

**A MODERN ENCOUNTER BETWEEN CHINESE BUDDHISM AND PERIODICAL
PUBLISHING**

by

Lianghao Lu

Bachelor of Arts, Renmin University of China, 2011

Submitted to the Graduate Faculty of the
Kenneth P. Dietrich School of Arts and Sciences in partial fulfillment
of the requirements for the degree of
Master of Arts

University of Pittsburgh

2014

UNIVERSITY OF PITTSBURGH
KENNETH P. DIETRICH SCHOOL OF ARTS AND SCIENCES

This thesis was presented

by

Lianghao Lu

It was defended on

April 7, 2014

and approved by

Dr. Clark Chilson, Associate Professor, Department of Religious Studies

Dr. Evelyn Rawski, University Professor, Department of History

Committee Chair: Dr. Linda Penkower, Associate Professor, Department of Religious Studies

Copyright © by Lianghao Lu

2014

A MODERN ENCOUNTER BETWEEN CHINESE BUDDHISM AND PERIODICAL PUBLISHING

Lianghao Lu, M.A

University of Pittsburgh, 2014

This thesis contends that the encounter between Chinese Buddhism and the periodical publication industry played a crucial part in the reform and transformation of Buddhism in late nineteenth- and early twentieth-century China. By delineating Buddhism's initial encounter with modern print technology and the subsequent development of Buddhist periodical publications, this thesis highlights the ways in which the monastic community used modern print technology to spread the voice of Buddhism in this era of drastic social change. Buddhist print culture also serves to illustrate another historical reality often neglected when studying modern Chinese Buddhism: the initiative of the Buddhist monastic order to participate in social transformation as well as Buddhist reform by combating the continuing degradation caused by national and ideological crises. Taking prominent Buddhist monks such as Zongyang, Yinguang, and Taixu as examples of various manners of engaging with periodical publication, this thesis reveals the different strategies implemented by the Buddhist sangha and the mixed attitudes they held toward modern communication techniques. The thesis ends by discussing advertisements printed in early twentieth-century Buddhist periodicals, which present a picture of a prosperous, active, and vivified—but not unified—Buddhist community which not only served its own members but also adapted to a changing social environment that incentivized proposals for both reform and preservation of Chinese Buddhism.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF TABLE	VII
LIST OF FIGURES	VIII
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	IX
1.0 INTRODUCTION.....	1
1.1 RESEARCH GOALS	5
1.2 METHODOLOGY AND LITERATURE REVIEW	8
1.3 STRUCTURE OF THE THESIS	13
2.0 PERIODICALS AS THE PLATFORM FOR A MODERN CHINESE ENLIGHTENMENT	16
2.1 PERIODICALS IN CHINESE HISTORY	17
2.2 WESTERN JOURNALS IN NINETEENTH-CENTURY CHINA	18
2.3 THE EFFORTS OF CHINESE INTELLECTUALS.....	21
3.0 INITIAL ENCOUNTER WITH AND THE VOICE OF BUDDHISM IN PERIODICALS.....	25
3.1 ZONGYANG: “AN EXTRAORDINARY MONK”	26
3.2 ZONGYANG’S MESSAGE TO SOCIETY	28
3.3 TURNING TO THE BUDDHIST COMMUNITY.....	32

4.0	THE FLOURISHING OF BUDDHIST PERIODICALS AND THE MESSAGE OF MODERNITY.....	38
4.1	TAIXU’S BUDDHIST PERIODICAL PUBLISHING ACTIVITIES.....	39
4.2	A COMPARISON BETWEEN TAIXU AND YINGUANG.....	43
5.0	A WINDOW INTO THE BUDDHIST COMMUNITY: ADVERTISEMENTS IN BUDDHIST PERIODICALS.....	48
5.1	TYPES OF ADVERTISEMENTS IN SHANGHAI BUDDHIST PERIODICALS	49
5.2	THE BUDDHIST COMMUNITY BEHIND THE ADVERTISEMENTS.....	57
5.3	ADVERTISING FOR THE MODERNIZATION OF BUDDHISM	64
6.0	CONCLUSION.....	69
	LIST OF CITED BUDDHIST PERIODICALS.....	73
	FIGURES.....	76
	BIBLIOGRAPHY	81

LIST OF TABLE

Table 1: Cited Buddhist Periodicals..... 72

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1: Advertisement in the first issue of <i>Foxue congbao</i>	76
Figure 2: Advertisement for <i>Haichao yin</i>	77
Figure 3: Advertisement for Tianchu Gourmet Powder	78
Figure 4: Advertisement for Tianchu Gourmet Powder.....	79
Figure 5: Advertisement for a gourmet power by “Taixu”	80

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

- MFQ *Minguo fojiao qikan wenxian jicheng* 民国佛教期刊文献集成
- MFQB *Minguo fojiao qikan wenxian jicheng bubian* 民国佛教期刊文献集成补编

1.0 INTRODUCTION

One night in February 1912, a group of monks and workmen, led by monk Shuangting 霜亭, one of the original managers of Jinshan Temple 金山寺 in Zhenjiang, Jiangsu Province, fought its way into the office of the Association for the Advancement of Buddhism (Fojiao xiejinhui 佛教协进会) to regain control of the temple from Taixu 太虚, Renshan 仁山,¹ and other Buddhist reformer-monks who had taken over the temple in the name of the Association two months earlier. Taixu was in Nanjing at the time of the attack, but Renshan and others were wounded with knives and clubs. Renshan escaped, however, and later went with Taixu to the Jiangsu provincial government office and had Shuangting and other conservative monks arrested. When Mengping 萌屏, the supervisor 监院 of Jinshan Temple, who at the time of the attack was fighting the reformer-monks agenda before the local government, returned to find the temple in chaos and without management, he went straight away to Shanghai and petitioned Zongyang 宗仰, the former abbot of Jinshan Temple, to pacify the chaos.²

¹ Renshan 仁山 (1881-1951) should not be confused with Yang Wenhui (1837-1911) whose courtesy name is also Renshan. Jinshan Temple refers to the major temple on Mt. Jinshan, aka Jiangtian Chan Temple 江田禅寺. Renshan was trained in a smaller temple in Jinshan, called Guanyin Ge 观音阁, and was regularly taunted by his counterparts in Jiangtian Temple. So when Taixu, Renshan and other reform monks took over the temple, monks in Jiangtian Temple were of mixed minds. For more information see Edward S. Krebs, *Shifu, Soul of Chinese Anarchism* (Lanham, Md: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, 1998), 229-230; Fang Zuyou 方祖猷, *Tiantaizong Guanzongjiang sizhi 1912-1949* 天台宗观宗讲寺志, 1912-1949 (Guanzongjiao Temple of Tiantai Buddhism, 1912-1949) (Beijing: Zongjiao wenhua chubanshe, 2006), 72-75.

² See Taixu's biography in *Lidai gaoseng zhuan* 历代高僧传 (Biographies of Eminent Monks in Chinese History), edited by Li Shan 李山 and Guo Changbao 过常宝 (Shanghai: Shandong renmin chubanshe, 1994); cf. Don A. Pittman, *Toward a Modern Chinese Buddhism*, chapter 2 (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2001); Holmes Welch, *The Buddhist Revival in China*

This incident, which Holmes Welch calls the “Invasion of Chin Shan [Jin Shan],” encapsulates the tension within the Buddhist community in the early years of twenty-first-century China. As the nation was involving itself in world events and undertaking projects of modernization in many areas, Chinese Buddhism likewise sat on the horns of a dilemma: transform to a modern form or insist on a traditional structure. What happened at Jinshan Temple in 1912 was a collapse at the intersection of these two alternatives. However, my interest here is not in the incident *per se* or in the power struggle for leadership within the Buddhist community. Rather, I wish to focus on the use of new and modern media bringing reform by two of the monks involved in the above incident—Zongyang (1865-1921) and Taixu (1890-1947). Taixu is well known for his idea of “humanistic Buddhism” 人间佛教, espousal of a full reform of Buddhism, efforts to create a world Buddhism, and active engagement with Buddhist publications. Zongyang, although less famous than his younger contemporary, was known for his artistic talents and editorial work on the *Pinjia jingshe dazangjing* 频伽精舍大藏经 (Kalaviṅka Hermitage Canon), the first letterpress edition of the Buddhist canon in China.³ Both of these figures were advocates for Buddhist reform and both engaged with the modern periodical and newspaper industry, making them monk-pioneers in journal publishing.

It may seem normal nowadays to find Chinese monks publishing in newspapers and periodicals and to have periodicals and newspapers exclusively dedicated to Buddhism. However, these practices were not at all common in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. Buddhism in that era faced many obstacles, one of which was that simply being a monk could damage one’s reputation. Joining the clergy was perceived not only as an escape

(Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1968), 28-33.

³ Liu Lin 刘凌 and Wu Shiyu 吴士余, eds., *Zhongguo xueshu mingci dacidian jinxiandai juan* 中国学术名著大词典近现代卷 (Dictionary of China Scholarly Terminologies Volume of Modern Era) (Shanghai: Hanyu dacidian chubanshe, 2001), 120-121.

from one's responsibilities, but also as a choice to be an "idler" in society.⁴ Furthermore, the popularity of Chan and Pure Land Buddhism, a trend inherited from the Ming dynasty (1368-1644), led Buddhists to focus more on the individual and other-worldly concerns⁵ than on active participation in secular affairs, leading to the popular impression of Buddhism as secluded and distant from the public sphere. Even Yang Wenhui 杨文会 (1837-1911), regarded as "the father of modern Buddhist revival,"⁶ did not engage much with social and secular issues but rather focused on preserving sutras (scriptures) and forming a modern sangha (Buddhist monastic community) education system. Therefore, Zongyang, who was engaged in newspaper publishing as early as 1901, and Taixu, who founded one of the longest-running Chinese Buddhist periodicals in 1920, have become important linchpins for tracing the use of modern media in the development of modern Chinese Buddhism. Although various intellectuals were genuinely interested in Buddhism and Buddhist philosophy in the late Qing (1644-1911) and early Republican (1911-1849) periods, few voices were heard from among the Buddhist clergy themselves in those discourses. However, by examining the print culture of Buddhism in that era, and in particular by tracing the publishing activities of Zongyang and Taixu, hitherto overlooked clerical perspectives on their engagement with the society can be revealed.

One important consequence of the fledging Buddhist print culture was how it affected monastic leadership within Buddhism. Through much of its history, religious authority in Chinese Buddhism had been derived from both state patronage and lineage. State patronage included financial sponsorship as well as involvement in monastic disputes, as in the case where Emperor Yongzheng 雍正 (r. 1722-1735) condemned Hanyue Fazang's 汉月法藏 (1573-1635)

⁴ Sin-Wai Chan, *Buddhism in Late Ch'ing Political Thought* (Hong Kong: Chinese University of Hong Kong, 1985), 16.

⁵ *Ibid.*, 18.

⁶ See Francesca Tarocco, *The Cultural Practices of Modern Chinese Buddhism: Attuning the Dharma* (London: Taylor & Francis, 2012), 10, and Shan Chun, *Major Aspects of Chinese Religion and Philosophy* (DE: Springer Verlag, 2012), 18.

treatise on the Linji Chan lineage one hundred years after the latter's dispute with his dharma master Minyun Yuanwu 密云圆悟 (1522-1642). The emperor exerted state power to ban the circulation of Hanyue Fazang's treatise.⁷ As for lineage, various Buddhist schools, including Tiantai and Chan, developed the notion of "patriarch" (zu, 祖), a monk perceived as the "spiritual heir of the Buddha."⁸ Hence almost all biographies of eminent monks from the medieval period onwards identify their subjects with certain schools, each with its founding line of patriarchs or creation stories. This category of school or sectarian identity serves to remind disciples and readers alike of the religious authority of orthodoxy and succession within traditions, and emphasizes those recognized as heirs or patriarchs of a certain line of succession. However, the situation changed drastically in the late Qing, when monastic Buddhism declined due to its aforementioned diminishing reputation and perceived disengagement, as well as wars, beginning with the Taiping Rebellion (1850-1864), during which the Qing government moved to expropriate temple property for the establishment of new schools. Many prominent monks in this era, including Zongyang and Taixu, came from indistinct Buddhist backgrounds (i.e., had no or loose association with a particular lineage), yet still received wide recognition from both the sangha and the laity.⁹ One factor contributing to this recognition was the advent of Buddhist publications, which enabled a broader audience to receive messages and sermons while developing devotion to Buddhism through following particular Buddhist figures in print.

⁷ Jiang Wu, *Enlightenment in Dispute: The Reinvention of Chan Buddhism in Seventeenth-Century China* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008), 163-86.

⁸ Elizabeth Morrison, *The Power of Patriarchs: Qisong and Lineage in Chinese Buddhism* (Leiden: Brill, 2010), 2.

⁹ More biographical information about Zongyang and Taixu will be provided in Chapters 3 and 4.

1.1 RESEARCH GOALS

This thesis follows two threads to explore the dynamics of change in modern Chinese Buddhism. One thread is that of modern monastic history. For many scholars, a modern Buddhist clergy only enters the picture after the fall of the Qing dynasty. The formation of many national associations by monks to negotiate with the government on behalf of Buddhism is a primary focus for scholars like Holmes Welch, David Palmer, Vincent Goossaert and Yoshiko Ashiwa. However, emphasis on the activities of these post-Qing associations inadvertently implies a negative value on the existence of monastic Buddhism in the late Qing and suggests that clerical history in modern Chinese Buddhism was interrupted, only to resurface after the 1911 Revolution.

Although monastic Buddhism in the late Qing cannot compare with its situation in the Southern and Northern Dynasties 南北朝 (420-589) and its heyday in the Sui 隋 (581-619) and Tang dynasties 唐 (618-907),¹⁰ it still existed and accumulated great power, playing a role in the later revival and flourishing of Buddhism in the Republican era. The leadership role in discussions of Buddhist doctrine and philosophy gradually transferred from the clergy to lay devotees and intellectuals during the Qing dynasty, particularly in the late Qing, when intellectuals were trying to find a substitute for the ruling Confucian ideology. Many of them, such as Gong Zizhen 龚自珍 (1792-1841), Wei Yuan 魏源 (1794-1857), Kang Youwei 康有为 (1858-1927), Tan Sitong 谭嗣同 (1865-1898), and Liang Qichao 梁启超 (1873-1929), set their eyes on Buddhist thought.¹¹ All these intellectuals, to a greater or lesser extent, sought and found

¹⁰ David Curtis Wright, *The History of China* (Santa Barbara: Greenwood, 2011), 63.

¹¹ See Chan, *Buddhism in Late Ch'ing Political Thought*, 29-53.

certain answers in Buddhist thought and then applied these answers to their own ideas for the construction of a new nation. They were the leading voices in early modern China on issues of reform and revolution, and their influence extended back into the Buddhist community, overshadowing the influence of the Buddhist clergy. This is what led to the impression of the non-existence of a monastic community. Yet the situation was more complex than it seemed. It is true that the Buddhist clergy did not contribute much to proposals for the nation in its critical moments of survival during the early twentieth century, but this does not mean that it turned its back on what was happening in Chinese society. Due to several catastrophes and government control over the sangha,¹² a majority of the clergy did not receive the kind of education their predecessors had or were not from cultural backgrounds similar to their predecessors; however, Zongyang still managed to participate in the discussion on the fate of the nation and followed the general intellectual trend that proposed a thorough change for the nation.¹³ Therefore, the first goal of this thesis is to fill in the blanks of the history of the social engagement of monastic Buddhism in the modern era.

The second goal is to explore the interaction between a new kind of print culture, namely newspaper and periodical publications, and the revival or reappearance of a mass Buddhist community. The revolution of modern Chinese print culture was triggered by clergy, although not Buddhists but rather Protestant missionaries, who brought both the technique of mechanical

¹² One of the catastrophes for Buddhism in the late Qing is the Taiping rebellion, as the Taiping regime destroyed temples and burned Buddhist texts in its territory, and note more information about the rebellion's influence on Buddhism can be found in Hu Siyong 胡思庸, "Taiping Tianguo yu Fojiao 太平天国与佛教 (Taiping Rebellion and Buddhism)" in *Taiping Tianguo Shilun Wenji* 太平天国史论文集 (Collections of Historical Essays on Taiping Rebellion), edited by Guangxi Taiping Tianguoshi Yanjiuhui 广西太平天国史研究会 (Guangdong: Guangdong renmin chubanshe, 1983), 263-281. For governmental control over Buddhism, see Yifa, *The Origins of Buddhist Monastic Codes in China: An Annotated Translation and Study of the Chanyuan Qinggui* (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2002), 74.

¹³ More discussion about Zongyang's political activities can be found in chapter 3.

printing and the form of the modern press to China in 1815.¹⁴ In the beginning, these missionaries, such as Robert Morrison (1782-1834) and William Milne (1785-1822) whose base was mainly in Malacca and Macau, led the development of the mechanical industry by issuing various books, periodicals, and newspapers, the spread of which infiltrated from coastal areas to regional centers of the countryside. However, as Christopher Reed suggests, “Missionaries were not axial to later developments.”¹⁵ The Christian message, though it still existed in the late nineteenth century, had gradually been replaced in modern publications with the introduction of Western science,¹⁶ and later with the advocacy of Western ideologies like the notion of citizenship, the rights of the people, constitutional monarchy, and other political and social ideas. It was during this time that intellectuals such as those mentioned above made their voices heard by taking advantage of the modern printing industry and publishing their work in periodicals and newspapers. As these media forms allowed for a much easier, wider and quicker transmission of ideas, it is fair to assert that, without these media, the resulting ideological contentions would have been less fierce and less widespread. Again, however, Buddhist voices, although seldom heard from in these media, are rarely mentioned or studied by historians of the period—at least not until 1912, when the first Buddhist periodical appeared. Does this mean that Buddhist clergy were not involved in these conversations until the fall of the Qing house? Certainly not. Although their voices were smaller and less innovative than those of intellectuals like Kang Youwei and Liang Qichao, Buddhist monks were participants in the reform discourse. Moreover, after the establishment of the Republic of China in 1911, when Buddhism finally began to engage in modern press publishing, the sudden appearance of massive numbers of

¹⁴ See Christopher A. Reed, *Gutenberg in Shanghai: Chinese Print Capitalism, 1876-1937* (Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 2011), 25-32, and Xiantao Zhang, *The Origins of the Modern Chinese Press: The Influence of the Protestant Missionary Press in Late Qing China* (London: Taylor & Francis, 2007), 35-39.

¹⁵ Reed, *Gutenberg in Shanghai*, 26.

¹⁶ Zhang, *The Origins of the Modern Chinese Press*, 50-52.

journals and other printed materials for mass consumption suggests a boom in the growth of the Buddhist community or at least a concerted move for more social involvement. In this thesis, therefore, I explore the flourishing of Buddhist periodical publications, the ways those publications advanced the authority of certain Buddhist monks and gained for their teachings a wider audience, and the ways these phenomena helped lead to a revival of Chinese Buddhism in the modern era.

1.2 METHODOLOGY AND LITERATURE REVIEW

Holmes Welch in *The Buddhist Revival in China* sets out a timeframe for the discussion of modern Chinese Buddhism, which he suggests started in the 1860s with Yang Wenhui.¹⁷ Scholars who have researched similar topics generally follow Welch's timeline. I also situate my two subjects, modern monastic Buddhism and Buddhist print culture, within this framework because it captures the vital period of modern Chinese Buddhism in terms of its encounter with the discourse on modernity. However, due to my focus on the monastic order of Buddhism, my timeframe here starts at the very end of the nineteenth century, when the Qing government lost the first Sino-Japanese War (1894-1895), causing the total destruction of traditional Confucian ideology and accelerating intellectual attempts to save the nation by adopting Western political and social ideas.

¹⁷ Welch, *The Buddhist Revival in China*, 2.

The majority of my research data comes from “new media” publications, including newspapers and periodicals. Between 1815 and 1911, at least 1,753 Chinese journals and 136 foreign language journals appeared in China,¹⁸ many of which have been collected in the *Wanqing qikan quanwen shujuku* 晚清期刊全文数据库 (Database of Late Qing Periodicals). Together they provide a comprehensive description of political affairs, issues of concern, and vicissitudes of the social landscape of the time, and contain valuable information about how monastic Buddhism was perceived as well as the activities of the Buddhist clergy. For the time period after 1911, data on a total of 233 Buddhist periodicals can be found in the *Minguo Fojiao qikan wenxian jicheng* 民国佛教期刊文献集成 (Collection of Republican-Era Buddhist Periodical Literature) and its supplement. Besides Buddhist periodicals, the National Digital Library of China also provides a database of other journals of the Republican Era, totally 4,351 to date.¹⁹ All these databases, as well as other primary source collections of particular historical figures, including governmental officials and intellectuals during that era, serve as resources for exploring the dynamics between media publication and the writings of monastic Buddhist figures, and for examining the reception of these writings and the medium by and interactions among lay Buddhists, Buddhist figures and other literati, and others from various social backgrounds.

To pursue the two goals of examining the social involvement of monastic Buddhists during the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries and the mutual influence of Buddhist print materials on the clerical and lay Buddhist communities, I apply two strategies. The first is to analyze the modern intellectual history of China, which was represented by an ethos of

¹⁸ Shi He 史和, Yao Fuzhong 姚福中 and Ye Cuidi 叶翠娣, eds. *Zhongguo jindai baokan minglu* 中国近代报刊名录 (Index of Modern Chinese Journals) (Fuzhou: Fujian renmin chubanshe, 1991), 1-2.

