calls the social kinesthetic. In the Imperial Greek and Early Modern case studies, I opened affective windows to better understand military culture and how notions of hegemonic masculinity were and are the essence of military violence.

This dissertation advances research in military studies and performance studies through its analysis of a performance practice not previously explored. Precision drill is consequential as military performance because militaries use it across ceremonial practice and for entertainment,

becoming the public-facing element of all martial activities. There are military, civilian, and educational institution precision drill teams throughout the world. The practice militarizes public and civil performances. Similar to the national anthem at sports events, the military becomes an element of any event that contains a drill performance and it then colors the entire performance. Contemporary high school drill teams and marching bands even carry an undercurrent of militarization to public school events. As I have argued, precision drill is a practice that was formed in educational systems, not the military. Using the foundational elements of military drill, civilians and schools developed a spectacular and more challenging version which found its way back to the military. My investigation of precision drill could be extended beyond military teams to the broader population to ask how that militarization carries through the performance to other aspects of the population participating in the practice.

Spectacular military performances are shifting nexuses that use the complexities of drill as one of many roads of influence. As a nexus, these performances resist singular interpretations of meaning. However, I have shown that though not singular, these performances build the nation and its identity. Through my analysis of the Royal Edinburgh Military Tattoo, I have identified a deep-seated hegemonic national and cultural identity. The highland soldier character and the values he represents (mutually inclusive masculine and national values) have been deftly shaped by the English government and its military needs. I have noted the ways that the Tattoo performs that identity, placing Scottishness on martial foundations. Still, that is not the only identity in Scotland, and identity is not the only important avenue of meaning in the Tattoo. The Tattoo's interaction with the arts, both incorporated into its performance and by association through the Edinburgh Festivals, opens possibilities of artistic and hegemonic-resistant Scottish national identity. Counter tattoo depictions, such as Burke's *Black Watch*, expose prospects of a Scottish

military identity outside the highland soldier and the Tattoo as its broadcaster. Through a rhizomatic view of the Tattoo as a nexus or node of meaning, these outlier possibilities become new entry points.

As the Tattoo has not received an academic history beyond this dissertation, it continues to offer a rich source of Scottish identities. With comprehensive access to historical materials, scholars could explore the counter-hegemonic Scottish identity and its role in this popular show. I was denied access to the Tattoo's archives and believe that this influential performance of Scottish nationality is worthy of an expanded history and analysis that archival access could provide. Eileen Miller's detailed history of the Edinburgh International Festival and her history's citation in numerous academic books and articles on Scottishness or Scottish life illustrates the rich information available, exemplifies a fruitful style for a monograph on Scottish history, and proves the weight of the festival elements in general Scottish life.⁴⁰⁴ As one of the festival elements, a history of the Tattoo would build on Miller's project and reach scholars outside of the performance field that are exploring Scottish politics and culture.

Through this dissertation, I have used a rhizomatic approach to history to demonstrate that history and memory cannot be fixed but are ever changing. The power of the present to influence the past and the past to influence the present through performance establishes an ever shifting way that the nation sees itself. In Chapter Four, Pierre Nora and the many scholars that followed him establish communal memory and its carriers, *lieux de mémoire*. I expanded on sites of memory to explore how performance functions as a site of memory that, at times, holds tight and, at times, strategically shifts its surrounding national ideologies. I detailed how the 2018 Bastille Day Parade

⁴⁰⁴ Eileen Miller, *The Edinburgh International Festival 1947-1996* (Aldershot, Hants: Scholar Press, 1996).

was a product of French history and historical political control but also how one connecting event could shift and build national meaning in order to ask who creates that meaning, now and in the future. Chapter Four was challenging as a scholar due to my lack of fluency in the French Language. The expansive rhizomatic scope of many geographies in this paper limited the depth of knowledge in both language and culture to specific locations, such as France. The Bastille Day Parade is a fascinating site of all things French. Future scholars could pivot from my focus on the ideological and historical significance of the French Revolution on the Bastille Day Parade to a broader consideration of colonization and French representation. Stepping further outside hexagonal⁴⁰⁵ France with the rhizome's offshoots would provide consideration of more diverse scholarship. It may reveal significant ideological factors on the parade outside of the storming of the Bastille or the revolution.

As a person born into an army family, I have been exposed to the ritual and pageantry of military life from childhood and continue to view it through the next generation. As a choreographer and practitioner of physical theatre, I am fascinated by meaning in the body. These two performances drew me to the study of military drill. It also drew me to study drill as a form with which I had physical and visual experience but had never academically or affectively considered. The form I knew and had regularly seen, along with its surrounding pageantry, was drill from the Western tradition. By examining Western drill with its Western nationalisms and ideologies, I could use my foundational knowledge to access the vital place that drill holds in the Western military structure. However, the next phase of this project is an expansion of geography. I will research drill in spectacular military performance in the Global South, and the expansion of

⁴⁰⁵ Hexagonal France refers to the area of France on the European continent, excluding Corsica, French territories, and the rest of the francophone world.