¹⁹ See <http://mylib.nlc.gov.cn/web/guest/minguoqikan>.

revolution and evolutionism. Under the general theme of creating social change, modern Chinese intellectuals introduced Western scientific methods, which are largely based on empirical conclusions from modern scientific observations, as replacements for traditional modes of Chinese thought; a political emphasis on individual rights and freedoms; and ideologies of nationalism advocating the formation of a modern state. I explore how Buddhist monks, exemplified by Zongyang, participated in this discussion, bringing Buddhism to the public's attention and setting an example of engaging social affairs for other reform monks who came after him, like Taixu's generation, thereby enabling Buddhism to compete with other religions such as Christianity.

The second strategy I employ is the paradigm of constructing an evolving notion of a modern Buddhism, examining the multifaceted transformations that occurred within Chinese Buddhism, including changes in Buddhist–state relations, the emphasis on attending to the concerns of the secular world, the evolution of leadership within the sangha, and the absorption and adaptation of Western rationalist ideology in dealing with issues of science, individual rights, and democracy. What scholars usually term the “reform of Chinese Buddhism” in the modern era encompasses various real changes, but two general trends of reform emerge. One is making the radical change to adapt to modern society; the other is preserving tradition while at the same time adapting so as to allow Chinese Buddhism to survive and prosper in modern society. For a long time scholars put great emphasis on the former, while somewhat disregarding the latter. These two trends are not as mutually exclusive as they may seem. Certain changes were made in order to preserve traditional practices in a modern form or to make certain religious practices more efficiently practicable in modern society, as can be seen in the case of

periodicals published by the Shanghai Buddhist Books Company 上海佛学书局, established in 1929, to which I will return.

A great number of works report on both the reform of Chinese Buddhism and the history and culture of printing in modern China. As noted above, Holmes Welch's *Buddhist Revival in China*, first published in 1968, is one of the pioneering works on twentieth-century Chinese Buddhism. Welch clearly depicts the trends in the revival of Chinese Buddhism and the reform activities of Taixu. In this book, Welch devotes significant attention to Taixu's reform proposal and activities, including the "Invasion of Chin-Shan." He also highlights the development of the Buddhist publishing industry and devotes a half chapter to publications. Though he mentions Buddhist periodicals, generally he treats them only as a publishing format that produced nothing new.

For Zongyang, there has been no single monograph specifically researching his Buddhist and social activities. One article that does include him, however, is "Silas Aaron Hardoon and Cross-Cultural Adaptation in Shanghai," written by Chiara Betta and collected in *Jews of China*, edited by Jonathan Goldstein. In it, Betta examines the relationship between Zongyang and Hardoon, a British real estate magnate who was one of Zongyang's most important sponsors, in terms of Zongyang's design of Hardoon's Aili (aka Hatong) Garden, one of the most extravagant gardens in Shanghai, and the patronage of Zongyang's revolutionary and religious activities, such as the printing of the Buddhist Canon.

Don A. Pittman's *Toward a Modern Chinese Buddhism* (2001) focuses solely on Taixu's reform activities. Pittman provides a comprehensive evaluation of Taixu's life, reform proposals, activities, and vision of a modern worldwide Buddhism. He also vividly contextualizes the social and political background of the time and offers a comparison of Taixu's claims and Christian

thought. He notes Taixu's involvement with publishing and sets this involvement in the context of Taixu's other educational activities.

With respect to printing technology, Christopher A. Reed's *Gutenberg in Shanghai: Chinese Print Capitalism, 1876-1937* provides a historical account of the transition of printing techniques in China, focusing mainly on the commercial print industry of Shanghai. Looking at the technological innovations in printing during this time, it is possible to evaluate periodicals and newspapers, both Buddhist and non-Buddhist, in terms of reader accessibility, range of reception and significance as a modern format.

In addition to these works, this thesis has directly and indirectly benefited from numerous works detailing Chinese Buddhism and social and political reform movements in early twentieth-century China, including *The Cultural Practices of Modern Chinese Buddhism: Attuning the Dharma* by Francesca Tarocco; *Superstitious Regimes: Religion and the Politics of Chinese Modernity* by Rebecca Nedostup; *Religion in Contemporary China: Revitalization and Innovation*, edited by Adam Yuet Chau; and *Making Religion, Making the State: The Politics of Religion in Modern China*, edited by Yoshiko Ashiwa and David L. Wank. All these works deal with Buddhism from a political, secular perspective and look at the issue of revival. Although few of them touch on Buddhist periodicals directly, they provide valuable ideas on the general theme of modern Chinese Buddhist reform, which involved social participation from the sangha, laity, intellectuals, politicians, and people from other religious backgrounds.

Chinese scholarship also started to pay attention to Buddhism in the late Qing and early Republican periods. *Jiushi yu jiuxin: Zhongguo jingdai Fojiao fuxin sichao yanjiu* by Li Xiangping, *Ershi shiji Zhongguo Fojiao* by Chen Bing and Deng Zimei, *Renjian chaoyin: Taixu dashi zhuan* by Chen Yongge, and many other works emphasize intellectual and monastic

developments in modern Chinese Buddhism.²⁰ As for the field of publication and printing, Chinese scholars mainly analyze it through the history of journalism, notably the work of Fang Hanqi, but recently there are also works from the cultural history perspective, such as Wu Yonggui's *Mingguo chubanshi*.²¹

1.3 STRUCTURE OF THE THESIS

I explore the intersection of monastic Buddhism and periodical publications by analyzing printing and textual culture in modern China and the monastic development of Buddhism. The second chapter mainly establishes the importance of periodical publications in nineteenth-century China and explores why this publishing form proved uniquely valuable to both secular intellectuals and Buddhists. The general development of periodicals and newspapers in nineteenth-century China shows a transition in role from the promotion of Christianity to the promotion of modern secular ideologies, a role that enabled periodicals and newspapers to contribute to the building of a modern China. Buddhists, both clergy and laity, engaged with these trends or were left behind by society.

The third chapter discusses the initial engagement between the sangha and periodical publishing. By analyzing the example of Zongyang, I demonstrate that at first the focus within

²⁰ Li Xiangping 李向平, *Jiushi yu jiuxin: Zhongguo jingdai Fojiao fuxin sichao yanjiu* 救世与救心中国近代佛教复兴思潮研究 (Salvation of Society and the Heart: On the Revival Thoughts of Modern Chinese Buddhism) (Shanghai: Shanghai renmin chubanshe, 1993); Chen Bing 陈兵 and Deng Zimei 邓子美, *Ershi shiji Zhongguo fojiao* 二十世纪中国佛教 (Chinese Buddhism in the Twentieth Century) (Beijing: Mingzhu chubanshe, 2000); Chen Yongge 陈永革, *Renjian chaoying: Taixu dashi zhuan* 人间潮音: 太虚大师传 (Sound of Sea Tide for the Human World: Biography of Master Taixu) (Zhejiang: Zhejiang renmin chubanshe, 2003).

²¹ Fang Hanqi 方汉奇, *Zhongguo jindai baokanshi* 中国近代报刊史 (History of Modern Chinese Newspapers) (Shanxi: Shanxi renmin chubanshe, 1981); Wu Yonggui 吴永贵, *Mingguo chubanshi* 民国出版史 (Publication History of Republican China) (Fujian: Fujian renmin chubanshe, 2011).

the sangha and among many other Buddhists was not on creating a modern Buddhism but on the making of a new state. The primary focus in Zongyang's case from the 1890s through the fall of the Qing dynasty in 1911 was on the fate of the nation and how to engage and support revolutionary activities. Yet lay Buddhists—that is, those intellectuals who absorbed Buddhist philosophy—and Buddhist monks differed in that the former played a leading role in the general discourse of reform and modernization while the latter tried to follow.

The fourth chapter illustrates the situation of Buddhist periodicals after the establishment of the Republic of China. By that time, the main theme in these publications had shifted to Buddhist reform, a movement advocated by Taixu and his followers. Taixu consciously engaged with periodical and newspaper publications and founded a series of Buddhist newspapers and periodicals, including the longest running and one of the most influential, *Haichao yin* 海潮音 (Sound of the Sea Tide). By the 1920s, the clergy had seized power over this form of discourse and various voices were competing for dominance. An examination of the conversation on issues of Buddhist reform in periodicals, as well as a comparison between Taixu and Yinguang 印光 (1860–1940), who is credited with reviving the Pure Land tradition in modern China, reveals the emergence of a new form of religious authority in Buddhism, one which I contend was derived from the power of publication.

The last chapter details the special place held by Buddhist periodicals in terms of the dynamics of its social existence. By examining these periodicals, a large audience and readership of lay Buddhists can be observed and analyzed. Here I focus on the advertisements in Buddhist periodicals in Shanghai, notably those that appeared in publications of the Shanghai Buddhist Books Company 上海佛学书局, established in 1929. Serving as a window into both what Buddhist and Buddhist-affiliated advertisers wanted to promote and what (monastic and) lay

Buddhists were interested in, print ads illustrate how periodicals accelerated the sale of other religious goods, including Buddhist texts, religious objects, and even products to facilitate the observation of everyday Buddhist disciplines like vegetarianism. These advertisements provide us with information on how certain Buddhist texts were promoted and how certain figures, such as Taixu and Yinguang, were perceived by the masses. Both the trend towards reform and that of traditional preservation appear in these advertisements.

Taken all together, this thesis illustrates the transformation of modern Chinese Buddhism in terms of how it engaged with relevant social ethos, the communication reform and its significance, and the actual social base for Buddhism. The key focus throughout is the media platform through which Buddhist figures expressed themselves to society and the Buddhist community. Chinese society in the modern era underwent drastic changes, and one of the results these changes brought was the dissolution of the stability between the central state and local community, a social paradigm in which Chinese Buddhism had mostly comfortably lived for more than a thousand years. Thus with such a change, the social position of Chinese Buddhism became obscure and uncertain. It was the efforts of these Buddhist figures and their engagement with the modern publishing industry that shaped the form of Buddhism in modern China and preserved the social role of Chinese Buddhism during an era when the tradition was in danger.

2.0 PERIODICALS AS THE PLATFORM FOR A MODERN CHINESE ENLIGHTENMENT

The new forms of modern media that appeared in nineteenth-century China were newspapers and periodicals. They were embraced first by intellectuals, who used them to promote social and political reform and introduce Western knowledge, and then by revolutionists, who used them to advocate social revolution and the establishment of a new form of nation-state. The Buddhist community did not have a periodical dedicated to Buddhism until October 1912, with the appearance of *Foxue congbao* 佛学丛报 (Buddhist Miscellany). But Chinese Buddhists engaged with periodicals and newspapers earlier than that. The earliest record I could find of a monk writing to a newspaper, at least using his priestly name and not a pseudonym, dates to 1882 and is found in a Catholic periodical named *Yiwen lu* 益文录 (Collection of Benign News), where a writer identified as “Hanshan Tieseng” 寒山铁僧 (Iron Monk from Cold Mountain) wrote Song (960-1279) style lyrics describing and admonishing against addiction to opium.¹ The author did not cite many specifically Buddhist ideas to comment on opium addiction, but did employ the commonly used Buddhist phrase “The sea of bitterness has no bounds, repent and the shore is at hand”² to exhort addicts to change their

¹ Hanshan Tieseng, “Poetry on Opium,” *Yiwenlu* no. 45 (1882): 45, reproduced in *Wanqing qikan quanwen shujuku* 晚清期刊全文数据库 (Database of Late Qing Journals).

http://www.cnbkxy.com/shlib_tsd/searchResultDetails.do?basedataId=25651510&needFr=false&incFt=false.

² This is a Chinese idiom with strong Buddhist connotations, which first appeared in a Yuan 元 dynasty (1279-1368) literary

behavior. At that time newspapers and periodicals conveyed not only news but also commentaries on news and social affairs. This function of a modern journal, which not only reports news but also provides a platform for various opinions and claims that speak to the public, did not develop in China until the middle of the nineteenth century, and it soon served as the catalyst for the eruption of revolutionary passion which dominated the social ethos for the modern Chinese history.

2.1 PERIODICALS IN CHINESE HISTORY

Newspapers in China before the appearance of those by Christian missionaries in the nineteenth century can generally be classified into two categories. The first, *di bao* 邸报, were official gazettes containing information about governmental matters such as details of official events, appointment regulations, and other official news. The second, *xiao bao* 小报, were a kind of unofficial newspaper printed by private reporters around the capital and which also reported governmental news but were faster, uncensored, and less reliable.³ Other newspaper-type products also existed, like *qi bao* 旗报 and *pai bao* 牌报, which were often used by rebels to spread their message.⁴ None of these newspapers were sold for commercial purposes, for they were produced for the purpose of conveying information or propaganda, and the cost was compensated by the producer or the patron. The first type of early newspapers was primarily for officials and intelligentsia, while the second one was for publicizing causes of rebellions.

work named “Laisheng zhai” 来生债. See *Cihai* 辞海 (Sea of Words), ed. by Cihai bianji weiyuanhui 辞海编辑委员会, (Shanghai: Shanghai cishu chubanshe, 1989), 765.

³ Ge Gongzhen 戈公振, *Zhongguo baoxue shi* 中国报学史 (History of Journalism in China) (Shanghai: Shanghai shudian, 1989), 23-32.

⁴ Fang Hanqi, *Zhongguo jindai baokan shi*, 3-5.

Starting in the late Ming dynasty, around the middle of the sixteenth century, a new form of newspaper called *jing bao* 京报 appeared in Beijing, which, unlike earlier newspapers that were distributed for free, were available for sale to the public. As the content of these papers however was still government-related information, their main consumers remained officials and merchants.⁵

Generally speaking, before Protestant missionaries introduced modern newspapers in the early nineteenth century, publication of early-form newspapers was monopolized by the government and not used for personal or commercial purposes. The sole function of these official newspapers was to communicate governmental information across the country. These early-form newspapers were managed either by a government agency or by certain liaisons or other officials who were stationed outside the capital. Either way, these reports were not intended for wide readership but rather were geared to officials, and did not include sections such as “Local News” or “Commentaries” like a modern newspaper does.

2.2 WESTERN JOURNALS IN NINETEENTH-CENTURY CHINA

The role of Christian missionaries in the development of modern Chinese journalism has been widely noted by scholars. Christian missionaries arrived in China as early as the Tang dynasty (618-907), but the process of orientalizing Western knowledge 西学东渐 was only initiated in the Ming dynasty (1368-1644), with the Italian Jesuit Matteo Ricci (1552-1610) as the most famous figure among those early missionaries. The main contribution of these

⁵ Ibid.

sixteenth-century missionaries is the establishment of a “cultural vocabulary”⁶ that enabled missionaries in the nineteenth century to quickly learn to adapt to Chinese social norms.

However, it was mainly Protestant missionaries, not Jesuits, who developed modern journalism in China, along with other modern printing techniques and ideas. Print media, and especially the wide distribution of the Bible and religious pamphlets, were an important strategy for Protestant missionaries in promoting their religion. Robert Morrison (1782-1834), the first Protestant missionary to China and the first translator of the Bible into Chinese, is considered the “originator of the modern Chinese press.”⁷ In August 1815, Morrison, with the assistance of his co-missionary William Milne (1785-1822), published the first modern Chinese periodical, *Chashisu meiyue tongji zhuan* 察世俗每月统计传 (China Monthly Magazine), in Malacca.⁸ Though it was not published in China, it still signified the appearance of the modern Chinese periodical. Between 1815 and 1821, *China Monthly Magazine* published “seven volumes, eighty four issues, and five hundred twenty four pages” in total, with circulations from “five hundred each issue in the beginning to three thousand in 1820.”⁹ The journal’s main contents were articles conveying Christian and moral messages, which occupied about eighty-five percent of each issue,¹⁰ but from time to time it introduced Western scientific ideas, like the basic astronomical concepts of the “solar system, planets, satellites, comets, eclipses etc.”¹¹ In content and organization *China Monthly Magazine* inherited the style employed by those early Catholic missionaries like Matteo

⁶ Xiantao Zhang, *The Origins of the Modern Chinese Press*, 30.

⁷ *Ibid*, 35.

⁸ Fang Hanqi, *Zhongguo jindai baokan shi*, 11-12.

⁹ Song Yingli 宋应离, ed. *Zhongguo qikan fazhanshi* 中国期刊发展史 (History of Periodicals in China) (Kaifeng: Henan daxue chubanshe, 2000), 18.

¹⁰ Su Jing 苏精, *Malixun yu Zhongwen yinshua chuban* 马礼逊与中文印刷出版 (Robert Morrison and Chinese Printing and Publication) (Taipei, Taiwan: Xuesheng shuju, 2000), 163.

¹¹ Xiantao Zhang, *The Origins of the Modern Chinese Press*, 37.

Ricci who tried to attract the Chinese by writing about Western scientific achievements, but Morrison and Milne placed more emphasis on their religious message than had Ricci.

After *China Monthly Magazine*, more and more Christian-oriented periodicals appeared in China. *Dongxi yang kao meiyue tongji zhuan* 东西洋考每月统记传 (Eastern Western Monthly Magazine, published 1833-1838), *Xiaer guanzhen* 遐迩贯珍 (China Serial, 1853-1856), *Liuhe congtan* 六合丛谈 (Shanghai Serial, 1857-1858), *Gezhi huibian* 格致汇编 (Chinese Scientific Magazine, 1876-1892),¹² and so many other influential periodicals were founded directly or indirectly by Western missionaries, sometimes with the assistance of Chinese intellectuals. Among them, *Dongxi yang kao meiyue tongji zhuan* was regarded as the model of modern Chinese journalism for “its strong secular concern and close connection with the foreign communities” and for the acceptable writing style that even included a quotation from Confucius on its front page.¹³

Wangguo gongbao 万国公报 (A Review of the Times, 1874-1907) was the most influential of these church periodicals in terms of its full engagement with Chinese society and its role during the reform of the nation. It derived from *Zhongguo Jiaohui xinbao* 中国教会新报 (Church News, 1868-1874), which was aimed at the Protestant community in China and had a limited circulation.¹⁴ The religious content of *Zhongguo Jiaohui xinbao* declined sharply when its editor, Young Allen (1836-1907), attempted to transform it into a periodical of Chinese social

¹² For more information on those periodicals see Zhao Xiaolan 赵晓兰 and Wu Chao 吴潮, *Chuanjiaoshi Zhongwen baokanshi* 传教士中文报刊史 (History of Missionary Journals in China) (Shanghai: Fudan daxue chubanshe, 2011), 54-76, 92-115, 133-157, 215-223.

¹³ Xiantao Zhang, *The Origins of the Modern Chinese Press*, 41, and Zhao Xiaolan and Wu Chao, *Chuanjiaoshi Zhongwen baokanshi*, 62.

¹⁴ For further information on *Jiaohui xinbao* and *Wangguo gongbao* see: Zhao Xiaolan and Wu Chao, *Chuanjiaoshi zhongwen baokanshi*, 158-205.

and political issues.¹⁵ After being renamed *Wanguo gongbao* in 1874, the periodical engaged in the promotion of Western science, advocated educational reform, campaigned against foot-binding, and encouraged “new policies” for governmental reform that imitated Western political structure.¹⁶ Disputes about the proper balance between religion and social issues arose among the missionaries involved with the magazine. When Young Allen received a new appointment within the church in 1883, the periodical ceased published. Six years later, however, it was restored to publication, and from then on focused even more on secular and political matters.¹⁷ The circulation of *Wanguo gongbao* began in 1874 with a print run of 1,000 for each issue and grew to nearly 40,000 in 1898.¹⁸ More than 500 Chinese writers contributed to the periodical over its lifetime before it ceased publication in 1907.¹⁹ It became one of the most important periodicals in the late Qing for the introduction of Western culture and Western knowledge.

2.3 THE EFFORTS OF CHINESE INTELLECTUALS

After the first Opium War between the Qing dynasty and Britain (1839-1842), China was forced to enter a new world order and adapt to unprecedented ideological and social changes. Chinese intellectuals, particular those who lived in coastal areas where they were one of the first people exposed to the western world, began to ponder the fate of the nation. Witnessing the technical innovations brought by western powers in the ceded territories, especially Hong Kong

¹⁵ Xiantao Zhang, *The Origins of the Modern Chinese Press*, 47.

¹⁶ Ibid, 46-61.

¹⁷ Zou Xiaozhan 邹小站, *Xixue dongjian—yingju yu xuanze* 西学东渐—迎拒与选择 (The Eastward Dissemination of Western Learning: Acceptance, Refusal and Selection) (Chengdu: Sichuan renmin chubanshe, 2008), 230.

¹⁸ Xiantao Zhang, *The Origins of the Modern Chinese Press*, 61.

¹⁹ Xiong Yuezhi, *Xixue dongjian yu Wanqing shehui*, 415.

which became a British colony under the Treaty of Nanking of 1842,²⁰ these Chinese intellectuals, including those I discuss in this section, started to accept those innovations. In the case under discussion here, they applied the new medium—modern publications—to reach the Chinese people with their own messages that differed from those of the missionaries.

When Wu Tingfang 伍廷芳 (ca. 1842-1922),²¹ who later became an important diplomat for the Qing as well as the Republican government, founded *Zhongwai xinbao* 中外新报 (China and Globe Daily) in Hong Kong in 1858, he rented the lead-print facility from a foreign press. For this reason, some scholars mistakenly count it as a foreign-funded newspaper.²² It was not until around 1874 that *Xunhuan ribao* 循环日报 (Universal Circulating Herald), a newspaper established in Hong Kong by the reformer Wang Tao 王韬 (1828-1897),²³ appeared as the first Chinese newspaper completely and unambiguously without Western funding in China.²⁴ Yet it was not until after the first Sino-Japanese War (1894-1895) that Chinese intellectuals, such as Kang Youwei and Liang Qichao, put substantial effort into the publication of modern newspapers. Between 1895 and 1898, about one hundred twenty new newspapers appeared in China, and eighty percent of them were founded solely by Chinese.²⁵ As Seungjoo Yoon nicely summarizes, two beliefs among Chinese intellectuals led them to regard newspaper and periodical publication as an attractive and efficient forum for their voices. One was the positive view of the newspaper as “a legitimate endeavor for themselves rather than clerical work

²⁰ Jonathan D. Spence, *The Search for Modern China* (New York: Norton, 1990), 159-164.

²¹ For more about Wu Tingfang see Linda Pomerantz-Zhang, *Wu Tingfang (1842-1922): Reform and Modernization in Modern Chinese History* (Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press, 1992).

²² Fang Hanqi, *Zhongguo jindai baokan shi*, 60.

²³ For more about Wang Tao see Paul A. Cohen, *Between Tradition and Modernity: Wang T'ao and Reform in Late Ch'ing China* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1974).

²⁴ Xiantao Zhang, *The Origins of the Modern Chinese Press*, 63.

²⁵ Liu Jialin 刘家林, *Zhongguo xinwen tongshi* 中国新闻通史 (A General History of Chinese Journalism) (Wuhan: Wuhan daxue chubanshe, 2005), 104.

reserved for minor functionaries”; another was that the Qing government realized the role of this medium and began to “rely on journalistic reports in policy deliberations.”²⁶

Several newspapers emerged as vital albeit sometimes short-lived mouthpieces for reform-minded intellectuals, including *Qiangxue bao* 强学报 (Self-Strengthening News, January 12 and 20, 1896, it only published two issues), *Shiwu bao* 时务报 (Chinese Progress, 1896-1898), *Xiang bao* 湘报 (Hunan News, March to October, 1898), *Guowen bao* 国闻报 (National News, 1897-1900), and *Xinmin congbao* 新民丛报 (New Citizen Journal, 1902-1907). All these journals were dedicated to bringing Western Enlightenment culture to China. *Shiwu bao* introduced the new political idea of popular power 民权;²⁷ the Chinese translation of Huxley’s *Evolution and Ethics* by Yan Fu 严复 was first serialized in *Guowen huibian* 国闻汇编 (Collection of the National News), a supplement to *Guowen bao*;²⁸ and Liang Qichao articulated his theory of modern Chinese nationalism in a series of articles published in *Xinmin congbao*, including his monumental “Xinmin shuo” 新民说 (Discourse on the New Citizen), which was serialized in the newspaper over four years.²⁹ Thus in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries these publications provided a platform for Chinese intellectuals to launch their Enlightenment project for the Chinese people. Due to the diversity of authors writing in these publications as well as the modern concept of free speech, although Chinese intellectual reformers controlled much of the discourse, they were not the only ones engaged in promoting

²⁶ Seungjoo Yoon, "Literati-Journalists of the *Chinese Progress* (Shiwu Bao) in Discord, 1896-1898," in *Rethinking the 1898 Reform Period: Political and Cultural Change in Late Qing China*, ed. Rebecca E. Karl and Peter Gue Zarrow (Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Asia Center, 2002), 51.

²⁷ Ibid, 48.

²⁸ Li Lu, "Translation and Nation: Negotiating 'China' in the Translations of Lin Shu, Yan Fu, and Liang Qichao." (Ph.D. dissertation, University of Massachusetts Amherst, 2007), 73-74.

²⁹ This was actually comprised of twenty political commentaries written by Liang Qichao and published in *Xinmin congbao* between 1902 and 1907, and later published as a book in 1936 under the name *Xinming shuo*. See Xiaobing Tang, *Global Space and the Nationalist Discourse of Modernity: The Historical Thinking of Liang Qichao* (Stanford, Cal: Stanford University Press, 1996), 46.

views in these types of media. As I have mentioned above, writers with a religious orientation also participated in the discussion, notably Christians. But a small portion of writers had a Buddhist background and tried to schematize Buddhism into the Enlightenment project. In the next chapter, I explore the initial Buddhist contact with these new media and examine how they fit themselves into the general discourse of the modern Chinese Enlightenment project.

3.0 INITIAL ENCOUNTER WITH AND THE VOICE OF BUDDHISM IN PERIODICALS

In the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, more and more monks used modern media to communicate with society and with the sangha. Among the writers, the name “Monk of Wumu Mountain” (Wumu Shan Seng, 乌目山僧) frequently appears. This is Zongyang. Zongyang began to use newspapers to advocate for the establishment of new educational institutions for Buddhism in 1901 in an article titled “Quan tongjiao guangkai yitang shuo 劝同教广开义堂说” (On Persuading Compatriots to Open Schools), which was published in *Nanyang qiri bao* 南洋七日报 (South Seas Weekly).¹ This weekly was founded in Shanghai in 1901 and published every Saturday, and was one of the new media publications at the turn of the last century advocating reforms to help the nation survive times of crisis.² As noted above, the earliest record of an author in a newspaper identifying himself as a monk was the “Iron Monk of Cold Mountain,” whose name was merely attached to a poetic lyric some two decades earlier. Zongyang, as far as the records show, was the second monk to participate in this print medium. The pieces by these two monks had an important feature in common. Their articles were not about Buddhism *per se* but about society at large. As Zongyang, to the delight of reformist

¹ Wumu Shan Seng, “Quan tongjiao guangkai yitang shuo 劝同教广开义堂说” (On Persuading Compatriots to Open Schools), *Nanyang qiribao* (1901), reproduced in *Wanqing qikan quanwen shujuku* 晚清期刊全文数据库 (Database of Late Qing Journals). http://www.cnbkys.com/shlib_tsd/searchResultDetails.do?basedataId=27527082&needFr=false&incFt=false.

² Zheng Tianting 郑天挺 and Rong Mengyuan 荣孟源, eds., *Zhongguo lishi dacidian Qingshi juan xia* 中国历史大辞典 清史卷下 (General History of China: Qing, Second Volume) (Shanghai: Shanghai cishu chubanshe, 1992), 520.

intellectuals, constantly reminded his readers in “On Persuading Compatriots to Open Schools,” the nation, religion, and Buddhism were all in danger of extinction, and only by establishing new schools and cultivating new students could Buddhism survive the chaotic era that followed the fall of the Qing dynasty.³ However, Zongyang’s main focus around that time was not on Buddhism *per se* but on the general reform of the nation and on revolutionary ideas. Therefore, tracking the new media activities of Zongyang, as well as his relevant social and religious projects, reveal how a Buddhist monk engaged with modern periodical publications and gained influence through that medium.

3.1 ZONGYANG: “AN EXTRAORDINARY MONK”

“My fellow countryman, Master Zongyang, is an extraordinary man.”⁴ This is a comment about Zongyang found in “Gengzi jinian tu xu” 庚子纪念图序 (Preface to the Memorial Painting of Gengzi), written in September 1901. This preface appeared in the newspaper *Tongren xiaoxian bao* 同人消闲报 (The Leisure, circulated 1900-1907), which announced an effort launched by Zongyang to collect paintings about the occupation of Beijing by the Eight-Nation Alliance (Genzi Incident, 庚子事件) that had occurred the previous year.⁵ Zongyang himself had contributed a painting to the paper to which several commentators added prefaces, including the one calling him “an extraordinary man.” Such a comment, with many other complimentary introductions, implies that Zongyang already had a certain amount of fame by

³ Wumu Shan Seng, “Quan tongjiao guangkai yitang shuo,” reproduced in *Wanqing qikan quanwen shujuku* http://www.cnbkxy.com/shlib_tsd/searchResultDetails.do?basedataId=27527082&needFr=false&incFt=false.

⁴ Shen Qian and Tang Wenquan, eds., *Zongyang shangren wenji*, 9.

⁵ Shen Qian and Tang Wenquan, eds., *Zongyang shangren wenji*, 6.

that time. However, this incident was not the peak of Zongyang's popularity but the beginning of his stepping out into society and creating a voice as a Buddhist monk.

Zongyang was born in Changshu, Jiangsu Province, in 1861. His secular name was Huang Haoshun 黄浩舜. At the age of 16, he joined the sangha at Qingling Temple 清凉寺 on nearby Mount Yu 虞山, under the supervision of the monk Yao Kan 药龕. Yao Kan had close relationships with many intellectuals, including Weng Tonghe 翁同和 (1830–1904), the Confucian scholar and imperial tutor of the Guangxu 光绪 Emperor (1871-1908, r. 1875-1908), all of whom paid great attention to the education of Zongyang. Five years later, Zongyang was sent to Jingshan Temple in Zhenjiang, Jiangsu Province where he learned Japanese, Sanskrit, and English, and then traveled around China, from south to north.⁶ During his time at Jingshan Temple (ca. 1882-1899), where he was appointed to the position of supervisor 监院, the Jewish merchant Silas Aaron Hardoon and his wife, Liu Jialing 罗迦陵 (aka Liza Roos), paid a visit to the temple in 1892.⁷ Impressed by Zongyang's talent and knowledge of Buddhism, they invited him to Shanghai in 1899. Their close relationship later proved to be an indispensable resource for Zongyang, providing many opportunities for him to engage with social and Buddhist issues. For example, Hardoon and Roos financially supported Zongyang's printing of the Chinese Canon, funded publications about revolutionary causes, and assisted revolutionists, including Zongyang, in escaping the Qing government.⁸ Therefore, Zongyang's personal background and activities do not strictly fit that of the typical traditional eminent monk who either assumed a prestigious

⁶ Li Shan and Guo Changbao, eds., *Lidai gaoseng zhuan*, 613-621; Shen Qian and Tang Wenquan, eds, *Zongyang shangren wenji*, 9-13, 213-224; He Jianmin 何建民, "Huang Zongyang yu jindai Fojiao wenhua zhenxing" 黄宗仰与近代佛教文化振兴 (Huang Zongyang and the Revival of Modern Chinese Buddhist Culture), *Foxue yanjiu* (2002): 194-205.

⁷ Chiara Betta, "Silas Aaron Hardoon and Cross-cultural Adaptation in Shanghai," in *Jews of China*, volume 1, ed. Jonathan Goldstein (Armonk, New York: M.E. Sharpe, 1999), 217.

⁸ Xia Boming 夏伯铭, *Shanghai jiushi zhi hatong fufu* 上海旧事之哈同夫妇 (Old Memory of Shanghai: Hatong Couple) (Shanghai: Shanghai yuandong chubanshe, 2008), 59-94.

lineage of one or several schools or innovatively contributed to Buddhist thought. Even though some records list Zongyang in the lineage of the Linji School of Chan Buddhism by tracing his training to the Jinshan Temple, we actually know almost nothing about Zongyang's stand on Buddhist philosophy.⁹ For at least the first forty years of Zongyang's life, that is prior to 1900, despite his educational background, there is little to indicate that he would eventually rise up in the sangha to become a prestigious leader beyond the confines of the lower Yangtze region, the area in which he spent his entire career. More importantly, he produced no known writings that can be dated earlier than 1900, when he started to write in newspapers and periodicals. Indeed, these forms of modern media are directly responsible for preserving Zongyang's writings, an effect that distinguishes him from many of his counterparts who were less active in such endeavors.

3.2 ZONGYANG'S MESSAGE TO SOCIETY

Zongyang's engagement with modern journalism took many forms: direct posts about social issues, editorial work for certain newspapers, and articles about Buddhist reform and other contemporary issues related to Buddhism that were published in both Buddhist periodicals and secular newspapers. As mentioned above, Zongyang's 1901 initiation of the collection of paintings of the Gengzi Incident was the first appearance of his work in a newspaper. One year later, in 1902, Zongyang painted a portrait of Confucius with a short description for *Zheng xue bao* 政学报 (Politics Learning Newspaper, 1902-?), in which he expressed his respect for

⁹ Zhang Dahua 张大华, *Wenhua xianchang* 文化现场 (Culture on the Scene) (Zhengjiang: Jiangsu daxue chubanshe, 2011), 183.

Confucius and lamented the ways later Confucians forgot the old teachings, “abolish[ed] religion,” and did not adhere to the spirit and learning of Confucius. In the same year a speech given by Zongyang at the opening ceremony of the Patriot School also appeared in *Xuan bao* 选报 (The Selection, 1901-1904) under the title “Aiguo xueshe kaixiao zhuci” 爱国学社开校祝辞 (Welcoming the Opening of the Patriot School).¹⁰ It included the oft-quoted line, “Though today the Emperor does not care about the people, should the people not care about the nation?”¹¹ These publications indicate that around this time Zongyang’s primary concern was the fate of the nation and the establishment of a new educational system in China. In 1902 Zongyang, along with the educator Cai Yuanpei 蔡元培 (1868-1940)¹² and other intellectuals, founded the China Education Association (Zhongguo jiaoyuhui, 中国教育会), for which Zongyang served as president (ca. 1902-1903). Together they published articles in support of the association in *Xuan bao* as well.¹³ With saving the nation being such a clear theme in Zongyang’s writings during this period, it is no wonder that these articles frequently appeared in publications inclined to reform and revolution, like *Xuan bao* and *Xinmin congbao*.¹⁴

Zongyang of course was far from the only individual to express concern over the national crisis, yet his identity as a Buddhist monk certainly gives his concerns unique characteristics. The Qing’s defeat by Japan in 1895 triggered across China a sense of impending national doom.

¹⁰ Zongyang, “Kongzi xiang tihou” 孔子像题后 (On Confucius Sculpture), *Zhengxue bao* no. 1 (1902), reproduced in *Zongyang shangren wenji*, ed. by Shen Qian, and Tang Wenquan, 13-14.

¹¹ Zongyang, “Aiguo xueshe kaixiao zhuci” 爱国学社开校祝辞 (Welcoming the Opening of the Patriot School), *Xuan bao* no. 35 (1902), reproduced in *Zongyang shangren wenji*, 14.

¹² Cai Yunpei later became president of Peking University, which was an influential institution for the New Cultural Movement and May Fourth Movement in the 1910s and 1920s. For more information see Vera Schwarcz, *The Chinese Enlightenment: Intellectuals and the Legacy of the May Fourth Movement of 1919* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1986), 12-54; Xiaoqing Diana Lin, *Peking University: Chinese Scholarship and Intellectuals, 1898-1937* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 2005).

¹³ Feng Ziyou 冯自由, *Geming yishi* 革命逸史 (Revolution Memoir), volume 1, (Shanghai: Xinxing chubanshe, 2009), 94-95.

¹⁴ He Jianmin, “Huang Zongyang yu jindai Fojiao wenhua zhenxing.” Zongyang frequently used the name “Wumu Shan Seng” in newspapers, and many of his writings were poems dedicated to other revolutionary intellectuals or to memorize their gatherings. Examples of his poetry are collected in *Wanqing qikan quanwen shujuku* 晚清期刊全文数据库 (Database of Late Qing Periodicals).

Intellectual reformers appealed to newspapers and periodicals to discuss their intentions to reform the nation by imitating the political system of either Britain or the United States. Zongyang did not advocate a specific ideal system that he wished the nation to adopt but demonstrated a general recognition that the nation's best hope for moving forward lay in embracing Western ideas.¹⁵ Though his ideas might not have been as innovative as those of intellectuals like Liang Qichao or reformists like Sun Yat-sen 孙中山 (1866-1925),¹⁶ Zongyang's religious identity, though not so obvious as it was perceived by his revolutionary colleagues, comfortably fit into the conversation, which in turn bolstered his reputation in society as well as in the sangha.

In 1903, Zongyang became an editor of *Su bao* 苏报 (Jiangsu Journal), which was an important medium for the incubation of the 1911 Revolution. He wrote many articles that appeared in this paper about saving the nation and which cited Buddhist parables and examples of bodhisattvas to encourage young students and others who cared about the nation to devote themselves to the cause of reform by rebelling against the rigid Qing regime. For example, in a letter that Zongyang addressed to students boycotting school and published on *Su bao* in 1903, he used the example of the bodhisattva Kṣitigarbha (Ch: Dizang, 地藏) and his famous vow, "I will not become a Buddha if the hells are not empty,"¹⁷ to exhort students to study for the nation.¹⁸ When *Su bao* published several radical articles encouraging revolution in 1903,

¹⁵ Zongyang, "Aiguo xueshe kaixiao zhuci," in *Zongyang shangren wenji*, 14-15.

¹⁶ See Peter Zarrow, *After Empire: The Conceptual Transformation of the Chinese State, 1885-1924* (Stanford, California: Stanford University Press, 2012).

¹⁷ This is a Chinese proverb originated from the sutra of the bodhisattva Kṣitigarbha, see *Dizang pusa benyun jing* 地藏菩萨本愿经 (Sūtra on the Past Vows of Kṣitigarbha Bodhisattva), *Taishō Shinshū Daizōkyō* 13, no. 412: 780c.

¹⁸ Zongyang, "Dai luojialin nyushi hui Zhejiang tuixuesheng shu" 代罗迦陵女士回浙江退学生书 (Letter to Students Boycotting Schools in Zhejiang in Representation of Ms. Luo Jialing), in *Zongyang shangren wenji*, 23-24.

including Zou Rong's 邹容 (1885-1905) "Revolutionary Army" (Geming Jun, 革命军)¹⁹ and Zhang Taiyan's 章太炎 (1868-1936) "The Relationship between Kang Youwei and the Aisin Gioro Emperor" (Kang Youwei yu Aixinjueluo jun zhi guanxi, 康有为与爱新觉罗君之关系),²⁰ which satirized the weakness of the Qing government and encouraged overthrowing the Qing regime, the government swiftly moved to ban the press and arrested many of the authors involved, includes Zou and Zhang. Although Zongyang was on the list of those wanted, he still tried to rescue the arrested authors and, after his efforts failed, fled to Japan to avoid the Qing crackdown for one year between 1903 and 1904.²¹ During Zongyang's stay in Japan, he met Sun Yat-sen (who would later be recognized as the founder of the Republic of China) and many other revolutionaries who would become members of Sun's underground resistance movement, the Revolutionary Alliance (Tong menghui, 同盟会), founded in 1905—although Zongyang did not become a formal member himself. Zongyang and Sun developed a close relationship as Sun appreciated Zongyang's efforts as a Buddhist monk to promote the cause of the revolution. Sun even let Zongyang live in the room downstairs from where he was staying in Tokyo.²² Their friendship lasted beyond the 1911 Revolution, and when Zongyang served as the abbot of Qixia Temple 栖霞寺 in Nanjing and tried to restore the glory of the temple between 1920 and 1921, Sun responded to the cause by donating a sum of money.²³ But the real significance of their friendship, as well as of Zongyang's friendship with other revolutionists, was that he was

¹⁹ Zou Rong was a radical Chinese nationalist and died in prison after the *Su Bao* Incident. For more information about this pamphlet see Zou Yong, *Revolutionary Army: A Chinese Nationalist Tract of 1903*, trans. with notes by John Lust (Paris: Mouton, 1968).

²⁰ Zhang Taiyan was a scholar in textual studies and philosophy, and a steadfast revolutionary; he went to prison for three years due to the *Su bao* incident. See Viren Murthy, *The Political Philosophy of Zhang Taiyan: The Resistance of Consciousness* (Leiden: Brill, 2011).

²¹ Zhang Taiyan 章太炎, "Xixiasi yinleng chanshi taming" 栖霞寺印楞禅师塔铭 (Inscription for Chan Master Yinleng of Xixia Temple), in *Zongyang shangren wenji*, 220.

²² Feng Ziyou, *Geming yishi*, 167-170.

²³ Zheng Lixin 郑立新, *Fohai huiliu: Lidai gaoseng xuezhzhe zhuan* 佛海慧流 历代高僧学者传 (Wisdom of Buddhism: Biographies of Eminent Monks and Scholars in Chinese History) (Beijing: Huaxia chubanshe, 1999), 402.

admitted into their circles as both a Buddhist monk and a revolutionist. This not only gave Zongyang legitimacy in the eyes of society but also extended his influence back to the Buddhist sangha whence he had come, as we have seen in his role in the Jinshan Incident.

3.3 TURNING TO THE BUDDHIST COMMUNITY

After the fall of the Qing in 1912, Zongyang reduced participation in secular political matters and concentrated more on issues specific to Buddhism, such as editing the Buddhist Canon, founding new schools for Buddhism,²⁴ and assuming management of Jinshan and Qixia temples in 1914 and 1920, respectively. He did not cease publishing in newspapers and periodicals, however. In fact, he served on the editorial board of several Buddhist publications and used them as channels through which to primarily communicate with the Buddhist sangha. Even prior to this change in orientation, because of Zongyang's close relationship with important revolutionary figures and intellectuals as well as his involvement with reformist new media, his renown had already extended back into the sangha. For example, his slightly older contemporary and Taixu's mentor, the monk and poet, Jichan 寄禅 (1851-1912), also known as Eight Fingers Monk 八指头陀, wrote a poem to express his admiration of Zongyang right before the 1911 Revolution. The first line of the poem reads: "I always think about Monk of Wumu Mountain/ I regret every time that we cannot see each other."²⁵

²⁴ Zongyang helped found Huayan University 华严大学 in Shanghai with the assistance of the Haroon couple. See Feng Ziyou, *Geming yishi*, 499.