Western military practices through colonization. In turn, I will look to physical military practices appropriated by the West from the Global South. In Chapter Two, I reference the energetic zouave drill. Though it started in Northern Africa, it was quickly assumed and adapted for French units, then spread through Europe and North America. I want to account for the travel of these movement practices globally, not only through a traditional historical account but through epistemologies of the body and colonialism. For now, I contribute this study of a physical practice that was once a battle tactic and is now entertainment to expose the significant systemic role that both the military and performance play in our lives and nations.

Bibliography

(1948).

Order 9981 issued by President Truman desegregating the military.

2017 Edinburgh International Festival Brochure. City of Edinburgh Council, 2017.

“About the 3rd U.S. Infantry Regiment.” Old Guard. Accessed June 10, 2022.
<https://www.oldguard.mdw.army.mil/regiment>.

“About.” Purdue Bands Orchestras About Comments. Accessed June 13, 2022.
<https://www.purdue.edu/bands/ensembles/aamb/about/>.

Allan, Stuart, and Allan Carswell. *The Thin Red Line: War, Empire and Visions of Scotland*. Edinburgh: National Museums of Scotland, 2004.

Alexander, Michael. “Black Watch: ‘Tragedy’ If Army Battalion Disbanded, Says Fife Chairman of Black Watch Association.” *The Courier*, November 17, 2020.

Ambrose, Stephen, Eric Jendresen, and Tom Hanks. “Curahee.” Whole. *Band of Brothers* no. Curahee. HBO, September 9, 2001.

Anderson, Benedict. *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*. London: Verso, 2006.

Angerer, Marie-Louise. “Affective Knowledge: Movement, Interval, Plasticity.” Essay. In *Timing of Affect Epistemologies of Affection*, edited by Marie-Luise Angerer. Zürich u.a: Diaphanes: Verlag nicht ermittelbar, 2014.

Angerer, Marie-Luise, Bernd Bösel, and Michaela Ott. “Introduction.” Essay. In *Timing of Affect: Epistemologies of Affection*, 1–16. Diaphanes, 2014.

Aristotle, and Richard Robinson. Essay. In *Aristotle’s Politics, Books III and IV*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1962.

Bacon, Francis. “Of the True Greatness of Kingdomes or Estates.” Essay. In *The Oxford Francis Bacon*, edited by M Kiernan, 97. Oxford: Clarendon, 1985.

Bairner, Alan. *Sport, Nationalism, and Globalization: European and North American perspectives*. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 2001.

- Ballantyne, Patricia H. *Scottish Dance Beyond 1805: Reaction and Regulation*. London: Routledge, 2020.
- Barrow, Geoffery W. S. *Robert the Bruce and the Scottish Identity*. Edinburgh: Saltire Society, 1984.
- Bassi. "Semantics of Manliness." Essay. In *Andreia: Studies in Manliness and Courage in Classical Antiquity*, edited by Ralph M. Rosen and Ineke Sluiter. Leiden: Brill, 2003.
- Bebber, Ruth Elizabeth. "A Manual for the Teaching of Exhibition Marching." Thesis, Proquest LLC, 2014.
- Beckerman, Bernard. "Spectacle in the Theatre." *Theatre Survey* 25, no. 1 (1984): 1–13. <https://doi.org/10.1017/s0040557400008176>.
- Bhabha, Homi K. *Nation and Narration*. London: Routledge, 1991.
- Bharucha, Rustom. *The Politics of Cultural Practice: Thinking through Theatre in an Age of Globalization*. New Delhi: Oxford University Press, 2003.
- Billig, Michael. *Banal Nationalism*. Los Angeles: Sage, 1995.
- Billington, Michael. "Edinburgh: A Fringe Affair with Scotland." *The Guardian*, August 2, 1996, sec. The Guardian Features Page.
- BOP Consulting, and Festivals and Events International. Rep. *Edinburgh Festivals: Thundering Hooves 2.0: A Ten Year Strategy to Sustain the Success of Edinburgh's Festivals*, 2015.
- BOP Consulting. Rep. *Edinburgh Festivals The Network Effect: The Role of the Edinburgh Festivals in the National Culture and Events Sector*, 2018.
- Bravo Goldsmith, Nestor. "Heterotopias of Power: Miners, Mapuche, and Soldiers in the Production of Utopian Chile." Essay. In *Performing Utopia*, edited by Rachel Bowdich and Pegge Vissicaro, 223–58. London: Seagull Books, 2017.
- Brennan, Teresa. *The Transmission of Affect*. Cornell University Press, 2004.
- "Brexit Vote: Nicola Sturgeon Statement in Full." BBC News, June 24, 2016. <https://www.bbc.com/news/uk-scotland-36620375>.
- Brocchetto, Marilia. "Venezuelan President Survives Apparent Drone Assassination Attempt." CNN, August 5, 2018. <https://www.cnn.com/2018/08/04/americas/venezuela-maduro/index.html>.