²⁵ Mei Jidian 梅季点, ed., *Bazhi toutuo shiwenji* 八指头陀诗文集 (Collected Poems of Eight Fingers Monk) (Changhai: Yuelu shushe 岳麓书社, 1984), 431.

In the first issue of *Foxue congbao* (October 1, 1912), Zongyang published “Fojiao jinxin shangque shu” 佛教进行商榷书 (Discussion of the Ongoing Reform of Buddhism), which was his response to the Jinshan Incident and one of the few articles he wrote addressing the systematic reform of Chinese Buddhism.²⁶ *Foxue congbao* was the first Chinese Buddhist periodical not founded by Buddhist monks but by a New Learning scholar and lay Buddhist named Di Chuqing 狄楚清 (c. 1873-1941) and edited by another layman named Pu Yicheng 濮一乘. It was published by You Zheng Press 有正书局 in Shanghai, a secular commercial press, and lasted for two years, publishing a total of twelve issues before it folded in 1914.²⁷ Although it was short-lived, it signaled the early stages of the flourishing of both Chinese journalism and Buddhist periodicals. Its twelve issues included articles by famous authors from the sangha, including Zongyang and Yinguang, who preferred to use the pen name Chang Can 常慚, and who would become known as the reviver of Pure Land in modern China. Zongyang was also an editor of the journal; as such, he was able to use it to respond to proposals by Taixu and other radical young reform monks, trying to pave a middle way between reformists and conservatives.

In his “Discussion of the Ongoing Reform of Buddhism,” Zongyang provided four suggestions for the reform of Buddhism. He did not agree with Taixu’s radical claim, as seen during the Jinshan Incident, that eradicating almost all tradition would help Buddhism survive. Therefore, the first point Zongyang called for was the restoration of monastic regulations. Zongyang believed that in times of crisis, Buddhism should not pursue trivial matters, such as ritual services, while forgetting the fundamental characteristics that distinguish Buddhism from

²⁶ Zongyang, “Fojiao jinxing shangque shu” 佛教进行商榷书 (Discussion of the Ongoing Reform of Buddhism), in *Zongyang shangren wenji*, 46-51.

²⁷ Cf. *Database for Modern Chinese Buddhism* 近代中國佛教檢索.
http://buddhistinformatics.ddbc.edu.tw/dmcb/Foxue_congbao_%E4%BD%9B%E5%AD%B8%E5%8F%A2%E5%A0%B1.
Accessed on November 18, 2012.

secular life. The second point he advocated, which was consistent with his longstanding emphasis on education, was the development of new forms of education. Here Zongyang advocated teaching a combination of traditional Confucian and Buddhist classics plus practical subjects, such as craftsmanship that had been introduced from the West. It differed from traditional Chinese Buddhist education, which varied from school to school but generally followed the master-apprentice model with emphasis on a particular set of texts and practices. For example, the Tiantai School emphasized the meditative practice of “calming and discerning” (*zhiguan*, 止 观) and the doctrinal classification of the “Four Doctoral Categories of the Teachings,” while the Linji School of Chan Buddhism relied on the practice of *gong’an* 公案 (public cases) and disputation to stimulate disciples to attain enlightenment.²⁸ What Zongyang called for was a reform in content as well as method, with the purpose of educating new monks about society as well as about Buddhism. The third point he advocated was regulation of the ordination of Buddhist monks. Zongyang emphasized an educational period in modern-form Buddhist schools, during which a novice would practice and adhere to Buddhist disciplines and be judged on whether he was capable of living a Buddhist monk’s life before being allowed to take tonsure or full ordination. Lastly, Zongyang proposed that Buddhist monks should renounce going to secular houses to perform rituals for economic benefit. He thought such activities not only disgraced the Buddhist image but also disturbed the monks’ practice of meditation.²⁹ Zongyang’s stance was far more moderate than the radical proposals by Taixu, which sought to eradicate all traditional monastic management and to assign an egalitarian status to all temples.³⁰

²⁸ Chen Xuexun 陈学恂, ed., *Zhongguo jiaoyushi yanjiu suitang juan* 中国教育史研究隋唐卷 (History of Chinese Education in the Sui and Tang Dynasties) (Shanghai: Huadong shifan daxue chubanshe 华东师范大学出版社, 2009), 414-415, 418-420.

²⁹ Zongyang, “Fojiao jinxing shangque shu,” in *Zongyang shangren wenji*, 46-51.

³⁰ See Taixu, *Zhengli sengjia zhidulun* 整理僧伽制度论 (The Reorganization of the Sangha System) (Taipei: Xinwenfeng chubanshe, 1985).

More importantly, Zongyang chose to publish his article in the first Buddhist periodical, a periodical that was published and circulated around the lower Yangtze region, the area in which the Jinshan Incident involving Taixu had occurred just eight months earlier. His intentions seem very clearly to be in response to a target audience that tended toward radical reform within the sangha.

The majority of Zongyang's writings were published in the Buddhist periodical *Foxue congbao*, with a few exceptions found in other secular newspapers. Generally speaking, after 1911 and in the early Republican era, everything Zongyang published relating to Buddhism appeared in *Foxue congbao*, while his writings on other social issues, such as the assassination of Song Jiaoren 宋教仁 (1882-1913), a Republican revolutionary and one of the founders of the Kuomintang, appeared in *Min li bao* 民立报 (Peoples' Independence, circulated 1910-1913).³¹ As for issues pertaining to Buddhism, Zongyang suggested that the central government use Buddhism as an ambassador to solve issues concerning Mongolia and Tibet instead of resorting to violence, expounded upon the moral function of Buddhism in Chinese society, and presented a petition to preserve Buddhist properties.³² Meanwhile, Zongyang's other projects included reprinting the Buddhist Canon (1909-1913) and establishing Huayan University 华严大学 in 1914, the first Buddhist university in China located in Shanghai; both projects were funded by Haroon.³³ After 1914, Zongyang gradually ceased writing in newspapers and periodicals and focused mainly on restoring Qixia Temple in 1920-1921. In the last ten years of his life,

³¹ For more information on *Min li bao* see Liu Jialin 刘家林, *Zhongguo xinwen tongshi* 中国新闻通史 (General History of Chinese Journalism) (Wuhan: Wuhandaxue chubanshe, 1995), 307.

³² Zongyang, "Zhi caijiemin xiansheng shu" 至蔡子民先生书 (Letter to Mr. Cai Jiemin), "Ku Songjiaoren zhi aisheng" 哭宋教仁之哀声 (On the Demise of Mr. Song Jiaoren), "Ni shang Fojiao Zonghui xiang zhengfu qingyuan bujiao mengzang yijianshu 拟上佛教总会向政府请愿布教蒙藏意见书 (Petition to the Government from China Buddhist Association on the Issue of Preaching in Mongolia and Tibet)," in *Zongyang shangren wenji*, 66-69, 50-56, 89-90, respectively.

³³ Chiara Betta, "Silas Aaron Haroon and Cross-cultural Adaptation in Shanghai," 221.

however, he witnessed the gradual development of Buddhist media in modern China, which included both newspapers and periodicals. In 1919, just two years before he died, *Haichao yin* appeared, a journal organized and established by Taixu, which later became one of the most influential Buddhist periodicals in modern China.

Between the 1890s and 1912, very few Buddhist monks besides Zongyang appeared as authors in newspapers or periodicals. Manshu 曼殊 (1884-1918) was the only other name I have been able to find, while Jichan's name appeared in poetic correspondences with other literati.³⁴ They also enjoyed eminent reputations within the sangha. Jichan was elected president of the Chinese General Buddhist Association (Zhonghua Fojiao zonghui, 中华佛教总会)³⁵ and was known for his talent in writing poetry. Manshu, whose erratic behavior led to his being dismissed from the sangha several times, was more of a poet, translator, and novelist than a monk.³⁶ Works by both men appeared in journals before 1912, but they were all poems and works of literature. Like many literati of their time, Manshu and Jichan were concerned about the fate of the nation and advocated patriotism, but limited that message to the people around them. Even though their critiques of society were occasionally conveyed in their poems published in newspapers or periodicals, the format and structure of that message restricted their ideas to a very limited audience. Hence, during the initial stage of involvement of the Buddhist clergy with new media publications, monks generally did not develop their own solutions to the social and political problems occupying the nation at that time and only followed the discourse set by reformist intellectuals. However, the existence of some voices in these publications was better than none at

³⁴ One article by Manshu, a preface to his painting collection, appeared in *Tian yi bao* 天义报 (Heavenly Mandate) in 1907. See *Wanqing qikan quanwen shujuku*. Jichan is mentioned in *Guo cui bao* 国粹报 (National Classics) in 1907 in a poem by the iteratus Bo Tao 伯韬 commemorating a visit by Jichan. See also *Wanqing qikan quanwen shujuku*.

³⁵ Don Pittman, *Toward a Modern Chinese Buddhism*, 50.

³⁶ Francesca Tarocco, *The Cultural Practices of Modern Chinese Buddhism: Attuning the Dharma* (New York: Routledge, 2007), 66-71.

all. And following the fall of the Qing, publishers and lay Buddhists quickly realized that it was time to let the voice of Buddhism be heard in society. Starting in Shanghai, various Buddhist periodicals appeared and spread throughout the nation. In the next two chapters, I depict the situation of the sangha and the Buddhist community during this period that saw the flourishing of Buddhist publications.

4.0 THE FLOURISHING OF BUDDHIST PERIODICALS AND THE MESSAGE OF MODERNITY

Starting with *Foxue congbao*, which began publication just as the Republic was forming, periodicals gradually became the preferred platform for various Buddhists to compete for power in terms of recognizing the essence of Buddhism in a modern context, adapting Buddhism to the paradigm of a modern state-church relationship, renouncing superstitious ideas and ritual practices in Buddhism, and reforming the sangha to meet the requirements of a modern Buddhism. Buddhist clergy also undertook other activities, such as publishing books, organizing national or regional Buddhist clerical and lay associations as well as international organizations, and submitting political petitions to the government for preserving Buddhist properties. Buddhist periodicals, however, due to their frequency of publication, ability to convey large amounts of information, popularity with clergy and lay Buddhists, and ability to reach a wide audience, served as a vital connecting platform for all these activities. Yet messages transmitted through periodicals also needed to be tailored to suit the periodical format, which required that both writing style and concepts be accessible to a wide readership and not only to a small circle of literati and elite monks. Despite Bourdieu's assertion that "art and cultural consumption are predisposed, consciously and deliberately or not, to fulfill a social function of legitimating social

differences,”¹ most Buddhist periodical, along with many other social publication, of that time were aimed at converting more readers to their side, as many polemical articles appeared in them that attempted to provide legitimate ground on which Buddhist could continue to exist and serve the Chinese society. Bourdieu, however, was correct about social differences in that wider Republican China society still perceived Buddhists not as holding an advantageous position in society but as constantly under attack. Buddhists were accused of being backwards and cultural dregs, of being out of place in a modern nation, and thus, like Confucians, should be treated as relics of feudalism. Among Buddhists, disputes over how the religion should be run and who had the power to define the discourse of a reform project were taking place as well. Therefore, tracing the publication activities of Taixu, who lived through this period and who witnessed and participated in the entire process of constructing a new Buddhism, will reveal the dynamics of forming a modern Chinese Buddhism through the perspective of periodical publications.

4.1 TAI XU’S BUDDHIST PERIODICAL PUBLISHING ACTIVITIES

Many scholars have devoted attention to Taixu and have analyzed his role in modern Chinese Buddhism reform, beginning with Holmes Welch’s *The Buddhist Revival in China*. Taixu’s influence on modern Chinese Buddhism and his humanistic Buddhist ideas were promulgated first by his disciples, particularly Yinshun 印顺 (1906-2005), who compiled the *Taixu dashi quanshu* 太虚大师全书 (Complete Works of Master Taixu) in 1948, and were then taught in Taiwan and Hong Kong. Taixu was a student in Jatavana Hermitage 祇洹精舍, which

¹ Pierre Bourdieu, *Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgement of Taste* (Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press, 1984), 7.

had been founded by Yang Wenhui in 1908. In his early years, as Taixu read the works of such revolutionaries as Liang Qichao, he became a revolutionary monk. After the Jinshan Incident described in the beginning of this thesis, however, Taixu conducted a meditation retreat for three years. Upon its completion, although still a revolutionary monk, Taixu began promoting his reform in a more tactical way, including reaching out to intellectuals, building relationships with various associations as well as the Nationalist government, and travelling around China and abroad.² Both Western and Chinese scholars have conducted extensive research on Taixu's life, his Buddhist doctrinal philosophy, his reform proposal for the sangha and the laity, and his innovation of humanistic Buddhism (*Renjian Fojiao*, 人间佛教).³ Here, I shall focus on his activities of editing and publishing Buddhist newspapers and periodicals, the primary means by which he, like Zongyang, promulgated his ideas and claims.

Taixu clearly understood the function of modern media in terms of propaganda and used it as a means of restoring Chinese Buddhism even before the appearance of *Foxue congbao*. In the “Fojiao xunbao xuyan” 佛化旬报绪言 (Preface to the *Buddhistic Trimonthly*), he recalled that, “[S]ince the Guang [Guangxu, 1875-1908] and Xuan [Xuantong, 1908-1911] periods, I have been planning to do this [edit and promote Buddhist media], but due to the timing, nothing was accomplished.”⁴ Taixu's first involvement with Buddhist newspapers was as chief editor of *Fojiao yuebao* 佛教月报 (Buddhism Monthly), first published by the Chinese General Buddhist

² Vincent Goossaert and David A. Palmer, *Religious Question in Modern China* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2011), 80-81.

³ Works on humanistic Buddhism includes Yin Shun 印顺, *Renjian fojiao lunji* 人间佛教论集 (Essays on Humanistic Buddhism) (Beijing: Zhonghua Shuju, 2010); Xue Yu 学愚 ed, *Renjian Fojiao yu dangdai lunli* 人间佛教与当代伦理 (Humanistic Buddhism and Contemporary Ethics) (Hongkong: Zhonghua shuju, 2012).

⁴ Taixu, “Fojiao xunbao xuyan” 佛化旬报绪言 (Preface to the *Buddhistic Trimonthly*), in *Taixu dashi quanshu di sanshier juan* 太虚大师全书 第三十二卷 (Complete Works of Master Taixu, vol.32), (Beijing: Zongjiao wenhua chubanshe, 2004), 377.

Association in Shanghai in 1913,⁵ but the periodical was as short-lived as the association, with only four issues published. Taixu engaged in managing Buddhist periodicals again five years later when he joined the editorial board of *Jueshe congshu* 觉社丛书 (Awakening Society Collectanea), a periodical that became *Sound of the Sea Tide* (Haichao yin) in 1919. During that interval, there were very few Buddhist periodicals and newspapers,⁶ so *Awakening Society Collectanea* and *Sound of the Sea Tide* were the two major publications in which Taixu published his works. In the first issue of the *Collectanea*, Taixu published two major works on his Buddhism reform proposals, “The Reorganization of the Sangha System” (Zhengli sengjia zhidulun, 整理僧伽制度论) and “On the True Dharma of the Buddhist Human Vehicle” (Fojiao rencheng zhengfa lun, 佛教人乘正法论). In the first article he proposed a reform of the Buddhist sangha that called for stricter organizational discipline and more systematic regulation of sangha life in accord with modern institutional configurations; the second emphasized reform to a “this-worldly” orientation of modern Buddhism that would encourage monks to devote more attention to social matters than they had hitherto been devoting.⁷

Taixu also encouraged the publication of other Buddhist newspapers and periodicals in addition to *Haichao yin*. In response, his disciples and lay followers founded many Buddhist journals, such as *Fohua Xinqingnian* 佛化新青年 (The Young Men's Buddhism Monthly, circulated 1923-1924) and *Xiandai sengjia* 现代僧伽 (Modern Sangha, 1928-1932), later became *Xiandai Fojiao* 现代佛教 (Modern Buddhism, 1932-1933). Taixu also greatly valued

⁵ Hong Jinlian 洪金莲, *Taixu dashi Fojiao xiandaihua zhi yanjiu* 太虚大师佛教现代化之研究 (On Taixu's Modernization of Buddhism) (Taipei: Dongchu chubanshe, 1995), 102.

⁶ Ibid.

⁷ *Jueshe congshu* no. 01 (1918), in *Minguo Fojiao qikan wenxian Jicheng diliujuan* 民国佛教文献期刊集成第六卷 (Complete Collection of Republican-Era Buddhist Periodical Literature, volume 60, edited by Huang Xianian 黄夏年 (Beijing, China: Quanguo tushuguan wenxian weisuo zhongxin, 2006), 358.

Buddhist newspapers. In “Fojiao ribao fakantici” 佛教日报发刊题辞 (Foreword to the *Buddhist Daily*) that appeared in the third issue of *Fojiao ribao* in 1935, he wrote that, “[Buddhist] daily newspapers only first appeared in Beijing in 1923, but lasted just for less than a year. . . . Last year *Shanghai shiminbao fukan* 上海市民报副刊 (*Shanghai Citizen Daily’s Supplement*) included ‘Fojiao tekan’ 佛教特刊 (Buddhism Specials);⁸ [the paper] has ceased [publication] now, so the only daily newspaper for Buddhism is this *Buddhist Daily*.”⁹ This sentence suggests that Taixu had great expectations that Buddhist newspapers could help spread the Buddhist message and restore the image of Buddhism in the eyes of the public. In the foreword, Taixu also described what he saw as the purpose of Buddhist media, which was “on the one hand, to let Buddhists recognize their own duty and meaning so as to shoulder the responsibility of upholding and protecting Buddhism and, on the other hand, to correct societal misunderstandings toward Buddhism so as to allow non-believers to receive the right message of Buddhism.”¹⁰ Due to financial problems, most of the Buddhist newspapers and periodicals established in the first two decades of the twentieth century did not last long, but Taixu nonetheless persisted in believing that they were an effective way to spread his message.

⁸ *Fojiao tekan* started in 1932 and ended in 1934. Ruan Renze 阮仁泽 and Gao Zhengnong 高振农, *Shanghai Zongjiaoshi* 上海宗教史 (History of Religion in Shanghai) (Shanghai: Shanghai renmin chubanshe, 1992), 395.

⁹ Taixu, “Fojiao ribao fakantici” 佛教日报发刊题辞 (Foreword to the *Buddhist Daily*), in *Taixu dashi quanshu di sanshier juan*, 381.

¹⁰ *Ibid.*, 383.

4.2 A COMPARISON BETWEEN TAIXU AND YINGUANG

Yinguang was born in 1861, about thirty years before Taixu, but he was active—and popular—mainly around the same time that Taixu was becoming prominent in the Buddhist community. Unlike Taixu, who did not have a clear Buddhist lineage background, Yinguang explicitly belonged to the Pure Land School and compiled a history of the lineage of the twelve Pure Land patriarchs.¹¹ In fact, his followers later recognized him as the thirteenth patriarch of the school.¹² Due to the peculiarity of the Pure Land lineage system by which its patriarchs are recognized posthumously in terms of the contributions each made to the Pure Land tradition, Yinguang’s religious authority was derived in a way similar to that of Zongyang and Taixu—through the modern publication industry. Yinguang’s involvement with periodicals, however, was less innovative and whole-hearted than that of the other two figures. Yinguang tends to be neglected in the study of Buddhism in Republican China due to his eclectic views on the issues of reform and modernizing Buddhism. He represents traditional Buddhism in that he insisted on the Pure Land tradition of inner cultivation and argued that by simple practice all people could realize the Buddha nature within them.¹³ Steven Heine and Charles S. Prebish also argue that he is a figure with a “conservative reaction against modernism.”¹⁴ During his life, however, and especially after the fall of the Qing house, Yinguang became more and more popular among the

¹¹ Francesca Tarocco, *The Cultural Practices of Modern Chinese Buddhism*, 65-67.

¹² Zhang Xuesong, “A Critical Study on Yinguang and His Reconstruction of Chinese Pure Land Buddhism,” Ph.D. dissertation, Chinese University of Hong Kong, 2008, 8. Chün-fang Yü, *The Renewal of Buddhism in China* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1981), 36-52.

¹³ Jan Kiely, “Spreading the Dharma with the Mechanized Press: New Buddhist Print Cultures in the Modern Chinese Print Revolution, 1866-1949,” in *From Woodblocks to the Internet: Chinese Publishing and Print Culture in Transition, Circa 1800 to 2008*, ed. Christopher A. Reed and Cynthia Brokaw (Leiden and Boston: Brill, 2010), 200-01.

¹⁴ Steven Heine and Charles S. Prebish, “Introduction: Traditions and Transformations in Modern Buddhism,” in *Buddhism in the Modern World: Adaptations of an Ancient Tradition*, ed. Steven Heine and Charles S. Prebish (New York: Oxford University Press, 2003), 7.

laity, leading to a “rise of fervent Pure Land activism in the 1920s.”¹⁵ The majority of Yinguang’s work was circulated as *Yinguang fashi wenchao* 印光法师文钞 (Collected Writings of Dharma Master Yinguang), which contains material in various literary genres, including his correspondence with friends, responses to questions from lay Buddhists, and prefaces to various Buddhist works such as sutra collections and religious paintings.¹⁶ Although he occasionally published in journals and periodicals, he did not take advantage of that platform to its full extent, as evidenced by the pseudonym he always used, Chang Cankui Seng 常惭愧僧, or “Ever-Ashamed Monk.”¹⁷ Hence I compare the publishing activities of Yinguang and Taixu to illustrate their different attitudes toward new media and how these attitudes resulted in different legacies for two major Buddhist figures of the modern era.

As noted above, Taixu acutely perceived that the new media of newspapers and periodicals could convey his message to a wider audience in Chinese society and could also propel discussion about the best direction in which to reform Buddhism. Of the many examples collected by Pittman to show how Taixu utilized periodicals to engage a wider readership, one involving a confrontation between Buddhism and Christianity is particularly interesting. A. J. Brace, an official of the Young Men's Christian Association in Chengdu, claimed that Taixu’s journals threatened the conversion efforts of missionaries. “They [people in Chengdu] had been heralded for more than a year,” Brace wrote, “and their way was prepared by a wide circulation of Taixu’s popular magazine, ‘*Haichao Yin.*’ Very carefully edited articles had prepared the people for the visit of the missionaries [Taixu’s students], and the new message found a ready

¹⁵ Jan Kiely, “Spreading the Dharma with the Mechanized Press: New Buddhist Print Cultures in the Modern Chinese Print Revolution, 1866-1949,” in *From Woodblocks to the Internet*, 202.

¹⁶ See Yinguang, *Yinguang fashi wenchao* 印光法师文钞 (Collected Writings of Dharma Master Yinguang) (Beijing: Zongjiao wenhua chubanshe, 2000).

¹⁷ See, for example, Chuan Can 常惭 “Zongjiao buyi hunlan hun” 宗教不宜混滥论 (On Religion Should not be Confounded), *Foxue congbao*, no.4 (1914): 1-7, in *MFQ* vol.4, 11-17.

response even before their arrival.”¹⁸ Thus, if Brace can be believed, Taixu relied heavily on his publications to establish a foundation for Buddhist conversion and targeted their messages towards an audience who desired the advancement of society. Brace summarized three main emphases of *Haichao yin*: a real desire to reform monasticism; a plan to reconstruct Buddhist theology along the lines of modern philosophy; and the usage of Buddha’s teachings to elevate the people and improve social conditions.¹⁹ Thus *Haichao yin* was a vital means for Taixu to reach his audience during a chaotic era in which that audience was presented with more than one choice of religion.

Yinguang also participated in the modern publication industry, but in a different way. Historian Zhang Xuesong notes that Yinguang used modern printing technology, the postal communication system, and developments in transportation to establish a huge network of lay Buddhist followers,²⁰ yet his publications were seldom actually written by him but were more often submitted by others who attended his lectures and then published notes. The first edition of his *Collected Writings* was published in 1918, and the book rapidly grew into several editions with more content added each time until, in 1925, the “Zhonghua Books edition had become so massive that it was inordinately expensive to print.”²¹ Jan Kiely calls the *Collected Writings* “a Buddhist publishing phenomenon,” but though the book was published in various editions, its frequency still did not match that of a periodical. Thus it seems that Yinguang did not adopt a strategy of using newspapers and periodicals to convert lay Buddhists *en masse*. Another characteristic of Yinguang’s publications is that he was not in control of any publications other than his *Collected Writings*, which means that, though he advocated Pure Land practice in a

¹⁸ Pittman, *Toward a Modern Chinese Buddhism: Taixu's Reforms*, 100.

¹⁹ *Ibid.*, 101.

²⁰ Zhang Xuesong, “A Critical Study on Yinguang and His Reconstruction of Chinese Pure Land Buddhism,” 6-7.

²¹ Jan Kiely, “Spreading the Dharma with the Mechanized Press: New Buddhist Print Cultures in the Modern Chinese Print Revolution, 1866-1949,” in *From Woodblocks to the Internet*, 200.

secular world, he was still wary of commercial printing forms like periodicals. In fact, rather than publish works for sale, Yinguang printed many texts for free circulation, which were supported by his lay followers.²²

Yinguang and Taixu had different ideas about what Chinese Buddhism should look like in a modern world, yet their ideas were not radically opposed. Similarly, in their effort to spread the Dharma, they both turned to the modern printing industry but differed in the extent to which they relied on it. Ambitious and eager to reform the sangha, Taixu exploited every means available to him, so that he not only founded *Haichao yin* but also urged his followers to engage in social publication ventures. Many advertisements printed in *Haichao yin* also appeared in other Buddhist periodicals, and many other regional Buddhist magazines resonated with calls for the overall reform of Chinese Buddhism, including the aforementioned *Fohua xinqingnian* and *Xiandai sengjia*. Meanwhile, though Yinguang did use the modern publication system to spread Pure Land Buddhism, his attitude toward those media followed the “morality movement” started in the seventeenth century by Yuan Huang 袁黄 (1533-1606) and Buddhist leader and anti-Jesuit Yunqi Zhuhong 云栖祿宏 (1535-1615). This movement advocated the use of morality books, a type of text written in plain language, to exhort people towards moral cultivation and practices with this-worldly concerns.²³ The efficiency of printing and the convenience of modern communication were for Yinguang an opportunity to spread the Pure Land teaching, which provided spiritual relief for practitioners who were undergoing social transitions and feeling hopeless about the future. Yinguang encouraged those believers to develop a balanced

²² Rulu, *Thinking of Amitabha Buddha: Selected Mahayana Sutras* (Author House, 2012), 223. Zhang Xuesong, “A Critical Study on Yinguang and His Reconstruction of Chinese Pure Land Buddhism,” 121.

²³ You Zian 游子安, *Shan yu ren tong—Mingqing yilai de cishan yu jiaohua* 善与人同一明清以来的慈善与教化 (Goodness and Fellowship: Charity and Moral Education since the Ming and Qing) (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 2005), 168.

psychological dependence on themselves and others,²⁴ but he did not make a particular call to change Buddhism itself. Scholars working on intellectual and monastic history, therefore, easily perceive Taixu's espousal of reform but overlook or undervalue Yinguang's efforts at mass conversion. Taixu and Yinguang, then, represent two approaches to the intersection between monastic Buddhism and modern periodical publications: the former exploited the new media to spread a new more socially engaged message for both the sangha and society at large, while the latter used modern printing technology to promote a traditional message.

The examples of Taixu and Yinguang indicate the complex picture of Buddhist publications in Republican China. Although from a present-day perspective Taixu seemed to have controlled the power of discourse on Buddhism during his time, the actual situation is more complex once we examine the Buddhist culture of publication. To determine the extent to which the messages of these monks were efficiently conveyed to their intended audiences requires more than just an examination of their publishing activities, but also an examination of the actual publications themselves and responses to them. One way to begin to do that is by looking at the advertisements that appear in these publications. Hence in the final chapter, I examine the advertisements of Buddhist periodicals in Shanghai—the center of the Buddhist publishing industry at that time—to determine what the actual concerns and needs of Buddhist consumers were and how those advertisements reflected the dynamics of Buddhist printings and social perceptions.

²⁴ Chen Bin 陈兵 and Deng Zimei 邓子美, *Ershi shiji Zhongguo Fojiao* 二十世纪中国佛教 (Chinese Buddhism in the Twentieth Century) (Beijing: Minzu chubanshe 民族出版社), 319.

5.0 A WINDOW INTO THE BUDDHIST COMMUNITY: ADVERTISEMENTS IN BUDDHIST PERIODICALS

Between 1912 and 1949, more than two hundred Buddhist periodicals appeared in China, and those periodicals were an important intersection between monastic Buddhism and the laity as well as between the Buddhist community and Chinese society in general. Examining the extent to which these periodicals can elucidate the overall development and transformation of Chinese Buddhism, here I focus on the advertisements that appeared in them, which act as a window into the Buddhist community and into the social perception of Chinese Buddhism at large. More specifically, I concentrate on those periodicals published in Shanghai between 1912 and 1937, that is, those published between the establishment of the Republican period and the start of the Sino-Japanese War, which interrupted general social life, shifted the focus of social concern to the conflict, and changed the market for ordinary commercial and religious products. I also consider influential periodicals published in other large cities in this period, but focus mainly on those from Shanghai for reasons outlined below.

Of all the periodicals published in the Republican period, Shanghai boasted the largest number of different kinds of Buddhist journals.¹ Shanghai should therefore be considered a core city for the Buddhist periodical publishing industry. In fact, Shanghai was and still is a leading

¹ Huang Xianian 黄夏年, "Minguo Fojiao qikan wenxian jicheng bubian xuyan" 民国佛教期刊文献集成补编序言, in *Minguo Fojiao qikan wenxian jicheng bubian mulu* 民国佛教期刊文献集成补编目录 (Catalogue of the Supplement to the Collection of Republican-Era Buddhist Periodical Literature), ed. Huang Xianian 黄夏年 (Beijing: Zhongguo shudian, 2008), 1-5.

city in China for Westernization and modernization, and as such it boasts a unique hybrid culture mingling West and East. An examination of Buddhist periodicals published in Shanghai in the first two decades of the Republic moreover reveals a typical pattern of commercial advertisements that had more or less become standardized throughout China by that time. Because the modern publishing style found in Buddhist periodicals published in Shanghai between 1912 and 1937 moreover was fully developed in Buddhist periodicals elsewhere in the country, Shanghai periodicals can serve as representative of periodicals and advertisements throughout China.

5.1 TYPES OF ADVERTISEMENTS IN SHANGHAI BUDDHIST PERIODICALS

There were about thirty-two different Buddhist periodicals published in Shanghai between 1912 and 1937.² The total number of volumes of each varied, from only a single issue, as with the *Banchan donglai ji* 班禅东来记 (Record of the Panchen Lama's Visit to the East, 1925), to more than one hundred issues, as with *Shiji fojiao jushilin linkan* (1923-1937) and *Foxue banyuekan* 佛学半月刊 (Buddhism Semimonthly, 1930-1944). The level of commercialization, as exemplified by the number, size, and style of advertisements, also differed according to the features and style of the particular periodical.

I have categorized advertisements appearing in these periodicals into four types. The first and most common kind advertised Buddhist texts and prints produced by the same press or approved by the same editorial board. This category also included advertisements for religious

² Huang Xianian, ed., *Minguo Fojiao qikan wenxian jicheng bubian mulu*, 1-2.

images and other religious products. The earliest Buddhist periodical, *Foxue congbao*, contained this kind of advertisement, usually on the last page of each issue. In its inaugural issue (September 1912), for example, there were two pages of commercial ads promoting Buddhist products sold by its press, Youzheng Books 有正书局, the first of which mainly advertised traditional texts for Buddhist practice and meditation, while the second promoted commentary texts on sutras as well as interpretative texts on the Buddha and Buddhist doctrine in general, with a few products like Buddhist paintings (see figure 1).³ In the second issue (November, 1912), the content of the advertising included more images and fewer commentary texts, but advertisements for traditional texts like famous sutras and the writings of eminent monks were absent.⁴ The religious paintings sold by Youzheng Books were not produced by the press itself but by Nanjing Jingfang 南京经坊 (Nanjing Sutra House), and here the press provided a platform to expand those sales.

Due to that *Foxue congbao* was the first Chinese Buddhist periodical, even though it only published twelve issues, its pattern of commercial advertisements set the pattern for other periodicals to follow. Later, as more and more commercial ads appeared in various Buddhist periodicals, many followed *Foxue congbao* in promoting Buddhist literature and art products made or sold by the periodical's own publishing house. Another example is *Shijie Fojiao jushilin linkan*, published by Shijie Fojiao Jushilin 世界佛教居士林 (World Buddhist Lay Association), in which there were seven pages of ads for Buddhist texts and one page of ads for paintings at the end. Here however a slightly different practice is evident, in that many of the advertised books and texts were not published by the same press as was the periodical. The editorial board

³ *Foxue congbao* no. 01 (1912), in *MFQ* vol.1, 179-180.

⁴ *Foxue congbao* no. 03 (1912), in *MFQ* vol.1, 545-546.

certainly would have had to approve the ad copy and so could not have been too averse to advertising other publishers' products. Whatever their provenance, advertisements in this first category followed the traditional reading and practice habits of Chinese Buddhists, both laity and clergy, which emphasized classic texts and daily worship of the Buddha image. The publishing houses also took advantage of—and showed off—their mechanical printing techniques by providing print images of Buddhas, bodhisattvas, and other Buddhist themes on a larger scale and at lower cost than sculptures and figurines.

The second category of advertisement aimed at enhancing a particular monk's reputation or expressing particular views of the periodical's editors by promoting books or periodicals that supported the monk or editorial views in question. These advertisements appeared in Buddhist periodicals in Shanghai as well as in other parts of the country starting in the early 1920s. A typical example is the promotion of *Haichao yin*, a key periodical for Buddhist reform then and now, as evidenced by its early relationship with Taixu and its continued reform agenda into the present. Advertisements announcing the publication of its upcoming issue appeared frequently in many other Buddhist periodicals, and many times those periodicals did not belong to the same publisher, indicating the non-territorial attitude within the Buddhist publication community. For example, the first issue of *Fohua* 佛化 (Buddhist Teachings) in October 1921 contained a quarter-page advertisement for *Haichao yin*, explicitly calling it “the best Buddhist periodical in the great universe” (see figure 2) even though it was published by Taidong Shuju 泰东书局 (Taidong Press) which was not the same press for *Hai chaoyin*.⁵ Similarly, *Foxue xunkan* 佛学旬刊 (Buddhist Studies Trimonthly) in 1922 also carried an advertisement for *Haichao yin*, which was not as large as the one in *Fohua* but which placed the title “*Haichao yin*” in a

⁵ *Fohua* no. 01 (1933), in *MFQB* vol. 01, 366.

rectangle of darkened dots to catch the reader's eye and specifically informed the reader that the next issue of *Haichao yin* had been published and was available for purchase.⁶ Notably, *Foxue xunkan* was edited and published in Chengdu, not Shanghai, but it carried similar advertisements for this Shanghai periodical.

Other similar types of promotional advertisements can be found for particular figures of that era. Taixu is a perfect example. He was a prolific author on Buddhism and an eminent figure in discussions of Buddhist reform. Because of his fame as a revolutionary monk as well as his role in the Jinshan Incident, so many advertisements were related to him in some way. For example, the advertised product might be his own writings or a summary of one of his lectures compiled by someone else. In September 1926, for example, the second issue of *Dongfang wenhua* 东方文化 (Eastern Culture) carried advertisements for a series of pamphlets promoting all kinds of new publications by the publishing house Taidong Shuju; Taixu's new work, "Renshengguan de kexue" 人生观的科学 (The Scientific View of Human Life),⁷ was included among these.⁸ Furthermore, because Taixu's work was a response to another influential debate, "Kexuan lunzhan" 科玄论战 (Debate between Science and Metaphysics),⁹ the publishing house also advertised an edited book of essays from the debate after the advertisement for Taixu's work.¹⁰ From the perspective of the publishing house, these advertisements were primarily intended to boost sales, but they also broadened the readership of Taixu's works by providing a

⁶ *Foxue xunkan* no. 03 (1922), in *MFQB* vol. 01, 385. The only preserved issues of *Foxue xunkan* start with issue 3 and end with issue 12 in 1922.

⁷ See Taixu, "Renshengguan de kexue" 人生观的科学 (Scientific View of Human Life), in *Taixu dashi quanshu* vol. 25.

⁸ *Dongfang wenhua* no. 02, in *MFQ* vol. 20, 544.

⁹ See Zhang Junmai 张君勱, Ding Wenjiang 丁文江 and others, *Kexue yu Renshengguan* 科学与人生观 (Science and the View of Human Life) (Jinan: Shandong renmin chubanshe, 1997).

¹⁰ *Dongfang wenhua* no. 02, in *MFQ* vol. 20, 545. The name of the edited volume is *Renshengguan de lun zhan* 人生观的论战 (Debate on View of Human Life), published by Taidong shuju.

comprehensive understanding of the position against which he was arguing and how he made his case.

In addition to the examples above, other Buddhist periodicals and newspapers were also promoted. In the middle of the front page of the first issue of *Foxue banyuekan* (1930) was an advertisement for another Buddhist periodical which appeared in the same year, *Zhongsheng* 钟声 (The Sound of the Bell), which included a brief description of the journal and its price.¹¹ Similar advertisements can also be found in *Husheng bao* 护生报 (Protecting Life), which promoted five other relevant Buddhist journals and newspapers.¹² As more and more Buddhist publications were established, including newspapers, periodicals, magazines, and books, the number of advertisements in them also grew rapidly as publishers made efforts to promote their publications. In short, advertisers sought and reached out to a broader and deeper readership base.

The third category of advertisement announced Buddhist services offered by individuals or by Buddhist study societies. The most conspicuous examples were advertisements selling the personal talents of calligraphers and painters. For example, in *Foxue banyuekan* (issue 49, 1933) were two separate advertisements for the literary services of the scholar-educator Jiang Qian 江谦 (1875-1942) promoting services relevant to Buddhists. His services included calligraphic writings of Buddhist aphorisms on scrolls, fans and so on—with prices depending on the length of the scroll—as well as much more expensive script and text composition services, including poetry, prefaces, and epilogues.¹³ The same advertisement appeared in the fourth issue of

¹¹ *Foxue banyuekan* no. 01 (1930), in *MFQ* vol. 47, 2.

¹² *Hu shengbao* no.76 (1935), in *MFQ* vol. 79, 214.

¹³ *Foxue banyuekan* no.49 (1931), in *MFQ* vol. 48, 93.

Foguangshe shekan 佛光社社刊 (Journal of the Buddhist Light Society) in 1932 as well, but there it only occupied one page.¹⁴

Besides advertisements for individual services, there were also announcements of institutional Buddhist services, like lectures and college admissions. For instance, *Zheng xin* 正信 (Right Faith), which was a periodical published in Wuchang 武昌, printed a notice about admissions to Wuchang Foxue Nuezhong Yuan 武昌佛学女众院 (The Female Division of Wuchang Buddhist College) in February 1934,¹⁵ and the next issue also contained an admissions advertisement for Puti Jingshe 菩提精舍 (Bodhi Vihara).¹⁶ In the third issue of *Foxue xunkan*, right next to an advertisement for *Haichao yin*, was a notification of a sutra lecture at the Chengdu Fojing Liutongche (成都佛经流通处 (Chengdu Buddhist Sutra Circulation Center), beginning with a full-page description of the operation of the circulation center.¹⁷ In addition to these individual and institutional religious services, this category also includes advertisements for religious goods manufactured or provided by the publishing house. The best examples of these appeared in *Foxue banyuekan*, which included ads for goods useful in the practice of Buddhism, like incense burners, Buddha lamps, and wooden fish.¹⁸

Generally speaking, advertisements of this third category were closely related to the activities of the Buddhist community as well as to Chinese society. Neither individual services, like calligraphy and script writing, nor institutional services, like Buddhist education and public lectures, were new to the Republican era. However, the promotion of these services in Buddhist periodicals, which had such a wide reach and readership, reflected the mobility of information

¹⁴ *Foguangshe shekan* no. 04, in *MFQ* vol. 17, 102.

¹⁵ *Zheng xin* no. 18 (1934), in *MFQB* vol. 43, 358.

¹⁶ *Zheng xin* no. 18 (1934), in *MFQB* vol. 43, 355.

¹⁷ *Foxue xunkan* no. 03 (1922), in *MFQB* vol. 1, 385.

¹⁸ *Foxue banyuekan* no. 49 (1931), in *MFQ* vols. 48, 88, 89.

and the eagerness of the Buddhist community to present itself to the masses during that era. At the same time, it can also be seen as a reflection of the religiosity of Chinese society and the social situation of Buddhism, to which I will return below.

The last type of advertisement cannot be easily categorized as Buddhist as it included various products, activities, and services that fall more obviously into other social and economic categories. These advertisements appeared in Buddhist periodicals in Shanghai as well as in many other places in China. Based on the variety of this kind of advertisement, they can be further subcategorized. First are advertisements for non-Buddhist magazines and books. For example, the third issue of *Foxue congbao* already contained a commercial advertisement for the magazine *Tielu xiehui* 铁路协会 (Railway Association). Its publisher was not particularly related to the editorial board of *Foxue congbao* nor was its distributor related to Youzheng Books, yet the *Railway Association* advertisement was printed consecutively in the fifth and sixth issues of *Foxue congbao*.¹⁹

The second subcategory advertised the commercial activities of the publishing house. One of the more common business advertisements for many publishing houses dealt with fundraising and stock selling. In the twenty-third issue of *Shijie Fojiao jushilin linkan* (1929), for example, there was a stock offering advertisement for Foxue shuju 佛学书局 (Buddhist Press).²⁰ A deadline notification for purchasing stock in *Dafalun Shuju* 大法轮书局 (Great Dharma Wheel Press) also appeared in *Jue youqing banyuekan* 觉有情半月刊 (Bodhisattva Semi-monthly) in 1944.²¹ In addition to these financial advertisements for publishing houses, there were also advertisements announcing investment opportunities, such as one for Lisheng Gufen

¹⁹ *Foxue congbao* no. 05 (1913) and no. 06 (1913), in *MFQ* vol. 2, 381, 560.