- Brooks, Alison Wood. "Get Excited: Reappraising Pre-Performance Anxiety as Excitement." *Journal of Experimental Psychology: General* 143, no. 3 (2014): 1144–58. <https://doi.org/10.1037/a0035325>.
- Broun, Dauvit, and R.J Finlay. *Image and Identity: the Making and Re-making of Scotland Through the Ages*. Edinburgh: John Donald Publishers, 1998.
- Bryant, Joseph M. "Military Technology and Socio-Cultural Change in the Ancient Greek City." *The Sociological Review* 38, no. 3 (1990): 484–516. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-954x.1990.tb00921.x>.
- Burke, Gregory. *Black Watch*. London: Faber And Faber, 2010.
- Burke, Gregory. *Re: Black Watch Thesis*, March 28, 2013.
- Burns, Robert. "Scots Wha Hae, or, Robert Bruce's Address to His Troops at Bannockburn by Robert Burns." Scottish Poetry Library, July 10, 2018. <https://www.scottishpoetrylibrary.org.uk/poem/scots-wha-hae-or-robert-bruces-address-his-troops-bannockburn/>.
- Bösel, Bernd. "Affective Synchronization, Rhythmanalysis, and Polyphonic Qualities of the Present Moment." Essay. In *Timing of Affect Epistemologies of Affection*, edited by Marie-Luise Angerer. Zürich u.a: Diaphanes: Verlag nicht ermittelbar, 2014.
- Cabranes-Grant, Leo. *From Scenarios to Networks: Performing the Intercultural in Colonial Mexico*. Evanston, IL: Northwestern University Press, 2016.
- Canovan, Margaret. *Populism*. New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1981.
- Castro-Klarén, Sara, and John Charles Chasteen, eds. *Beyond Imagined Communities: reading and writing the nation in nineteenth-century Latin America*. Washington: Woodrow Wilson Center Press, 2004.
- Cigainero, Jake. "Who Are France's Yellow Vest Protesters, And What Do They Want?" NPR, December 3, 2018.
- Clarke, Hilary. "29 Killed in Attack on Iranian Military Parade." CNN, October 4, 2018. <https://www.cnn.com/2018/09/22/middleeast/iran-attack-parade-intl/index.html>.
- Collard, D.F. "Edinburgh Military Tattoo 'Standing Administrative Instructions' Amendment No. 1." Edinburgh: Ministry of Works Tattoo Office, December 21, 1960.
- Commands for the Exercife of Foot, Arm'd with Fire-Lock-Muskets and Pikes; with the Evolutions*. London , 1690.

- Connolly, Joy. "Like the Labor of Heracles: Andreia and Paideia in Ancient Rome." Essay. In *Andreia: Studies in Manliness and Courage in Classical Antiquity*, edited by Ralph M. Rosen and Ineke Sluiter. Leiden: Brill, 2003.
- Craw, Victoria. "National Front Leader Marine Le Pen Tipped for French Presidential Run Following Terrorist Attacks." *News.Com.Au*. January 25, 2015.
- Davidson, Neil. *The Origins of Scottish Nationhood*. London: Pluto Press, 2000.
- Davies, EDW. "Military Directions or the Art of Training: Plainly Demonstrating How Every Good Soldier Ought to Behave in Warfare." *Printed by Edward Griffin London*, 1618.
- Davis, Tracy C. *Stages of Emergency: Cold War Nuclear civil defense*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2007.
- Deleuze, Gilles, Félix Guattari, and Brian Massumi. *A Thousand Plateaus: Capitalism and Schizophrenia*. London: Bloomsbury Academic, 1980.
- Denis, Claire. *Beau Travail*. France: Arte, Pyramid Distributions, 1999.
- Deutsch, James I. "The Blinding of Isaac Woodard." *Journal of American History* 108, no. 3 (2021): 671–72. <https://doi.org/10.1093/jahist/jaab341>.
- Dinu, Dana. "Ancient Greek Military Theory And Practice. Aeneas Tacticus (II)." *International conference KNOWLEDGE-BASED ORGANIZATION* 23, no. 2 (2017): 287–91. <https://doi.org/10.1515/kbo-2017-0129>.
- Doran, Susan. "Monarchy and Masculinity in Early Modern England." Essay. In *The Palgrave Handbook of Masculinity and Political Culture in Europe*, edited by Christopher Fletcher, Rachel E Moss, Sean Brady, and Lucy Riall, 201–24. London: Macmillers Publishers Ltd., 2018.
- Douglas, Jason. "Brexit Stirs Scottish Call For Independence Referendum." *Wall Street Journal: Eastern Edition*. April 25, 2019, sec. World News.
- Durkheim, Émile, Carol Cosman, and Mark Sydney. Cladis. *The Elementary Forms of Religious Life*. Oxford, England: Oxford University Press, 2008.
- Edensor, Tim. *National Identity, Popular Culture and Everyday Life*. Oxford: Berg, 2002.
- Edinburgh Tattoo. *Scottish Command Presents the Edinburgh Tattoo Programmes 1954-1985*. Edinburgh Tattoo, n.d.
- Imperial War Museum Archives