²⁰ *Shijie Fojiao jushilin linkan* no. 23 (1929), in *MFQB* vol. 10, 224.

²¹ *Jue youqing banyuekan* no.123 (1944), in *MFBQ* vol. 62, 309.

Youxian Gongsi 利生股份有限公司 (Lisheng Co., Ltd) that appeared in *Foxue banyukan* in 1937.²² Usually corporations advertising in this way were linked to the cause of Buddhism in some way, or else their founders were connected to the publishing house or to the editorial board.

A third subcategory of advertisement promoted various consumer products intended for daily use but which linked the product to Buddhism to appeal to the readers of Buddhist periodicals. One such advertisement for Tianchu Gourmet Powder 天厨味精 repeatedly appeared in *Shijie Fojiao jushilin linkan* and *Foxue banyuekan* as well as *Haichao yin*. The Taichu Gourmet Powder Factory was founded by Wu Yunchu 吴蕴初 and Zhang Yiyun 张逸云, two Shanghai entrepreneurs, to compete with Japanese-produced gourmet powder (aka monosodium glutamate) and which had successfully developed into a large corporation.²³ Advertisements for this product can be seen in both Buddhist periodicals and secular magazines, but with different descriptions and promotional tactics (see figures 3 and 4). In addition, sometimes these advertisements tried to construct a relationship with Buddhism by having prominent monks promote it, as in the case of Hehe Fen 和合粉, a kind of sauce which Taixu commented on it in an advertisement in *Foxue banyuekan* (see figure 5).²⁴

Generally, all these categories of advertisements that appeared in Buddhist periodicals in Shanghai and other places in Republican China demonstrate the distinct features of the market and their target audiences and their concerns. The various types of advertisements paralleled the need for various texts, services and products provided by both the Buddhist community and

²² *Foxue banyuekan* no. 145 (1937), in *MFQ* vol. 53, 340.

²³ Xiong Yuezhi 熊月之, *Shanghai mingren mingshi mingwu daguan* 上海名人名事名物大观 (General Introduction of Famous People, Events and Products of Shanghai), (Shanghai: Shanghai renmin chubanshe, 2004), 457.

²⁴ *Foxue banyuekan*, no. 35 (1932), in *MFQ*, vol. 47, 356.

society. Therefore, it is important to understand their subtexts, first as they relate to Buddhist society and then to the general social landscape.

5.2 THE BUDDHIST COMMUNITY BEHIND THE ADVERTISEMENTS

In the tradition of Buddhism, the Chinese Buddhist community is composed of both the monastic clergy and the laity. However, as religion in China has always been largely syncretic or non-exclusive in nature for the laity, the Buddhist laity was never easily distinguishable from the rest of society. By the Republican era, this situation had only become more complicated. As Holmes Welch observed, “Almost all Chinese were partly or occasionally Buddhist.”²⁵ Welch identified Buddhist laypeople by cataloguing different types of lay societies as well as by noting their activities such as religious publishing and the observance of vegetarianism.²⁶ However, Welch did not explore the editorial perspectives of those publications, which I have found extremely valuable for understanding the concerns and activities of the Buddhist community in general. Therefore, here I explore the implications of the advertisements appearing in Buddhist periodicals, primarily in Shanghai, in terms of the market for those advertised products and publications, their affordability for the ordinary citizen, the diversity of the Buddhist economy, and finally the shape of the general Buddhist community in and around Shanghai.

Who purchased the products appearing in Buddhist periodical advertisements? The answer can be found in the content of the periodicals and the products advertised in them. By researching the continuities and discontinuities of advertisements with respect to their content,

²⁵ Welch, *The Buddhist Revival in China*, 72.

²⁶ *Ibid.*, 74-86.

the interests of the market can be deduced. In looking at the first issue of the first Buddhist periodical, *Foxue congbao*, for example, the main subjects of its advertisements were sutras, commentaries, and excerpts of writings by eminent monks, all of which were vital for helping lay Buddhists understand the doctrines and practices of Buddhism. However, from the second issue on, advertisements for products of this type declined in number and were replaced by advertisements for Buddhist paintings, including images of Buddhas and bodhisattvas. Yet the content of advertisements varied in each issue such that, although the promotion of images became more prominent, the promotion of Buddhist sutras still appeared from time to time. For example, ads for the *Pinjia jingshe dazangjing* compiled by Zongyang as mentioned earlier appear in the fourth and sixth issues (February 1913 and May 1913)²⁷ and the promotion of the sutra house of Tianning Temple 天宁寺 appeared in the seventh issue (June 1913).²⁸ The variation of advertised products in *Foxue congbao* therefore is helpful in revealing the target audience of the journal and the market's reception of it.

Since *Foxue congbao* ceased publication after its twelfth issue (June 1914) due to financial problems,²⁹ the effectiveness of the advertisements that appeared in it is difficult to judge, but the intended audience can still be deduced when the content of the journal itself is taken into consideration. Generally, *Foxue congbao* was aimed at Buddhists whose literacy level was above average. Although pages of ads selling printed images are consistently found, the promotion of sutras printed by different sutra houses also appear from time to time. For example, in its tenth issue (March 1914) there is an advertisement for sutras by the Hunan Buddhist

²⁷ *Foxue congbao* no. 04 (1913) and no. 06 (1913), in *MFQ* vol. 2, 179, 562.

²⁸ *Foxue congbao* no. 07 (1913), in *MFQ* vol. 3, 145-148.

²⁹ Meng Lingbin 孟令兵, *Lao Shanghai de wenhua qipa—Shanghai Foxue shuju* 老上海的文化奇葩—上海佛学书局 (*The Extraordinary Culture of Old Shanghai: Shanghai Buddhist Books*) (Shanghai: Shanghai renmin chubanshe, 2003), 17.

Society 湖南佛学会.³⁰ On the whole, advertisements in *Foxue congbao* mainly promoted texts rather than services, and those texts were not suitable for elementary-level readers but for readers with a certain degree of education. Other accounts, like that of how the reformer Liang Shuming 梁漱溟 (1893-1988) first learned Buddhism by reading articles from *Foxue congbao*,³¹ corroborate this argument about the audience of the journal.

The development of Buddhist periodicals after *Foxue congbao* took many forms, but in terms of commercial scale, two trends generally present themselves. One is a reduction in the scale of the advertisements, which might present the journal as a pure learning and scholarly communication platform. A good example comes from *Fojiao yuebao* 佛教月报 (Buddhist Monthly, circulated 1913), one of whose two editors was Taixu and which was affiliated with the Chinese General Buddhist Association. Although the journal included a price list for advertisements according to the space the ad occupied on the page and the duration of its running time,³² this journal never actually printed any commercial advertisements before it ceased publication in the same year as it appeared. This same trend is found in *Zhongguo Fojiaohui gongbao* 中国佛教会公报 (Official Bulletin of the Chinese Buddhist Association, 1929-1930), which served as the bulletin of the Chinese Buddhist Association and contained official documents, regulations, and petitions to the Kuomin government, and *Foxue congkan* 佛学丛刊 (Buddhist Studies Series, 1936), which was mainly a selection of middle-length works on Buddhism.³³

³⁰ *Foxue congbao* no. 10 (1914), in *MFQ* vol. 4, 2.

³¹ Zheng Dahua 郑大华, *Liang Shuming yu xiandai xin Ruxue* 梁漱溟与现代新儒学 (Liang Shuming and Modern Neo-Confucianism) (Beijing: Wenjin chubanshe, 1993), 13.

³² *Fojiao yuebao* no.01 (1913), in *MFQ* vol. 5, 283.

³³ For more information on *Zhongguo Fojiaohui gongbao* see Ruan Renze and Gao Zhengnong, *Shanghai zongjiaoshi*, 305. For more information on *Foxue congkan* see Ma Tianxiang 麻天祥, *Fanguan rensheng de xuanluan zhilu—jinxindai zhongguo Foxue yanjiu* 反观人生的玄览之路—近现代中国佛学研究 (Reflections on the Metaphysics of Human Life: Research on

Another trend was to maximize the level of commercialization by filling pages with all kinds of advertisements. By this measure, *Foxue banyuekan* was the most commercialized of all the Buddhist journals appearing before the Japanese invasion. It was published by Shanghai Foxue Shuju 上海佛学书局 (Shanghai Buddhist Books), an active press dedicated to the publication of Buddhist texts and related products. Many advertisements were printed in its pages to promote other texts and religious goods offered by the publishing house. Moreover, besides its own publications, Shanghai Buddhist Books also helped promote the circulation of Buddhist texts and books of other houses, stating in the first issue (October 1930) that it would provide Buddhist temples, learning societies, and clergy with a twenty percent discount on all purchases on both its publications and those of other houses, except for Yixue Shuju 医学书局 (Medical Books).³⁴ In its initial stage, each issue of the periodical was comprised of only four pages, of which advertisements occupied more than half the space on each page. This percentage remained largely the same after the journal expanded its page length to twelve pages per issue. *Foxue banyuekan* can therefore be considered more like a pamphlet or a Buddhist publication bulletin than a periodical *per se*.

The scale of circulation of Buddhist periodicals and other goods is difficult to determine due to the lack of sales records preserved by many publishing houses and editorial boards. In addition, though the economic cost of purchasing read materials continued to decline in modern China, borrowing books and journals from libraries and other channels was still popular among readers. Therefore the sales records of one book or issue of a periodical would not provide an accurate number of the size of the audience in any case. Yet a very rough estimate is attainable

Modern Chinese Buddhism) (Guyang: Guizhou renmin chubanshe, 1994), 57.

³⁴ *Foxue banyuekan* no. 01 (1930), in *MFQ* vol. 47, 7.

by taking the range of distribution and cost of purchase into consideration. The most direct answer to the question of how far a Buddhist periodical could reach usually lies on its last page, on which is printed the name of the distributor and the places of distribution. Take the first Buddhist periodical *Foxue congbao* as an example. Its publisher was Youzheng Books, whose headquarters were in Shanghai, but it also had two branches in Beijing and Tianjin.³⁵ The *Jueshe congshu* 觉社丛书 (Awakening Society Collectanea), which was the third oldest Buddhist periodical to appear in Shanghai and was edited by the Awakening Society, was published by Zhonghua Shuju 中华书局, one of the three giant book publishers in that city with branches or distribution agreements all over China. Thus the periodical was purchasable in any branch of Zhonghua Books, which covered essentially the whole nation. By the time Shanghai Buddhist Books was established in 1929, it assumed it would be able to sell most Buddhist publications and products so easily that it opened eight branches in China and contracted with more than a hundred distributors in the nation as well as in Southeast Asia.³⁶ Other periodicals also relied on certain publishing houses in Shanghai as distributors in order to reach more readers throughout the country. *Hai chaoyin*, for example, was at first edited in Hangzhou and later Wuhan and Beijing, but distributed by Zhonghua Shuju, which was based in Shanghai.³⁷

Another indicator of the size of the audience is the price of the periodical and the prices of the products advertised in it. The cost of these products naturally followed the economic trends and the inflation of currency in Republican China. Therefore, I cite the price index of rice as a point of comparison to understand the price of Buddhist products. According to Yeh-chien

³⁵ *Foxue congbao* no. 01 (1912), in *MFQ* vol. 1, 4.

³⁶ Fu Jiaoshi 傅教石, "Minguo nianjian de Shanghai Foxue shuju" 民国年间的上海佛学书局 (Shanghai Buddhist Books in Republican China), *Fayin* 法音 no. 11 (1988): 22.

³⁷ Huang Xianian, "Zhongguo Fojiaojie chuban shijian zuichang de kanwu—*Haichao yin*" 中国佛教出版界最长的刊物—海潮音, *The Longest Periodicals of Chinese Buddhist Publications: Haichao Yin*], in *Wuyue Fojiao*, volume 2 吴越佛教第二卷, ed. Hangzhou Foxueyuan 杭州佛学院 (Beijing: Zongjiao Wenhua Chubanshe, 2007), 296-297.

Wang, the rice price in the Yangtze Delta, which includes Shanghai, in 1912 was 6.16 *tael* for one *shi*, a Chinese measurement of volume amounting to 1.035 hectoliters.³⁸ And because of the chaotic currency situation in early Republican China, with both *tael* and *yinyuan* 银元 in circulation, the exchange rate between the two was roughly 1 *tael* to 1.34 *yuan*.³⁹ At that time, the price for one issue of *Foxue congbao* was 3 *jiao* with about one hundred eighty pages per issue,⁴⁰ equal to 0.3 *yuan*, and 1 *shi* was about 178 *jin*,⁴¹ which amounted to 89 kilograms. Hence purchasing one issue of *Foxue congbao* was equal to buying nearly 20 kilograms of rice. Although *shi* is a measurement of volume and the actual weight of rice might vary according to the quality of the rice, it was still a considerable expense in 1912 to purchase a Buddhist periodical, and naturally out of reach to the lower classes. The prices of image paintings, meanwhile, differed according to the size and color of the image. For example, in its second and third issue of *Foxue congbao* (November and December 1912), a color painting of “Amitābha Buddha Escorting a Believer to the Western Paradise” was advertised for 1.5 *jiao*, while a large color painting of Avalokiteśvara was for sale for 3.5 *jiao*.⁴² The economic conditions of the intellectual class, or the later so-called middle class, in cities like Shanghai and Beijing, were better than those of most other people, however, so these individuals would have been able to afford the habit of buying magazines and journals.

Five years after *Foxue congbao* first appeared, when *Jueshe congshu* began publication in 1918 with about one hundred fifty pages per issue, its price was the same as that of *Foxue congbao*. One explanation for this is that the general price index for 1912 and 1917 was

³⁸ Yeh-chien Wang, “Secular Trends of Rice Prices in the Yangzi Delta, 1638–1935,” in *Chinese History in Economic Perspective*, eds. Thomas G. Rawski and Lillian M. Li (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1992), 46.

³⁹ *Ibid.*, 47.

⁴⁰ *Foxue congbao* no. 01 (1912), in *MFQ* vol. 1, 4.

⁴¹ Chen Mingyuan 陈明远, *Wenhua ren yu qian* 文化人与钱 (Literati and Money) (Tianjin: Baihua wenyi chubanshe, 2001), 13.

⁴² *Foxue congbao* no. 01 (1912) and no. 02 (1912), in *MFQ* vol. 1, 180, 365.

similar,⁴³ so there was no need for *Jueshe congshu* to raise its price. By 1922 when *Shijie Fojiao jushilin linkan* appeared with approximately the same pages as those two above, its price was surprisingly lower than that of *Foxue congbao*, only costing 2.5 *jiao* for one issue,⁴⁴ while the price of rice had increased to 8.68 *tael* for 1 *shi*.⁴⁵ Given that both journals had a similar number of pages, it is amazing that the latter cost less than the former. In 1930, the price of *Foxue banyuekan* was 2 *jiao* for a one-year subscription,⁴⁶ even though it was much thinner and contained more advertisements than any of its predecessors, while rice prices had reached 13.22 *tael* for 1 *shi*.⁴⁷ The price of its one-year subscription was raised to 5 *jiao* in 1933, double that of its inaugural year; each issue was twelve pages.⁴⁸

A description of income status and cost of living in Shanghai in the Republican era would further help to determine potential consumers for religious periodicals and goods. According to statistics concerning the cost of living in Shanghai in 1927, the income of a family of five could be categorized into four levels: 1) monthly income over 200 *yuan* was considered wealthy; 2) income between 100 and 200 *yuan* was middle class; 3) income around 66 *yuan* was an ordinary family; 4) income below 30 *yuan* was considered poor.⁴⁹ Therefore, the purchase price of Buddhist periodicals like *Shijie Fojiao jushilin linkan* and *Foxue banyuekan* meant it was affordable for an ordinary family and above. To understand how many people were above “poor,” I cite the estimate of Du Xuncheng 杜恂诚 that there were about 1.275 million citizens

⁴³ Yu Yaohua 余耀华, *Zhongguo jiage shi* 中国价格史 (A History of Price in China) (Beijing: Zhongguo wujia chubanshe, 2000), 303.

⁴⁴ *Shijie Fojiao jushilin linkan* no.01 (1923), in *MFQ* vol. 14, 405.

⁴⁵ Yeh-chien Wang, “Secular Trends of Rice Prices in the Yangzi Delta, 1638–1935,” in *Chinese History in Economic Perspective*, 47.

⁴⁶ *Foxue banyuekan* no.01 (1930), in *MFQ* vol. 47, 2.

⁴⁷ Yeh-chien Wang, “Secular Trends of Rice Prices in the Yangzi Delta, 1638–1935,” in *Chinese History in Economic Perspective*, 47.

⁴⁸ *Foxue banyuekan* no. 68 (1933), in *MFQ* vol. 49, 1.

⁴⁹ Chen Mingyuan 陈明远, *Wenhua ren yu qian*, 76.

in Shanghai in 1933 whose income were above the poverty line.⁵⁰ Hence the potential audience for Buddhist periodicals as well as other products was more than a million in Shanghai, not counting those who were in a similar economic situation around the lower Yangzi Delta and in other large cities like Beijing, Wuhan, Guangzhou, and so on.

With such a large potential population for the consumption of Buddhist periodicals, there is no wonder that so many of them appeared in about the forty years between the 1911 Revolution, which ended the dynastic rule of China, and the rise of the Chinese Communist Party and establishment of the People's Republic of China in 1949. Advertisements, as well as the format of periodicals, were new to Buddhism in modern China, thus their emergence was closely related to the general print culture of the era. In analyzing advertisements in Buddhist periodicals, I have consistently encountered content and format that cannot be separated from the social culture. Hence I turn now to locating these advertisements within the holistic view of print culture of Republican era Shanghai.

5.3 ADVERTISING FOR THE MODERNIZATION OF BUDDHISM

David McMahan accurately complicated the notion of “Western Buddhism,” originally thought to be a Western adaptation and recreation of Buddhism for modernity, stating that it was a “cocreation of Asians, Europeans, and Americans.”⁵¹ The project of modernizing Buddhism occurred in China starting in the mid- and late nineteenth century, symbolized by the lay Chinese

⁵⁰ Du Xuncheng 杜恂诚, “1933 Nian Shanghai chengshi jieceng shouru de yige gusuan 1933” 年上海城市阶层收入的一个估算 (An Estimation of Incomes of Different Classes in Shanghai in 1933), *Zhongguo jingjishi yanjiu* (Chinese Economic History), 01 (2005): 121.

⁵¹ David L. McMahan, *The Making of Buddhist Modernism* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008), 6.

Buddhist reformer Yang Wehui's (1837-1911) establishment of the Jinling Sutra Publishing House 金陵刻经处 in 1866.⁵² By the time of Republican China, the project had grown out of the germination stage into its heyday. Traditionally, scholars tend to view Taixu's "Invasion of Jinshan Temple" 大闹金山寺 as the beginning of radical reform,⁵³ yet the reform project did not go smoothly or proceed unimpeded. The awakening of the Buddhist community after the intellectual effort to revive Buddhism and establish it as a national religion⁵⁴ led to fierce discussion of exactly how the reform should be undertaken. Advertisements, and in particular advertisements promoting the reform of Buddhism and particular figures who advocated reform and introduced Western ideas of modernity and modern religion, can also offer some insight into this discourse.

As noted above, many advertisements in what I classified as the second category of ads were dedicated to espousing a particular stand on or figure in Buddhist reform. Taixu is a good example. *Haichao yin* was a vital platform for Taixu to express his ideas and an important foothold for the revival of Buddhism, yet in its early stage this journal almost ceased publication due to financial constraints;⁵⁵ however, after consigning distribution to Shanghai Buddhist Books in 1930, sales of the journal jumped to more than ten thousand copies per issue.⁵⁶ Advertisements for *Haichao yin* appeared in almost every issue of *Foxue banyuekan*, some even

⁵² Welch, *The Buddhist Revival in China*, 4.

⁵³ Welch, *The Buddhist Revival in China*, 26-33.

⁵⁴ Zhang Taiyan is a prominent figure in the debate over establishing a state religion in the late Qing period. See Viren Murthy, *The Political Philosophy of Zhang Taiyan: The Resistance of Consciousness* (Leiden: Brill, 2011), 89-134.

⁵⁵ Huang Xianian 黄夏年, "Zhongguo Fojiaojie chuban shijian zuichang de kanwu—*Haichao yin*" 中国佛教出版界最长的刊物—海潮音 (The Longest Periodicals of Chinese Buddhist Publications: *Haichao Yin*), in *Wuyue Fojiao*, vol. 2 吴越佛教第二卷, ed. Hangzhou Foxueyuan 杭州佛学院 (Beijing: Zongjiao Wenhua Chubanshe, 2007), 297.

⁵⁶ Meng Lingbin 孟令兵, *Lao Shanghai de wenhua qipa—Shanghai Foxue shuju*, 95.

offering free copies under sponsorship,⁵⁷ which certainly contributed much to the promotion and sale of *Haichao yin*.

In addition to the promotion of periodicals, other texts for Buddhist modernization were also emphasized. For example, Ouyang Jingwu 欧阳竟无 (1871-1943) was a prominent lay Buddhist who was slated to inherit Yang Wenhui's legacy of preserving and publishing Buddhist sutras and of forming a modern educational system for Buddhism.⁵⁸ He delved into doctrinal studies of Buddhism as well and produced a significant address titled "Buddhism as neither Religion nor Philosophy" 佛法非宗教非哲学, in which he argued for the rational character of Buddhism.⁵⁹ It was published as a pamphlet, and advertisements for it appeared in *Foxue xunkan* for more than ten issues.⁶⁰ Furthermore, other advertisements promoted publications that addressed Buddhist reform directly or indirectly that dealt with how Buddhism could and should adapt to modernity. For example, in 1932, after more than a decade of living in the West, the eminent Buddhist laywomen and journalist Lyu Bicheng 吕碧城 (1883-1943) published *Oumei zhiguang* 欧美之光 (The Light of Europe and America). The book was advertised in *Foxue banyukan* prior to its publication, and the advertisement included a preview of its pictorial content.⁶¹ Related advertisements and comments appeared in *Haichao yin* and *Shijie Fojiao jushilin linkan* as well.⁶² The book introduced the issue of animal protection in the West from a Buddhist perspective, implying the similarity between Buddhist practice in China and related themes in the West, and its publication by Shanghai Buddhist Books suggests that it fit into the

⁵⁷ *Foxue banyuekan* no.30 (1932), in *MFQ* vol. 47, 287.

⁵⁸ See Eyal Aviv, "Differentiating the Pearl from the Fish Eye: Ouyang Jingwu (1871-1943) and the Revival of Scholastic Buddhism." Ph.D. dissertation, Harvard University, 2008.

⁵⁹ Ouyang Jingwu 欧阳竟无, *Ouyang Jingwu ji* 欧阳竟无集 (*Collection of the Works by Ouyang Jingwu*) (Beijing: Zhongguo Shehui Kexue Chubanshe, 1995), 1-13.

⁶⁰ *Foxue xunkan* no. 10 (1922), no. 11 (1922), no. 12 (1922), in *MFQB* vols. 01, 467, 487, 507; no. 13 (1922), *MFQ* vol. 07, 411.

⁶¹ *Foxue xunkan*, no. 14 (1931), in *MFQ* vol. 47, 123, 131.

⁶² See *Shijie Fojiao jushilin linkan* no.31: 12, in *MFQB* vol.11, 358; *Haichao yin* no. 4 (1931): 56, in *MFQ* vol. 177, 456.

general theme of how Buddhism could adapt to a modern world. Although publications like *Oumei Zhiguang* do not directly engage with the issue of Buddhist reform, they still address related concerns like how Buddhism should be identified in the environment of the West and the overlapping ideas between Buddhism and the West. All those issues have continuously been considered by various Buddhist reformers and are still relevant today.

McMahan distills Charles Taylor's discourse of modernity into three general domains: Western monotheism, rationalism and scientific naturalism, and Romantic expressivism.⁶³ He also examines the manifestation of modern Buddhism through these three aspects and demonstrates the complexity of the process of responding with Buddhism to those paradigms. The relevant issue here is that in the Republican era, such a project had already begun and the competition over interpretation and reform can be illustrated through advertisements and the products they sold, which embodied two views—that changes should be made and that traditions should be preserved. Besides advertisements for reform journals like *Haichao yin*, there also were advertisements advocating some more “modest” works on how Buddhism should look in the modern era, such as the compiled works of Yinguang 印光. Jan Kiely called the popularity of Yinguang's books a “miracle,”⁶⁴ and this popularity was reflected in advertisements. Although the contents of the advertisements in Buddhist reform periodicals did not unilaterally promote a single view of Buddhist modernity, a majority of them followed identifiable trends of adaptation and transformation. Certain traditional Buddhist products, such as the work of Yinguang and other Buddhist texts, were still in large demand, but new texts pointing to the construction of a

⁶³ McMahan, *The Making of Buddhist Modernism*, 10.

⁶⁴ Jan Kiely, "Spreading the Dharma with the Mechanized Press: New Buddhist Print Cultures in the Modern Chinese Print Revolution, 1866-1949," in *From Woodblocks to the Internet*, 200-202.

new Buddhism were also consumed by the Buddhist community. It is those works that prepared Buddhism for the modern era.

6.0 CONCLUSION

The intersection of the development of Chinese monastic Buddhism and the modernization process of print media in China is brimming with heterogeneity and sophistication. I have outlined the process by which Chinese Buddhist monks gradually engaged with and exploited the advantages that modern media, namely newspaper and journal publications, could provide them, and depicted the outcome of that intersection, namely, a broader audience, a message of modernity, and a revival of a continuing tradition of social engagement in Chinese Buddhism. The examples I have chosen—Zongyang, Taixu, and Yinguang—all enjoyed great fame during their lifetimes and beyond for their efforts to contribute, each in his own distinctive ways, to society as well as to Buddhism. Consciously or not, they all helped to shape Chinese Buddhism in modern society.

Zongyang was a model of a political monk focused on the fate of the nation and society, a concern leading to his participation in revolutionary activities. In Chinese history, it is not uncommon to have monks involved with politics, and indeed Buddhism as a whole as well as individual Buddhist schools depended on access to certain political power during their incubation and periods of prosperity. The peculiarity of Zongyang, who is credited as the thirteenth patriarch of Pure Land, is that he was not the same kind of revolutionary Buddhist figure as were earlier medieval eminent monks like the *de facto* founder of Tiantai Zhiyi 天台智顛 (538–597),

the sixth patriarch of Chan, Huineng 六祖慧能 (638–713), or the four eminent monks of the late Ming, who emphasized syncretistic styles of Buddhism.¹ Zongyang did not contribute much to doctrinal innovation or syncretism, nor did he establish new regulations for the sangha or play a key role in rebuffing challenges from Christianity or other religions and ideologies. However, he exemplified how a monk could engage with modern media so as to make a stand for Buddhism, was a pioneer in the project of modernizing China, and helped with the preservation of Buddhist texts by editing the Buddhist Canon. Therefore, beginning with an examination of his publication experiences, I have articulated the initial contact between Buddhism and the modern publishing industry and what the concerns of Buddhists were during the late nineteenth- and early twentieth centuries—a period that led up to and ultimately resulted in the fall of the Qing house and the establishment of the Republic.

Coming into the early Republican period, Taixu was a key figure in modern Chinese Buddhist reform for his advocacy of humanistic Buddhism dedicated to realizing a pure land in the human world, an outlook which “bore many parallels with liberal Protestant thinking.”² For a long time, scholars have given much attention to the content and orientation of his reform by thoroughly examining his life and by describing many of his activities related to Buddhist publications in terms of his enthusiasm to promote his reforms. In this essay, I specifically explored his publishing activities, wherein he consciously engaged with those media, a phenomenon which had rarely happened in the history of Chinese Buddhism. Many Buddhist periodicals were encouraged by Taixu and dedicated to his cause, making Buddhist reform the central theme of modern Chinese Buddhism.

¹ The Four Eminent Monks of the late Ming are Zibo Zhenke 紫柏真可 (1543-1603), Hanshan Deqing 憨山德清 (1546-1623), Yunqi Zhuhong 云栖株宏 (1535-1615), and Ouyi Zhixu 藕益智旭 (1599-1655).

² Vicent Goossaert and David A. Palmer, *The Religious Question in Modern China* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2011), 81.

Yinguang's attitude towards modern publication contrasted sharply with Taixu's. As I have demonstrated, Yinguang also emphasized social engagement, but he concentrated more on self-cultivation and the accumulation of merit through charitable works. Yinguang's reform differed from Taixu's due to its inheritance of traditional Pure Land ideas and practices, with slight modifications to suit the then-current society. One such difference is illustrated in his attitude towards Buddhist publications. Though he perceived the convenience of those media, Yinguang still considered them primarily a means to accumulate merit rather than a means by which to bring about changes in Buddhism and society in general.

Taken together, those three Buddhist figures engaged with the modern publication industry from different perspectives yet all contributed to the transformation of Buddhism in modern China. Although their attitudes towards the new medium varied, they nonetheless demonstrated to the Buddhist community the importance of engaging with such a medium, voluntarily or not. And by engaging with the modern publication industry with its own voice, Buddhism embraces the emerging public sphere, and the social layer of civil society, which has enabled Buddhism to remain an inseparable component of the modern Chinese society.

The advertisements in Buddhist periodicals of the Republican period acted as indicators for evaluating the extent to which a Buddhist revival was occurring and how it blended with modern publishing modes. The publishing activities of several monks were not by themselves enough to reveal the actual situation of Buddhist periodical publications. Advertisements in those periodicals conveniently provided access to the dynamics of text publications, religious services, lay Buddhist societies, and the scale of commercialization in Buddhism. Moreover, they provided evidence of the actual impact of certain Buddhist figures on the discourse of Buddhist reform and modernization, evidence that can help us to gain a real sense of the acceptance of and

resistance to various claims on reform. And though reform was the main theme during that era, advertisements make clear that the Buddhist market was still in need of various traditional texts. However, what is conspicuously absent here are advertisements for many other conventional services, such as funeral services, suggesting that the urban-based readership had a different taste in terms of what Buddhism was able to provide for them in the new era.

Looking at print culture in conjunction with concurrent monastic Buddhist history to analyze the transformation of modern Chinese Buddhism fills an important gap in the intellectual history and institutional analysis of modern Chinese Buddhism. However, further work should be done on the details of print culture in modern China from the perspective of regional monasteries. So far, my database relates primarily to urban contexts, like the cities of Shanghai, Beijing, Chengdu, and so on, and does not include monasteries and Buddhists operating in the vast countryside. In the Republican era, however, the urbanization process was still getting underway, so the rural population actually made up the majority of the nation. The unequal pace of modernization in China, especially between urban and rural areas, also influenced the results of many Buddhist reform proposals. Moreover, the adaptation of Buddhism to local traditions resulted in an inertia that preserved many practices that might be perceived elsewhere as heterodoxies, practices that were a target for modern Buddhist reform. How the message of “orthodox” Buddhism was conveyed to those rural areas and how those areas reacted to reform, however, require further investigation and analysis.

LIST OF CITED BUDDHIST PERIODICALS

Table of Relevant Buddhist Periodicals¹

	LOCATION of Publication	Publisher	Duration
Foxue Congbao 佛学丛报 Buddhist Miscellany	Shanghai 上海	Youzheng Shuju 有正书局	1912-1914
Fojiao Yuebao 佛教月报 Buddhist Monthly	Shanghai		1913
Jueshe Congshu 觉社丛书 Awakening Society Collectanea	Shanghai	Zhonghua Shuju 中华书局	1918-1919
Haichao Yin 海潮音 The Sound of Sea Tide	Shanghai, Hangzhou 杭州, Beijing 北京, Wuhan 武汉	Shanghai Foxue Shuju 上海佛学书局 (starting 1930)	1920-1949 (in mainland China)
Fohua 佛化 Buddhist Teaching	Shanghai	Taidong Shuju 泰东书局	1921-?
Shijie Fojiao Jushilin Linkan 世界佛教居士林林刊 Association Magazine of the World Buddhist Lay Association	Shanghai	Shanghai Foxue Shuju (starting 1930)	1923-1937

¹ Data from the *MFQB* catalogue and “Database of Modern Chinese Buddhism.”

Banchan Donglaiji 班禅东来记 Record of the Panchen Lama's Visit to the East	Shanghai	Shijie Shuju 世界书局	1925 (It is one special issue)
Fohua Xunkan 佛化旬刊 Buddhist Teaching Trimonthly	Shanghai	Shanghai Fohua Xunkan Bianjishe 上海佛化旬刊编辑社	1925-?
Dongfang Wenhua 东方文化 Eastern Culture	Shanghai	Taidong Shuju Shanghai Foxue Shuju (last issue)	1926-1931?
Zhongsheng 钟声 The Sound of the Bell	Shanghai	Shanghai Foxue Shuju	1930
Foxue Banyuekan 佛学半月刊 Buddhism Semimonthly	Shanghai	Shanghai Foxue Shuju	1930-1944
Xiandai Sengjia 现代僧伽 Modern Sangha	Xiamen 厦门 Chaozhou 潮州	Xiandai Sengjiashe 现代僧伽社	1928-1932
Xiandai Fojiao 现代佛教 Modern Buddhism	Chaozhou	Xiandai Sengjiashe	1932-1933
Foxue Xunkan 佛学旬刊 Buddhist Studies Trimonthly	Chengdu 成都	Chengdu Shaocheng Gongyuan Fojing Liutongchu 成都少城公园佛经流 通处	1922-1923?
Zheng Xin 正信 Right Faith	Wuhan	Fojiao Zhengxinhui 佛教正信会	1932-1949
Zhongguo Fojiaohui gongbao	Shanghai	Zhongguo Fojiao Zonghui	1929-1936

中国佛教会公报 Official Bulletin of the Chinese Buddhist Association ²		中国佛教总会	
Fohua Xinqingnian 佛化新青年 The Young Men's Buddhism Monthly	Wuhan	Fohua Xinqingnian Hui 新青年会	1923-1924
Husheng Bao 护生报 Protecting Life	Shanghai		1932-1936
Jue Youqing Banyuekan 觉有情半月刊 Bodhisattva Semi- monthly	Shanghai	Dafalun Shuju 大法轮书局	1939-1953

² From the fourth to sixth issue this publication was named *Zhongguo Fojiashui yuekan* 中国佛教会月刊 (Chinese Buddhist Association Monthly); from the seventh issue on it was renamed *Zhongguo Fojiashuibao* 中国佛教会会报 (Journal of the Chinese Buddhist Association).

FIGURES

目書所通流經佛行發局書正有

五彩印西方阿彌陀佛接引像
 接引云者凡人臨命終時佛即示現接引衆生至極樂世界也佛說阿彌陀經云西方有淨土名爲極樂世界其中有佛號阿彌陀吾人只須執持阿彌陀佛名號念念西方願生彼土果能臨命終時一心不亂即能決定往生彼土云我國夙崇佛教近世研究佛學者益多本局特恭印大福繪畫高妙色相莊嚴純無俗陋習氣永合供奉之用每幅價洋二角又本局前出洋金印西方三聖像原價一角半現改一角五彩印播真金西方三聖像原價一角現改一角半定價從廉藉廣流布

起信論科註
 此書爲學佛者初步必要之書經桂君伯華集各家註釋而錄其首義記分注句下庶學易者于領解每本大洋一角五分

華嚴原人論合解再版出書
 以爲人之道則與衆生何異凡吾人既得爲人而不知所以所以爲人知人則知天知佛知凡入聖此書可爲絕妙之津梁矣每本一角五分

釋迦如來應化事迹出版
 此書乃將釋迦佛降生以來種種聖跡精繪成圖此從初刻精本落石共三冊連史紙印者大洋九角有光紙印者大洋五角批發照本局例

-180-

Figure 1: Advertisement in the first issue of *Foxue congbao*¹

¹ *Foxue congbao* no. 01(1912), in *MFQ* vol. 01, 180.

大宇長宙中

海潮音

第一之月刊

理 的 利
界 疑 的 劍
斷 疑 的 劍
界 命 的 將
然 界 的 軍
白 然 的 猛

總發行所漢口仁里巷堤街佛教會
發行處 各埠佛經流通所各書局

閱中華唯一佛學雜誌海潮音月刊者鑒

本月刊第一年已出滿十二期內容豐富理論宏深早已膾炙人口而其警醒酣夢對治濁世尤為妙契時機救世之傑著薄海內外學佛同人咸請太虛法師廣賜法音增加篇幅以開知見法師應對不遑而又常赴各省講經之聘遂命本會專任其責教請湖南善因法師出山駐錫本會任總編輯從第二年正月份起改由本會發行並請定國內佛學鉅子三十餘人分任著述以饜閱者之望凡我同好諒必先親為快也預定全年尤為盼

漢口佛教會謹啓

佛化首卷二號目次預告

唯我主義之實行佛學…………… 彭普善佛

評信耶教的一個最大底謬誤和我所反對的一個最大底條件…………… 張天痕

江五民佛論法非之評判…………… 兩生齋

揭破同善社黑幕之二…………… 佛屍

明甲是個魂屍說什麼靈佛咧？…………… 化民

嗚嗚形同殘廢院的叢林和騙局式的小庵…………… 紫鵲孤魂

上海佛教公會雜評史…………… 卍

二月十日發行告白見時報定全年

一月以上者須向編輯處定

混

Figure 2: Advertisement for *Haichao yin* in *Fohua*²

² *Fohua* no. 01 (1921), in *MFBQ* vol. 01, 366.

天 廚 味 精

此粉係由一精製之天廚味精... 其味清香... 且能去腥... 誠為烹飪中之至寶也。凡欲購者請認明商標為要。



此粉係由一精製之天廚味精... 其味清香... 且能去腥... 誠為烹飪中之至寶也。凡欲購者請認明商標為要。

總批發所 上海 粵波路 四九廿九號

-292-

Figure 3: Advertisement for Tianchu Gourmet Powder in *Foxue banyuekan*³

³ *Foxue banyuekan* no. 31 (1932), in *MFQ* vol. 47, 292.



Figure 4: Advertisement for Tianchu Gourmet Powder in *Wanxiang* 万象 (Kaleidoscope)⁴

⁴ *Wanxiang* no. 01 (1941), data from *Minguo qikan ziyuanku* 民国期刊资源库 (Minguo Periodicals Database), Guojia shuzi tushuguan 国家数字图书馆 (National Digital Library of China).



-356-

Figure 5: Advertisement for a gourmet powder by “Taixu”⁵

⁵ *Foxue banyuekan*, no. 35 (1932), in *MFQ*, vol. 47, 356.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Primary Sources

Dizang pusa benyun jing 地藏菩萨本愿经 (Sūtra on the Past Vows of Kṣitigarbha Bodhisattva),

Taishō Shinshū Daizōkyō 13, no. 412: 777-789.

Huang Xianian 黄夏年, ed. *Minguo Fojiao wenxian qikan jicheng* 民国佛教文献期刊集成

(Complete Collection of Republican-Era Buddhist Periodical Literature). Beijing, China:

Quanguo tushuguan wenxian weisuo zhongxin, 2006.

Huang Xianian, ed. *Minguo Fojiao wenxian qikan jicheng bubian* 民国佛教文献期刊集成补编

(Supplement to the Collection of Republican-Era Buddhist Periodical Literature). Beijing

Zhongguo shudian, 2008.

Minguo qikan ziyuanku 民国期刊资源库 (Minguo Periodicals Database). Guojia shuzi

tushuguan 国家数字图书馆 (National Digital Library of China).

Ouyang Jingwu 欧阳竟无. *Ouyang Jingwu ji* 欧阳竟无集 (*Collection of the Works by Ouyang*

Jingwu). Beijing: Zhongguo Shehui Kexue Chubanshe, 1995.

Shen qian 沈潜, and Tang Wenquan 唐文权, eds. *Zongyang shangren wenji* 宗仰上人文集

(Collection of Works by Master Zongyang). Wuhan, China: Huazhong shifan daxue

chubanshe, 2000.

Taixu 太虚. *Taixu dashi quanshu* 太虚大师全书 (Complete Works of Master Taixu). Beijing: Zongjiao wenhua chubanshe 宗教文化出版社, 2004.

Wanqing qikan quanwen shujuku, 晚清期刊全文数据库 (Late Qing Dynasty Full-text Database, 1833-1911). National Index to Chinese Newspapers & Periodicals 全国报刊索引 (Quanguo baokan suoyin).

Ying Guang 印光. *Ying Guang fashi wenchao* 印光法师文钞 (Collected Writings of Dharma Master Ying Guang). Beijing: Zongjiao wenhua chubanshe, 1999.

Secondary Sources

Ashiwa, Yoshiko, "Positioning Religion in Modernity: State and Buddhism in China," in *Making Religion, Making the State: the Politics of Religion in Modern China*, edited by Yoshiko Ashiwa and David L. Wank, 43-73. Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press, 2009.

Aviv, Eyal. "Differentiating the Pearl from the Fish Eye: Ouyang Jingwu (1871-1943) and the Revival of Scholastic Buddhism." Ph.D. dissertation, Harvard University, 2008.

Barrett, Timothy Hugh. *The Woman Who Discovered Printing*. New Haven; London: Yale University Press, 2008.

Betta, Chiara. "Silas Aaron Hardoon and Cross-cultural Adaptation in Shanghai." In *Jews of China, Volume One*, edited by Jonathan Goldstein, 216-229. Armonk, New York: M.E. Sharpe, 1999.

Bourdieu, Pierre. *Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgement of Taste*. Tr. by Richard Nice. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1984.

Brokaw, Cynthia, *The Ledgers of Merit and Demerit: Social Change and Moral Order in Late Imperial China*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1991.