- Edison, Thomas A. *Arabian Gun Twirler*. *Library of Congress*. Paper Print Collection. Accessed 2022. <https://www.loc.gov/item/96515758/>.
- Elgenius, Gabriella. *Symbols of Nations and Nationalism: Celebrating Nationhood*. Basingstoke, Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan, 2019.
- Ellsworth, Elmer E. *The Zouave Drill: Being a complete manual of arms for the use of the rifled musket, with either the percussion cap or Maynard Primer: Containing also the complete manual of the sword and sabre*. Philadelphia: T.B. Peterson and Brothers, 1861.
- Evans, Tom. “Sturgeon: Scotland Will Vote Yes to Independence by Comfortable Margin.” *The Independent*, August 10, 2022. <https://www.independent.co.uk/news/uk/nicola-sturgeon-first-minister-scotland-iain-dale-scottish-government-b2142413.html>.
- Felix, Bate. “France’s Macron Marks Second Bastille Day with Champs Elysees Parade.” *Reuters*, July 14, 2018. <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-france-nationalday-parade-idUSKBN1K40GB>.
- Foster, Susan Leigh. *Choreographing Empathy: Kinesthesia in Performance*. London: Routledge, 2011.
- Foucault, Michel, and David Couzens Hoy. *Foucault: A critical reader*. New York, NY, USA: B. Blackwell, 1986.
- Foucault, Michel. *The History of Sexuality*. Translated by R. Hurley. 1976th ed. Vol. 1 *The Will to Knowledge*. Penguin , 1998.
- “The Fringe in Numbers.” *Edinburgh Festival Fringe*, August 26, 2019. <https://www.edfringe.com/learn/news-and-events/the-fringe-in-numbers>.
- Garcez, Bruno. “Mexico Independence Day Marked with Huge Military Parade.” *BBC*, September 17, 2013. <https://www.bbc.co.uk/news/av/world-latin-america-24130790/mexico-independence-day-marked-with-huge-military-parade>.
- Gardiner, Steven L. “The Warrior Ethos: Discourse and Gender in the United States Army since 9/11.” *Journal of War & Culture Studies* 5, no. 3 (2012): 371–83. https://doi.org/10.1386/jwcs.5.3.371_1.
- Gellner, Ernest. *Nations and Nationalism*. Oxford: Blackwell, 1983.
- Gherghina, Sergiu, Sergiu Mişcoiu, and Sorina Soare. In *Contemporary Populism a Controversial Concept and Its Diverse Forms*. Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2013.

- Ghobari, Mohammed, and Aziz El Yaakoubi. "Houthi Drones Kill Several at Yemeni Military Parade." Reuters, January 10, 2019. <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-yemen-security/houthi-drones-kill-several-at-yemeni-military-parade-idUSKCN1P40N9>.
- Gilbert, Helen, and Jacqueline Lo. *Performance and Cosmopolitics: Cross-cultural Transactions in Australasia*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009.
- Gold, John R, and Margaret M Gold. "The Graves of the Gallant Highlanders": Memory, Interpretation and Narratives of Culloden." *History and Memory* 19, no. 1 (2007): 5.
- Gold, John R., and Margaret M. Gold. *Festival Cities: Culture, Planning, and Urban Life*. London ; New York: Routledge, Taylor et Francis Group, 2020.
- Goldstein, Joshua S. *War and Gender: How Gender Shapes the War System and Vice Versa*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009.
- Gouge, William. *The dignitie of Chiualrie set forth in a sermon preached before the Artillery Company of London, Iune xiiij. 1626. by William Gouge, B. of diuinity and preacher of gods word, in black-friers London*. London, n.d.
- Gounaridou, Kiki. *Staging Nationalism: Essays on Theatre and National Identity*. Jefferson, NC: McFarland, 2005.
- Habkirk, Evan J. "From Indian Boys to Canadian Men? The Use of Cadet Drill in the Canadian Indian Residential School System." *British Journal of Canadian Studies* 30, no. 2 (2017): 227–48. <https://doi.org/10.3828/bjcs.2017.13>.
- Hannah, Eleanor. *Manhood, Citizenship, and the National Guard: Illinois, 1870-1917*. S.l.: Ohio State University , 2007.
- "Harry R. Gillet Will Go to Washington Today." *St. Joseph News-Press*. February 12, 1939.
- Harvie, Jen. "Cultural Effects of the Edinburgh International Festival: Elitism, Identities, Industries." *Contemporary Theatre Review* 13, no. 4 (2003): 12–26. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1048680032000118378>.
- Headquarters , TC 3-21.5 § (2021).
- Manual for Drill and Ceremonies
- Healy, Rachael. "'Someone's Making Money but Its Not Us'- the Comics Spurning the Edinburgh Fringe." *The Guardian* , July 11, 2022, sec. Comedy.
- Heath, Allister. "Remainers Are Moving Heaven and Earth – but Not the Polls." *The Telegraph*, May 11, 2016. <https://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/2016/05/11/remainers-are-moving-heaven-and-earth--but-not-the-polls/>.

- Hobsbawm, E. J., and T. O. Ranger. *The Invention of Tradition*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2017.
- Hughes, Amy. *Spectacles of Reform: Theater and Activism in Nineteenth-century America*. Ann Arbor, MI: The University of Michigan Press, 2014.
- Ichijo, Atsuko, and Anthony Smith. "Forward." Foreword. In *Scottish Nationalism and the Idea of Europe: Concepts of Europe and the Nation*. Routledge, 2016.
- Ichijo, Atsuko. *Scottish Nationalism and the Idea of Europe: Concepts of Europe and the Nation*. Routledge, 2016.
- Imre, Zoltán. "Staging the Nation: Changing Concepts of a National Theatre in Europe." *New Theatre Quarterly* 24, no. 01 (2008). <https://doi.org/10.1017/s0266464x08000079>.
- The Inspection*. United States: A24, 2022.
- Iriye, Akira. *Cultural Internationalism and World Order*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins Univ. Press, 2010.
- Jannarone, Kimberly. "Choreographing Freedom: Mass Performance in the Festivals of the French Revolution." *TDR/The Drama Review* 61, no. 2 (2017): 117–39. https://doi.org/10.1162/dram_a_00651.
- Jobs, Sebastian. *Welcome home, boys! Military victory parades in New York City 1899-1946*. Frankfurt: Campus Verlag GmbH, 2013.
- Kershaw, Baz. "Curiosity or Contempt: On Spectacle, the Human, and Activism." *Theatre Journal* 55, no. 4 (2003): 591–611.
- Kleinschmidt, Harald. "The Military and Dancing Changing Norms and Behaviour, 15th to 18th Century." *1995* 25, no. 2 (1995). <https://doi.org/10.16995/ee.843>.
- Kleinschmidt, Harald. "Using the Gun: Manual Drill and the Proliferation of Portable Firearms." *The Journal of Military History* 63, no. 3 (1999): 601. <https://doi.org/10.2307/120497>.
- Knowles, Richard Paul. *Theatre & Interculturalism*. London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010.
- Kringelbach, Hélène Neveu. *Dancing Cultures: Globalization, Tourism and Identity in the Anthropology of Dance*. New York: Berghahn Books, 2012.
- König, Alice. "Tactical Interactions Dialogues between Greece and Rome in the Military Manuals of Aelian and Arrian." Essay. In *Literature and Culture in the Roman Empire, 96-235: Cross-Cultural Interactions*, edited by Rebecca Langlands and James Uden, 134–56. Cambridge, United Kingdom: Cambridge University Press, 2020.