- _____. *The Sibao Book Trade in the Qing and Republican Periods*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Asia Center, 2007.
- _____. “On the History of Book in China,” in *Printing and Book Culture in Late Imperial China*, edited by Cynthia Brokaw, and Kai-wing Chow, 3-54. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 2005.
- Cihai bianji weiyuanhui 辞海编辑委员会 ed. *Cihai* 辞海 (Sea of Words). Shanghai: Shanghai cishu chubanshe, 1989.
- Chan Sin-wai. *Buddhism in Late Ch'ing Political Thought*. Hong Kong: The Chinese University Press, 1985.
- Chaves, Mark. “Secularization as Declining Religious Authority.” *Social Forces* 72 (1994): 749–774.
- Chen Bing 陈兵 and Deng Zimei 邓子美. *Ershi shiji Zhongguo Fojiao* 二十世纪中国佛教 (Chinese Buddhism in the Twentieth Century). Beijing: Minzu chubanshe 民族出版社, 2000.
- Chen Mingyuan 陈明远. *Wenhuaren yu qian* 文化人与钱 (Literati and Money). Tianjin: Baihua wenyi chubanshe, 2001.
- Chen Xuexun 陈学恂, ed. *Zhongguo jiaoyushi yanjiu suitang juan* 中国教育史研究隋唐卷 (History of Chinese Education in the Sui and Tang Dynasties). Shanghai: Huadong shifan daxue chubanshe 华东师范大学出版社, 2009.
- Chen Yongge 陈永革. *Renjian chaoyin—Taixu dashi zhuan* 人间潮音—太虚大师传 (The Sound of Tide in Human World: Biography of Master Taixu). Hangzhou, China: Zhejiang renmin chubanshe 浙江人民出版社, 2003.

- Cheng, Ying-wan. *Postal Communication in China and Its Modernization, 1860-1896*. Cambridge, MA: East Asian Research Center, Harvard University, distributed by Harvard University Press, 1970.
- Cohen, Paul A. *Between Tradition and Modernity: Wang T'ao and Reform in Late Ch'ing China*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1974.
- _____. *China Unbound: Evolving Perspectives on the Chinese Past*. London; New York: Routledge, 2003.
- Cowie, Sarah E. *The Plurality of Power: An Archaeology of Industrial Capitalism*. New York and London; Heidelberg: Springer, 2011.
- Deng Zimei 邓子美. *Chuantong Fojiao yu Zhongguo jindahuai—bainian chongtu yu wenhua jiaoliu* 传统佛教与中国近代化一百年文化冲突与交流 (Traditional Buddhism and the Modernization of China: A Hundred Years of Cultural Conflict and Communication). Shanghai: Huadong shifandaxue chubanshe, 1994.
- Dillon, Michele. "Pierre Bourdieu, Religion, and Cultural Production." *Cultural Studies <=> Critical Methodologies* 01 (2001): 411–429.
- Du Xuncheng 杜恂诚. "1933 Nian Shanghai chengshi jiecheng shouru de yige gusuan 1933 年上海城市阶层收入的一个估算 (An Estimation of Incomes of Different Classes in Shanghai in 1933)," *Zhongguo jingjishi yanjiu*, 01 (2005): 116-122.
- Fang Hanqi 方汉奇. *Zhongguo jindai baokan shi* 中国近代报刊史 (A History of Modern Chinese Journalism). Taiyuan, China: Shanxi renmin chubanshe, 1991.
- Fang Zuyou 方祖猷. *Tiantaizong Guanzongjiang sizhi 1912-1949* 天台宗观宗讲寺志 1912-1949 (Guanzongjiao Temple of Tiantai Buddhism, 1912-1949). Beijing: Zongjiao Wenhua Chubanshe, 2006.

- Feng Ziyou 冯自由, *Geming yishi* 革命逸史 (Revolution Memoir, volume 1). (Shanghai: Xinxing chubanshe, 2009).
- Fu Jiaoshi 傅教石. "Minguo nianjian de Shanghai Foxue shuju" 民国年间的上海佛学书局 (Shanghai Buddhist Books in Republican China), *Fayin* 法音 no. 11 (1988): 21-26.
- Fung, Edmund S. K. *The Intellectual Foundations of Chinese Modernity: Cultural and Political Thought in the Republican Era*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2010.
- Ge Gongzhen 戈公振. *Zhongguo baoxu shi* 中国报学史 (A History of Chinese Journalism) Shanghai: Shangwu yinshuguan 商务印书馆, 1935.
- Grieder, Jerome B. *Intellectuals and the State in Modern China*. New York: Free Press; London: Collier Macmillan, 1981.
- Goldman, Merle, and Leo Ou-fan Lee. *An Intellectual History of Modern China*. Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press, 2002.
- Goossaert, Vincent, and David A. Palmer. *The Religious Question in Modern China*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2011.
- Guo Peng 郭朋. *Taixu sixiang yanjiu* 太虚思想研究 (On the Thought of Taixu). Beijing, China: Zhongguo shehui kexue chubanshe, 1997.
- Hammerstrom, Erik J. "Buddhists Discuss Science in Modern China (1895-1949)." Ph.D. dissertation, Indiana University, 2010.
- He Jianmin 何建民. "Huang Zongyang yu jindai Fojiao wenhua zhenxing" 黄宗仰与近代佛教文化振兴 (Huang Zongyang and Revival of Modern Chinese Buddhist Culture). *Foxue yanjiu* (2002): 194-205.
- Heine, Steven, and Charles S. Prebish, "Introduction: Traditions and Transformations in Modern

- Buddhism," in *Buddhism in the Modern World: Adaptations of an Ancient Tradition*, ed. Steven Heine and Charles S. Prebish, 3-8. New York: Oxford University Press, 2003.
- Hesmondhalgh, D. "Bourdieu, the Media and Cultural Production." *Media, Culture & Society* 28 (2006): 211-231.
- Hong Jinlian 洪金莲, *Taixu dashi Fojiao xiandaihua zhi yanjiu* 太虚大师佛教现代化之研究 (On Taixu's Modernization of Buddhism). Taipei: Dongchu chubanshe, 1995.
- Hosseini, S. H. "Religion and Media, Religious Media, or Media Religion: Theoretical Studies." *Journal of Media & Religion* 7 (2008): 56-69.
- Hulters, Ted. "Culture, Capital, and the Temptations of the Imagined Market: The Case of the Commercial Press." In *Beyond the May Fourth Paradigm: In Search of Chinese Modernity*, edited by Chow Kai-wing, 27-50. Lanham: Lexington Books/Rowman & Littlefield, 2008.
- Hu Siyong 胡思庸. "Taiping Tianguo yu Fojiao 太平天国与佛教 [Taiping Rebellion and Buddhism]" in *Taiping Tianguo Shilun Wenji* 太平天国史论文集 (Collections of Historical Essays on Taiping Rebellion), edited by Guangxi Taiping Tianguoshi Yanjiuhui 广西太平天国史研究会, 263-281. Guangdong: Guangdong renmin chubanshe, 1983.
- Ip, Hung-yok. "Buddhism, Literature, and Chinese Modernity: Su Manshu's Imaginings of Love (1911-1916)." In *Beyond the May Fourth Paradigm: In Search of Chinese Modernity*, edited by Chow Kai-wing, 27-50. Lanham: Lexington Books/Rowman & Littlefield, 2008.
- Judge, Joan. *Print and Politics: 'Shibao' and the Culture of Reform in Late Qing China*. Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press, 1996.

- Khojastea, Hassan, and Abdolhosein Kalantari. "The Media Rituals: The Relationship between Media and Religion." *Asian Journal of Social Science* 37 (2009): 284-304.
- Kiely, Jan. "Spreading the Dharma with the Mechanized Press: New Buddhist Print Cultures in the Modern Chinese Print Revolution, 1866-1949," in *From Woodblocks to the Internet: Chinese Publishing and Print Culture in Transition, Circa 1800 to 2008*, edited by Cynthia Brokaw, and Christopher A. Reed, 185-212. Leiden: Brill, 2010.
- Kieschnick, John. *The Impact of Buddhism on Chinese Material Culture*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2003.
- Laitinen, Kauko. *Chinese Nationalism in the Late Qing Dynasty: Zhang Binglin as an Anti-Manchu Propagandist*. London: Curzon Press, 1990.
- Li Shan 李山 and Guo Changbao 过常宝, eds. *Lidai gaoseng zhuan 历代高僧传* (Biographies of Eminent Monks in Chinese History). Jinan, China: Shandong renmin chubanshe, 1994.
- Li Xiangping 李向平. *Jiushi yu jiuxin: Zhongguo jingdai Fojiao fuxin sichao yanjiu 救世与救心 中国近代佛教复兴思潮研究* (Salvation of Society and the Heart: On the Revival Thoughts of Modern Chinese Buddhism). Shanghai: Shanghai renmin chubanshe, 1993.
- Lin, Nan. *Social Capital: A Theory of Social Structure and Action*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2002.
- Lin, Xiaoqing Diana. *Peking University: Chinese Scholarship and Intellectuals, 1898-1937*. Albany: State University of New York Press, 2005.
- Lin, Yusheng. *The Crisis of Chinese Consciousness: Radical Antitraditionalism in the May Fourth Era*. Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1979.
- Liu Jialin 刘家林. *Zhongguo xinwen tongshi 中国新闻通史* (General History of Chinese Journalism). Wuhan: Wuhandaxue chubanshe, 2005.

- Liu Lin 刘凌 and Wu Shiyu 吴士余, eds. *Zhongguo xueshu minci dacidian jinxiandai juan* 中国学术名著大词典近现代卷 (Dictionary of China Scholarly Terminologies Volume of Modern Era). Shanghai: Hanyu dacidian chubanshe, 2001.
- Long, Darui. “An Interfaith Dialogue between the Chinese Buddhist Leader Taixu and Christians.” *Buddhist-Christian Studies* 20.1 (2000): 167–189.
- Lu, Li. “Translation and Nation: Negotiating ‘China’ in the Translations of Lin Shu, Yan Fu, and Liang Qichao.” Ph.D. dissertation, University of Massachusetts Amherst, 2007.
- Ma Tianxiang 麻天祥. *Fangguan rensheng de xuanluan zhilu—jinxiandai zhongguo Foxue yanjiu* 反观人生的玄览之路—近现代中国佛学研究 (Reflections on the Metaphysics of Human Life: Research on Modern Chinese Buddhism). Guiyang: Guizhou renmin chubanshe, 1994.
- McMahan, David L. *The Making of Buddhist Modernism*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2008.
- Meng Lingbin 孟令兵. *Lao Shanghai de wenhua qipa—Shanghai Foxue shuju* 老上海的文化奇葩—上海佛学书局 (*The Extraordinary Culture of Old Shanghai: Shanghai Buddhist Books*). Shanghai: Shanghai renmin chubanshe, 2003.
- Mittler, Barbar. *A Newspaper for China?: Power, Identity, and Change in Shanghai's News Media*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Asia Center, 2004.
- Morrison, Elizabeth. *The Power of Patriarchs: Qisong and Lineage in Chinese Buddhism*. Leiden: Brill, 2010.
- Murphy, Viren. *The Political Philosophy of Zhang Taiyan: The Resistance of Consciousness*. Leiden: Brill, 2011.

- Nedostup, Rebecca. *Superstitious Regimes: Religion and the Politics of Chinese Modernity*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2009.
- Pacey, Scott. "A Buddhism for the Human World: Interpretations of Renjian Fojiao in Contemporary Taiwan." *Asian Studies Review* 29.3 (2005): 61–77.
- Pittman, Don Alvin. *Toward a Modern Chinese Buddhism: Taixu's Reforms*. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2001.
- Pomerantz-Zhang, Linda. *Wu Tingfang (1842-1922): Reform and Modernization in Modern Chinese History*. Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press, 1992.
- Poon, Shuk-Wah. *Negotiating Religion in Modern China State and Common People in Guangzhou, 1900-1937*. Hong Kong: Chinese University Press, 2011.
- Rawski, Evelyn S. *Education and Popular Literacy in Ch'ing China*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1979.
- Reed, Christopher A. *Gutenberg in Shanghai: Chinese Print Capitalism, 1876-1937*. Vancouver: The University of British Columbia Press, 2004.
- Rey, Terry. *Bourdieu on Religion: Imposing Faith and Legitimacy*. London and Oakville, CT: Equinox Publishers, 2007.
- Ruan Renze 阮仁泽, and Gao Zhengnong 高振农. *Shanghai zongjiaoshi 上海宗教史 (History of Religion in Shanghai)*. Shanghai: Shanghai renmin chubanshe, 1992.
- Rulu. *Thinking of Amitabha Buddha: Selected Mahayana Sutras*. Bloomington: Author House, 2012.
- Schwarcz, Vera. *The Chinese Enlightenment: Intellectuals and the Legacy of the May Fourth Movement of 1919*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1986.

- Shen Qian 沈潜. “Huang Zongyang yu 1903 nian qianhou de Qingmo geming sichao” 黄宗仰与 1903 年前后的清末革命思潮 (Huang Zongyang and the Late Qing Revolution Ethos around 1903). *Xuezhou shifan xueyuan xuebao* 02 (1996): 75-80.
- _____. “Huang Zongyang yu Minchu zhengchao 黄宗仰与民初政潮 (Huang Zongyang and Political Trends in Early Republic China).” *Xuezhou shifan daxue xuebao* 02 (2010): 83-88.
- _____. “Huang Zongyang yu Sun Zhongshan” 黄宗仰与孙中山 (Huang Zongyang and Sun Yat-sen). *Dangan yu shixue* 档案与史学 01 (1998): 57-60.
- _____. “Xinhai Geming qianhou de Huang Zongyan” 辛亥革命前后的黄宗仰 (Huang Zongyang before and after the Xinhai Revolution). *Huazhong shifan daxue xuebao* 华中师范大学学报 02 (1997): 108-114.
- _____. “Yidai mingseng Huang Zongyang yu Shanghai 一代名僧黄宗仰与上海 (Master Huang Zongyang and Shanghai).” *Suzhou daxue xuebao* 苏州大学学报 03 (2010): 102-106.
- Shan Chun, *Major Aspects of Chinese Religion and Philosophy*. New York: Springer, 2012.
- Shi He 史和, Yao Fuzhong 姚福中 and Ye Cuidi 叶翠娣, eds. *Zhongguo jindai baokan minglu* 中国近代报刊名录 (Index of Modern Chinese Journals). Fuzhou: Fujian renmin chubanshe, 1991
- Shi, Shumei. *The Lure of the Modern: Writing Modernism in Semicolonial China, 1917-1937*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2001.
- Song Yingli 宋应离, ed. *Zhongguo qikan fazhanshi* 中国期刊发展史 (History of Periodicals in China). Kaifeng: Henan daxue chubanshe, 2000.
- Spence, Jonathan D. *The Search for Modern China*. New York: Norton, 1990.

- Steinmetz, George. "Bourdieu's Disavowal of Lacan: Psychoanalytic Theory and the Concepts of 'Habitus' and 'Symbolic Capital.'" *Constellations* 13 (2006): 445–464.
- _____. "Bourdieu, Historicity, and Historical Sociology." *Cultural Sociology* 5 (2011): 45–66.
- Su Jing 苏精. *Malixun yu Zhongwen yinshua chuban* 马礼逊与中文印刷出版 (Robert Morrison and Chinese Printing and Publication). Taipei, Taiwan: Xuesheng shuju, 2000.
- Tang Hongli 唐红丽. "Mingguo Sichuan Fojiao qikan chuyi" 民国四川佛教期刊刍议 (Sichuan's Buddhist Periodicals in Republican China). *Fayin* 法音 07 (2010): 35-39.
- Tang, Xiaobing. *Global Space and the Nationalist Discourse of Modernity: The Historical Thinking of Liang Qichao*. Stanford, Cal: Stanford University Press, 1996.
- Tarocco, Francesca. *The Cultural Practices of Modern Chinese Buddhism: Attuning the Dharma*. London and New York: Routledge, 2007.
- _____. "On the Market: Consumption and Material Culture in Modern Chinese Buddhism." *Religion* 41 (2011): 627–644.
- Tuzzeo, Daniel Ryan. "Education, Invention of Orthodoxy, and the Construction of Modern Buddhism on Dharma Drum Mountain." Ph.D. dissertation, Florida State University, 2012.
- Verter, Bradford. "Spiritual Capital Theorizing Religion with Bourdieu against Bourdieu." *Sociological Theory* 21 (2003): 150–174.
- Wagner, Rudolf G. *Joining the Global Public: Word, Image, and City in Early Chinese Newspapers, 1870-1910*. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 2007.
- Wang, Yeh-chien. "Secular Trends of Rice Prices in the Yangzi Delta, 1638–1935," in *Chinese History in Economic Perspective*, eds. Thomas G. Rawski and Lillian M. Li, 35-68. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1992.

- Wasserstrom, Jeffrey N. *Student Protests in Twentieth-century China the View from Shanghai*. Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press, 1991.
- Weber, Max. *Max Weber: Readings and Commentary on Modernity*, edited by Stephen Kalberg. Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishers, 2005.
- Weber, Max. *The Theory of Social and Economic Organization*. Tr. by A.M. Henderson and Talcott Parsons. New York: Oxford University Press, 1947.
- Weidner, Marsha Smith. *Cultural Intersections in later Chinese Buddhism*. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2001.
- Welch, Holmes. *The Buddhist Revival in China*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1968.
- _____. *The Practice of Chinese Buddhism, 1900-1950*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1967.
- Weston, Timothy B. *The Power of Position: Beijing University, Intellectuals, and Chinese Political Culture, 1898-1929*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2004.
- Wong, Young-tsu. *Search for Modern Nationalism: Zhang Binglin and Revolutionary China, 1869-1936*. Hong Kong and New York: Oxford University Press, 1989.
- Wright, David Curtis. *The History of China*. Santa Barbara: Greenwood, 2011.
- Wu, Jiang. *Enlightenment in Dispute: The Reinvention of Chan Buddhism in Seventeenth-Century China*. Oxford; New York: Oxford University Press, 2008.
- Wu Yonggui 吴永贵, *Minguo chubanshi* 民国出版史(Publication History of Republican China). Fujian: Fujian renmin chubanshe, 2011.
- Xia Boming 夏伯铭. *Shanghai jiushi zhi hatong fufu* 上海旧事之哈同夫妇 (Old Memory of Shanghai: Hatong Couple). Shanghai: Shanghai yuandong chubanshe, 2008.

- Xing Jun. *Baptized in the Fire of Revolution: The American Social Gospel and the YMCA in China, 1919-1937*. Bethlehem: Lehigh University Press; London; Cranbury, NJ: Associated University Presses, 1996.
- Xiong Yuezhi 熊月之. *Shanghai mingren mingshi mingwu daguan* 上海名人名事名物大观 (General Introduction of Famous People, Events and Products of Shanghai). Shanghai: Shanghai renmin chubanshe, 2004.
- Xue Yu 学愚 ed. *Renjian Fojiao yu dangdai lunli* 人间佛教与当代伦理 (Humanistic Buddhism and Contemporary Ethics). Hongkong: Zhonghua shuju, 2012.
- Yifa. *The Origins of Buddhist Monastic Codes in China: An Annotated Translation and Study of the Chanyuan Qinggui*. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2002.
- Yin Shun 印顺, *Renjian fojiao lunji* 人间佛教论集 (Essays on Humanistic Buddhism). Beijing: Zhonghua Shuju, 2010.
- Yoon, Seungjoo. "Literati-Journalists of the *Chinese Progress* (Shiwu Bao) in Discord, 1896-1898," in *Rethinking the 1898 Reform Period: Political and Cultural Change in Late Qing China*, ed. Rebecca E. Karl and Peter Gue Zarrow, 48-76. Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Asia Center, 2002.
- Yü Chün-fang. *The Renewal of Buddhism in China: Chu-hung and the Late Ming Synthesis*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1981.
- Yu Yaohua 余耀华, *Zhongguo jiage shi* 中国价格史 (A History of Price in China). Beijing: Zhongguo wujia chubanshe, 2000.
- Zarrow, Peter Gue. *China in War and Revolution, 1895-1949*. London and New York: Routledge, 2005.

- _____. *After Empire: The Conceptual Transformation of the Chinese State, 1885-1924*. Stanford, California: Stanford University Press, 2012.
- Zhang Dahua 张大华. *Wenhua xianchang* 文化现场 (Culture on the Scene). Zhengjiang: Jiangsu daxue chubanshe, 2011.
- Zhang Hua 张华. *Yang Wenhui yu Zhongguo jindai Fojiao sixiang zhuanxing* 杨文会与中国近代佛教思想转型 (Yang Wenhui and the Transformation of Modern Chinese Buddhism). Beijing: Zongjiao yu wenhua chubanshe 宗教与文化出版社, 2004.
- Zhang, Xiantao. *The Origins of the Modern Chinese Press: the Influence of the Protestant Missionary Press in Late Qing China*. London and New York: Routledge, 2007.
- Zhao Xiaolan 赵晓兰 and Wu Chao 吴潮. *Chuanjiaoshi Zhongwen baokanshi* 传教士中文报刊史 (History of Missionary Journals in China). Shanghai: Fudan daxue chubanshe, 2011.
- Zheng Lixin 郑立新. *Fohai huiliu: Lidai gaoseng xuezhe zhuan* 佛海慧流 历代高僧学者传 (Wisdom of Buddhism: Biographies of Eminent Monks and Scholars in Chinese History). Beijing: Huaxia chubanshe, 1999.
- Zheng Tianting 郑天挺 and Rong Mengyuan 荣孟源, eds. *Zhongguo lishi dacidian Qingshi juan xia* 中国历史大辞典 清史卷 下 (General History of China: Qing, Second Volume). Shanghai: Shanghai cishu chubanshe, 1999.
- Zou Xiaozhan 邹小站, *Xixue dongjian—yingju yu xuanze* 西学东渐—迎拒与选择 (The Eastward Dissemination of Western Learning: Acceptance, Refusal and Selection). Chengdu: Sichuan renmin chubanshe, 2008.
- Zou Yong, *Revolutionary Army: A Chinese Nationalist Tract of 1903*. trans. with notes by John Lust. Paris: Mouton, 1968.