- Laclau, Ernesto. *On Populist Reason*. London: Verso, 2018.
- Lawrence, David R. "Great Yarmouth's Exercise: Honour, Masculinity, and Civic Military Performance in Early Stuart England." Essay. In *Worth and Repute: Valuing Gender in Late Medieval and Early Modern Europe: Essays in Honour of Barbara Todd*, edited by Barbara J. Todd, Kim Kippen, and Lori Woods, 367–91. Toronto: Centre for Reformation and Renaissance Studies, 2011.
- Lawrence, David R. "The Complete Soldier: Military Books and Military Culture in Early Stuart England, 1603-1645." Dissertation, Brill, 2009.
- Lei, Daphne P. "Interruption, Intervention, Interculturalism: Robert Wilson's HIT Productions in Taiwan." *Theatre Journal* 63, no. 4 (2011): 571–86. <https://doi.org/10.1353/tj.2011.0118>.
- Lendon, Brad. "Russia Having Difficulty Making New Weapons, but Might Have Enough Older Ones, Report Says." CNN, April 19, 2023. <https://www.cnn.com/2023/04/19/europe/russia-weapons-production-report-intl-hnk-ml/index.html>.
- Macias, Amanda. "Trump's Military Parade Is Estimated to Cost \$92 Million – \$80 Million More than Earlier Estimate." CNBC, April 5, 2019. <https://www.cnbc.com/2018/08/16/trump-military-parade-expected-to-cost-80-million-more-than-estimated.html>.
- Martin, Randy. "A Precarious Dance, a Derivative Sociality." *TDR/The Drama Review* 56, no. 4 (2012): 62–77.
- Martin, Randy. *Critical Moves: Dance Studies in Theory and Politics*. Durham, NC: Duke Univ. Press, 1998.
- Martin, Randy. *The Oxford Handbook of Dance and Politics*. Edited by Rebekah J. Kowal and Gerald Siegmund. New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2019.
- Massumi, Brian. *Parables for the Virtual: Movement, Affect, Sensation*. Durham: Duke University Press, 2021.
- Matthew, Christopher Anthony, Aelianus, and Brian Bosworth. "Forward." Foreword. In *The Tactics of Aelian: Or on the Military Arrangements of the Greeks: A New Translation of the Manual That Influenced Warfare for Fifteen Centuries*. Barnsley: Pen & Sword Military, 2012.
- Matthew, Christopher Anthony, and Aelianus. *The Tactics of Aelian or on the Military Arrangements of the Greeks: a New Translation of the Manual that Influenced Warfare for Fifteen Centuries*. Barnsley: Pen & Sword Military, 2012.

- Mazey, Paul. "The March: Military and Ceremonial Music." Essay. In *British Film Music: Musical Traditions in British Cinema, 1930s 1950s*. S.l.: Palgrave Macmillan, 2020.
- McArthur, Colin. *Scotch Reels: Scotland in Cinema and Television*. London: British Film Institute, 1982.
- McClary, Susan. *Structures of Feeling in Seventeenth-Century Cultural Expression*. Toronto, Ont: University of Toronto Press, 2013.
- McConachie, Bruce A., and Tobin Nellhaus. *Theatre Histories: An Introduction*. Abingdon (Oxon): Routledge, 2016.
- McCrone, David, and Gayle McPherson. *National Days: Constructing and Mobilising National Identity*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009.
- McIvor, Charlotte. "Introduction." Essay. In *Interculturalism and Performance: New Directions?*, edited by Jason King . Cham: pelgrave macmillan, 2019.
- McNeill, William Hardy. *Keeping Together in Time: Dance and Drill in Human History*. New York, USA: ACLS History E-Book, 2013.
- Melin, Mats, and Jennifer Shoonover. *Dance Legacies of Scotland: The True Glen Orchy Kick*. New York, NY: Routledge, 2021.
- Melin, Mats. "Step Dancing in Cape Breton: Contrasting Contexts and Creative Process." *MUSICultures* 40, no. 1 (2013): 35–56.
- Menon, Jisha. *Performance of Nationalism: India, Pakistan, and the Memory of Partition*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2018.
- Miceli, Maria, Cristiano Castelfranchi, and Andrew Ortony. *Expectancy and Emotion*. Oxford u.a.: Oxford Univ. Press, 2015.
- Miller, Eileen. *The Edinburgh International Festival 1947-1996*. Aldershot, Hants: Scholar Press, 1996.
- Miller, William L., and Asifa Hussain. *Multicultural Nationalism: Islamophobia, Anglophobia, and Devolution*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2006.
- Moore, Emma. "Women in Combat: Five-Year Status Update." Center for a New American Security (en-US), March 31, 2020.
<https://www.cnas.org/publications/commentary/women-in-combat-five-year-status-update>.

- Mosse, George L. *The Nationalization of the Masses: Political Symbolism and Mass Movements in Germany From the Napoleonic Wars Through the Third Reich* George L. Mosse. New York: H. Fertig, 1975.
- Most Honourable Privy Counsaile. *Instructions for the Musters and Armes and Use Thereof*. London: Bonham Norton and John Bill Printers of the King, 1626.
- Newton, Michael Steven. *Warriors of the Word: the World of the Scottish Highlanders*. Edinburgh: Origin, 2019.
- Newton, Michael. "The Hidden History of Highland Dance." Michael Newton © 2012 the hidden history of highland dance, 2012.
https://www.krhighland.com/uploads/6/3/3/7/6337854/the_hidden_history_of_highland_dance__2_.pdf.
- Office of the Undersecretary of Defense. "Demographics of the U.S. Military." Council on Foreign Relations, July 13, 2020. <https://www.cfr.org/backgroundunder/demographics-us-military#chapter-title-0-8>.
- Penman, Michael A. "Robert Bruce's Bones: Reputations, Politics and Identities in Nineteenth-Century Scotand." *International Review of Scottish Studies* 34 (2009).
<https://doi.org/10.21083/irss.v34i0.1075>.
- Redcoat. "Site for Edinburgh Tattoo: Objections to the Castle Esplanade." *The Scotsman*. June 21, 1955, sec. Points of View.
- Reeser, Todd W. *Masculinities in Theory: An Introduction*. Hoboken, NJ: John Wiley & Sons, 2010.
- Reid, R. "National War Museum." Edinburgh: Edinburgh Castle, n.d.
- Reinke-Williams, Tim. "Manhood and Masculinity in Early Modern England." *History Compass* 12, no. 9 (2014): 685–93.
- Ritzer, George. *Globalization: a Basic Text*. Chichester, West Sussex: John Wiley & Sons, Inc., 2015.
- Roberts, Michael. "Military Revolutions, 1560-1660." Essay. In *Military Revolution Debate: Readings on the Military Transformation of Early Modern Europe*, edited by CLIFFORD J. ROGERS. S.l.: ROUTLEDGE, 2019.
- The Royal Edinburgh Military Tattoo. *The Royal Edinburgh Military Tattoo 2017: Splash of Tartan*. Musselburgh, Scotland: Ivanhoe Printing Co. Ltd., 2017.
- "The Royal Edinburgh Military Tattoo: History of the Tattoo." Royal Edinburgh Military Tattoo. Accessed July 12, 2022. <https://www.edintattoo.co.uk/history>.

- “The Royal Edinburgh Military Tattoo: History of the Tattoo.” Royal Edinburgh Military Tattoo. Accessed May 17, 2023.
<https://www.edintattoo.co.uk/history#:~:text=In%201950%20the%20first%20Edinburgh,was%20the%20first%20Tattoo%20Producer.>
- “Russia’s Victory Day Takes on New Importance for the Kremlin This Year.” Episode. *Weekend Edition Sunday*. Washington, DC: NPR, May 8, 2022.
[https://www.npr.org/2022/05/08/1097184192/russia-victory-day-2022.](https://www.npr.org/2022/05/08/1097184192/russia-victory-day-2022)
- Savigliano, Marta. *Tango and the Political Economy of Passion*. New York, NY: Routledge, 1995.
- Schechner, Richard, and Sara Brady. *Performance Studies: an Introduction*. New York: Routledge, 2013.
- Schneider, Rebecca. *Performing Remains: Art and War in Times of Theatrical Reenactment*. Abingdon, Oxon: Routledge, 2011.
- Sedgwick, Eve Kosofsky. *Epistemology of the Closet*. Berkely and Los Angeles,, CA: University of California Press, 2008.
- Serrano González, Raquel. “The Double Marriage: A Gendered Approach to Politics and Power.” Essay. In *(Re)Defining Gender in Early Modern English Drama Power, Sexualities and Ideologies in Text and Performance*, edited by Laura Martínez-García and María José Álvarez-Faedo. Bern: Peter Lang AG, Internationaler Verlag der Wissenschaften, 2021.
- Shaviro, Steven. *The Cinematic Body*. Minneapolis, Minn: Univ. of Minnesota Press, 2011.
- Shepard, Alexandra. *Meanings of Manhood in Early Modern England*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008.
- Skey, Michael. “The National in Everyday Life: A Critical Engagement with Michael Billig’s Thesis of Banal Nationalism.” *The Sociological Review* 57, no. 2 (2009): 331–46.
[https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-954x.2009.01832.x.](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-954x.2009.01832.x)
- Smith, Anthony D. *Theories of Nationalism*. London: Duckworth, 1983.
- Smout, T.C. “Perspectives on the Scottish Identity.” *Scottish Affairs* 6 (First Series, no. 1 (1994): 101–13. [https://doi.org/10.3366/scot.1994.0010.](https://doi.org/10.3366/scot.1994.0010)
- Sponsler, Claire. “Writing the Unwritten: Morris Dance and Theatre History.” Essay. In *Representing the Past: Essays in Performance Historiography*, edited by Thomas Postlewait and Charlotte Canning. Iowa City: University of Iowa Press, 2010.

- Staley, Seward Charle. *Marching Tactics, for use in Physical Education*. New York: A.S. Barnes, 1938.
- Strachan, Hew. "Scotland's Military Identity." *Scottish Historical Review* 85, no. 2 (2006): 315–32. <https://doi.org/10.3366/shr.2007.0026>.
- Stephens, Angharad Closs. *The Persistence of Nationalism: From Imagined Communities to Urban Encounters*. London: Routledge, 2014.
- Sun Tzu. *The Art of War*. Translated by Griffith Samuel B. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1963.
- "Support the National Theatre of Scotland." National Theatre of Scotland, July 1, 2022. <https://www.nationaltheatrescotland.com/support-us>.
- Sweeney, Simon. *Europe, the State, and Globalisation*. Harlow: Pearson/Longman, 2005.
- "The Tattoo Should Be Free Says the Lord Provost: The Ideal Location - Holyrood." *The Scotman*, August 28, 1959.
- Taylor, Diana. *Disappearing Acts: Spectacles of Gender and Nationalism in Argentina's "Dirty War"*. Durham, NC: Duke Univ. Pr., 2005.
- Taylor, Diana. "Performance and/as History." *TDR/The Drama Review* 50, no. 1 (2006): 67–86. <https://doi.org/10.1162/dram.2006.50.1.67>.
- Taylor, Diana. *The Archive and the Repertoire: Performing Cultural Memory in the Americas*. Durham: Duke University Press, 2007.
- Trevor-Roper, H. R. *The Invention of Scotland: Myth and History*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2014.
- Trost, Wiebke. "Time Flow and Musical Emotions in the Role of Rhythmic Entrainment." Essay. In *Timing of Affect Epistemologies of Affection*, edited by Marie-Luise Angerer. Zürich u.a: Diaphanes: Verlag nicht ermittelbar, 2014.
- Turner, Victor W. *From Ritual to Theatre: the Human Seriousness of Play*. New York: PAJ, 1982.
- "U.S. Army Drill Team ." US Army Drill Team. Accessed June 16, 2022. <https://www.oldguard.mdw.army.mil/specialty-platoons/us-drill-team>.
- U.S. Army Research Institute for the Behavioral and Social Sciences, Gary Riccio, Randy Sullivan, Gerald Klein, Margaret Salter, and Henry Kinnison, *Warrior Ethos: Analysis of the Concept and Initial Development of Application* § (n.d.).

- “Unit Home.” Silent Drill Platoon. Accessed June 13, 2022.
<https://www.barracks.marines.mil/Units/Company-A/Silent-Drill-Platoon/>.
- United States Army Drill Team at Twilight Tattoo. YouTube.* YouTube, 2019.
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=_UY7xmB7jho.
- Uzelac, Gordana. “National Ceremonies: The Pursuit of Authenticity.” *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 33, no. 10 (2010): 1718–36.
- Wade, Nicholas. “English, Irish, Scots: They’re All One ,” n.d.
- Wastie, W.V. Letter to Minister. Edinburgh: Headquarters, Scottish Command, September 10, 1959.
- Watson, Ariel. “Birnam Wood: Scotland, Nationalism, and Theatres of War.” *Theatre History Studies* 33, no. 1 (2014): 226–49. <https://doi.org/10.1353/ths.2014.0027>.
- Watson, Fiona. “Enigmatic Lion: Scotland, Kingship and National Identity in the Wars of Independence.” Essay. In *Image and Identity: Making and Re-Making of Scotland through the Ages*, edited by Dauvit Brown, Richard J Finlay, and Michael Lynch. John Donald, 1998.
- Whitman, James Q. *The Verdict of Battle the Law of Victory and the Making of Modern War*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2012.
- Wickman, Matthew. *The Ruins of Experience: Scotland’s “Romantick” Highlands and the Birth of the Modern Witness*. Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2011.
- Williams, Raymond. *Marxism and Literature*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1977.
- Williams, Vivien Estelle. “The Bagpipe and Romanticism: Perceptions of Ossianic ‘Northernness.’” *European Romantic Review* 27, no. 4 (2016): 459–73.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/10509585.2016.1190088>.
- Wilmer, S. E., and Michael Coveney. “The National Theatre and Civic Responsibility in the British Isles.” In *National Theatres in a Changing Europe*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008.
- Young, Mitchell. *Nationalism in a Global Era: the Persistence of Nations*. London: Routledge, 2011.